

**Determinants of Supply for English Private Tutoring: Voices of
English Tutors in Kazakhstan**

Zhanerke Kamilat

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Multilingual Education

Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education

May 2024

Word Count: 19 552

Author Agreement

By signing and submitting this license, I Zhanerke Kamilat (the author) grant to Nazarbayev University (NU) the non-exclusive right to reproduce, convert (as defined below), and/or distribute my submission (including the abstract) worldwide in print and electronic format and in any medium, including but not limited to audio or video.

I agree that NU may, without changing the content, convert the submission to any medium or format for the purpose of preservation. I also agree that NU may keep more than one copy of this submission for purposes of security, back-up and preservation.

I confirm that the submission is my original work, and that I have the right to grant the rights contained in this license. I also confirm that my submission does not, to the best of my knowledge, infringe upon anyone's copyright.

If the submission contains material for which I do not hold copyright, I confirm that I have obtained the unrestricted permission of the copyright owner to grant NU the rights required by this license, and that such third-party owned material is clearly identified and acknowledged within the text or content of the submission.

IF THE SUBMISSION IS BASED UPON WORK THAT HAS BEEN SPONSORED OR SUPPORTED BY AN AGENCY OR ORGANIZATION OTHER THAN NU, I CONFIRM THAT I HAVE FULFILLED ANY RIGHT OF REVIEW OR OTHER OBLIGATIONS REQUIRED BY SUCH CONTRACT OR AGREEMENT.

NU will clearly identify my name(s) as the author(s) or owner(s) of the submission, and will not make any alteration, other than as allowed by this license, to your submission. I hereby accept the terms of the above Author Agreement.


Author's signature:



Date: 31.05.2024

Declaration

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work, and to the best of my knowledge, it contains no materials previously published or written by another person, or substantial proportions of material which have been submitted for the award of any other course or degree at NU or any other educational institution, except where due acknowledgment is made in the thesis. This thesis is the result of my own independent work, except where otherwise stated, and the views expressed here are my own.

Signed: 

Date: 31.05.2024

Ethical Approval



53 Kabanbay Batyr Ave.
Astana 010000
Republic of Kazakhstan
Date: October 13, 2023

Dear: **Kamilat Zhanerke**

This letter now confirms that your research project titled '**Determinants of Supply for English Private Tutoring: Voices of English Tutors in Kazakhstan**' has been approved by the Graduate School of Education Ethics Committee of Nazarbayev University.

You may proceed with contacting your preferred research site and commencing your participant recruitment strategy.

Yours sincerely,




Syed Abdul Manan

On behalf of:

Dr Syed Abdul Manan, *PhD*
Chair, GSE Ethics Committee
Graduate School of Education
Nazarbayev University

Block C3, Room M027
Office: +7(7172)6016
Mobile: +77079240053
email: syed.manan@nu.edu.kz, gse.irec@nu.edu.kz

CITI Training Certificate

		Completion Date 21-Aug-2023 Expiration Date 21-Aug-2026 Record ID 57691190
This is to certify that:		
Zhanerke Kamilat		
Has completed the following CITI Program course:		
Students conducting no more than minimal risk research (Curriculum Group) Students - Class projects (Course Learner Group) 1 - Basic Course (Stage)		
Under requirements set by:		
Nazarbayev University		
 Collaborative Institutional Training Initiative 101 NE 3rd Avenue, Suite 320 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301 US www.citiprogram.org		
Verify at www.citiprogram.org/verify/?w6911d25b-b21b-4f3f-9fec-2d32cf26cbdf-57691190		

Not valid for renewal of
certification through CME.

Acknowledgments

Michael Scott once said, “Sometimes I’ll start a sentence, and I don’t even know where it’s going. I just hope to find it along the way.” Similarly, starting to write my master's thesis was challenging, but I successfully completed it with consistent hard work and effort.

First and foremost, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. Syed Abdul Manan, for his guidance and insightful feedback throughout my thesis writing journey. I am profoundly thankful to my academic English instructors, Ainur Almukhambetova and Anita Jayachandran, for their support and valuable suggestions that improved my thesis. I would also like to extend my heartfelt thanks to Dr. Anas Hajar, who generously shared literature, articles, and books that were crucial for my study.

On a personal note, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my fiancé Sabit Shaiholla, who endlessly loved and supported me during these two years of the master’s program. Your belief in me and encouragement constantly motivated me during challenging times. I am also thankful to my family for their love, understanding, and patience. Мама, сіздің қолдауыңыз үшін көп рақмет!

Finally, I wish to thank my groupmates for their moral support and for always being there when I needed them. As Andry Bernard said, “I wish there was a way to know that you are in the good old days before you’ve actually left them.” Completing a Multilingual Education program felt like this quote. Thank you.

Abstract

Determinants of Supply for English Private Tutoring: Voices of English Tutors in Kazakhstan

English language proficiency is highly valued in private tutoring (PT), especially for those learning it as a supplementary language. Although the global significance of English Private Tutoring (EPT) is well-known, this industry is still in its early stages of development (Yung & Hajar, 2023). This qualitative study investigated why English tutors are entering Kazakhstan's EPT market. The study explored the factors that influence their decision-making processes, the role of economic considerations, and the specific English skills and competencies that are most in demand in the private tutoring market. The researcher used various data collection tools, including narrative writing and semi-structured interviews. Bray's (2021) theoretical framework was also used to understand the phenomenon of PT from different perspectives - physical, political, economic, cultural, and pedagogical geography. The study found that the participants were motivated to become English tutors due to their flexible working hours, teaching mode, professional development, and passion for teaching. Additionally, the study discovered income disparities among English tutors caused by differing rates. The participants also mentioned the demand for productive skills in the English language, such as speaking and writing, in the private tutoring market. While some participants were willing to pursue a career as an English tutor in the future, others considered it to be a temporary job. When considering future research, it is crucial to explore income inequality among English tutors in Kazakhstan and the impact of emerging technologies like Artificial Intelligence (AI) on their instructional methods.

Keywords: private tutoring (PT), English private tutoring (EPT), English tutors, factors influencing teachers' decisions, English skills, qualitative study

Аңдатпа

Ағылшын тілін жеке оқытуға сұранысты анықтайтын факторлар:

Қазақстандағы ағылшын тілінің репетиторлардың пікірлері

Ағылшын тілін білу жеке репетиторлық салада, әсіресе оны қосымша тіл ретінде үйренетіндер үшін жоғары бағаланады. Ағылшын тілінің жеке репетиторлығының жаһандық маңызы белгілі болғанымен, бұл сала әлі де дамудың бастапқы кезеңінде Юнг және Хаджар (2023). Бұл сапалы зерттеуде ағылшын тілінің оқытушылары неліктен ағылшын тілі бойынша жеке репетиторлық қызметтердің қазақстандық нарығына шығатыны зерттелді. Зерттеу барысында ағылшын тілі мұғалімдерінің шешім қабылдау процесіне әсер ететін факторлар, экономикалық ойлардың рөлі, сондай-ақ жеке репетиторлық қызметтер нарығында ең көп сұранысқа ие ағылшын тілін меңгерудің нақты дағдылары мен құзыреттері зерттелді. Деректерді жинау кезінде зерттеуші әңгіме жазу және жартылай құрылымдалған сұхбаттар сияқты әртүрлі зерттеу құралдарын пайдаланды. Брейдің теориялық базасы (2021) жеке репетиторлық құбылысын әртүрлі көзқарастардан - физикалық, саяси, экономикалық, мәдени және педагогикалық географиядан түсіну үшін де қолданылды. Зерттеу қатысушылардың икемді жұмыс кестесі, оқыту режимі, кәсіби дамуы және оқытуға деген құштарлығы арқылы ағылшын тілінің тәрбиешісі болуға ынталы екенін көрсетті. Сонымен қатар, зерттеу әртүрлі ставкалардан туындаған ағылшын тілінің оқытушылары арасындағы табыс айырмашылығын анықтады. Қатысушылар сонымен қатар жеке репетиторлық қызметтер нарығында ауызша және жазбаша сөйлеу сияқты ағылшын тілін меңгеру дағдыларына сұранысты атап өтті. Кейбір мүшелер болашақта ағылшын тілінің тәрбиешісі ретінде мансабын жалғастыруға дайын болса, басқалары оны уақытша жұмыс

ретінде қарастырды. Болашақ зерттеулерді қарастыру кезінде Қазақстандағы ағылшын тілі оқытушылары арасындағы табыс теңсіздігін және жасанды интеллект сияқты жаңа технологиялардың оларды оқыту әдістеріне әсерін зерттеу өте маңызды.

Түйін сөздер: жеке оқыту, ағылшын тілінің оқытушылары, мұғалімдердің шешімдеріне әсер ететін факторлар, ағылшын тілін білу, сапалы оқыту.

Аннотация

Факторы определяющие спрос на частное обучение английскому языку: мнения репетиторов английского языка в Казахстане

Знание английского языка высоко ценится в сфере частного репетиторства, особенно для тех, кто изучает его в качестве дополнительного языка. Хотя глобальное значение частного репетиторства английского языка хорошо известно, эта отрасль все еще находится на ранней стадии развития Юнг и Хаджар (2023). В этом качественном исследовании изучалось, почему репетиторы английского языка выходят на казахстанский рынок частных репетиторских услуг по английскому языку. В ходе исследования были изучены факторы, влияющие на процесс принятия решений преподавателями английского языка, роль экономических соображений, а также специфические навыки владения английским языком и компетенции, которые наиболее востребованы на рынке частных репетиторских услуг. При сборе данных исследователь использовал различные исследовательские инструменты, такие как написание рассказов и полуструктурированные интервью. Теоретическая база Брея (2021) также была использована для понимания феномена частного репетиторства с разных точек зрения - физической, политической, экономической, культурной и педагогической географии. Исследование показало, что участники были мотивированы стать репетиторами английского языка благодаря гибкому графику работы, режиму преподавания, профессиональному развитию и страсти к преподаванию. Кроме того, исследование выявило разницу в доходах среди репетиторов английского языка, вызванную разными ставками. Участники также отметили спрос на навыки владения английским языком, такие

как устная и письменная речь, на рынке частных репетиторских услуг. В то время как некоторые участники были готовы продолжить карьеру в качестве репетитора английского языка в будущем, другие рассматривали это как временную работу. При рассмотрении будущих исследований крайне важно изучить неравенство в доходах среди преподавателей английского языка в Казахстане и влияние новых технологий, таких как искусственный интеллект (ИИ), на их методы обучения.

Ключевые слова: частное обучение, репетиторы английского языка, факторы, влияющие на решения учителей, знание английского языка, качественное обучение.

Table of Contents

Author Agreement.....	ii
Declaration.....	iii
Ethical Approval	iv
Acknowledgments.....	vi
Abstract.....	vii
Аңдатпа.....	ix
Аннотация.....	xi
Table of Contents	xiii
List of Tables	xvi
Chapter 1. Introduction.....	17
Background Information.....	18
Problem Statement	19
Purpose of the Study.....	20
Research Questions	21
Significance of the Study.....	21
Outline of the Thesis	22
Chapter 2. Literature Review	24
Definitions of Private Tutoring (PT)	24
Modes of Private Tutoring Delivery.....	25
Shadow Education in Post-Soviet Context	28
Students’ Perspectives on PT	30
English Tutors’ Perspectives for PT.....	31
Advantages and Disadvantages of PT	33
Development of PT/ EPT in Kazakhstani Context.....	35
Theoretical Framework.....	37
Summary.....	41
Chapter 3. Methodology	42
Research Design.....	42
Sampling	43
Data Collection Instruments	45
Data Collection Procedures.....	47

Data Analysis	48
Ethical Considerations	51
Summary	52
Chapter 4. Findings	53
Biographical Vignettes of the Research Participants	53
RQ1: Factors that Influence Teachers' Preference for EPT	57
Flexible Working Hours	57
The Possibility for Choosing Students and Setting Rates.....	59
Flexible Teaching Mode	60
Passion for Teaching.....	61
Professional Development	63
RQ2: Role of Economic Factors in Influencing Teachers' Decisions to Work as Private English Tutors	66
High Cost of Living in Big Cities.....	66
Financial Motivation.....	67
Income Disparities.....	69
Return on Investment.....	71
Consumer-driven Demand	72
RQ 3: English Skills in Great Demand in the PT Market?.....	74
Speaking and Listening Skills	75
Speaking and Writing Skills.....	76
Four Main Skills	77
Summary	78
Chapter 5. Discussion.....	80
Physical Geography.....	80
Economic Geography	83
Political Geography	85
Pedagogical Geography	86
Cultural Geography	87
Summary	89
Chapter 6. Conclusion	90
Main Conclusions of the Study	90
Strengths and Limitations	92
Implications for Further Research.....	93
Recommendations and Future Research Directions.....	95
Personal Reflection.....	95
References.....	96

Appendix A – Declaration of the Use of Generative AI	111
Appendix B	112
Appendix C	116
Appendix D.....	119
Appendix E	122
Appendix F.....	128
Appendix G.....	129

List of Tables

Table 1. Demographic Characteristics of the English Tutors45

Chapter 1. Introduction

Kazakhstan has established itself as the leading country in Central Asia through the implementation of a trilingual educational model, in which a wide range of subjects are taught in Kazakh, Russian, and English at secondary schools and universities (Hajar & Mhamed, 2021; Goodman & Abdimanapova, 2020; Karabassova, 2021). These three languages have essential roles. Namely, Kazakh is the designated official language of the state, and Russian is used for communication between different ethnic groups. In contrast, English is used for the country's effective integration into the global economy. Hajar and Mhamed (2021) highlighted that the significance of English as a third language (L3) in Kazakhstan is directed by two presumptions. First, English proficiency is crucial for individuals to obtain economic returns for their labor, and second, it contributes to national economic development as it is widely recognized as a universal lingua franca for international trade. Park (2011) also suggested that English is frequently perceived as crucial for achieving prosperity in contemporary society. It is widely acknowledged as a means of facilitating social integration on a comprehensive level, serving as a medium for progress in both economic and social spheres.

Language plays a crucial role within the framework of neoliberalism, primarily originating from the reconceptualization of language as a commodifiable skill (Park, 2015). Neoliberalism perceives language as a neutral and abstract instrument for communication, capable of transmitting information clearly and unaltered (Park, 2015). Moreover, neoliberalism practices in most education systems worldwide promote the idea that government authority should not be regarded as an exclusive means of funding and

delivering education (Addi-Racciah, 2019). This has led to the commodification of education services and obliged parents to ensure their children's academic achievements (Holloway & Kirby, 2020). Thus, private tutors provide one of the main educational services. Private tutoring (PT) is a paid service that focuses on helping students with academic subjects and is outside of traditional education (Yung & Bray, 2017).

Background Information

Bray and Hajar (2023) state that PT is widely recognized as “shadow education” because it collaborates with formal schooling and imitates the official syllabus and pedagogical approaches. Bray (2021a) highlighted that the urge of neoliberalism, globalization, and social competition impacted the development of PT worldwide. Moreover, researchers globally have been interested in examining the field of PT in Africa (Bray, 2021), Central Asia (Silova, 2009), East Asia (Zhang & Yamato, 2018), Europe (Bray, 2011), North America (Aurini et al., 2013), South America (Lasekan et al., 2019) and the Middle East (Bray & Hajar, 2023) for over a decade.

The global outbreak of COVID-19 in 2020 has led to a significant increase in the provision of online tutoring services, particularly during periods of formal school closure. This trend has been observed by scholars such as Hajar and Karakus (2023a). Various modes of PT are currently being developed, including small group tutoring, individual tutoring, online sessions, and video-recorded lectures. Thus, it is crucial to explore how “shadow education sheds light on fundamental inequalities,” emphasizing online PT and its contemporary modalities such as “Zutors (Zoom tutors), education pods, and micro-schools (Šťastný & Kobakhidze, 2020, p. 10-11).

The PT market has increased in Central Asia because of the low salaries of schoolteachers and the rising demand for enrollment in higher education institutes (Carlsen, 2020). Private tutors are usually hired to teach children during crucial transitions in the traditional educational system. For instance, the study of Hajar and Karakus (2023b) about Kazakhstan illustrated the scale that 75.06% (623 out of 830) of the respondents participated in PT aimed to achieve excellence in the university entrance examinations and to attain state grants at their preferred academic institutions. According to Bray (2021a), PT is “a primary instrument for preserving and increasing social inequalities” because only a few families can cover the expenses of PT or can afford less sufficient supplementary lessons.

Problem Statement

Considering the expansion of English Private Tutoring (EPT) in Kazakhstan, this study explores teachers' motivation to work as private tutors. It probes various factors that drive English tutors toward the career path in the EPT market. Yung and Hajar (2023) emphasized that EPT is in the early stages of its development despite its widespread acceptance and implications for developing future generations, financial expansion, the functioning of the traditional educational system, and social and cultural growth. Thus, EPT results from commodifying and privatizing education in a neoliberal environment where everything is done for profit (Ball, 2012; Verger et al., 2016). Despite the prevalence of EPT within the realm of supplementary education, the scholarly investigation surrounding EPT remains at an early stage (Yung, 2022a, p. 215), with a conspicuous absence of input from educators who deliver EPT. Through a qualitative

analysis, this study aims to investigate the gap in understanding EPT from the viewpoints of self-employed and English tutors employed at private tutoring centers.

According to previous research, certain factors determine the needs of the private tutoring market in Kazakhstan (Kalikova & Rakhimzhanova, 2009). The prevalence and motivations for private supplementary tutoring are significantly influenced by educational factors, namely the number of tasks students must complete at school and the dominance of antiquated teaching techniques (Silova, 2009). The wide acceptance of PT is impacted by various economic factors, especially the earnings disparity between individuals with a strong education foundation and those without adequate educational background (Bray, 2003; Ireson, 2004; Kwan-Terry, 1991). Thus, education is commonly viewed as a form of investment that is highly likely to yield returns, and people tend to invest in it (Psacharopoulos & Patrinos, 2004).

Another prevalent factor contributing to the widespread acceptance of EPT is the substandard English education level, specifically in regions beyond the urban center (Hamid et al., 2018). These factors encompass the importance attributed to quickness, the weight given to high-stakes exams, the expectations of parents, and the educational background of individuals involved (Hajar & Karakus, 2023c).

Purpose of the Study

This study explores the factors that motivate educators to participate in Kazakhstan's English private tutoring sector. It aims to understand the importance of various factors and the influence of economic considerations on teachers' decision to engage as private tutors in Kazakhstan. Additionally, the study seeks to identify the specific English language proficiencies and capabilities highly valued in private tutoring.

Regrettably, precise statistics regarding the amount of private tutoring service providers in Kazakhstan are unavailable. Nevertheless, various studies on the subject of private tutoring in Kazakhstan indicate that there is a growing demand for such services in the country. For instance, in the study of Hajar and Karakus (2023c), the findings revealed that 318 out of 750 (42.4%) participants took English supplementary lessons, and 68% of them received one-on-one EPT services during the global pandemic when personal interactions were restricted. Additionally, Akimenko (2017) suggested that this trend is increasing to supplement traditional forms of education.

Research Questions

To achieve the purpose of this study, the following research questions were developed:

1. What factors influence teachers' preference for English private tutoring in Kazakhstan?
2. What is the role of the economic factor in influencing teachers' decisions to work as English private tutors in Kazakhstan?
3. What English skills are in greater demand in the private market?

Significance of the Study

The current study carries significant importance for various reasons. Firstly, most of the previous research on PT has concentrated on the viewpoints of students and parents. However, this study emphasizes the factors that lead English tutors to opt for private tutoring as an employment option. For instance, the previous research conducted by Hajar, Sagintayeva, and Izenkova (2023) explored that the rate of PT dramatically grew during COVID-19. As a result, it revealed that 75.06% (623 out of 830) participants of this study took fee-charging online supplementary classes during the last 12 months.

Secondly, the study explores factors impacting a teacher's career change from schoolteachers to English private tutors, which is suggested as an under-researched area. Shadow education warrants greater attention, not solely as an autonomous enterprise but also due to its far-reaching impact on mainstream educators and pedagogy (Bray, 2021).

Thirdly, the PT field is not regulated by the government. Silova (2010) argued that "poor legislation, a lack of mechanisms for implementation, and a lack of legal administration" illustrate the PT market in Central Asia. Consequently, most of the PT centers in Central Asia, along with Kazakhstan, are not regulated because the authorities considered that implementing standards for the certification of tutorial centers could suggest that they accept and legitimize their presence (Hajar & Karakus, 2023a).

To sum up, this study may be beneficial and provide direction for educators, policymakers, and educational stakeholders to develop more efficient strategies and support systems for teachers in mainstream schools and impact the development of the PT market in Kazakhstan.

Outline of the Thesis

This thesis is structured into six chapters. The first chapter provides a comprehensive overview of background information relevant to ongoing research and defines this study's research problem and purpose. Moreover, it examined the significance of this study and presented the research questions. The literature review chapter of this study consists of the following sections: definitions of PT, modes of PT delivery, shadow education in a post-Soviet context, students' perspectives on PT, tutors' perspectives on PT, advantages and disadvantages of PT, development of PT / EPT in Kazakhstan, and the theoretical framework.

Chapter three of this thesis presents the research design and describes the sampling procedure, data collection procedures and instruments, data analysis procedures, and ethical considerations. Chapter four presents the main findings of this research, and Chapter five discusses the findings of this study concerning the reviewed literature. Chapter six outlines the significant findings, identifies limitations, explores potential future implications, and provides recommendations for various stakeholders.

Chapter 2. Literature Review

The previous chapter introduced information about private tutoring (PT) and English private tutoring (EPT). Additionally, the research problem, purpose, and research questions, along with the significance of the study, were defined. This chapter is devoted to reviewing the literature relevant to this study about the following topics: definitions of PT, modes of PT delivery, shadow education in a post-Soviet context, students' perspectives on PT, tutors' perspectives on PT, advantages and disadvantages of PT, development of PT / EPT in Kazakhstan, and the theoretical framework.

Definitions of Private Tutoring (PT)

Private tutoring (PT) has emerged as a prevalent global extracurricular language acquisition activity. According to Yung (2019), PT is seen as a “paid service students use to supplement their learning of academic subjects at school outside school hours” (p. 120). The term “shadow education” is widely recognized in comparative education due to its coexistence with mainstream education and its tendency to replicate the curriculum and instructional methods employed in formal education (Bray, 2021a; Yung & Bray, 2021).

The term “shadow education” is a commonly used metaphor in literature worldwide, although the terminology may vary in different contexts. Some volumes of literature rely on ‘private tutoring,’ whereas others utilize contrasting terms. For instance, Stewart (2015) conducted a study in some parts of the Caribbean area that used the term “extra lessons”; in some regions of Southeast Asian nations and Mauritius, Foondun (2002) utilized the term “private tuition.” The terms “coaching” or “after-school tutoring” are frequently used in the American context (Buchmann et al., 2010; Zimmer et al.,

2010), and Bray (2009) has repeatedly used “private supplementary tutoring” for diverse contexts. Some researchers adopted the terms from their first language, “cram schools,” such as *juku* in Japan (Allen, 2016), *hagwon* in South Korea (Kim & Jung, 2021; Lee, 2010), *buxiban* in Taiwan (Chou & Yuan, 2011) and *bou zaap* in Hong Kong (Yung, 2021).

Shadow education has three essential characteristics: privateness, supplementation, and academic subjects (Bray & Yung, 2016). privateness refers to restricting the act of tutoring to solely encompass the services rendered by either individuals or organizations in return for a specified monetary compensation. Thus, it neglects any form of free-of-charge tutoring provided by families, volunteers, and friends and free lessons offered by teachers. Supplementation is a supplementary element to the educational offerings of mainstream schools and is delivered during non-school hours. The literature on shadow education highlights academic subjects in numerous educational systems, encompassing national languages, English, mathematics, and other subjects included in public examinations (Hajar et al., 2023).

Modes of Private Tutoring Delivery

EPT has diverse modalities, including individual lessons, small-group tutoring, and lecture-style tutoring (Yung, 2022a). Moreover, the individual sessions of EPT may be conducted in various venues such as residences, libraries, and coffee shops. Bleistein and Lewis (2015) suggested that due to the absence of a structured curriculum, English tutors can address the learner’s unique requirements and their particular language acquisition objectives during individual lessons. Moreover, English tutors and tutees can engage in face-to-face dialogues in a language being learned. Working with one student,

a tutor can tailor the lessons according to his needs. However, it is hardly attainable in larger groups or classroom tutoring scenarios (Yung & Hajar, 2023). However, the commission of one-to-one private tutoring is significantly higher than group tutoring (Zaylobidinova, 2022).

Small-group tutoring can also be conducted in various settings. The size of groups differs depending on the specific circumstances. For example, in Hong Kong, a small group consists of two to seven people, but if the number of students exceeds it is required to register as a “school” (Yung, 2021). Similarly, small tutoring groups in South Korea generally comprise two to five students (Kim & Jung, 2019). Small-group tutoring provides a platform for students to engage in interpersonal interactions and boost their English skills. Moreover, these students may participate in communicative activities, encouraging more authentic interaction. Additionally, English tutors may develop classroom exercises that facilitate collaborative learning and peer review.

Lecture-style tutoring commonly occurs in a classroom environment. This form of tutoring is referred to as “cramming” or “cram school” and is especially noticeable in the context of Asian countries where formal education is focused on exams (Yung & Hajar, 2023). The studies of Allen (2016) and Yung (2019) have shown that this EPT is commonly focused on exam skills instead of authentic interaction in the English language. Moreover, lecture-style tutoring is usually promoted and taken by famous or star tutors in specific contexts (Stastny, 2017; Yung & Yuan, 2018). The most well-known tutors record their instructional lessons through video recordings and promote their online and video courses (Eng, 2019; Yung, 2022b). Traditional one-to-one tutoring

is still in high demand in various settings; online tutoring has also gained popularity recently.

Zhang and Bray (2020) suggested that over the past few decades, there has been a notable rise in the distribution of online tutoring services. The digital platforms provide advantages to households with the financial means to cover the costs of subscriptions and technological devices, displaying a trend toward urbanization due to the higher prevalence of broadband infrastructure in urban areas (Bray, 2021b). Thus, even though cyberspace is globalized, it still has a differential impact on place and space (Bray, 2021b). Online tutoring may be conducted in tutors' homes through video conferencing platforms across international borders, where students can also receive individual classes in their own homes. Online tutoring provides flexibility and privacy, as students can access recorded versions of tutoring sessions (Yung, 2016).

Technological advances have played a significant role in English language teaching (ELT), encompassing EPT (Yung & Hajar, 2023). Online English tutoring organizations across the globe have access to language teaching, exam preparation, and homework assistance services (Kozar & Sweller, 2014; Ventura & Jang, 2010). At present, the primary mode of online tutoring engagements is conducted via a Learning Management System (Godwin-Jones, 2016). This system is designed to enable tutors to generate and structure educational material, conduct lessons, evaluate their students' progress, and offer feedback. Private tutoring companies may also create digital applications and platforms to instruct English by implementing Artificial Intelligence (AI) technologies. Thus, due to the constant development of modern technologies, the online English tutoring market may significantly improve the level of EPT and offer

English learners more personalized opportunities to develop their linguistic proficiency (Yung & Hajar, 2023).

Shadow Education in Post-Soviet Context

In the Central Asian nations, namely Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan, there was a notable departure of educational staff from schools to the private sector following the disintegration of the previous socialist alliance in 1991. Consequently, the economic downturn resulted in these governments allocating less than 3% of their Gross Domestic Product (GDP) toward the education sector (Silova, 2010). English proficiency is limited to a small percentage of the population residing in Central Asia (Hajar, 2023). For example, the outcomes of a standardized English language assessment, which concentrated on listening and reading proficiencies, administered by the Common European Framework of Reference (CEFR) on 2.2 million non-native adult English speakers from 112 countries were analyzed (EF English Proficiency Index, 2021). The research revealed that students in four of the five Central Asian nations (Turkmenistan being the exception) exhibited deficient levels of English proficiency. Uzbekistan occupied the 88th position, Kazakhstan the 96th, Kyrgyzstan the 101st, and Tajikistan the 103rd in the rankings. Yilamu's (2018) findings could potentially be ascribed to the impact of the governance of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (USSR), which prioritized the promotion of the Russian language, whereas "English was by and large absent from domestic public life" and its utilization was primarily limited to "some state-organized, narrow professional circles," namely diplomacy, foreign affairs, foreign trade, and international tourism. (p.134).

Due to the results of these consequences, PT emerged as a prevailing approach for numerous households to address deficiencies in education and offered supplementary earnings to educators who were receiving wages below the national mean income (Silova, 2010). Moreover, PT has become extremely popular in Central Asia because of the implemented central testing system, meager official salaries, and competition for admission to prestigious educational institutions (Carlsen, 2020). Hajar et al. (2023) suggested that hiring private tutors in families predominantly occurs when children encounter critical assessments that dictate their forthcoming educational and professional prospects.

The demand for private tutoring in Central Asia is driven mainly by schoolteachers who give private tutoring services and refer other teachers' tutoring services to their students. PT is regarded as a type of entrepreneurship, and teachers are neither constrained nor obligated to pay taxes for tutoring services. Therefore, the results obtained from Khaydarov (2020) revealed that most students were tutored in large groups (65%) and small groups (63%), but individual tutoring (only 17% of participants) was significantly less prevalent. Similar to Kazakhstan, shadow education in Uzbekistan still does not adhere to any official regulations regulating teachers' involvement in the PT market (Khaydarov, 2020). This jurisdiction is characterized as a *laissez-faire* approach, by which solely teachers and students are responsible for decision-making regarding PT, as the school and educational authorities do not have any policies (Bray & Kwo, 2014).

The most notable shift is from secondary school to tertiary institutions. According to Silova (et al., 2006), most students surveyed, 59.1 percent, reported receiving some

form of supplementary private tutoring during their final year of secondary school. The extent of private tutoring varied across different countries. In Kazakhstan, 64.8 percent of surveyed students received tutoring, while in Tajikistan, 60.0 percent, and Kyrgyzstan, 52.5 percent. It is important to note that the overall level of private tutoring in Central Asia is lower than in the Caucasus region, where over 80 percent of students in Azerbaijan and Georgia received tutoring. However, private tutoring in Central Asia exceeds that of Southeast and Central Europe, where less than 60 percent of sampled students in Bosnia, Herzegovina, Croatia, and Slovakia received tutoring.

Students' Perspectives on PT

Bray (2021a) argued that the primary motivation for students to participate in PT classes is their pursuit of academic excellence rather than simply keeping up with the pace of their classes. Khaydarov (2020) revealed that most Uzbek students (97%) received private tutoring to prepare themselves for national entrance examinations. Mainly, students received guidance in two or three academic subjects, as these exams depend on a combination of three subjects. This proposes that students primarily engage in PT to enhance their knowledge and skills (Bray, 2006; Bray & Kobakhidze, 2014; Silova, 2009b) to cope with high-stakes examinations effectively. In a recent investigation conducted by Hajar and Karakus (2023b) involving 952 Kazakhstani students and their PT experiences during the COVID-19 pandemic, the researchers discovered that 55% of the participants allocated 21,000–40,000 tenge (equivalent to US\$47–90) per month for PT, viewing it as a genuine lifeline for students amidst the challenges posed by the pandemic. This was due to the limited preparedness of schoolteachers in delivering online instruction during this global health crisis.

Additionally, numerous respondents highlighted the role of PT in securing state grants for admission into highly selective Kazakhstani universities, which often have high tuition fees.

Globally, English is perceived as one of the most frequently selected subjects for enrollment in the private tutoring market, encompassing both native English speakers and those who learn English as an additional language (EAL) (Yung & Hajar, 2023). However, despite the broader acceptance of research in English private tutoring (EPT) theories, practices, and procedures, it is “still in its infancy” (Yung, 2020, p.883). EPT is considered more significant and valuable than traditional schooling (Yung & Hajar, 2023). Hajar (2023) surveyed 637 students who studied in grade 6 (ages 11-12) at mainstream schools in Astana, and the findings revealed that 52.75% of students were taking supplementary English lessons.

English Tutors’ Perspectives for PT

Bray (2021b) suggested that private tutors’ services are often rendered by part-time and full-time staff employed by commercial organizations. Part-time tutors frequently include active schoolteachers, while full-time tutors commonly consist of former schoolteachers. In addition, both current and retired educators can provide private supplementary instruction autonomously, without any association with corporate entities. Around the globe, a substantial portion of this tutoring service is rendered by mainstream educators seeking additional income (Bray, 2021b). Moreover, individuals who offer tutoring services can include university students, retired individuals, and other non-formal workers.

According to Bray (2021a), two dimensions of indistinct professional boundaries can be discerned. As the blurred professional boundaries title indicates, the first dimension refers to the professional limits that are not clearly defined. The second dimension pertains to the task performed by tutors who are not part of the mainstream teaching profession. Consequently, there exists a separation between instructors referred to as tutors and another group labeled as teachers. Nonetheless, instructors also assume the duty of tutoring by guiding and facilitating the learning process; moreover, in other languages, the differentiation between instructors and educators is not formulated in the same manner as in English. Thus, Bray's (2021a) study highlights ambiguities and role overlaps.

For instance, English tutors in Sweden are seen as the 'face' of companies (Hallsen & Karlsson, 2019). In contrast, in Hong Kong, they are presented as "exam expert star teachers" (Yung & Yuan, 2018, p.5) who are meeting the demands and needs of the market that are crucial for modern-day business practices. The tutors justified their approval of students' engagement in PT by perceiving it as more advantageous in assisting low-achieving students or considering it essential for students' academic success. Khaydarov's (2020) study suggested that none of the teachers mentioned any negative aspects of PT, and they were inclined to support PT, as they provided tutoring services as well. However, some teachers demonstrated empathy towards students due to the escalating competition and complexity of exams. Interestingly, the teachers also indicated that parents would encourage their children to receive PT.

Advantages and Disadvantages of PT

In many education systems across the globe, the primary motivation for the need for private tutoring (PT) is rooted in social competition. This motivation is driven by the aspiration to receive exceptional scores in examinations during the transition of education from school to university, as highlighted by Bray and Hajar (2023). A few studies have observed that PT can be a compensatory social factor (Kim & Jung, 2019, p.32). Guill and Bonsen (2011) documented substantial positive impacts of PT on the academic achievement of students in Germany. This research uncovered that pupils from lower-income households were given more PT than those from higher-income families. Kim's (2016) research in South Korea elucidated the potential of PT to alleviate educational inequality. Providing personalized assistance to disadvantaged students during PT sessions at affordable costs mitigated the disparity in educational outcomes.

In Central Asia, Silova (2009) highlighted that many students preferred receiving private tuition (PT) from their schoolteachers. However, it is essential to note that this practice may be linked to the unethical utilization of PT, whereby schoolteachers exert pressure on their students to attend PT sessions for which fees are charged, taking place outside of regular school hours. In addition, there have been concerns about the unfair treatment in the educational setting between students chosen for PT and those not (Hajar et al., 2022). Tutors exhibited a positive attitude towards PT practices, expressed satisfaction with students benefiting from PT services, and did not express concerns regarding their students seeking PT (Khaydarov, 2020).

In a recent investigation conducted by Hajar and Karakus (2023a), a comprehensive examination of 952 students from Kazakhstan was carried out to explore their experiences with private tutoring (PT) during the COVID-19 pandemic. The

findings of this study indicated that a significant portion, precisely 55%, of the respondents allocated a monthly budget of 21,000–40,000 tenge (equivalent to US\$47–90) for PT. This financial commitment was perceived as a “genuine salvation” for students during the pandemic due to the limited preparedness of schoolteachers to deliver online instruction. Furthermore, the study revealed that PT was crucial in assisting students in securing state grants to prestigious Kazakhstani universities, which impose substantial tuition fees.

Consequently, for most participants, PT proved to be a more accessible option than bearing the burden of university expenses (Hajar & Karakus, 2023a). Drawing upon the work of Kim and Yung (2021), it is argued that providing PT vouchers by certain governments, such as Australia and Japan, for students who demonstrate slower progress in academic subjects is indicative of a strategy to mitigate educational inequality. This approach implies that PT possesses the potential to reduce disparities in educational achievement.

However, Bray and Kwo (2014) studied the various dimensions of social inequity, including socio-economic, gender, racial/ethnic, and rural/urban aspects, concerning shadow education. Affluent families with significantly more earnings may invest in PT and receive an education at a more prestigious level than families with smaller incomes. Therefore, children from disadvantaged families with an eagerness to learn cannot access private tutoring classes due to socioeconomic inequality. Bray et al. (2011) and Bray et al. (2014) suggest that children in larger cities receive more and better-quality private tutoring. However, those in rural locations cannot manage to attend even the most basic forms of tutoring.

In certain countries, shadow education provokes gender inequities, too. For instance, Zaylobidinova's (2019) investigation revealed that in Uzbekistan, more girls attend private tutoring classes as they must study diligently to achieve high scores on entrance exams for higher education institutions. Therefore, men who have completed military service receive a 50% additional point boost to their total score in the entrance examination, significantly increasing their scores (Zaylobidinova, 2019). Additionally, certain nations, namely Cambodia's government, cannot restrict PT due to a failure to provide schoolteachers with an advantageous salary. Thus, they must acquire a second job as a private tutor to sustain themselves (Bray et al., 2015; Chandara, 2011).

Development of PT/ EPT in Kazakhstani Context

Supplementary education in key school disciplines supported by parents and carried out beyond official school hours has become a prevalent phenomenon since early twenty-first century (Zhang & Bray, 2020). The private tutoring market in Kazakhstan offers diverse educational services that cover various levels of education. In preschool education, private tutoring prepares children to transition into elementary school. Likewise, at the basic education level, private tutoring serves as a means of remediation or enhancing students' academic competitiveness (Kalikova & Rakhimzhanova, 2009). Moving on to the realm of high school education, private tutoring is utilized by students aiming to enhance their academic performance in tests and examinations (Kalikova & Rakhimzhanova, 2009). Furthermore, there is a high demand for private tutoring among high school graduates who seek to prepare themselves for gaining admission into higher education institutions that are increasingly competitive (Kalikova & Rakhimzhanova, 2009).

Hajar and Abenova (2021) conducted an empirical investigation into private tutoring (PT) in Kazakhstan, focusing on fee-based PT sessions attended by first-year students at Kazakhstani universities two years prior to entering university. This investigation revealed that nearly 60% of the individuals, specifically 86 out of 144, had undergone PT, suggesting that a majority of students, or three-fifths, had successfully obtained admission to their university following PT. Fifty percent of the participants engaged in PT sessions in a group setting, while a mere 5 out of 86 participants (7%) opted for virtual PT sessions. This low percentage can be attributed to the data collection timeframe between 2018 and 2019, predating the global emergence of the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020.

Despite the prevalence of low proficiency in the English language across Central Asia, there has been a noticeable surge in the significance of English, particularly in Kazakhstan (Hajar, 2023). According to Reagan (2019), this trend can be attributed to “the neoliberal agenda of government as it seeks to become a player in the global economic community” (p. 448). Kazakhstan has taken the lead in Central Asia by pioneering the implementation of a trilingual education policy, which entails the instruction of various subjects in Kazakh, Russian, and English within secondary schools and higher education institutions (Ahn & Smagulova, 2021). Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools (NISs) are the primary location for evaluating Kazakhstan’s trilingual educational framework. Shamshidinova et al. (2014) suggested that encompassing Kazakh, Russian, and English languages guarantees “the transformation of Kazakhstan into a country with competitive human capital” (p. 72). Language is essential in creating neoliberal subjects and serves as a good product with market value or a necessary skill to

develop human capital (Cameron, 2000; Heller 2010, 2011). Therefore, NISs utilize English Medium of Instruction (EMI) to teach STEM subjects and collaborate with international universities such as Cambridge University (UK) and the University of Pennsylvania (USA).

Theoretical Framework

According to Bray (2021b), shadow education exhibits unique dynamics compared to formal schooling, mainly focusing on the primary and lower-secondary educational stages. Two significant factors contributing to the distinct dynamics are shadow education's non-mandatory nature and its provision by private entities instead of public institutions. This study is guided by Bray's (2021b) theoretical framework, which examines the phenomenon of PT through the lenses of physical, political, economic, pedagogical, and cultural geography.

To start with, the physical geography lens plays an essential role in shaping the delivery of education by determining the accessibility of educational opportunities (Bray, 2021b). The PT market is primarily controlled by entrepreneurs and informal providers interested in providing services in various modes to wealthy and middle-class families residing in crowded cities and students at significant transition points in their education for financial gain (Bray, 2021b). However, households in barely populated regions spanning various income levels benefit from services tailored for densely populated areas. An example of this is the internet-based mode. The study by Zhang and Bray (2021) in China demonstrated that large-scale tutoring companies utilized online platforms to enable tutors based in one location to engage with students across various locations simultaneously. Online tutoring eliminates the need for tutors to be located near

their workplace, making it easier for tutoring companies to recruit staff. Therefore, the tutoring sector has surpassed previous imitative models and established a distinctive operational framework (Bray, 2021b).

Political geography encompasses policymakers' responses, particularly those at different levels of government, to the expansion of PT (Bray, 2021b). In his theoretical framework, Bray (2021b) proposes that political geography indicates a notable impact of political elements on portraying national, subnational, and supranational boundaries. The characteristics and configurations of shadow education manifest the national and subnational education systems, albeit with reduced formalization and oversight. Zhang (2019) suggested that certain governments have implemented stringent regulatory measures regarding private supplementary tutoring, emphasizing its alignment with formal schooling to varying degrees. Meanwhile, Robertson and Dale (2016) provided insights at the supranational level regarding the implications of neoliberalism "as a global political endeavor" (p.33).

However, there is a shift in trends as alternative education providers increasingly establish their presence. The study of Zhang and Bray (2020) revealed that in Japan, certain prominent providers of supplementary education are presently engaging in partnerships with the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) to operate in underdeveloped nations, while similar organizations in other regions are actively participating in discussions led by UNESCO regarding education in an evolving global context. To the extent that the proliferation of market-oriented educational structures on a worldwide scale aligns with the domestic political approval of neoliberal ideologies, it

represents a sphere where the discipline of political geography intersects with that of economic geography (Bray, 2021b).

Economic geography addresses the cost of PT in terms of equity (Bray, 2021b). The study by Šťastný (2017) mapped the provision of tutoring services and associated pricing across various regions within the Czech Republic. His analysis revealed a notable prevalence of higher supply levels and prices in urban areas and their suburbs. Bray (2021b) also suggested that economic geography manifests in the tutoring providers' advertising. Tutorial companies vary in size, with the bigger ones standing out for their bold advertising in bustling areas and on public transportation. Clients often use the services for a brief period leading up to their secondary school exams, while the companies aim to attract large groups of students for their classes (Bray, 2021b). Large shadow education companies primarily target upper-working, lower-middle, and potentially middle-class families, consequently prioritizing locations where these groups gather (Bray, 2021b). Moreover, Bray (2021b) emphasized that tutorial centers can be found in residential areas, shopping centers, and convenient locations for public transportation access.

Bray (2021b) suggested that geographical lenses often reflect the socioeconomic disparities of various family classes, with each class residing in specific regions and suburbs. This demonstrated that economic disparities reflected spatially, highlighting the intersection of economics and cultures, including class, race, and ethnicity. Cultural geography posits the provision of shadow education varies across cultural groups due to its voluntary nature, resulting in diverse availability. Moreover, collecting groups in particular geographical regions frequently shapes this disparity (Bray, 2021b). Shadow

education, commonly associated with Confucian cultures, has been prevalent in East Asia for a significant period, as highlighted in various studies (Chou, 2014; Kim, 2016). The study by Ho (2017) in Australia analyzed the highly focused education strategies and additional resources within the Chinese migrant community, contrasting them with the more conventional and laid-back methods observed among white Australian individuals. This is a broad observation related to the cultural geography of the region, and when families with Confucian heritage cultures relocate, similar observations are made in other countries.

According to Bray (2021b), pedagogical geography pertains to the specific locations within formal educational settings where additional instruction is offered, with a wide range of options available for tutoring outside of traditional classrooms. Brehm (2021b) noted that the dynamics of PT exhibit notable distinctions from those observed in mainstream schools. Bray (2021b) suggested that private tutorial spaces within specific academic institutions play a crucial role in enhancing the quality of tutoring sessions by minimizing distractions and limiting student social interactions. Conversely, smaller classes may mirror the size of those commonly seen in secondary schools. They could be situated in purpose-built facilities or adapted spaces that convey implicit messages about the hidden curriculum (Bray, 2021b). Furthermore, the instructional methods employed in the shadow education class showed notably more tolerance. Upon inquiry regarding this matter, the teacher highlighted that students made financial investments in shadow education and possessed the autonomy to decide on their attendance (Bray, 2021b).

Summary

Overall, the literature review chapter revealed the definitions and modes of PT/EPT and provided a broad understanding of PT worldwide. Specifically, the section on the advantages and disadvantages of PT demonstrated that PT may positively and negatively influence the education system beliefs of tutors and students. Furthermore, the section about the development of PT in Kazakhstan showed the growth of the PT market and highlighted the studies conducted in the last decade. Finally, it also elaborated the main theoretical concepts of Bray's (2021b) understanding of PT through physical, political, economic, cultural, and pedagogical lenses.

Chapter 3. Methodology

The previous chapter reviewed the literature on the scale and nature of private tutoring (PT) in Central Asia, specifically focusing on English private tutoring (EPT). The literature review chapter highlighted the perspectives of students and tutors of PT/EPT classes, the advantages and disadvantages of PT, the development of PT/ EPT in Kazakhstan, and Bray's (2021b) theoretical framework of understanding PT through physical, political, economic, cultural, and pedagogical lenses. The methodology chapter outlines the data collection process.

To achieve the aims of this study, the following research questions needed to be answered:

1. What factors influence teachers' preference for English private tutoring in Kazakhstan?
2. What is the role of the economic factor in influencing teachers' decisions to work as English private tutors in Kazakhstan?
3. What English skills are in greater demand in the private market?

The methodology chapter presents the research design as well as the reasons for using a narrative study. It clarifies the methodologies of data collection instruments, such as narrative writing and semi-structured interviews. This chapter will also outline data collection procedures, data analysis, and ethical considerations.

Research Design

This section elaborates on the research design applied in the present study and justifies its selected research methodologies. This study uses qualitative research to analyze factors influencing English tutors' decision to work in the EPT market in

Kazakhstan. According to Denzin and Lincoln (2018), qualitative study entails an informative and naturalistic perspective toward the world. Therefore, qualitative studies analyze the phenomena by exploring the significance that individuals attribute to them. Moreover, qualitative research utilizes various empirical materials, namely life stories, interviews, artifacts, personal experiences, and case studies that illustrate “meanings in individual’s lives” (Denzin & Lincoln, 2018).

As previously emphasized, this study leverages qualitative research, specifically narrative research. As Johnson and Christensen (2019) clarified, narrative studies are unique in that they involve individuals recounting personal biographies of their lived experiences, which scholars then scrutinize using relational approaches. Narrative studies investigate institutional, social, cultural, familial, and linguistic narratives that are intricately woven into each participant’s experiences and ultimately shape the individual’s lived experiences (Johnson & Christensen, 2019).

The narrative study was selected for this study for two reasons. The narrative study is most suitable here because English tutors share personal information regarding their choice of English tutors. Another reason is the study’s use of personal interviews to analyze teachers' experiences (Creswell, 2013).

Sampling

Since this study is mainly focused on English tutors and some of the participants were known to the researcher, multiple sampling strategies were utilized, namely convenience and purposive. Convenience sampling, also known as accidental or opportunity sampling, was chosen to recruit the participants of this study. This sampling necessitates selecting nearby individuals to act as participants, and the process continues

until the desired sample size is obtained from those who are available and accessible at the time. The researchers selected the sample from those to whom she had easy access. Since convenience sampling does not represent any group other than itself, it does not aim to generalize to the broader population (Cohen, 2018).

Meanwhile, purposive sampling was also used for selecting the participants as it is typically employed to include individuals who possess substantial knowledge, namely, those who possess an in-depth understanding of specific matters, potentially due to their professional position, authority, network connections, expertise, or personal experiences (Ball, 1990). The purposeful sampling criteria for this study are: 1) English tutors with at least three years of teaching experience and 2) English tutors who work in educational centers or are self-employed in Almaty or Astana. Moreover, this sampling is useful for various types of research to attain representatives, facilitating comparisons and intentions toward specific and distinctive issues or cases (Teddile & Yu, 2007). Using the above methods, this study recruited seven English tutors from the two main cities of Kazakhstan, namely Almaty and Astana. All the participants were female and were recruited through a popular online community for English tutors called “Scholarium,” which operates on the instant messaging app Telegram. The participants were given pseudonyms, and their information is provided in the table below.

Table 1*Demographic Characteristics of the English Tutors*

Name	Age	Gender	Work experience	Region
Nadezhda	31	Female	9 years	Almaty
Zhanar	24	Female	4 years	Astana
Dina	25	Female	7 years	Almaty
Altynai	26	Female	5 years	Almaty
Kalamkas	39	Female	10 years	Almaty region
Aizere	30	Female	3 years	Almaty
Balzhan	25	Female	4 years	Almaty

Data Collection Instruments

Creswell (2013) describes data collection as gathering detailed data to address the study's research questions. The data collection methods used in this study include narrative writing and semi-structured interviews. Narrative writing encompasses more than just individual experiences, and it also includes societal, cultural, and institutional narratives that shape, influence, express, and bring about these experiences (Clandinin & Connelly, 2004). The present study employs narrative writing as the primary data collection tool, owing to its ability to provide rich and in-depth insights into the backgrounds, experiences, motivations, and challenges encountered by English tutors (Appendix B). These narratives served as the essential data source, and participants could

provide them in various forms, such as written essays, audio recordings, and digital documents. To ensure inclusivity and respect for participants' linguistic preferences, the researcher provided an option for participants to choose their desired language for their narratives, which included Kazakh, Russian, and English. To facilitate this, the narrative questions were made available in all three languages (Appendix B).

The second data collection tool is the semi-structured interviews. This data collection tool was chosen as semi-structured interviews encompass benefits of both structured and unstructured types, specifically the inclusion of prearranged questions and the allowance for adaptability (Dörnyei, 2007; Clarke & Braun, 2006). The researcher intended to empower the interviewees to facilitate the sharing of their perspectives on EPT and obtain valuable information from their personal experiences in providing EPT was achieved through the utilization of the semi-structured interview format (Appendix B). This format enabled the avoidance of predefined categories, which may have constrained the richness and comprehensiveness of the interviewees' narratives (Dörnyei, 2007, p. 136). According to Cohen (2018), the order and phrasing of questions in semi-structured interviews may be modified to participants' responses based on prompts and probes. Thus, a researcher can reduce the questions that may be sensitive to participants and add more relevant interview questions. The semi-structured interview questions in this study addressed the influence of various factors on English tutors' decisions to work in the EPT field and the demand for specific English skills. The study participants were interviewed in one of the desired languages (English, Russian, Kazakh) based on their linguistic preferences so that they could express their thoughts openly and with assurance.

Data Collection Procedures

The data collection began in mid-November after receiving approval from the GSE Ethics Committee. This process took around four weeks. A supervisor reviewed the narrative writing questions, and after receiving written narratives from participants, the supervisor reviewed semi-structured interview questions. Upon ethics approval, the participants received a recruitment message, were invited to participate in the study, and were provided with detailed information about the purpose and procedures involved. Furthermore, the informed consent was sent by email to the participants of this study, who then signed it.

The informed consent provided information about the purpose of the study, the degree of confidentiality, the specific requirements from the participants, and potential risks associated with the research procedure for the individuals involved in this study (Dörnyei, 2007). According to Cohen (2018), the prominent concern of informed consent is autonomy, which became apparent from participants' rights to self-determination and freedom. Once the consent forms were signed, the participants were sent narrative writing questions (Appendix B) and had one week to complete. After collecting the narratives from the English tutors, the data was used to create semi-structured interview questions. Analyzing narratives and making semi-structured interviews required two weeks. Subsequently, the participants of this study, English tutors from Almaty and Astana, were interviewed online through the Zoom platform. This platform was selected for its ease of use and accessibility to participants and the researcher. The participants were given step-by-step instructions on joining the Zoom sessions and assistance in case of any technical difficulties. According to Cohen (2018), the digital environment maintains the structures that impact how individuals work and live. Therefore, social media platforms provide

opportunities to bypass conventional power dynamics and enhance the probability that individuals will feel a sense of liberation when expressing themselves. The duration of each interview was around 40 to 60 minutes. Meeting times were arranged to accommodate the participants' schedules, and I requested their permission to record the online interviews. However, I took notes during the interview if they declined the request to be recorded.

Data Analysis

The researcher utilized Braun and Clarke's (2006) thematic analysis (TA) model, which consists of six phases. Thematic analysis (TA) is a method that is employed to recognize, identify, and analyze patterns of significance (commonly known as 'themes') in qualitative data (p.1). Braun and Clarke (2006) suggested that TA offers accessible and structured methodologies for producing codes and themes from qualitative data. Consequently, TA was employed in this study due to its distinguishing feature, which lies in adaptability, not solely theoretical adaptability, but regarding research questions, data collection method, sample size, and approaches to generating meaning. TA can be employed to classify patterns within and across data about participants' lived experiences, viewpoints and perspectives, actions, and practices.

Therefore, following Braun and Clarke's (2006) approach to thematic analysis, the dataset utilized in this study was examined based on the following six sequential phases:

1. At the initial data analysis stage, I familiarized myself with the data collected during the data collection process. Since it is essential to engage and "immerse" myself in the data to comprehend the profound and extensive nature of the

- material, “repeated reading” of the transcribed data was necessary to see patterns, meanings, and other relevant aspects (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Thus, to accomplish this aim, I transcribed the interviews conducted with the participants of this study into a digital document (Appendix F). By reading the personal narrative writing pieces that had been collected and analyzing the transcriptions from interviews, I took note of continuing patterns that were apparent within the entire data set.
2. The next stage consisted of producing preliminary codes. After familiarizing myself with the data, I proceeded to a methodological examination of the data via inductive coding. In this stage, the coding process encompassed an analytical reading and the classification of data fragments that adhered to this study's questions. At this point, examining each piece of data carefully and repeatedly to pinpoint and organize the data relevant to the research questions was crucial.
 3. The following step includes transitioning from codes to themes for every crucial data fragment. Themes serve as a foundational structure for organizing and revealing my research findings. Braun and Clarke’s (2006) suggestions to identify themes or patterns within data were followed. They suggest either an inductive or “bottom-up” manner (Frith & Gleeson, 2004) or a theoretical or deductive or “top-down” manner (Boyatzis, 1998; Hayes, 1997). I utilized the inductive approach, implying that the identified themes are closely associated with the data (Patton, 1990).
 4. The next step involved evaluating the potential themes.

5. During this phase, it was crucial to identify and assign themes that aligned with the study's research questions. As a result, I carefully examined the themes for their consistency, focus, and relevance to the three research queries.
6. In the final stage of the TA process, I created a detailed report summarizing this study's results. At this point, I ensured the report accurately reflected the data analysis, providing a thorough evaluation relevant to this study's focus and theoretical framework.

Table 2*Sample of Coding*

Interview transcripts	Inductive codes	Themes based on codes	Main themes
“ <u>I am flexible</u> and that’s why <u>I can take on so many other projects to try myself</u> ”.	Flexibility	Flexible work hours	Factors driving the decision to be an English tutor
“ <u>Freedom of choice in making my own timetable and deciding what materials</u> to use, making more money, all that probably motivated me the most”.	Freedom of choice	The possibility to choose students and set rates	Factors driving the decision to be an English tutor
“I can cancel if I’m sick or I can reschedule the lesson.	Comfortable job	Flexible teaching mode	Factors driving the decision to be an English tutor

That is, a very
comfortable, comfortable
job. You don't have to go
anywhere. You are sitting
at home and drinking
tea".

Ethical Considerations

Ethical considerations are inherent in narrative study, from initiating one's narrative to managing interpersonal dynamics and disseminating research findings through written texts (Clandinin & Connelly, 2004). Regarding narrative writing, the participants were advised adequately that their written work would not be evaluated as correct or incorrect about their expressions of EPT (Cohen et al., 2007; Creswell, 2013). In the case of semi-structured interviews, participants were provided with consent documents before the interview. These documents contained important information about the study's goals, the expected interview length, the procedures for managing data, and the participant's right to withdraw from the research or answer inappropriate questions without facing any negative consequences (Roberts & Priest, 2010). By ensuring the participants' anonymity, the researcher ensured that there was no potential harm or minimal risk to their professional and personal lives (Clarke & Braun, 2006).

Throughout the study, the privacy of the research participants was ensured. To maintain their confidentiality during the data collection, analysis, and report writing, pseudonyms were assigned to all individuals involved in the research. Additionally, to protect participants' confidentiality, only the researcher was given access to the audio recordings of the Zoom meetings, which were saved on a personal computer. The

research findings and conclusions were thoroughly reviewed to eliminate any information that could reveal the participants' identities (Dörnyei, 2007). As a result, the study's findings did not include any explicit or comprehensive data that could be used to identify the English tutors.

Summary

This chapter demonstrated the methodology utilized in this study by elaborating on the research design, sampling, data collection tools, procedures, subsequent data analysis, and ethical considerations. The participants of this study, seven English tutors, were recruited through multiple sampling methods, such as convenience and purposive. The methodology employed in this study included narrative writing and individual semi-structured interviews to facilitate the data collection process. The next chapter will demonstrate the main findings of this study.

Chapter 4. Findings

This chapter presents the key findings from the data obtained from the narrative writings collected from seven English tutors and semi-structured interviews conducted with the same English tutors to examine the factors influencing English tutors' decisions to work in a private tutoring market. Three research questions guided the collected data and data analysis:

1. What factors influence teachers' preference for English private tutoring in Kazakhstan?
2. What is the role of economic factors in influencing teachers' decisions to work as private tutors?
3. What English skills are in greater demand in the private tutoring market?

Therefore, the current chapter provides an analytical account of the examined results, which were analyzed following Braun and Clarke's (2006) six-phase thematic analysis framework, as previously outlined in Chapter 3.

Biographical Vignettes of the Research Participants

The English tutors involved in this study are Nadezhda, Zhanar, Dina, Aizere, Altynai, Zarina, and Balzhan, all of whom are Kazakhstani citizens. Five English tutors presently reside in Almaty, one in the region of Almaty, and one participant is from Astana. All the English tutors conduct their lessons online through online meeting apps such as Zoom due to the convenience of conducting English lessons from home. This chapter provides the background information about the participants based on their narrative writings and individual semi-structured interviews conducted.

Nadezhda

Nadezhda holds a bachelor's degree in pedagogy. She is a highly experienced English teacher and IELTS tutor with nine years of teaching experience in various educational institutions, including state schools, private institutes, and universities. She is currently on maternity leave and focuses primarily on IELTS test preparation, dedicating 20 hours weekly to teaching. In addition to teaching, Nadezhda is involved in several non-paid projects. She works as a translator at her in-law's firm. She serves as a partnership coordinator for the Kazakhstani Association of English Language Teachers, a community supporting private tutors. Nadezhda believes that private tutors often feel isolated and that being part of a community can help them grow and improve in their field. She also emphasizes the importance of Continuous Professional Development (CPD) in the private tutoring industry.

Zhanar

Zhanar attended EMI secondary school but did not take private English lessons to learn English. She chose not to work as an English private tutor because she believed it would create a gap between students based on socioeconomic status. Despite this, Zhanar has a bachelor's degree in pedagogy and has worked as an English tutor for four years. Currently, she teaches teenagers and adults at an educational center. Zhanar decided to become a private tutor to start her career and enhance her CV while studying at a pedagogical university. She mentioned that studying at the pedagogical faculty was not challenging enough, so she opted to work.

Dina

Dina has a bachelor's degree in pedagogy and has worked as a private tutor for seven years. She started her career as a tutor during her third year of study and used to work at an educational center but was not officially registered as she was still a student. She was unhappy with the center's pay and working conditions. Thus, she transitioned to self-employment and started advertising herself as an English tutor on Instagram to find students. She has been self-employed for one year and five months, teaching 15 hours weekly. She finds teaching online and being self-employed more convenient and enjoyable. She has also named herself "Teach Savvy" due to her extensive knowledge of various platforms and websites and her effective use of technology while teaching English online.

Altynai

Altynai holds a bachelor's degree in pedagogy and has worked as a private tutor for five years. She was initially hired to teach children and teenagers at an educational center, but she worked there for only a few months since the center did not fulfill the contract terms and kept delaying payment. After quitting this job, she was hired by another educational center in the fourth year of her studies in the fall of 2019. Altynai worked there for two years. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, educational centers had to switch to an online format, and she had to learn how to work with computer tools. As a result, these skills enabled Altynai to work independently. Since 2021, she has become a freelance tutor and has been self-employed. She advertises herself through Instagram and finds new students through social media and parent recommendations. Altynai emphasized that private tutoring is her primary source of income and does not consider it

a “temporary job.” She also mentioned that Kazakhstani society does not consider private tutoring a “serious job.”

Kalamkas

Kalamkas has a bachelor’s degree in journalism. She stumbled upon the English private tutoring market when her friend asked her to conduct English lessons for her son. At first, Kalamkas refused the offer since she had no experience in teaching. However, her friend insisted that she provide tutoring services. In 2013, Kalamkas started her career path as a private tutor. Her first student showed excellent results, and she is still proud of him. However, Kalamkas feels that she is less qualified than other private tutors due to the absence of a pedagogical degree. Despite this, she advertises her services through social media, specifically Instagram. Currently, she teaches only one student online due to a shortage of time between caring for her children and doing household jobs. She currently lives with her family in the countryside.

Aizere

Aizere is a passionate and dedicated individual with a bachelor’s degree in regional studies. Despite her academic background, English has always been essential to her life. She started learning the language very young and has been fond of it ever since. Aizere is also a talented musician and used to be the lead singer in a well-known band. Her band produced several hit songs and music videos. However, she explored other career paths when she faced financial challenges and needed to pay off her debts and loans. That’s when she stumbled upon private tutoring. Initially, Aizere took up the job of teaching general English to students of all ages at an educational center. However, she

found a deep passion for teaching over time and decided to pursue it full-time. It has been three years since she started teaching English, and she considers it the perfect job.

Balzhan

Balzhan has a bachelor's degree in pedagogy and has worked as an English tutor for four years. She teaches students of all ages, including children, teenagers, and adults, and works for 20 hours per week. Balzhan considers teaching English an integral part of her life and career. She also holds a master's degree in translation and previously worked as a translator in a bank. However, she found it challenging to translate banking-related vocabulary and eventually quit the job to return to private tutoring.

RQ1: Factors that Influence Teachers' Preference for EPT

The data analysis revealed the five core factors that drove the participants' decision to become an English tutor concerning the first research question. The data exploration discovered that five essential factors prompted the individuals who participated in this qualitative investigation to pursue a career as an English tutor. These factors included flexible working hours, the possibility of choosing students and setting rates, flexible teaching mode, passion for teaching, and professional development.

Flexible Working Hours

The data analysis revealed that all seven participants highlighted the flexibility of working hours as the primary factor influencing their decision to work as English tutors. The participants also emphasized that flexible working hours allow them to set convenient schedules and maintain work-life balance. As shown below, Nadezhda, Aizere, and Altynai effectively expressed this point.

This reason was also mentioned in narrative writing. According to Nadezhda's narrative writing, private tutoring presents various project opportunities and allows her to create her schedule.

Yes, I don't think that 20 hours of work is too much, it is quite little to say so. I managed to balance my life pretty well because, for now, as a freelancer, I can basically schedule my week the way that I want it to be (Extract 1, Nadezhda, December 15, 2023).

Aizere and Altynai are self-employed English tutors who previously worked in educational centers. They compared their experiences to their current, more flexible schedules.

I used to work in offices and always found it difficult to wake up early and leave the house at 9 a.m. But now, with my current job, I get to work from home and enjoy my tea without worrying about going anywhere. It's absolutely amazing and convenient" (Extract 2, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

I find it strange to imagine myself on a regular schedule. Let me tell you, I woke up an hour and a half ago, at noon, which is impossible for a teacher who works at school on a weekday (Extract 3, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Dina is an English tutor and is currently self-employed. However, her previous experience working in educational centers was neither flexible nor financially beneficial. Due to the inconvenience of the work schedule, she used to spend a considerable amount of money on food and transportation.

I used to work at an educational center, and my lessons would usually start at 9 a.m. Because I didn't eat at home, I had to take a break between 10 a.m. and 12

p.m. to have breakfast. During this break, I would go out and search for a café or restaurant to have my meal. However, this whole process was quite stressful for me, as I ended up spending a lot of money (Extract 4, Dina, December 11, 2023).

The Possibility for Choosing Students and Setting Rates

The second most influential factor for English tutors when choosing their career path was the ability to make independent choices, including using materials for their students and setting their rates. In the fifth extract, Aizere drew an intriguing parallel between teachers and celebrities, pointing out that both experiences have a similar journey. Early on, actors and actresses tend to accept all offers that come their way, whereas once they achieve fame, they become more selective about the roles they take on. Similarly, she notes that English tutors undergo a comparable process, and they gradually become more selective when choosing students.

I started being more selective and only teaching those I could connect with. It's like actors at the beginning of their careers, and they can't choose which movie they want to act in; they take whatever they get. But when they become celebrities, they can choose. Similarly, I choose who I teach and am honest with parents if I do not fit their child. I suggest they try drawing or math instead or find another English tutor (Extract 5, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

During the interview with Aizere, she mentioned that the primary advantages of being a private tutor are the ability to teach in convenient conditions, set prices, and the ability to manage her schedule: "I have the freedom to set my own rates or cancel the job if I'm unable to work due to illness or relocation. This is one of the key factors that makes it a comfortable job" (Extract 6, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Altynai has pointed out that private tutors have the liberty to set their own prices, which are determined by the amount of effort they put in, the quality of their teaching, and their continuous pursuit of knowledge.

I am impressed by the fact that, as a tutor, I am free to set my own prices for the services I offer. This means that my income solely depends on my own efforts and the quality of my work. By continually improving my lessons, expanding my knowledge of teaching methods, and applying new tools in education, I can grow as a professional and increase my income accordingly (Extract 7, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

I gained more experience over time, and I raised my rates when I began working for myself. This resulted in a decrease in the number of hours I worked, but I was able to find additional ways to earn money outside of my regular working hours. Gradually, I was able to balance my workload and increase my earnings. (Extract 8, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Flexible Teaching Mode

According to the data analysis, all seven participants in this study conducted their lessons remotely. Most of them emphasized the convenience of working from home. This was also one of the main reasons why the participants of this study decided to become an English tutor. Altynai and Aizere preferred working from home due to the positive impact of the COVID-19 pandemic working remotely and weather conditions.

I can work at a time that is convenient for me without being tied to a specific location. All I need is my laptop and a good internet connection. Thanks to this, I

can work wherever and whenever possible (Extract 9, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Altynai responded, “Especially now, when the weather is minus 25 degrees, I don’t even want to go outside. When I look at winter, I’m just happy that I work from home, and nothing bothers me” (Extract 10, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Then COVID-19 happened, and I started staying at home. Being a homebody was like paradise for me. I didn’t have to go anywhere, wasn’t late for anything, and was still getting paid. Working from my laptop made everything super convenient, and I could work anywhere. I’m in Bangkok and will live here for two months, but my work is still going great. This is a big plus for me (Extract 11, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Currently, Dina is teaching English lessons online from home, which has allowed her to spend less money on transportation and food and save it for other needs.

The positive aspect is that I am not spending any money on transportation or food. Even if I had to pay rent, I would still have enough money to cover basic needs such as groceries and spending time with friends.
(Extract 12, Dina, December 11, 2023).

Passion for Teaching

Based on data analysis, it has been found that English tutors prefer to work in the private tutoring sector due to their passion for teaching. The tutors derive immense satisfaction when they help their students improve their language skills. Dina is a perfect example of this; she enjoys explaining English grammar to her students meticulously and deliberately.

The fact that I really like helping people and explaining to them what to do and how to do it. I like to be precise with small details, so I wanted to help more people with English (Extract 13, Dina, December 11, 2023).

Moreover, Balzhan stressed the importance of getting positive feedback and active student involvement during lessons. She mentioned that these factors are among the primary reasons English tutors find their work fulfilling: they feel motivated to improve their teaching skills.

As a professional, my job is to teach, and as a teacher, I often find that students appreciate and enjoy my lessons. When I hear students talk about how interesting a task was or suggest playing a game we've played before, it motivates me to continue improving my lessons (Extract 14, Balzhan, December 14, 2023).

On the contrary, Zhanar believes that the main reason for tutoring is not financial gain but rather an opportunity to teach and communicate with her students.

But money is not the first thing. I guess students are the first thing, and I keep in touch with them after the lessons. I still keep in touch with some students from my previous workplace (Extract 15, Zhanar, December 18, 2023).

Another participant, Aizere, recognized a similarity between her singing career and her experience as an English tutor. She found teaching to be a fulfilling job. Many people expressed gratitude to her and her band during her time as a singer. They claimed that their songs acted as mental health support and even prevented suicidal thoughts.

Aizere acknowledged that songs can have a significant impact on people's lives.

However, in teaching, she can see firsthand the positive impact she has on her students' learning journey.

When you create and write a song, you don't always think about how it will touch someone's life. You can't see the people who listen to it and how it may impact them. You release it into the world and hope for the best. However, when you teach someone something, you see the result immediately. They tell you what they learned and how they plan to use it. It's inspiring to see how you can help people in such a direct way. Of course, you get paid for your work, and it's not free help. But seeing people come back and leave positive reviews is rewarding. Teaching is a mission that can be very fulfilling. It's a pleasant and rewarding job (Extract 16, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Aizere intentionally entered the private tutoring market, in contrast to Altynai, who had no plans to teach English. Still, she was inspired and motivated by people's eagerness to learn a new language once she started.

I didn't have any plans at all. I enjoyed studying languages. My motivation comes from seeing the spark in people's eyes when they want to learn, and I get to teach them. It's an interesting exchange of experiences where I know the language from other people's perspectives (Extract 17, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Professional Development

The data analysis revealed that professional development is an essential factor influencing English tutors' decisions to work in the private tutoring market. The participants emphasized that the competitiveness of the private tutoring market is encouraging them to develop and acquire new teaching techniques and improve their teaching methodology. Dina has highlighted three main components that may provide

English tutors with opportunities to be successful in this field: the correct methodology, excellent level of English and pronunciation, and usage of new technologies.

In my experience of English tutoring, I've narrowed it down to three main pillars of vital skills for English tutors: correct methodology while teaching, excellent level of English and pronunciation, usage of new technologies, and interactive lessons. That's it. If you have at least two of those, you're in luck and can be successful. The quality of my lessons improved compared to when I worked in educational centers. I have bought many courses for my professional growth, which have helped me be more successful and become a great teacher (Extract 18, Dina, December 11, 2023).

Altynai has some similarities with Dina's point about the development of teaching methodology. She emphasized that attending professional development has dramatically affected the quality of her lessons and was more valuable than the knowledge she gained at a pedagogical university. She stresses the importance of professional development for improving her methods of teaching English.

The correctness of language teaching methodology this involves learning different methods, including how to teach correct pronunciation, grammar, and other essential language components. I recently attended lectures from a highly skilled language teacher with a Certificate in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (CELTA) certification, despite my previous four years of study in pedagogy at the bachelor's level, where I didn't skip any classes and have had a diploma with honors. It turned out that these lectures were more valuable to me

than the knowledge I gained at university (Extract 19, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Aizere and Zhanar expressed the need for English tutors to enhance their teaching strategies and acquire technological skills. Aizere responded, “I believe that tutors should continuously improve their qualifications, like any other professionals. This includes improving their knowledge of the language and mastering skills such as teaching strategies and technology” (Extract 20, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Additionally, it is important for tutors to regularly improve their teaching skills to engage students of the new generation who have difficulties with concentration. Therefore, to be able to deal with different types of students, teachers have to be aware of the problems their students might face and with varying techniques of teaching that they can use to improve students’ motivation and engage them in the learning process in general (Extract 21, Zhanar, December 18, 2023).

Based on the quotes provided by the participants, the main reason for pursuing a career as an English tutor is the flexibility of working hours. Aizere (Extract 2) and Altynai (Extract 3) both cited this as the primary factor in their decision to pursue this path, expressing satisfaction with the ability to sleep longer and avoid morning rush hour. Altynai (Extract 3) also noted that she struggled with working within the confines of a traditional school schedule. The participants compared their current workplace to previous jobs where inconvenient timetables made their experience unpleasant. Along with flexibility and cost savings, which Dina (Extract 12) highlighted, the other core factors influencing their decision to work as English tutors included their passion for teaching and the ability to work remotely. Aizere (Extract 16) even found tutoring more

rewarding than her singing career. Additionally, the participants emphasized the importance of developing professional skills to succeed as a modern English tutor. Dina (Extract 18) outlined the three primary skills required for success in the current PT market.

RQ2: Role of Economic Factors in Influencing Teachers' Decisions to Work as Private English Tutors

The data analysis discovered the four fundamental economic factors influencing English tutors' decisions to engage in the private tutoring sector concerning the second research question. The data analysis revealed four economic factors that influenced the individuals' decision to choose private tutoring as a career option. These factors included the high cost of living in big cities, financial motivation, income disparities, return on investment, and the current demand for English tutors.

High Cost of Living in Big Cities

Based on the data provided in Table 1, most English tutors are from Almaty, a city known for its high cost of living. Balzhan highlighted that her earnings as an English tutor are insufficient to cover her expenses and bills.

Living in Almaty is quite expensive, and my income is insufficient to cover all my expenses. I have taken out some loans and have to pay for housing fees, which leaves me with very little money for other basic needs, such as food and transportation. Additionally, it can be costly to go out and relax. Thus, my income does not cover all my expenses (Extract 22, Balzhan, December 14, 2023).

Similarly, Altynai also said that when she worked as an English tutor at an educational center, her earnings were insufficient to cover her expenses. This led her to

become self-employed and promote herself as an English tutor on social media. She also shared some unofficial statistics that she had come across on social media. She mentioned that in Kazakhstan, it is middle class if a person has a minimum income of 700,000 tenge.

In general, the middle class in Kazakhstan is considered to be people who earn at least 700 thousand tenge per person in the family. However, this is a fragile middle class, comprising only about 5% of the population. Unfortunately, I have not reached the middle class yet, but I am getting closer. I have been tutoring online for three years now, and before that, I worked in various centers where I had a boss and did not have to worry about finding students. However, the earnings I received were not enough to cover my living expenses. Realizing I needed to change something, I started using Instagram and TikTok to promote my tutoring services. As a result, I started attracting more adult, paying students. I also improved the quality of my lessons, which helped to increase my income and standard of living (Extract 23, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Financial Motivation

According to the data analysis, the participants in this study had a financial incentive to work as English tutors, as they had financial responsibilities such as loans, debts, and fees. Kalamkas explained this in the following extract, where she shared her struggles.

Honestly, it's a bit embarrassing for me to admit this, but I need to earn some money. I have a large amount of debt that I need to pay off. It's not just about motivation, and it's a necessity for me right now. So, I'm working hard to earn

money, and I believe that in doing so, I will also be able to benefit others (Extract 24, Kalamkas, December 16, 2023).

Similarly, Aizere faced financial issues when working as an English tutor at an educational center. She shared her struggles and desire to earn money during this challenging period.

The main reason I decided to become a teacher was simple - I needed a job that would bring me a stable income. The end of 2019 was a challenging period for me. I had left my previous job, and while I was relying on my partner for financial support, our relationship eventually fell apart. I was left with a mortgage to pay and no source of income. To make ends meet, I started working at a language school (Extract 25, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Kalamkas suggested that working as an English tutor can be financially rewarding. However, the tutor's income may depend on their competitiveness, which is determined by positive recommendations from students or their parents. Nevertheless, successful tutors can yield sufficient income to cover all personal expenses.

I believe it will cover all expenses and even more if you become a great teacher and find new students through word of mouth and other means. You can establish yourself as a great English tutor (Extract 26, Kalamkas, December 16, 2023).

Meanwhile, Nadezhda mentioned that her involvement in other projects prevents her from teaching more students, which aligns with Kalamkas's point.

So, if I wanted all my financial expenses to be covered, I would definitely take more students, but because my priorities are not that right now, I take fewer students to cover more projects (Extract 27, Nadezhda, December 15, 2023).

In the same way, Aizere emphasized that increasing her rates as an English tutor allowed her to reduce her working hours and earn extra income from other activities.

No, teaching was my main source of income. However, when I increased my rates, I was able to free up some time for other pursuits. I have various interests, including singing and cartoon dubbing, and these activities also started generating some extra income on the side (Extract 28, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Income Disparities

The data analysis revealed that the English tutors set various prices relying on their work experience, expertise, teaching methodology, and additional technological skills. Therefore, the data analysis demonstrated that income disparities are a regular phenomenon in the private tutoring market. Some individuals who participated in this study also earned different amounts of income, which they shared with their per-hour income.

Dina and Nadezhda determine rates based on lesson type, time of day, and specific English teaching purposes.

I work from 11 am to 8 pm. If the lessons are from 11 am to 5 pm, I charge 7000 tenge. For lessons from 5 pm to 8 pm, I charge 7500 tenge. For English lessons tailored to specific purposes, I charge 8000 tenge per hour. For group lessons consisting of three or more people, I charge 3,500 tenge per hour. For pair lessons, I charge 4,500 tenge per hour (Extract 29, Dina, December 11, 2023).

It depends on what I am teaching and how many students I teach. I have a set rate for my time, and the more students there are, the lower the payment per student (Extract 30, Nadezhda, December 15, 2023).

Meanwhile, Aizere emphasized that her rates are significantly higher than those at educational centers. However, her lessons are worth the investment and still affordable for adults.

I didn't increase my lesson prices too much just to have 2-3 daily lessons.

Although my lessons were more expensive than those offered at the language center, they were still reasonably priced and worth the investment. In other words, they were still affordable (Extract 31, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Balzhan expressed a viewpoint similar to Aizere's. Still, she emphasized the rates charged by English tutors and highlighted the significant price variation within the private tutoring industry. Balzhan suggested that the pricing may depend on the level of expertise possessed by the English tutors, but she found it challenging to provide a precise answer.

Well, to be honest, the prices are very different. Some tutors charge about 2,000 tenge per hour. Some of them take 5,000 tenge per hour. Some of them charge 7,000 tenge or 8,000 tenge. I think that it depends on whether teachers are good enough, but they want to have as many students as they can. That's why they try to lower their prices to get enough students. I can't answer the question because the prices differ (Extract 30, Balzhan, December 14, 2023).

Nevertheless, English tutors may have a flexible schedule and teaching mode, but Balzhan suggested that schoolteachers have more financially stable incomes.

Regarding teachers in Kazakhstan, mainly tutors, it seems that many don't charge high prices for their lessons. I've heard of some charging as little as 2000 tenge or 2500 tenge per hour. In my opinion, this is quite low, and they don't earn enough

money. Teachers who work in state schools may earn a good salary, perhaps around 400,000 tenge or more, but this depends on their experience level and the number of hours they work. Nevertheless, not all teachers earn that much, which may not cover all their expenses. So, while some teachers and tutors may earn enough, many of them don't earn enough to meet their needs (Extract 32, Balzhan, December 14, 2023).

Although schoolteachers may earn a higher salary, Dina and Aizere both agree that English tutors have the potential to charge more per hour for their lessons if they are competitive and possess the skills required to succeed in the private tutoring market.

I would say the average individual hour is 5,500 minutes. Or at least I always say that to my teachers because I want them to start earning more. Once you change your style again, once you change even like a platform or start conducting your lessons, make it more interactive, and stuff like this, your price immediately goes up. You can start with 5,500 tenge (Extract 33, Dina, December 11, 2023).

Aizere responded, “Once you have established a strong foundation, you can increase your rates. You could even charge 10,000 tenge per hour for teaching English” (Extract 34, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Return on Investment

An English tutor's decision to set higher prices in the private tutoring market can be influenced by their professional development. According to Nadezhda and Balzhan, the experience and certificates held by English tutors are essential factors that demonstrate their expertise. She responded, “So, the higher your qualification is, the higher your price is” (Extract 36, Nadezhda, December 15, 2023).

Balzhan suggested that having certificates could attract new customers and serve as advertising. She responded, “Obtaining some certificates could help you increase your rates. Once you attract students through advertisements on Instagram or other websites, you can raise your rates by highlighting your additional certifications and experience” (Extract 37, Balzhan, December 14, 2023).

Another participant, Aizere, highlighted that obtaining certificates and taking courses is considered an investment in an English tutor’s teaching career and may also be essential for increasing the price. She responded, “You need to invest in yourself and undergo training to achieve a good income. That’s also not cheap, and as a teacher, you understand that any such effort needs to be fairly compensated” (Extract 38, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Altynai pointed out that English tutors increasingly seek pedagogical certificates or professional training from certified individuals, similar to Aizere’s view.

It’s pretty popular to take pedagogical exams such as the Teaching Knowledge Test (TKT), Certificate in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (CELTA), and Diploma in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (DELTA) these days. Even if someone doesn’t plan to take the test themselves, they often receive training from specialists who have CELTA and conduct training for others (Extract 39, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Consumer-driven Demand

During the interviews, it was emphasized that private tutoring is rising, with a high demand for English tutors. Altynai noted that people view English tutoring as a full-time profession rather than a part-time job.

The education industry seems to be growing in popularity due to the increasing interest in tutoring. People are no longer treating it as a part-time job but rather as a full-time profession. With a high demand for English language learning, the market offers many opportunities for tutors to stand out in the industry (Extract 40, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Nadezhda mentioned that the number of freelancers has increased since 2017. She also noted that the online tutoring market has grown significantly due to the pandemic.

The number of freelance teachers has significantly increased in recent years. This trend has developed since around 2017, with many language centers opening. This trend is continuing to rise, and with the coronavirus pandemic, there has been a tremendous increase in online centers. Therefore, this is a growing market (Extract 41, Nadezhda, December 15, 2023).

Meanwhile, Kalamkas described the image of an English tutor as being in high demand. She mentioned that this person has a queue of clients, and everyone intends to take their services.

The most important thing is to work conscientiously and diligently, like a responsible adult, focusing on achieving good results. If you do so, you will be highly sought after and even have clients waiting for your services. You'll have a waiting list, and when a spot becomes available, you can assure them that you'll be happy to take them on. It won't be about money but rather the quality of your services and the time you can dedicate to each client (Extract 42, Kalamkas, December 16, 2023).

Zhanar pointed out that the quality of private tutoring services is affected by the high demand for them, not vice versa. She also highlighted that university graduates are less likely to work as schoolteachers and prefer to start their own businesses in the private tutoring industry due to the extremely high demand.

So, it affected the quantity of private tutoring but not the quality because people saw a demand for it. Also, for instance, all the graduates from all the universities, instead of going or getting some experience from mainstream school, would instead go and run their own business, again, which is in the sector of private tutoring, because they see that there is a demand on it, regardless of the quality of the teachers that they hire or of the books or the materials that they use (Extract 43, Zhanar, December 18, 2023).

To conclude, English tutors are free to charge whatever they deem appropriate based on their work experience and expertise. Another factor observed was the return on investment, as English tutors seek various professional certificates to enhance their knowledge and increase their rates. Finally, the demand for English tutors in the PT market was considered. Participants highlighted that the EPT market is in high demand, with Nadezhda (Extract 41) noting a significant increase in English tutor freelancers. However, Zhanar pointed out that while the demand for the PT market has increased the number of extra supplemental lessons, it has not necessarily affected the quality.

RQ 3: English Skills in Great Demand in the PT Market?

The data analysis revealed that speaking, listening, and writing are in the highest demand in the PT market in relation to the third research question. The data analysis also discovered that productive skills such as speaking and writing are more popular among

private tutors. However, English tutors mentioned that they teach all four skills in combination to achieve a good acquisition level for their students.

Balzhan emphasized that modern English tutors recognize the significance of speaking skills and aim to incorporate speaking practice in their English lessons. She suggested that some teachers still rely on outdated methods to enhance speaking skills or completely disregard the importance of practicing these skills. Balzhan also emphasized that current English tutors are more skilled and professional.

Speaking and Listening Skills

But right now, English lessons are different. In these lessons, the main focus is on speaking fluently in English. Teachers use many other exercises to help improve students' speaking skills. However, some teachers who still use outdated teaching methods do not give their students enough opportunities to speak. These teachers focus on teaching grammar and vocabulary without providing enough exercises to enhance speaking skills. I think that this is not a good thing. Nowadays, English teachers are more knowledgeable and better understand how their students can improve their speaking skills (Extract 44, Balzhan, December 14, 2023).

Unlike Balzhan, Aizere primarily teaches adults. Thus, adults seek speaking skills for professional purposes and listening skills to improve language comprehension while watching authentic movies and series. Aizere responded, "Spoken language is needed for passing interviews, traveling, studying. Listening comprehension is necessary for watching movies and understanding native speakers and accents" (Extract 45, Aizere, December 15, 2023).

Another participant, Altynai, highlighted that it is crucial to correct students' mistakes while learning to speak in English, even if they have limited grammar and vocabulary.

I correct people's language because many want to speak fluently without a good grasp of grammar and vocabulary. By fixing their language, we can bring their language skills up to the level needed for effective communication. As a result, they can achieve their personal goals (Extract 46, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Speaking and Writing Skills

Nadezhda highlighted the significant need for proficient speaking and writing in the EPT industry. This is due to the potential shortfall in expertise among schoolteachers and the time constraints that hinder the comprehensive teaching of these skills within mainstream schools.

Nobody teaches students at school, that's the reason. When I was studying at school and when I was teaching at school, I definitely understood that teachers don't have enough time or qualifications to teach their students to speak properly or formulate their ideas properly in spoken or written form (Extract 47, Nadezhda, December 15, 2023).

Dina stressed that some of her students underestimated the importance of specific skills, such as writing. However, during her lessons, she explained that all language skills are equally essential to achieve a high level of language acquisition. She clarified to her students that focusing solely on speaking skills is insufficient.

Some individuals believe that speaking alone is enough for daily use and that they do not need to focus on other areas, such as writing. However, it is essential to

realize that writing is a crucial skill, as it is necessary for tasks such as sending emails or writing comments on social media platforms. As an English teacher, I have had many students who have expressed that they do not need to focus on writing. However, I always make it clear to them that it is impossible to become proficient in English by solely focusing on speaking (Extract 48, Dina, December 11, 2023).

Four Main Skills

The data analysis revealed that all participants acknowledged the importance of teaching the four primary language skills, including reading, writing, speaking, and listening. The four English language skills are closely linked, and it is impossible to enhance one without improving the others. One of my participants mentioned that numerous individuals hold misconceptions that acquiring skills is more crucial than others.

So, learning a language involves mastering grammar, listening, reading, vocabulary, and all other aspects of the language. These aspects are interconnected, and it's impossible to improve one without the others. When working with people, it's sometimes necessary to break their preconceptions and help them understand the reality of language learning (Extract 49, Altynai, December 14, 2023).

Dina made a similar point to Altynai's regarding misconceptions about the interconnectedness of four English language skills. However, she also mentioned her experience of learning, which required additional effort beyond attending tutoring classes.

I believe that many people do not understand that to become proficient in English, they need to have a combination of different skills. To excel in the language, one must also focus on reading, listening, grammar, vocabulary, and writing. In addition to attending classes, I also did individual work outside of my lessons to improve my English skills (Extract 50, Dina, December 11, 2023).

This final section of the findings chapter focused on the demand for English language skills. The study included input from English tutors who emphasized that the demand for skills depends on their student's specific needs, age, and goals. As a result, the subthemes were divided into speaking and listening, speaking and writing, and four primary skills identified as being in the highest demand among students. Moreover, Dina and Altynai (Extracts 49 and 50) shared their experience of explaining to their students that all four language skills (reading, writing, listening, and speaking) should be learned in combination and focusing only on one skill will not significantly improve their overall language level.

Summary

This chapter demonstrated the main findings concerning the influence of various factors on teachers' decisions to pursue English tutoring. Essentially, it commences by providing the personal narratives of seven participants, which serve as primary data. Subsequently, the findings were categorized into three main themes that emerged from data analysis, which provide a deeper insight into the complex interplay of various factors that shape the attitudes and motivations of teachers towards English tutoring. These themes included factors driving the decision to be an English tutor, the impact of economic factors on the provision of EPT, and the demand for English language skills.

These findings will be explained in greater detail in the subsequent chapter, considering the theoretical framework and previous research related to this topic.

Chapter 5. Discussion

The previous chapter of this qualitative study presented the main findings from the data obtained from the narrative writings and semi-structured interviews collected from seven English tutors. The findings chapter presented the various personal factors that motivate English tutors in the PT market. Additionally, it highlighted the impact of economic factors on the number of English tutors operating in the EPT field. Furthermore, the findings highlighted the considerable demand for English language proficiency among students, with participants emphasizing that this demand varies based on factors such as age, goals, and individual needs.

This study aimed to explore the factors influencing English tutors' decisions to work in a private tutoring market, the role of economic factors in this decision, and which English skills are in higher demand. This chapter discusses the findings presented earlier, guided by Bray's (2021b) theoretical framework. This framework examines the phenomenon of PT through physical, economic, political, pedagogical, and cultural geography lenses.

Physical Geography

The study findings support Bray's (2021b) theoretical framework for understanding PT through physical, economic, political, pedagogical, and cultural geography in PT. The findings demonstrated that most participants were self-employed, worked full-time, or worked at private tutoring centers in urban cities such as Almaty and Astana. According to Bray (2021b), physical geography refers to the priority that focuses on the changing approaches employed to guarantee educational access for every individual, regardless of geographic location. Moreover, physical geography significantly

impacts educational provision as it can dramatically determine access. The provision of shadow education in various teaching modes is predominantly influenced by market dynamics and decentralized choices made by entrepreneurs in the PT and informal providers.

In contrast, conventional schooling mirrors the centralized planning of standardized services (Bray, 2021b). This is consistent with one of the exciting findings of this study, which is that all the participants employed the online meeting platform Zoom to conduct their English tutoring sessions. The participants highlighted that the COVID-19 pandemic significantly influenced the switch to online tutoring.

The previous literature by Zhang and Bray (2020) emphasized that in early 2020, with the global COVID-19 pandemic, many tutoring companies that offered in-person lessons had to shut down when schools closed due to the pandemic. However, the tutoring businesses that employ technology for remote learning witnessed a sudden surge in demand. Another investigation by Rowe (2021) demonstrated that the COVID-19 pandemic resulted in a significant rise in online tutoring, leading to the emergence of “Zutors” – tutors who utilize the Zoom platform. Moreover, there has been a novel surge in the implementation of novel methods in PT. An earlier study in ELT (English Language Teaching) by Yung and Hajar (2023) revealed that private tutoring companies employed the usage of AI (Artificial Intelligence) while creating their digital platforms and applications for teaching the English language. Therefore, online EPT is drastically growing due to the ongoing development of new technologies. This study’s findings align with the provided literature, as the participants emphasized improving their knowledge and skills in using new technologies as English tutors.

This study's main findings revealed that English tutors value flexibility and prefer not to adhere to a fixed schedule, unlike mainstream schoolteachers. Based on my analysis, the most crucial factor driving the decision to become an English tutor is having flexible working hours. The earlier study by Ventura and Jang (2010) revealed that online tutoring is frequently positioned as a more convenient alternative for tutors and students rather than traditional one-to-one tutoring. Convenience is attributed to the affordances facilitated by the Internet and other technological developments. Moreover, Yung's (2016) study also discovered that web-camera-enabled online tutoring can provide supplementary lessons to students across different countries. This eliminates the need for students to travel to a physical location for the lessons, and they can access recorded versions of the lessons, which makes online tutoring more flexible and private.

Another important finding indicates that the mode of instruction influences the rates of tutoring classes. This echoes Zaylobidinova (2022), who also found that the cost of one-on-one tutoring sessions is significantly higher than that of other tutoring groups. Previous research has shown that EPT has various modalities, such as private lessons, small-group tutoring, and lecture-style tutoring (Yung, 2022a). The prior study by Yung and Hajar (2023) suggested that while working with an individual learner, a tutor can personalize the educational sessions based on the specific requirements of that learner. Nevertheless, achieving this level of personalization becomes significantly challenging while dealing with larger cohorts or classrooms often seen in tutoring centers. Bray (2021b) highlighted that private-sector entrepreneurs typically display minimal enthusiasm in offering services at increased prices to restricted populations with

moderate earnings. Consequently, families residing in thinly populated regions experience limited availability of supplementary educational opportunities.

Economic Geography

As defined by Bray (2021), economic geography is the impact of neoliberal economic principles on the organization and allocation of educational resources, and the behavior of parents and schools in the academic market is a subject of interest.

Additionally, Bray (2021b) suggested that tutoring providers' advertising strategies demonstrate economic geography's fundamental principles. At various levels, from local communities to the entire nation, the advertising geography mirrors the wide range of economic environments within which tutoring services are active.

The findings demonstrated that the most striking finding was the substantial difference in income disparities among English tutors. Participants indicated that their income depends on various factors, and their prices significantly differ. Participants highlighted challenges in determining the precise hourly salary for English tutors in Kazakhstan, and rates can vary based on the tutor's teaching experience, expertise, language proficiency, and location. Bray and Hajar (2023) emphasized that geographical factors define various manifestations of disparities associated with PT, as tutorial facilities tend to be more prevalent in urban regions compared to rural settings. While technology can help bridge the geographical gap in PT access, disparities in internet connectivity and computer equipment persist among wealthier households, as highlighted by Bray and Hajar (2023).

Furthermore, all the participants emphasized that tutors have the autonomy to set their rates based on their professional qualifications. According to Silova (2010), the PT

market is not as strictly regulated as traditional schooling; in many areas, it functions without much oversight or control. The former study by Zhang and Bray (2018) found that one of the most famous PT companies in China was charging US\$1200 per month for tutoring Grade 9 students, and this action effectively resulted in the exclusion of most families. Zhang (2019) emphasized that even without regulations, shadow education still mirrors mainstream schooling influenced by political geography. As a result, the content and organization of shadow education reflect national and subnational education systems, although in a more informal and loosely monitored way.

Another important finding is that the EPT market is experiencing high consumer demand. The findings also revealed the growing trend of English tutors being classified as “freelancers” since 2017, given their self-employed status. It was also noted that the increase in private tutoring companies impacted the quantity of these organizations more than their quality. The findings of this study align with a previous study by Gupta (2023), who found that English tutoring services illustrated the interconnection between private tutoring and the broader social class dynamics, revealing how PT influences and is influenced by these dynamics. The former study by Mahmud and Bray (2017) in Bangladesh suggested notable variances in expenditure allocation for tutoring services between English and other academic subjects in urban and rural contexts. One participant in this study emphasized that university graduates often choose to work in the private tutoring sector over mainstream schools because of the financial benefits and the opportunity to run their own businesses.

Political Geography

The political geography of Bray's (2021b) theoretical framework suggests that the representation of national and subnational boundaries, along with supranational boundaries, is significantly influenced by political factors. Even in unregulated environments, shadow education is influenced by political geography to the extent that it mirrors mainstream schooling, which is also influenced by political geography.

Therefore, the substance and configuration of private tutoring mirror the characteristics of national and subnational educational frameworks, admittedly in a more informal and loosely monitored approach. As noted earlier, the individuals who participated in this study were self-employed, worked full-time, or worked for private tutoring companies. Two participants did not hold a pedagogical degree and entered the private tutoring sector unexpectedly. These participants emphasized that they entered the PT sector due to financial difficulties and personal debts. One highlighted her willingness to work in any position while experiencing financial difficulties. The coaching sector is a significant livelihood source for numerous individuals with diverse skill sets. Terminating these facilities would result in individuals being deprived of their employment opportunities, consequently giving rise to economic hardships for both the affected individuals and their families (Zaman, 2020).

The findings of this study are consistent with a previous study by Bray (2021a, p.65), who found that part-time or full-time workers frequently provide private tutoring services at commercial companies. Part-time tutors often include employed mainstream schoolteachers, while full-time workers are former schoolteachers. Furthermore, current and former educators can independently offer private supplementary instruction without affiliation with corporate entities. Additionally, individuals who offer tutoring services

can encompass university students, retired individuals, and other non-formal workers (Bray, 2021a, p.65). Nevertheless, most of the participants of this study hold a pedagogical degree, and working in the EPT sector encourages them to enhance their teaching skills and obtain valuable certificates to demonstrate their expertise. Thus, the most important finding of this investigation is that English tutors are willing to invest in their education and improve teaching skills to increase the rates of their lessons. The previous study by Hajar et al. 2023, revealed that in Kazakhstan, policymakers have embraced a *laissez-faire* approach by overlooking the concept of PT and allocating decision-making to educators and their students.

Pedagogical Geography

As defined by Bray (2021b), pedagogical geography refers to the areas within formal education institutions where supplementary education is provided and alternative spaces for tutoring can vary significantly. Additionally, Brehm (2021) suggested that the pedagogical lens indicated that the dynamics observed in private tutoring significantly diverged from those witnessed in the traditional classroom setting. The findings of this study demonstrated that the demand for English skills depends on various factors such as the needs, age, and aims of students. Additionally, it revealed that productive skills such as speaking and writing are in higher demand among adult students, whereas schoolchildren do not consider focusing on specific skills. These findings are consistent with previous literature by Bleistein and Lewis (2015), who suggested that English tutors can address the individual needs of learners and language acquisition objectives while conducting individual lessons due to the absence of a structured curriculum. Additionally, English tutors and their students can be engaged in face-to-face dialogues in the English

language due to the various modes of EPT. Bray (2021b) also found that individual lessons provided in the classrooms of tutorial centers enhance tutoring sessions by removing distractions and potential companionship from classmates.

The findings of this study about the demand for English skills revealed that to acquire the English language fully, both a tutor and a student need to be fully involved. One of the study participants stressed the importance of students dedicating extra time to revise materials and independently learn the English language. One previous study by Chih-Hao (2019) investigated the study about the impact of English proficiency on students in their final years of high school in Taiwan. It highlighted the significance of students' involvement in self-directed learning for academic achievement. The study observed that the duration of time devoted to independent research, as opposed to receiving PT services, significantly influenced their academic achievements. Moreover, the Taiwanese study also found the challenges of evaluating private tutoring services, underscoring that these services may not deliver the desired outcomes "without students" efforts. The results of the Taiwanese study align with the current study's findings, highlighting the significance of involving both a tutor and a student in learning a foreign language to enhance the effectiveness of supplementary classes.

Cultural Geography

According to Bray (2021b), cultural geography suggests that shadow education varies among cultural groups due to its voluntary nature, leading to different levels of access, and the clustering of groups in specific geographic areas often influences this disparity. A possible explanation of the current study's findings, namely the high demand for English tutors in Kazakhstan, can be interconnected with the cultural lens of PT.

Zhunuosova et al. (2021) proposed that the surge in interest in acquiring English language skills in Kazakhstan can be attributed to its promise of enhanced job opportunities, alongside the national agenda aimed at establishing ties with the top fifty most advanced nations globally, where fluency in English is deemed crucial for the population of Kazakhstan. According to Brehm (2021), Karlsson (2020), and Sobhy (2012), shadow education has a significant impact on the traditions of education and the dynamics within families and schools. The earlier study by Holloway and Kirby (2020) in the United Kingdom found that children from wealthier socio-economic backgrounds were more willing to receive private tutoring than those from lower socio-economic classes. The influence of shadow education can vary depending on the region, nationally and internationally. In certain areas, shadow education may completely replace traditional schooling rather than simply complementing it (Bhorkar & Bray, 2018; Silova & Kazimzade, 2006).

The study's results indicated a continuing high demand for the EPT market, with a consistent need for English skills. Additionally, two participants noted that the desire to improve speaking and writing skills may be attributed to a lack of teaching experience and the busy schedules of schoolteachers. The participants recalled their experience of studying at school and emphasized that schoolteachers could not provide effective results in their teaching. According to the present results, previous studies of EPT in Bangladesh by Hamid et al. (2018) revealed that students tend to join tutoring centers “not because of its proven effectiveness but because of their declining faith in school English teaching (p.881).” Another participant in the study emphasized that current schoolteachers fail to recognize the significance of speaking skills in the modern world and are unaware of

methodologies for teaching spoken English. This finding is consistent with the former study by Islam (2015) in Bangladesh, which revealed that English education in schools is often deemed insufficient to guarantee the acquisition and advancement of appropriate language skills. However, Gupta's research (2023) in an Indian context showed that assessing the effectiveness of private tutoring is a complex and challenging task. Hamid et al. (2018) found that the high approval of tutoring services might not necessarily correlate with their efficacy. Many individuals seeking tutoring may base their decision on an assumption of its effectiveness, reasoning that it would not be as popular among other students if it were ineffective.

Summary

This chapter discussed the findings presented in Chapter 4 about previous research and Bray's (2021b) theoretical framework, which examines the phenomenon of PT through the lenses of physical, political, economic, pedagogical, and cultural geography. Each of these lenses was explained and linked to the findings of this study, and the previous studies of EPT and PT were also referred to. The study's main findings are outlined in the following chapter, and the limitations and implications of the findings for future research, policy, and practice are presented.

Chapter 6. Conclusion

The previous chapter discussed the study's findings and analyzed the factors influencing teachers to pursue careers as English tutors. The chapter also examined the English skills in the highest demand among their students. To accomplish the goals of this study, the following research questions were formulated:

1. What factors influence teachers' preference for private English tutoring in Kazakhstan?
2. What is the role of the economic factor in influencing teachers' decisions to work as English private tutors in Kazakhstan?
3. What English skills are in greater demand in the private market?

This chapter presents the study's conclusions and limitations. It also suggests pedagogical implications for policy and practice and recommends further research.

Main Conclusions of the Study

This study aimed to investigate the motivating factors that lead English tutors from main cities such as Almaty and Astana to seek employment in the English private tutoring (EPT) market and to identify the specific English language skills in high demand among consumers of these English tutors. The findings revealed that the main factors for pursuing a career in English were the flexibility of working hours and teaching mode because most participants conducted their supplementary lessons remotely. Additionally, it demonstrated that English tutors are willing to work in the EPT field because of their passion for teaching and opportunities to enhance their professional skills. Upon analysis of the impact of economic factors, this study found that financial motivation, income disparities, return on investment, and consumer demand are the primary drivers. The

financial motivation factor indicates that the EPT market is willing to hire non-formal workers. Most of the participants became English tutors due to financial challenges. The income disparities revealed in the findings show significant differences in the earnings of English tutors in Kazakhstan. Those who invest in improving their teaching skills and knowledge are more likely to see a rise in their rates, as shown in the return-on-investment findings. Additionally, consumer demand for English tutoring services is high, and Kazakhstan's EPT market is growing rapidly.

This study utilized Bray's (2021b) theoretical framework of understanding PT through the lenses of physical, economic, political, pedagogical, and cultural geography (for further elaboration about this theoretical framework, see Chapter 2). This theoretical framework enabled the interpretation of the findings of this study across various geographies of Private Tutoring (PT). The findings demonstrated that English tutors are inclined to pursue English tutoring careers in the EPT field because of the convenience it offers for online teaching and conducting lessons internationally and the usage of new technologies and Artificial intelligence (AI) while teaching English in line with the principles of physical geography. The main findings of economic geography revealed that the English private tutoring market (EPT) is not financially stable, and the earnings of English tutors significantly vary according to their teaching experience and skills, proficiency level in the English language, and overall popularity. The economic geography also demonstrated that the PT field is mainly demanding in big cities such as Almaty and Astana.

The findings concerning political geography illustrated that private tutoring companies may not prioritize pedagogical degrees and the presence of teaching

experience while hiring English tutors; instead, they focus mainly on language proficiency. Surprisingly, two participants in this study entered the PT market due to financial challenges. The research in pedagogical geography revealed significant differences between the PT field and traditional education settings, with the PT field providing more opportunities for students to improve their language proficiency skills. Most participants highlighted the increased demand for productive skills such as speaking and writing. Additionally, the findings emphasized the importance of collaborative efforts between tutors and students in their work. According to the results of cultural geography, having a solid command of the English language is crucial in Kazakhstan. Multiple studies by Hamid & Mahmud, 2023; and Khaydarov, 2020 have shown that students generally believe shadow education tutors to be more competent. The findings indicate that many schoolteachers may lack the necessary teaching skills and techniques to instruct students in productive skills effectively.

Strengths and Limitations

Based on this study's main findings, the following section highlights its strengths and limitations. Yung (2023) indicates that EPT is still an under-researched area despite increasing recognition of the PT field, which has significant implications for educational practices. Most Kazakhstani researchers examined students' perceptions (Hajar et al., 2023d; Hajar et al., 2021; Hajar & Abenova, 2021; Kalikova & Rakhimzhanova, 2009). Another study examined the PT field's scale, nature, and policy implications (Hajar et al., 2023d). As a result, it demonstrated the lack of empirical studies that examine the EPT field. As Bray (2021b) suggested, the EPT accepts non-formal workers without formal pedagogical qualifications to work as English teachers. The main strength of my study is

that it investigates the factors and perspectives of English tutors who work in the EPT market. Moreover, no empirical studies have examined the EPT field in Kazakhstan.

I also suggest highlighting the limitations of this study. One of the limitations is the small sample size of participants from urban areas in Kazakhstan, such as Almaty and Astana, which means the findings cannot be applied to all English tutors in the country. Consequently, more research is needed to examine the EPT factors and their impact across Kazakhstan, with particular attention to rural areas. Another limitation concerns the data collection process of this study, as I conducted semi-structured interviews via Zoom. The online meeting platform and Zoom interviews were more convenient because of their flexibility and the participants' preferences. Furthermore, it is worth noting that certain participants were located outside of Kazakhstan at the time of the interview, making it necessary to engage with them exclusively through this online platform. Given the findings and limitations, this study can have potential implications for future research.

Implications for Further Research

Based on the analysis of the data derived from the participants of this study, the subsequent policy implications may enhance comprehension of the experiences of educational stakeholders in Kazakhstan within the EPT market. One of the main practical implications in the EPT field involves the establishment of a regulatory entity dedicated to managing the PT market in Kazakhstan. The regulation of the PT field presents a dichotomy with two distinct perspectives that must be considered. First, the unregulated pricing of English tutor services in Kazakhstan has been a topic of concern, as the absence of regulations has resulted in a wide range of prices in the EPT market. This has made it difficult to determine the average earnings of English tutors in the country, as

highlighted by the participants of this study. The lack of a standardized pricing model has led to disparities in the fees charged by tutors, which may impact the accessibility of EPT services for students from diverse socioeconomic backgrounds (Hajar & Yung, 2023; Hajar & Karakus, 2023b).

Second, Silova (2010) emphasized that Kazakhstan attempted to implement regulations in the PT field, and tutors were required to obtain a license and pay taxes to provide private tutoring services legally. As a result, many Kazakhstani tutors hesitated to disclose their extra earnings, viewing it as a means of survival (Silova, 2010).

Additionally, Bray (2021c) suggested that hindering and banning tutors from offering services is often portrayed as “swimming against the tide of other forces” (p.182). PT is here to stay, particularly as numerous parents strive to provide their children with extra assistance, regardless of the standard of education offered in mainstream schools.

Additionally, many tutors feel it is advantageous to deliver PT services and supplement their earnings, further contributing to its continued prevalence (Bray, 2021c). Therefore, examining PT regulations’ positive and negative effects on mainstream education is necessary.

Finally, a significant practical implication is suggested regarding the importance of high-quality EPT sessions facilitated by English tutors. One of the participants in this study emphasized that private tutoring companies are seeing growth solely due to the demand for English skills rather than an emphasis on quality.

Recommendations and Future Research Directions

Regarding recommendations for further research, it is necessary to explore the income disparity of English tutors across various regions of Kazakhstan. Furthermore, more research is needed to examine the perceptions of tutors and students about online teaching modes. As technology advances rapidly, it is becoming increasingly essential to conduct investigations into the potential impact of new technologies, including Artificial Intelligence (AI), on the teaching approaches utilized by English tutors. By doing so, English tutors can better understand how to integrate these tools into their teaching methods. Finally, analyzing the shadow education market from various viewpoints would improve the comprehensive understanding of this phenomenon. It could represent a crucial milestone in acknowledging its increasing significance and influence on traditional education systems and broader communities within Kazakhstan and globally.

Personal Reflection

As a final thought, I reflect on the journey of writing a master's thesis on English Private tutoring. Throughout this journey, I gained a deeper understanding of PT and EPT. I conducted a qualitative study and improved my skills in analyzing, collecting, and interpreting the data. Writing each chapter of my master's thesis was challenging, but each chapter pushed me to research, analyze, and draft multiple times. My critical thinking skills evolved due to constant thinking about structuring the thesis chapters. Despite that, my academic English skills significantly improved due to constantly drafting the chapters. This journey taught me many valuable lessons and opened the route to academia.

References

- Addi-Raccah, A. (2019). Private tutoring in a high socio-economic secondary school in Israel and pupils' attitudes toward school learning: A double-edged sword phenomenon. *British Educational Research Journal* 45, no. 5:938–996.
- Ahn, E. S., & Smagulova, J. (2021). English language choices in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. *World Englishes*, 41(1), 9–23. <https://doi.org/10.1111/weng.12552>
- Akimenko, O. (2017). Investigating the effectiveness of private small group tutoring of English in Kazakhstan: Perceptions of tutors and students. *NUGSE Research in Education*, 2(1), 16–26.
- Allen, D. (2016). Japanese cram schools and entrance exam washback. *The Asian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 3(1), 54–67.
<https://caes.hku.hk/ajal/index.php/ajal/article/view/338>
- Aurini, J., Davies, S., & Dierkes, J. B. (Eds.). (2013). *Out of the shadows: The global intensification of supplementary education* (Vol. 22). Bingley: Emerald
- Ball, S. J. (2012). *Global Education Inc.: New policy networks and the neoliberal imaginary*. Routledge.
- Benson, P. (2011). Language learning and teaching beyond the classroom: An introduction to the field. In P. Benson & H. Reinders (Eds.), *Beyond the language classroom* (pp. 7–16). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Bhorkar, S., & Bray, M. (2018). The expansion and roles of private tutoring in India: From supplementation to supplantation. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 62, 148–156. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2018.03.003>
- Bleistein, T., & Lewis, M. (2015). *One-on-one language teaching and learning: Theory and Practice*. Palgrave Macmillan.

- Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). *Transforming qualitative information: thematic analysis and code development*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage. <http://psycnet.apa.org/record/1998-08155-000>
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101.
<https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Bray, M. (2006). Private supplementary tutoring: comparative perspectives on patterns and implications. *Compare*, 36(4), 515–530.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03057920601024974>
- Bray, M. (2021a). Teachers as tutors, and tutors as teachers: blurring professional boundaries in changing eras. *Teachers and Teaching*, 28(1), 64–77.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2021.2019700>
- Bray, M. (2021b). Geographies of shadow education: patterns and forces in the spatial distributions of private supplementary tutoring. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 53(3), 343–360.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2021.1915749>
- Bray, M. (2021c). Swimming against the tide: Comparative lessons from government efforts to prohibit private supplementary tutoring delivered by regular teachers. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*, 11(2), 168–188.
<https://doi.org/10.1556/063.2020.00031>
- Bray, M., & Hajar, A. (2023). *Shadow education in the Middle East*.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003317593>

- Bray, M., Adamson, B., & Mason, M. (Eds.) (2014). *Comparative Education Research: Approaches and Methods*. Second edition. *CEPS Journal : Center for Educational Policy Studies Journal*, 4(3), 131–136.
<https://doi.org/10.26529/cepsj.19>
- Bray, M., Kwo, O., & Jokić, B. (2014). *Researching private supplementary tutoring: methodological lessons from diverse cultures*.
<http://hub.hku.hk/handle/10722/221959>
- Bray, T. M. (2009). *Confronting the shadow education system: What government policies for what private tutoring?* United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization; International Institute for Educational Planning.
- Bray, T. M. (2011). *The challenge of shadow education: Private tutoring and its implications for policymakers in the European Union*. European Commission.
- Bray, T. M. (2021). *Shadow education in Africa: Private supplementary tutoring and its policy implications*. Comparative Education Research Centre, The University of Hong Kong. UNESCO.
- Bray, T., & Kobakhidze, M. (2014). The global spread of shadow education: supporting or undermining qualities of education? In *SensePublishers eBooks*.
<https://hub.hku.hk/handle/10722/198945>
- Brehm, W. (2021). *Cambodia for sale: Everyday privatization in education and beyond*.
<https://www.amazon.com/Cambodia-Sale-Everyday-Privatization-Education/dp/0367712032>

- Buchmann, C., Condron, D. J., & Roscigno, V. J. (2010). Shadow education, American style: test preparation, the SAT and college enrollment. *Social Forces*, 89(2), 435–461. <https://doi.org/10.1353/sof.2010.0105>
- Carlsen, A. (2020). *Ensuring lifelong learning for all in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan: Country evidence and policy recommendations*. UNESCO Publishing.
- Chandara, T. (2011 June 24). *Rean Kua - Why Private Tutoring?* Retrieved from <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VKcuoKrJD0w>
- Chih-Hao C. (2019). Effects of Private Tutoring on English Performance: Evidence from Senior High Students in Taiwan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 68, 80–87. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2019.05.003>
- Chou, C. P. (2014). A matter of trust: shadow education in Taiwan. *Revue Internationale D'éducation De Sèvres/Revue Internationale D'éducation Sèvres*. <https://doi.org/10.4000/ries.3800>
- Chou, C. P., & Yuan, J. K. (2011). Buxiban in Taiwan. *International Institute for Asian Studies IIAS Newsletter*, 56(15), 1.
- Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2004). *Narrative Inquiry: Experience and Story in Qualitative Research*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2018). *Research Methods in Education* (8th ed.). London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315456539>
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches* (3rd ed.). SAGE.

- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (Eds.). (2018). *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research* (5th ed.). Los Angeles, CA: Sage.
- Dörnyei, Z. (2007). *Research methods in applied Linguistics: Quantitative, Qualitative, and Mixed Methodologies*. Oxford University Press, USA.
- EF English Proficiency Index. (2021). A ranking of 112 countries and regions by English Skills. Retrieved November 29, 2021, from <https://www.ef.com/assetscdn/WIBIwq6RdJvcD9bc8RMd/cefcom-epi-site/reports/2021/ef-epi-2021-english.pdf>
- Eng, R. (2019). The tutoring industry in Hong Kong: from the past four decades to the future. *ECNU Review of Education*, 2(1), 77–86.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/2096531119840857>
- Foondun, A. R. (2002). The issue of private tuition: An analysis of the practice in Mauritius and selected South-East Asian countries. *International Review of Education* 48 (6), 485-515.
- Frith, H., & Gleeson, K. (2004). Clothing and Embodiment: men managing body image and appearance. *Psychology of Men & Masculinity*, 5(1), 40–48.
<https://doi.org/10.1037/1524-9220.5.1.40>
- Godwin-Jones, R. (2016). Looking back and ahead: 20 years of technologies for language learning. *Language Learning & Technology* 20 (2), 5-12.
- Goodman, B., & Abdimanapova, L. (2020). Alignment, challenge, and agency: EFL teachers' perspectives on trilingual education and curriculum reform in Kazakhstan. *Asian EFL Journal*, 24(6), 73-102.

- <https://www.elejournals.com/asian-efl-journal/volume-24-issue-6-november-2020/>
- Gupta, A. (2023). The Nature and scope of English Private Tutoring: An analysis of the shadowing process and Middle-Class Identity in Globalising India. In *International Perspectives on English Private Tutoring: Theories, Practices, and Policies* (pp. 55–72). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-26817-5_4
- Hajar, A. (2023). Investing in English Private Tutoring to Achieve an Ideal Multilingual Self: Evidence from Post-Soviet Kazakhstan. In *Springer eBooks* (pp. 17–35).
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-26817-5_2
- Hajar, A., & Abenova, S. (2021). The role of private tutoring in admission to higher education: Evidence from a highly selective university in Kazakhstan. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*, 11(2), 124–142.
<https://doi.org/10.1556/063.2021.00001>
- Hajar, A., & Karakuş, M. (2023a). Throwing light on fee-charging tutoring during the global pandemic in Kazakhstan: implications for the future of higher education. *Asia Pacific Education Review*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-023-09831-7>
- Hajar, A., & Karakuş, M. (2023b). Private supplementary tutoring and educational inequality in secondary education in Kazakhstan. *Central Asian Survey*, 42(3), 617–636. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02634937.2023.2234420>
- Hajar, A., & Karakus, M. (2023c). Coming out of the shadows: investing in English private tutoring at a transition point in Kazakhstan’s education system during the

- global pandemic. *Language Learning Journal*, 1–14.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/09571736.2023.2213244>
- Hajar, A., & Mhamed, A. a. S. (2021b). Exploring Postgraduate students' challenges and strategy use while writing a master's thesis in an English-medium University in Kazakhstan. *Tertiary Education and Management*, 27(3), 187–207.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11233-021-09072-6>
- Hajar, A., & Yung, K. (2023). Private tutoring in English: lessons learnt and ways forward. In *Springer eBooks* (pp. 267–279). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-26817-5_15
- Hajar, A., Sagintayeva, A., & Izenkova, Z. (2021). Child participatory research methods: exploring grade 6 pupils' experiences of private tutoring in Kazakhstan. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 52(3), 369–389.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/0305764x.2021.2004088>
- Hajar, A., Sagintayeva, A., & Izenkova, Z. (2023d). Private supplementary tutoring at a transition point in Kazakhstan's education system: its scale, nature, and policy implications. *European Education*, 55(1), 16–29.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10564934.2023.2179926>
- Hallsén, S., & Karlsson, M. (2018). Teacher or friend? – consumer narratives on private supplementary tutoring in Sweden as policy enactment. *Journal of Education Policy*, 34(5), 631–646. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02680939.2018.1458995>
- Hamid, M. O., & Mahmud, R. (2023). The dynamics of private tutoring and the English language in Bangladesh. In *Springer eBooks* (pp. 95–112).
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-26817-5_6

- Hamid, M. O., Khan, A., & Islam, M. (2018). The spread of private tutoring in English in developing societies: exploring students' perceptions. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 39(6), 868–886.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2017.1308314>
- Hayes, N. (1997). Theory-led thematic analysis: social identification in small companies. In N. Hayes (Ed.), *Doing Qualitative Analysis in Psychology*. Hove, UK: Psychology Press.
- Ho, C. (2017). The new meritocracy or over-schooled robots? Public attitudes on Asian–Australian education cultures. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 43(14), 2346–2362. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183x.2017.1315855>
- Holloway, S. L., & Kirby, P. (2020). Neoliberalising education: new geographies of private tuition, class privilege, and minority ethnic advancement. *Antipode (Oxford. Print)*, 52(1), 164–184. <https://doi.org/10.1111/anti.12587>
- Ireson, J. (2004). Private tutoring: How prevalent and effective is it?. *London Review of Education*, 2(2), 109-122.
- Islam, A. S. M. (2015). *Language policy and practice in secondary school contexts in Bangladesh: Challenges to the implementation of language-in-education policy*. Unpublished PhD dissertation, Aalborg University, Denmark.
- Johnson, R. B., & Christensen, L. (2019). *Educational research: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed approaches*. Sage publications.
- Kalikova, S., & Rakhimzhanova, Z. (2009). Private tutoring in Kazakhstan. In I. Silova (Ed.), *Private supplementary tutoring in Central Asia: New opportunities and*

burdens (pp. 93-118). Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning.

Karabassova, L. (2021). English-medium education reform in Kazakhstan: comparative study of educational change across two contexts in one country. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 22(5), 553–573.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2021.1884436>

Karlsson, M. (2020). A question of time and place: student tutors' narrative identities in for- and non-profit contexts in Sweden. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 51(8), 1241–1256.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2020.1835462>

Khaydarov, S. (2020). Shadow Education in Uzbekistan: Teachers' perceptions of private tutoring in the context of Academic Lyceums. *Orbis Scholae*, 14(2), 81–104.

<https://doi.org/10.14712/23363177.2020.20>

Kim, Y. C. (2016). Shadow education and the curriculum and culture of schooling in South Korea. In *Palgrave Macmillan US eBooks*. <https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-51324-3>

Kim, Y. C., & Jung, J. (2019). Shadow Education as Worldwide Curriculum Studies. In *Springer eBooks*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-03982-0>

Kim, Y. C., & Jung, J. H. (2021). *Theorizing shadow education and academic success in East Asia: Understanding the meaning, value, and use of shadow education by East Asian students*. Routledge.

- Kozar, O., & Sweller, N. (2014). An exploratory study of demographics, goals, and expectations of private online language learners in Russia. *System*, 45, 39–51. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2014.04.005>
- Kwan-Terry, A. (1991). Home language and school language: A study of children's language use in Singapore. *Child language development in Singapore and Malaysia*, 12-34.
- Lasekan, O., Moraga, A., & Galvez, A. (2019). Online marketing by private english tutors in chile: a content analysis of a tutor listing website. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 18(12), 46-62.
- Lee, B. (2010). The pre-university English-educational background of college freshmen in a foreign language program: A tale of diverse private education and English proficiency. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11, 69-82.
- Mahmud, R., & Bray, M. (2017). School factors underlying demand for private supplementary tutoring in English: urban and rural variations in Bangladesh. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 37(3), 299–309. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2017.1321525>
- monitoring of private tutoring (pp. 71–98). Open Society Institute.
- Park, J. S. (2011). The promise of English: linguistic capital and the neoliberal worker in the South Korean job market. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 14(4), 443–455. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2011.573067>
- Park, J. S. (2015). Language as pure potential. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 37(5), 453–466. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2015.1071824>

- Patton, M. (2014). *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Patton, M.Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Psacharopoulos, G., & Patrinos*, H. A. (2004). Returns to investment in education: a further update. *Education economics*, 12(2), 111-134.
- Reagan, T. (2019). Language planning and language policy in Kazakhstan. In A. Kirpatrick & A. J. Liddicoat (Eds.), *The Routledge International Handbook of Language Education Policy in Asia* (pp. 442–451). Routledge.
- Roberts, P., & Priest, H. (2010). *Healthcare Research: A Textbook for students and Practitioners*. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell. <http://ci.nii.ac.jp/ncid/BB0558751X>
- Robertson, S. L., & Dale, R. (2016). Comparing education policies in a globalising world: methodological reflections. In *Education systems and inequalities* (pp. 33-50). Policy Press.
- Shamshidinova, K., Ayubayeva, N., & Bridges, D. (2014). Implementing radical change: Nazarbayev intellectual schools as agents of change. In D. Bridges (Ed.), *Educational reform and internationalisation : The case of school reform in Kazakhstan* (pp. 71-82). Cambridge University Press.
- Silova, I. (2010). Private tutoring in Eastern Europe and Central Asia: policy choices and implications. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 40(3), 327–344. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057920903361926>
- Silova, I. (Ed.). (2009). *Private supplementary tutoring in Central Asia* UNESCO.

- Silova, I., & Bray, M. (2006). Education in a hidden marketplace Monitoring of private tutoring Open Society Institute.
- Silova, I., & Kazimzade, E. (2006). Country Reports: Azerbaijan. *Education in a hidden marketplace: Monitoring of private tutoring*, 113-141.
- Silova, V. Būdiene, & M. Bray (Eds.), Education in a hidden marketplace: Monitoring of Private Tutoring, Open Society Institute.
- Sobhy, H. (2012). The de-facto privatization of secondary education in Egypt: a study of private tutoring in technical and general schools. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 42(1), 47–67.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2011.629042>
- Šťastný, V. (2017). Private tutoring lessons supply: insights from online advertising in the Czech Republic. *Compare*, 47(4), 561–579.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2016.1259064>
- Šťastný, V., & Kobakhidze, M. N. (2020). Throwing light on shadow education. *Orbis Scholae*, 14(2), 5–12.
- Stewart, S. (2015). A Mixed-Methods Study of extra lessons in Jamaica: Methodological Experiences and Reflections. In *Springer eBooks* (pp. 201–217).
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-30042-9_10
UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning.
- Ventura, A., & Jang, S. (2010). Private tutoring through the internet: globalization and offshoring. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 59–68.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-009-9065-5>

- Yamato, Y., & Zhang, W. (2017). Changing schooling, changing shadow: shapes and functions of jukuin Japan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 37(3), 329–343.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2017.1345719>
- Yilamu, W. (2018). Neoliberalism and Post-Soviet transition. In *Springer eBooks*.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-69221-0>
- Yung, K. (2020). Shadow education as a form of oppression: conceptualizing experiences and reflections of secondary students in Hong Kong. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 41(1), 115–129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2020.1727855>
- Yung, K. (2022a). Enhancing language learning in private tutoring. In *Routledge eBooks* (pp. 214–228). <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003048169-18>
- Yung, K. (2022b). Problematising students' preference for video-recorded classes in shadow education. *Educational Studies*, 48(5), 719–726.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2020.1814697>
- Yung, K. W. (2019). Exploring the L2 selves of senior secondary students in English private tutoring in Hong Kong. *System*, 80, 120–133.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2018.11.003>
- Yung, K. W. H. (2020). Investing in English private tutoring to move socially upward: a narrative inquiry of an underprivileged student in Hong Kong. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 41(10), 872–885.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2019.1660667>
- Yung, K. W. H. (2021). Hong Kong: Students' learning in shadow education. In *Theorizing Shadow Education and Academic Success in East Asia* (pp. 158–174). Routledge.

- Yung, K. W. H., & Bray, M. (2016). Shadow education: Features, expansion and implications. In *Making sense of education in post-handover Hong Kong* (pp. 107-123). Routledge.
- Yung, K., & Bray, M. (2021). Globalisation and the expansion of shadow education: Changing shapes and forces of private supplementary tutoring. In *Springer eBooks* (pp. 679–697). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-66003-1_39
- Yung, K., & Yuan, R. (2018). ‘The most popular star-tutor of English’: discursive construction of tutor identities in shadow education. *Discourse*, 41(1), 153–168. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2018.1488241>
- Yung, K.W.H., & Bray, M. (2017). Shadow Education: Features, Expansion and Implications. In *Making sense of education in post-handover Hong Kong: Achievements and challenges* In T. K. C. Tse&M. Lee (Eds.), pp. 95–111). Routledge.
- Zaman, S. (2020, June 2). Private tutors: No schools, no livelihood. *The Business Standard*. <https://www.tbsnews.net/feature/panorama/private-tutors-no-schools-no-livelihood-87628>
- Zaylobidinova, M. (2019). Shadow Education in Uzbekistan: Parents’ Perspectives in Demand for Private Tutoring in Secondary Schools in Ferghana. Unpublished Master’s Thesis
- Zaylobidinova, M. (2022). Commodification of education in the form of shadow education. *Academica : An International Multidisciplinary Research Journal*, 12(1), 200–206. <https://doi.org/10.5958/2249-7137.2022.00048.9>

- Zhang, W. (2019). Regulating private tutoring in China: uniform policies, diverse responses. *ECNU Review of Education*, 2(1), 25–43.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/2096531119840868>
- Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2017). Equalising schooling, unequalising private supplementary tutoring: access and tracking through shadow education in China. *Oxford Review of Education*, 44(2), 221–238. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03054985.2017.1389710>
- Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2020). Comparative research on shadow education: Achievements, challenges, and the agenda ahead. *European Journal of Education*, 55(3), 322–341. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12413>
- Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2021). A changing environment of urban education: historical and spatial analysis of private supplementary tutoring in China. *Environment and Urbanization*, 33(1), 43–62. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0956247820981820>
- Zhunuosova, G., Cortazzi, M., & Jin, L. (2021). Roles and models of English teachers in Kazakhstan. *World Englishes*, 41(1), 104–114.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/weng.12558>
- Zimmer, R., Hamilton, L., & Christina, R. (2010). After-school tutoring in the context of no child left behind: Effectiveness of two programs in the Pittsburgh public schools. *Economics of Education Review*, 29(1), 18-28.



Thesis Title: Determinants of Supply for English Private Tutoring: Voices of English Tutors in Kazakhstan

Appendix A – Declaration of the Use of Generative AI

I hereby declare that I have read and understood NUGSE’s policy concerning appropriate use of AI and composed this work independently (please check one):

- with the use of artificial intelligence tools, or
 without the use of artificial intelligence tools.

(If you have used AI tools as defined in the GSE policy document, please complete the rest of this form.)

During the preparation of this thesis/examination, I used Grammarly to fix grammatical mistakes in my thesis. _____

I also declare that I

- am aware of the capabilities and limitations of AI tool(s),
 have verified that the content generated by AI systems and adopted by me is factually correct,
 am aware that as the author of this thesis I bear full responsibility for the statements and assertions made in it,
 have submitted complete and accurate information about my use of AI tools in this work, and
 acknowledge that there may be disciplinary consequences if I have not followed NUGSE’s guidelines regarding AI appropriate use.

Name:

Signature:

Date:

¹ Examples of REASON: brainstorm ideas / find or select sources on a topic / paraphrase / structure and organize the written text / edit the text for clarity and grammar / ask for tips to improve coherence / cite and reference sources

Appendix B

Guiding Questions for the Written Narrative

1. Could you provide some information about your background and experience working as an English tutor?
2. When did you start learning English at school? What does English mean to you now?
3. How long have you been doing private tutoring? Which subjects do you provide private tutoring on? How many hours do you spend per week on your private tutoring classes?
4. When and why did you decide to start working as a private tutor?
5. What is the primary motivation of teachers in Kazakhstan to work in the private tutoring market?
6. How do economic factors such as financial stability or salary impact teachers' decisions to be English tutors in Kazakhstan?
7. What other factors may influence teachers' decisions? Are there any societal and cultural factors that make the private tutoring market more applicable?
8. What role does the growing interest in private tutoring for teachers in Kazakhstan play in the demand for English skills?
9. To what extent do teachers' development and training impact the level of quality and effectiveness of English private tutoring services in Kazakhstan?
10. What are the advantages and disadvantages of being a private tutor in Kazakhstan?

Вопросы к повествовательному эссе

1. Не могли бы вы предоставить некоторую информацию о своем образовании и опыте работы репетитором английского языка?
2. Какова основная мотивация учителей в Казахстане работать на рынке частного репетиторства?
3. Что было или остается вашей основной мотивацией для работы частным репетитором английского языка?
4. Как экономические факторы, такие как финансовая стабильность или заработная плата, влияют на решение учителей стать репетитором английского языка в Казахстане?
5. Какие еще факторы могут повлиять на решения учителей? Существуют ли какие-либо социальные и культурные факторы, которые делают рынок частного репетиторства более приемлемым?
6. Какую роль растущий интерес к частному репетиторству для учителей в Казахстане играет в спросе на знание английского языка?
7. Как знание английского языка влияет на успех и конкурентоспособность репетиторов английского языка на рынке частных репетиторских услуг в Казахстане?
8. В какой степени развитие и обучение учителей влияют на уровень качества и эффективности услуг частного репетиторства английского языка в Казахстане?
9. С какими основными профессиональными проблемами сталкиваются преподаватели английского языка в Казахстане?
10. Каковы преимущества и издержки работы репетитором английского языка в Казахстане?

Жазбаша баяндауға арналған нұсқаулық сұрақтар

1. Сіз өзіңіздің біліміңіз бен ағылшын тілінің тәрбиешісі ретіндегі тәжірибеңіз туралы біраз ақпарат бере аласыз ба?
2. Қазақстандағы мұғалімдердің жеке репетиторлық нарықта жұмыс істеуге негізгі уәждемесі қандай?
3. Ағылшын тілінің жеке оқытушысы болу үшін сіздің негізгі мотивацияңыз не болды немесе не болып қалады?
4. Қаржылық тұрақтылық немесе жалақы сияқты экономикалық факторлар мұғалімдердің Қазақстанда ағылшын тілінің оқытушысы болу шешіміне қалай әсер етеді?
5. Мұғалімдердің шешімдеріне тағы қандай факторлар әсер етуі мүмкін? Жеке репетиторлық нарықты қолайлы ететін әлеуметтік және мәдени факторлар бар ма?
6. Қазақстандағы мұғалімдер үшін жеке репетиторлыққа деген қызығушылықтың артуы ағылшын тілін білуге деген сұраныста қандай рөл атқарады?
7. Ағылшын тілін білу Қазақстандағы жеке репетиторлық қызметтер нарығында ағылшын тілі репетиторларының табысы мен бәсекеге қабілеттілігіне қалай әсер етеді?
8. Мұғалімдердің дамуы мен оқуы Қазақстандағы ағылшын тілінің жеке репетиторлық қызметтерінің сапасы мен тиімділігінің деңгейіне қаншалықты әсер етеді?
9. Қазақстанда ағылшын тілі оқытушылары қандай негізгі кәсіби проблемаларға тап болады?

10. Қазақстанда ағылшын тілі оқытушысы болудың артықшылықтары мен шығындары қандай?

Appendix C

Data collection instruments

Semi-structured Interview Questions

1. How does your view regarding private tutoring impact your decision to be an English tutor?
2. In your perspective, what are the primary personal and professional factors that drive educators in Kazakhstan to provide private English tutoring services?
3. How has Kazakhstan's economic situation, including employment and earnings stability, influenced your decision to be an English tutor?
4. How has the growing need for English language skills influenced the expansion of private tutoring for teachers in Kazakhstan?
5. As an English tutor, could you please elaborate on what specific English language skills Kazakhstani students want to improve?
6. Are there any differences in the demand for particular English language abilities among different age groups or professions in Kazakhstan's private tutoring market? If there are, could you provide further details on these differences?
7. What are the reasons for the high demand for these specific skills?

Полу структурированные вопросы для интервью

1. Как, по-вашему, мнение о частное репетиторстве повлияло на ваше решение стать репетитором английского языка?
2. С вашей точки зрения, каковы основные личные и профессиональные факторы, которые побуждают преподавателей в Казахстане предоставлять услуги частного репетиторства по английскому языку?
3. Как экономическая ситуация в Казахстане, включая факторы, а именно трудоустройства и стабильность заработка, повлияла на ваше решение стать репетитором английского языка?
4. Как растущая потребность в знании английского языка повлияла на расширение частного репетиторства для учителей в Казахстане?
5. Как преподаватель английского языка, не могли бы вы, пожалуйста, подробнее рассказать о том, какие конкретно навыки владения английским языком казахстанские студенты хотят улучшить?
6. Существуют ли какие-либо различия в спросе на знания определенных навыков английского языка среди разных возрастных групп или профессий на рынке частного репетиторства Казахстана? Если таковые имеются, не могли бы вы предоставить более подробную информацию об этих различиях?
7. В чем причины высокого спроса на эти специфические навыки?

Сұхбатқа арналған жартылай құрылымдалған сұрақтар

1. Сіздің жеке репетиторлық пікіріңіз ағылшын тілінің оқытушысы болу туралы шешіміңізге қалай әсер етті деп ойлайсыз?
2. Сіздің көзқарасыңыз бойынша, Қазақстандағы оқытушыларды ағылшын тілі бойынша жеке репетиторлық қызмет көрсетуге итермелейтін негізгі Жеке және кәсіби факторлар қандай?
3. Қазақстандағы экономикалық жағдай, оның ішінде факторлар, атап айтқанда жұмысқа орналасу және табыстың тұрақтылығы сіздің ағылшын тілінің оқытушысы болу шешіміңізге қалай әсер етті?
4. Ағылшын тілін білудің өсіп келе жатқан қажеттілігі Қазақстандағы мұғалімдер үшін жеке репетиторлықтың кеңеюіне қалай әсер етті?
5. Ағылшын тілі мұғалімі ретінде қазақстандық студенттер ағылшын тілін меңгерудің қандай дағдыларын жетілдіргісі келетіні туралы толығырақ айтып бере аласыз ба?
6. Қазақстанның жеке репетиторлық нарығында әртүрлі жас топтары немесе кәсіптер арасында ағылшын тілінің белгілі бір дағдыларын білуге сұраныста қандай да бір айырмашылықтар бар ма? Егер бар болса, сіз осы айырмашылықтар туралы толығырақ ақпарат бере аласыз ба?
7. Осы нақты дағдыларға жоғары сұраныстың себептері қандай?

Appendix D

Recruitment message for participants of this study

Dear X,

You have received this message because you are working in the private tutoring market. I am Zhanerke Kamilat, a second year Master's student at the Graduate School of Education, Nazarbayev University. I would be highly grateful if you could participate in my study, which examines factors influencing teachers' decisions to work as English private tutors. Your participation will be greatly appreciated. Online interviews will take approximately 30 to 40 minutes. However, please be informed that participation in this study is voluntary. You have the right not to answer the questions that make you feel uncomfortable, and you have the right to withdraw from the study at any time. Moreover, I guarantee you that your participation will be kept confidential, and I will employ a pseudonym on the interview transcript. If you have any other questions or concerns, please contact me via email at zhanerke.kamilat@nu.edu.kz or phone number +771 488 10 38.

I look forward to your participation in this study and appreciate your time.

Zhanerke Kamilat,

Master student at Nazarbayev University, Graduate School of Education.

Сообщение о наборе участников на участие в моем исследовании

Дорогой X,

Вы получили это сообщение, потому что работаете репетитором английского языка.

Я Жанерке Камилат, студентка второго курса магистратуры Высшей школы образования Назарбаев Университета. Я была бы очень признательна, если вы приняли участие в моем исследовании, которое рассматривает факторы, влияющие на решения учителей работать в качестве частных преподавателей английского языка. Ваше участие будет высоко оценено. Онлайн-интервью займет примерно 30–40 минут вашего времени. Вместе с тем я прошу вас принять к сведению, что участие в этом исследовании является добровольным. У вас есть право не отвечать на вопросы, которые заставляют вас чувствовать себя неудобно, и вы имеете право отказаться от участия в исследовании любое время. Кроме того, я гарантирую вам, что ваше участие будет конфиденциальным, и я использую псевдоним в расшифровке интервью. Если у вас есть другие вопросы по поводу участия в исследовании, пожалуйста, напишите мне на почту zhanerke.kamilat@nu.edu.kz или же на мой личный номер +771 488 10 38.

Я с нетерпением ожидаю вашего участия в этом исследовании и ценю ваше уделенное время.

Жанерке Камилат,

Магистрант Высшей школы образования в Назарбаев Университет.

**Менің зерттеуіме қатысушыларды тартуға арналған
хабарлама**

Құрметті Х,

Сіз бұл хабарламаны ағылшын тілінің тәрбиешісі ретінде жұмыс істегендіктен алдыңыз.

Мен Жанерке Камилат, Назарбаев Университетінің жоғары білім беру мектебінің магистратурасының екінші курс студентімін. Егер сіз мұғалімдердің жеке ағылшын тілі мұғалімдері ретінде жұмыс істеу шешімдеріне әсер ететін факторларды қарастыратын менің зерттеуіме қатысқан болсаңыз мен өте ризамын. Сіздің қатысуыңыз жоғары бағаланады. Онлайн сұхбат сіздің уақытыңыздың шамамен 30-40 минутын алады.

Сонымен қатар, мен сізден осы зерттеуге қатысу ерікті екенін ескеруіңізді сұраймын. Сіз өзіңізді ыңғайсыз сезінетін сұрақтарға жауап бермеуге құқығыңыз бар және кез келген уақытта зерттеуге қатысудан бас тартуға құқығыңыз бар.

Сонымен қатар, мен сіздің қатысуыңыз құпия болатынына кепілдік беремін және сұхбат транскрипциясында бүркеншік атты қолданамын. Егер сізде зерттеуге қатысу туралы басқа сұрақтарыңыз болса, маған электрондық пошта арқылы жіберіңіз zhanerke.kamilat@nu.edu.kz немесе менің жеке нөміріме +771 488 10 38.

Мен сіздің осы зерттеуге қатысуыңызды асыға күтемін және сіздің уақытыңызды бағалаймын.

Жанерке Камилат,

Назарбаев Университетінің Жоғары Білім Беру Мектебінің магистратурасының екінші курс студенті.

Appendix E

INFORMED CONSENT FORM

Determinants of Supply for English Private Tutoring: Voices of English Tutors in Kazakhstan

You are invited to participate in a research study by Zhanerke Kamilat, a second-year Master of Arts in Multilingual Education student at Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education. This study is aimed to explore the factors that influence and motivate teachers for English private tutoring (EPT) in Kazakhstan.

Procedures: You will be asked to answer 10-15 questions about your experiences working as an English tutor, the challenges you encountered, and factors that affected your choice to be an English tutor through narrative writing and online individual interviews. If you grant permission, I will tape-record the responses, as they will be used in further analysis. If you do not wish to be recorded, I can take notes while you answer the questions.

Time involvement: You will be given 6-8 days to write your narratives. After the narratives will be analyzed, and you will be invited to individual interviews. The approximate time that individual semi-structured interviews will take is around 30 to 40 minutes.

Risks and benefits: There are minimal risks associated with participation in the study. I intend to take the required steps to protect your confidentiality from possible risks. I will use a pseudonym instead of your name and instead of the name of the school on the interview transcript. Additionally, I will ensure that the transcripts and the file that connects the pseudonyms with actual names are safeguarded through password protection on my laptop. At the end of the investigation of this study, the voice file will be erased. Furthermore, any identifying details will be removed from the final version of the dissertation or written report to safeguard your anonymity. Finally, all password-protected files shall be removed from the computer upon completing the study.

You will not receive any tangible compensation. Participants will receive no direct benefits in participating in this study. However, your responses can help the researcher learn more about English private tutoring, Linguistics entrepreneurship, and Neoliberalism in the context of Kazakhstan. The indirect benefit of this research is the possibility of sharing information about the factors that impact teachers' decisions to work as private tutors. Any publication of this study accessible to the public will not disclose your personal identifiers, namely your name or any other personal information that may be used to identify you.

Participants' rights: Your participation in this study is voluntary. Although questions are not intended to be sensitive, if at any point you do not wish to answer a question, you may decline to respond. If you wish to withdraw from the project, you may do so at any time, and all the information (tapes, notes) will be deleted. Please be informed that the results of this study will be used for writing a Master's thesis or might also be presented

at conferences or published in scientific journals. If you have questions or want a copy or summary of this study's results, please contact me by email or phone number below.

CONTACT INFORMATION:

Researcher: Zhanerke Kamilat

Master of Arts in Multilingual Education second-year student
Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education

Phone number: +7 771 488 1038

Email: zhanerke.kamilat@nu.edu.kz

Questions: If you have any questions, concerns, or complaints about this research, its procedures, risks, and benefits, contact the master's Thesis Supervisor for this student work, Syed Abdul Manan, via email at syed.manan@nu.edu.kz.

Please sign this consent form if you agree to participate in this study.

- I have carefully read the information provided;
- I confirm that I am 18 or I am older than 18;
- I have been given complete information regarding the purpose and procedures of the study;
- I understand how the data collected will be used and that any confidential information will be seen only by the researcher and will not be revealed to anyone else;
- I understand that I am free to withdraw from the study at any time without giving a reason;
- With full knowledge of all preceding, I agree to participate in this study of my own free will.
- I give my permission to audio record the interview: Yes _No _

Participant

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Researcher

Signature: _____ Date: _____

ФОРМА ИНФОРМИРОВАННОГО СОГЛАСИЯ

Изучение факторов, влияющих на частное обучение английскому языку учителей в Казахстане

Приглашаем вас принять участие в исследовании Жанерке Камилат, студентки второго курса магистратуры в области многоязычного образования, Высшей школы образования в Назарбаев университет. Данное исследование направлено на изучение факторов, которые влияют и мотивируют учителей работать частным репетитором английского языка в Казахстане.

Процедуры: Вас попросят ответить на 10-15 вопросов о вашем опыте работы репетитором английского языка, проблемах, с которыми вы столкнулись, и факторах, повлиявших на ваш выбор в качестве репетитора английского языка, посредством написания повествования и индивидуальных онлайн-интервью. Если вы дадите разрешение, я сделаю запись ваших ответов, поскольку они будут использованы при дальнейшем анализе. Если вы не хотите, чтобы вас записывали, я могу делать заметки, пока вы отвечаете на вопросы.

Временная вовлеченность: Вам будет дано 6-8 дней на написание ваших рассказов. После того, как рассказы будут проанализированы, вас пригласят на индивидуальные интервью. Приблизительное время, которое займет индивидуальное интервью составляет около 30-40 минут.

Риски и выгоды: Есть минимальные риски, связанные с участием в исследовании. Я намерена предпринять необходимые шаги для защиты вашей конфиденциальности от возможных рисков. Я буду использовать псевдоним вместо вашего имени и названия школы в транскрипции интервью. Кроме того, я позабочусь о том, чтобы файлы с транскрипцией, который связывает псевдонимы с реальными именами, были защищены паролем на моем ноутбуке. По окончании этого исследования голосовые файлы будет удалены. Кроме того, любые данные которые идентифицируют вас будут удалены из окончательной версии диссертации или письменного отчета, чтобы сохранить вашу анонимность. Наконец, все файлы будут защищены паролем и удалены с компьютера по завершении исследования.

Вы не получите никакой ощутимой компенсации. Участники не получают никаких прямых преимуществ от участия в этом исследовании. Однако ваши ответы могут помочь исследователю узнать больше о частном репетиторстве английского языка, лингвистическом предпринимательстве и неолиберализме в Казахстанском контексте. Косвенным преимуществом этого исследования является возможность обмена информацией о факторах, влияющих на решения учителей работать частными репетиторами английского языка. Любая публикация этого исследования, доступная общественности, не будет раскрывать ваши персональные данные, а именно ваше имя или любую другую личную информацию, которая может быть использована идентификации вашей личности.

Права участников: Ваше участие в данном исследовании является добровольным. Хотя вопросы не предназначены для того, чтобы быть деликатными, если в какой-либо момент вы не захотите отвечать на вопрос, вы можете отказаться отвечать.

Если вы хотите уйти из проекта, вы можете сделать это в любое время, и вся информация (записи, заметки) будет удалены. Пожалуйста, имейте в виду, что результаты этого исследования будут использованы для написания магистерской диссертации, а также могут быть представлены на конференциях или опубликованы в научных журналах. Если у вас есть вопросы или вы хотите получить копию или краткое изложение результатов этого исследования, пожалуйста, свяжитесь со мной по электронной почте или по номеру телефона, указанному ниже.

КОНТАКТНАЯ ИНФОРМАЦИЯ:

Исследователь: Жанерке Камилат

Магистр искусств в области многоязычного образования, студент второго курса

Высшая школа образования Назарбаев университета

Номер телефона: +7 771 488 1038

Электронная почта: zhanerke.kamilat@nu.edu.kz

Вопросы: Если у вас есть какие-либо вопросы, опасения или жалобы по поводу этого исследования, его процедур, рисков и преимуществ, свяжитесь с научным руководителем магистерской диссертации по этой студенческой работе Сайед Абдулом Мананом по электронной почте по адресу syed.manan@nu.edu.kz.

Пожалуйста, подпишите эту форму согласия, если вы согласны участвовать в этом исследовании.

- Я внимательно ознакомился с предоставленной информацией;
- Я подтверждаю, что мне 18 лет или я старше 18;
- Мне была предоставлена полная информация относительно цели и процедур исследования;
- Я понимаю, как будут использоваться собранные данные и что любая конфиденциальная информация будет видна только исследователю и не будет раскрыта никому другому;
- Я понимаю, что я волен отказаться от участия в исследовании в любое время без объяснения причин;
- Полностью осознавая все вышесказанное, я соглашаюсь участвовать в этом исследовании по собственной воле.
- Я даю свое разрешение на аудиозапись интервью: Да _ Нет _

Участник

Подпись: _____ Дата: _____

Исследователь

Подпись: _____ Дата: _____

АҚПАРАТТАНДЫРЫЛҒАН КЕЛІСІМ НЫСАНЫ

Қазақстанда ағылшын тілінен дербес репетиторлықпен айналысатын мұғалімдерге әсер ететін факторларды зерттеу

Сіздерді Назарбаев Университетіндегі Жоғары Білім Беру Мектебінің Көптілді білім беру магистрлік бағдарламасының екінші курс студенті Камилат Жанеркенің зерттеуіне қатысуға шақырамыз. Бұл зерттеу жұмысы Қазақстан мұғалімдерін ағылшын тілінің репетиторы ретінде жұмыс істеуге ынталандыратын және олардың шешіміне әсер ететін факторларды зерттеуге бағытталған.

Өткізу рәсімі: сізге өзіңіздің ағылшын тілінің репетиторы ретіндегі тәжірибеңіз, туындаған мәселелер және ағылшын тілінің репетиторы болу шешіміңізге әсер еткен факторлар туралы 10-15 сұраққа эссе жазу және жеке онлайн сұхбат беру арқылы жауап беру қажет болады. Сіздің рұқсатыңызбен, мен сіздің жауаптарыңызды таспаға жазып аламын, өйткені олар әрі қарай талдау кезінде қолданылады. Егер сіз жауаптарыңыздың таспаға жазылуын қаламасаңыз, мен сіз сұрақтарға жауап берген кезде қолдан жазбалар жасайтын боламын.

Қатысу уақыты: сізге эссе жазуға 6-8 күн беріледі. Эсселер талданғаннан кейін сіз жеке сұхбатқа шақырыласыз. Жеке сұхбат шамамен 30-40 минут уақытыңызды алады.

Зерттеу жұмысына қатысудың қауіптері мен артықшылықтар: зерттеуге қатысумен байланысты қауіп мөлшері минималды. Мен сіздің жеке ақпаратыңызды ықтимал қауіптерден қорғау үшін қажетті шараларды қабылдайтын боламын. Мен сұхбат транскрипциясында сіздің атыңыз бен мектебіңіздің атауының орнына лақап ат қолданатын боламын. Сонымен қатар, лақап атты шынайы аттарыңызбен байланыстыратын транскрипцияланған файлдардың құпия сөзбен қорғалған ноутбукта сақталуын қамтамасыз етемін. Зерттеу аяқталған соң сұхбаттың аудио жазбалары жойылады. Сонымен қатар, сіздің тұлғаңызды әшкерелей алатын кез келген деректер сіздің тұлғаңызды жасырын сақтау үшін диссертацияның немесе жазбаша есептің соңғы нұсқасынан жойылады. Ақырында, барлық файлдар құпия сөзбен қорғалады және зерттеу аяқталғаннан кейін ноутбуктен жойылады.

Сіз қатысқаныңыз үшін елеулі өтемақы алмайсыз. Қатысушылар бұл зерттеуге қатысудан тікелей пайда көрмейді. Алайда сіздің жауаптарыңыз зерттеушіге қазақстандық контекстте ағылшын тілінің дербес репетиторлығы, тілдік кәсіпкерлік және неолиберализм туралы білімін тереңдетуге көмектеседі. Бұл зерттеудің жанама артықшылығы - мұғалімдердің ағылшын тілінің дербес репетиторы ретінде жұмыс істеу шешімдеріне әсер ететін факторлар туралы ақпарат алмасу мүмкіндігі. Осы зерттеудің кез-келген жариялануы сіздің жеке деректеріңізді, атап айтқанда, сіздің атыңызды немесе сіздің жеке басыңызбен сәйкестендіруге болатын кез-келген жеке ақпаратты жария етпейді.

Қатысушылардың құқықтары: сіздің бұл зерттеуге қатысуыңыз ерікті болып табылады. Сұрақтар шетін болатындай етіп құрастырылмағанымен, егер сіз кез

келген бір уақытта сұраққа жауап бергіңіз келмесе, жауап беруден бас тарта аласыз. Егер сіз зерттеу жобасынан кеткіңіз келсе, оны кез келген уақытта жасай аласыз және сізге қатысты барлық ақпарат (жазбалар, жазбалар) жойылатын болады. Бұл зерттеудің нәтижелері магистрлік диссертация жазу үшін пайдаланылатынын және конференцияларда ұсынылуы немесе ғылыми журналдарда жариялануы мүмкін екенін есте сақтаңыз. Егер сізде сұрақтар туындаса немесе осы зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесін немесе қысқаша мазмұнын алғыңыз келсе, маған электрондық пошта немесе төменде көрсетілген телефон нөмірі арқылы хабарласа аласыз.

БАЙЛАНЫС АҚПАРАТЫ:

Зерттеуші: Камилат Жанерке

Көптілді білім беру саласындағы магистрлік бағдарламасының екінші курс студенті

Назарбаев Университетінің Жоғары Білім Беру Мектебі

Телефон нөмірі: +7 771 488 1038

Электрондық пошта: zhanerke.kamilat@nu.edu.kz

Сұрақтар: егер сізде осы зерттеуге, оның өткізілу рәсімдеріне, тәуекелдері мен артықшылықтарына қатысты сұрақтарыңыз, алаңдаушылықтарыңыз немесе шағымдарыңыз болса, бұл студенттік жұмыстың магистрлік диссертация жетекшісі Сайед Абдул Мананмен электрондық пошта арқылы байланыса аласыз syed.manan@nu.edu.kz.

Егер сіз осы зерттеуге қатысуға келіссеңіз, осы келісім нысанына қол қойыңыз.

- Мен берілген ақпаратпен мұқият таныстым;
- Мен 18 жастамын немесе 18 жастан асқанымды растаймын;
- Маған зерттеудің мақсаты мен өткізу рәсімдері туралы толық ақпарат берілді;
- Мен жиналған деректердің қалай пайдаланылатынын және кез келген құпия ақпарат тек зерттеушіге қол жетімді болатынын және басқа ешкімге ашылмайтынын түсінемін;
- Мен еш түсіндірусіз кез келген уақытта зерттеуге қатысудан бас тарта алатынымды түсінемін;
- Жоғарыда айтылғандардың барлығын толық біле отырып, мен бұл зерттеуге өз еркіммен қатысуға келісемін.
- Мен сұхбаттың таспаға жазылуына рұқсат беремін: Иә _ Жоқ

Қатысушы

Қолы: _____ Күні: _____

Зерттеуші

Қолы: _____ Күні: _____

Appendix F

Interview Coding Sample (Excerpt)

Interview transcripts	Inductive codes	Themes based on codes	Main themes
<p>“<u>I am flexible</u> and that’s why <u>I can take on so many other projects to try myself</u>”.</p>	Flexibility	Flexible work hours	Factors driving the decision to be an English tutor
<p>“<u>Freedom of choice in making my own timetable and deciding what materials</u> to use, making more money, all that probably motivated me the most”.</p>	Freedom of choice	The possibility to choose students and set rates	Factors driving the decision to be an English tutor
<p>“I can cancel if I’m sick or I can reschedule the lesson. That is, a <u>very comfortable, comfortable job</u>. You don’t have to go anywhere. You are sitting at home and drinking tea”.</p>	Comfortable job	Flexible teaching mode	Factors driving the decision to be an English tutor

Appendix G

Transcription Sample of Interview

Researcher: Okay, Natalia, so how are you today? Is everything going well? Yeah, I'm good, thank you. So you wrote in your narrative that you have been working for eight and a half years as a private tutor in schools. Can you tell me exactly how long you have worked in a school, private university, or educational center? Which?

Participant: I started working at the language centers since I was 19. So I've been teaching English, and I was preparing students to take a United National test, and then I started preparing them for the IELTS test. So, I've been doing this for a pretty long time since I was 19. As for the school experience, I worked at the school for a year, for the whole year. It was a state school in a very small town in East Kazakhstan. I worked at the university, but I didn't teach there. I was working as the head of the International Relations Department.

Researcher: Interesting. So, now you're a private and English tutor, yes?

Participant: Yes.

Researcher: So, you're working on your own like a freelancer, or you're still working in an educational center. Is it an educational center? Hello? Yeah, can you repeat the question, please? Sure. So now you're working as a private tutor, an English tutor freelancer, or you're working in an educational center? I'm a freelancer. Okay, so you're working on your own, yeah? Alright, interesting. So, when did you start to work as a freelancer?

Participant: The second was in... Actually, I worked as a part-time freelance English tutor from 2017, I guess, but as a full-time freelance worker, if we can say so, it was from 2019. Yeah, that was the year when I started working on my own.

Participant: Interesting. So, do you usually teach online or offline? Both. It is mostly online, but up until 2021, it was offline as well.

Researcher: So, you have a variety of students, yeah? Children, so you teach everyone? Children, teenagers, adults, or do you have a specific category?

Participant: I'm mostly focused on preparing my students for IELTS. Usually, my students are those studying at high school, adults, or students at the university. But as I also teach general English, I can take children and teenagers, so there is a variety of age groups. Again, I would repeat that during the last two years, even more so during the last three years, I guess I've been mostly focused on preparing my students for IELTS. That's why I mostly work with high school students, university students, and adults.

Researcher: Interesting. You also said that you're spending around 20 hours on average on your teaching, yeah? And how do you keep a work-life balance? Is it easy to keep it with 20 hours of work?

Participant: Yes, it is because I don't think 20 hours of working is too much. I think it is. It's quite, yeah, there's quite little to say. And yes, I managed to balance my life pretty well because I, as a freelancer, can basically schedule my week the way I want it to be. I am also involved in many other projects. For example, I am a partnership coordinator at the Kazakhstani Association of English Language Teachers. I also have several more projects that I am working on.

Researcher: Except for teaching, you're working on some projects and earning money from them, right? Do you think all these things sufficiently cover all your living expenses?

Participant: No, because several of my projects are non-paid. For example, the Kazakhstani Association of English Language Teachers is a non-paid job I am doing. That's why it doesn't cover any of my financial needs. At the same time, I work part-time at my in-laws company. So that's why, again, I'm working there as a non-paying helper. That's why I don't get paid. That's why, again, it doesn't cover. So, actually, if I wanted all my financial expenses to be covered, I would definitely take more students, but because my priorities are not that right now, that's why I take fewer students to cover more projects.

Researcher: Interesting. So you're covering these two projects on voluntary-based. So you just help. Yeah. Interesting. So let's come back to your lessons. What are the factors? Like how do you charge per lesson? So does the price depend on the number of people in the group or the number of hours? How do you usually charge your students per lesson?

Participant: It depends on what I'm teaching. It depends on, again, the number of students that I'm teaching. So basically, I do have some money that I think my time costs, and the more students there are, the less the payment is for them.

Researcher: So are you teaching groups now? So are you dividing your students by groups or individual? Yeah, like this? Yes. Okay. All right. Interesting. And could you please tell me what is going on according to your narrative? You said that one of the skills in demand is the productive ones, productive ones, for sure, you wrote. So it means they want more speaking, yeah, they want their speaking to be developed and writing. So, my other participants said that the majority of their students want their speaking to improve their speaking, mostly. So why do **you think students need productive skills?** Why are productive skills in high demand?

Researcher: Because nobody teaches them at school. That's the reason. When I was studying at school when I was teaching at school, I definitely get the understanding that teachers right now, they don't have enough time or they don't have enough qualification to teach their students speak properly, to teach their students formulate their ideas properly in either way in spoken or written form. So that's why again, the students come and say that, oh, you know, I can hear well, I, I'm my listening is quite good. I can read the books, and I pretty much understand very much of the film that I'm watching, but I can't speak, but I can try.

I have so many requests for formal writing. So it's like, please teach me how to write emails. I'm working at AIFC and I have to write emails every day, but I don't know how to do this. So, or something like, I don't like, I don't, I can't formulate any kind of email for my job. And that's why again, the writing and speaking are in high demand, let's say for students.

Researcher: But for your students, for your high school students, those for your IELTS preparation, is the speaking also in a high demand and writing?

Participant: Yeah, definitely. Especially for IELTS, if we can see the basic exam again, the end, it happens worldwide. It doesn't happen only for my students or for students of Kazakhstan, it happens worldwide. The productive skills are those which are more difficult to develop, which are more difficult to improve, because it actually involves much more mental work that the mind does. And that's why again, the students find it

difficult to find the ideas in the head and then to formulate them. That's why again, high school students, I think that even the younger the student is, the more difficult it is for him to speak well, to speak coherently, to produce a piece of writing, which is coherent, which is grammatically correct, or which is, for IELTS, there is a criterion called task response, which says exactly, yeah, which says exactly how well the students question was answered. This criterion is one of the most difficult ones. Because students, especially high school students, they simply don't know how to answer the question so that you answer it. And you don't write fluff instead of writing the answer. And this is a problem for speaking or writing both of them. And I think again, when the student is young, it is harder for the student to formulate the answer.

Researcher: Okay, good. Interesting that you're sharing with your working experience as an IELTS tutor, yeah? Can you tell me about any trends or changes in English private tutoring market? Is it now growing in Kazakhstan?

Participant: Yes, definitely. There are so many freelance teachers now. And I think that the market had been developing for the last six years, maybe since 2017. There were so many language centers that have been opening and it continues. This trend is on the rise. And now with the coronavirus pandemic, the number of online centers had increased tremendously. So I think that, yeah, it happens. It happens.

Researcher: So it means anyone could be a private tutor, English private tutor, yes?

Participant: Unfortunately, yes. I don't like both. I don't understand many of the things other teachers or other language centers are doing, especially in terms of their qualifications. So sometimes I see teachers who are underqualified who actually can not do this, but they do this. Or vice versa. As again, I focus on IELTS preparation. I see across the country, there are so many language centers which provide IELTS preparation with tutors who are not qualified to do this, who actually cannot do this very well. This is a problem which actually, yeah, I'm here. So yeah. Yeah. Yeah, that's a problem, yeah, with the quality of lessons and the quality of teachers, yeah? Quality of teaching. Right. Just a second. Give me a second.

Researcher: So, and how do you keep improving your skills? How do you keep your skills? and keep on growing your professionalism, if I can say like that. Do you...

Participant: First of all, yeah, I'm pretty much involved in CPD. And what I'm doing is again, a non-paid voluntary work at Kazakhstan Association of English Language Teachers is that promoting CPD development for teachers, English teachers across the country. So what I'm doing exactly to improve myself is that I'm involved in many CPD courses, for example, one that I'm enrolled in right now. I finish it next week. It is the course produced by Bridge Council. It is this like kind of a specially designed CPD course for English teachers. And I think it is held worldwide because we have groups from other countries as well. So actually, yeah, so the one course that I'm doing is CPT course from British Council. Another one is that I'm involved in the Kazakh Standard Association of English Language Teachers, where we actually conduct webinars and we organize the events and we go on the meetings, meetups with our regional groups, with the regional coordinators. So we are actually developing that. Then I'm preparing myself to take other exams, including Tiki, Celta, Delta and all the other stuff. So yeah, this is what I'm doing, including visiting seminar conferences and the whole bunch of things.

Researcher: Wow, interesting. So you're doing a lot. You're doing actually a lot to be the professional in this sphere. My question, another question about your clients and

students, are they asking about any certificates? For example, you mentioned Delta, yeah. Are they asking, like, do you have any certificates? Can you prove that you're a good teacher? For example,

Participant: no, they don't. Mostly my students, they come with the help of word. So by recommendation, for sure. And I'm sure that 80% of people in our country, or even 90% of people in our country, have no idea what Delta is or what Celta is. They've just heard about what... They've heard this word and they think that it's a fancy one. So if they hear that Delta has Celta, they think, oh, yeah, I heard this word, so it's a fancy one. So she must be fancy. So this is how they regard this. But I also don't understand pretty much of that. I don't think that the team... who has taken cell toll with Delta can be regarded as the perfect tutor. Because this is also difficult, right? So you can have this certificate, but still your lessons can be dull, can be not very efficient.

So it doesn't prove anything for me. And then as for what? As for these certificates, I think that probably in the next five years, this situation may change because now, again, I see a great development of some sort of rating teachers in terms of their qualification. So the higher your qualification is, the higher your price is.

Researcher: So the price will depend on this as well, yeah? Interesting. So what does it mean being a qualified private tutor? What do you have to have? Like you're saying that having a certificate might not be enough, but can you describe an ideal, maybe something close to ideal private tutor?

Yeah, it's a difficult one. The criteria would definitely include the students' happiness, like how happy the students are, how efficient the classes are. Let's say, yeah, I would regard the beauty of a teacher from the efficiency of its students, of his or her students. If the students are efficient, if the students are happy, if the students understand what they are taught, then the teacher is good. I think that it's the only thing that I would regard. But then I could also include other criteria, including the interesting lessons, interactive exercises, and then the use of different resources, practicing all four skills. I mean, speaking and reading like productive and receptive ones. And then, and the whole bunch of that stuff. What about motivation? Motivation. Motivation of home. Motivation of teachers to teach. I would say that it's not the criterion, but it would be seen in the results of the students.

When the teacher is not motivated, the lessons are bad, or the lessons are not good enough. Yeah, and the students, they actually feel it. And then the students lose their motivation. So again, if students are motivated, if students are efficient, then it means that the teacher is definitely a good one. So the teacher is. at some point, motivated to do either her job.

Researcher: Okay. What motivates you to teach and to help people with the volunteering things, except helping people that you mentioned in your narrative, except this? What motivates you?

Participant: The success that they get, the success that they earn, the results that they get, is the only thing that motivates me now. So when I see that my students enter Ivy League universities, or when I see that my students get the highest progress that they could have dreamt about, this motivates me.

Researcher: So you're helping your students to achieve their goals and to make their dreams come true. Yeah, so this is one of the reasons. Okay, very interesting. What... Can you tell me a little bit more about the advantages and disadvantages of being a private

tutor? In the advantages section, you only mentioned flexibility, and in the disadvantages section, you mentioned fewer options for CPD. CPD becomes more expensive in some cases. Can you elaborate a little bit more on this? What about the advantages and disadvantages of being a private tutor?

Participant: In Kazakhstan, exactly. As for the disadvantage, I would definitely say it is the peeling of loneliness. Again, I am involved in the Association of English-Language Teachers because when you teach online or as a private tutor, you don't have that much teaching community. And that's why people may feel excluded from it, excluded from the updates on education and methodology, let's say. So, yeah, this is the disadvantage for me. So, there were no meetups, fun, team building, or nothing. That's why, again, like the Kazakhstan Association of English-Language Teachers, we solve this problem, and we have meetups to help freelance teachers not feel left out. As for the advantages, it's definitely the financial one. Yeah, so I'm sure that everyone's talking about the finances. So again, you can... get more money; you are not that dependent on anyone. So, the one thing I like most about being a private user is that I can arrange my time how I want it to be. I don't have to ask for a day off when needed. I don't have to arrange my time again at around some conference or a seminar, which I must attend because my principal said I must attend it, but I'm not interested in that at all.

Yeah. Interesting. So flexibility and financial benefits. Yeah, I would say something like this: That's the main reason why you're a private tutor.

Researcher: Okay, and I think you can also add here that you can choose your own students, the people you want to work with, right?

Yes, but I'm not that person who actually chooses. I was thinking that one of the advantages instead of being a priority is that you don't need to follow the student book that the government had actually asked you to use on your lessons. You may choose whatever information you want and you may create a lesson in the way that you want. And what I like most probably is that nobody comes and assesses my teaching, let's say so, because I hate when some fancy methodologist from the regional office of administration comes and says, yeah, I'm going to assess the lesson that you were teaching and it's going to be the open lesson. So I hated that when I was teaching, even though my lessons were good, I didn't get any bad remarks on my teaching. Yet, I did like that a lot because... and that poses so much stress on both teacher and students and everyone, including the head of the department, the principal, so everyone.

And yeah, that's not good. Something that I don't like and something that I like in private teaching that I can arrange and I can assess myself pretty pretty well. Yeah, so I can say what I did wrong, what could be improved. And probably, again, if our system of CPD in Kazakhstan, now I am in the working group for British Council and we are developing the framework for the Ministry of Education on the matter of CPD. So we are developing a framework, some kind of a big document with recommendations of what could be developed and what could be improved.

In the CPD for teachers and EFL teachers in Kazakhstan. And this is something that we mentioned: the amount of those who control you, the number of people who control you, is immense. At the same time, there are no mentors who would actually help you with your problems. One of the things again, which I liked at the Kazakhstanian Association of English Language Teachers, is that it is a community where nobody controls you, but it helps you. So if a teacher comes and says, my first-grade students shout, and they don't

listen to me, we find the solution; we find the person who can help with that. So instead of judging and instead of pointing the figures and saying, yeah, Miss Natalia is a bad teacher because her students are not listening to her and something like that. So this was again, like the school or any university is under total control of everyone, everyone who feels obliged to do this.

Researcher: Interesting. So do you see yourself in five years as a private tutor? Would you still continue this journey as a private tutor in the next five years? I can't say for sure. I'm still thinking on what I can do, what I can do, what else? Let's say what else I can do with this. So, for now, again, as I said, what I like in a private tutor job is not a private tutor. That I am flexible, and that's why I take so many other projects to try myself. And that's why I cannot promise you that, like, in five years, I'll still be teaching like 20 hours per week. But still, what I think is that I may leave it as a hobby. Now, I have several colleagues, and one is my kind of role model.

She was my English teacher when I started school and now she's my colleague. So basically, she's involved in so many other projects, but she's still, even though she's like 60, maybe I don't know how old she is right now, like 55, 60. So even though she's quite old right now, yeah, so she's an aged person. She still teaches because she regards it as her hobby. It's the way to stay young is the way to stay updated. It's the way to be energetic.

Because children get this energy, and children give this energy, this is a mutual connection. That's why I'm thinking of leaving tutoring as a hobby and maybe doing something else part-time.

Researcher: Okay, my last question. Do you think private tutoring is rewarding? No, for me, no. Private tutoring is not as rewarding as it is of being a state school teacher. I don't know why. Maybe it is because students pay exactly you to get their education or anything; there is nothing else. But definitely, the teacher who works at school is more, let's say, more probably respected by the students, is more praised by the students. By the surroundings, probably. But again, I would definitely mention that teachers at school are immersed in all of these bad comments from teachers, the community, parents, and students. So, this is also enough for them. But again, I don't think that private tutoring is so rewarding that it's an attractive job that everybody should be teaching them. I don't think so.

What's more, after I talked to the teacher and many professionals. For example, I had a chance to talk with Ben Nelson. He is a founder and a professor at the Minerva University. So it's the most innovative university in the world. He had founded it. And I've talked to him about the future of teaching and on the future of tutoring.

We agreed that it could be substituted by AI in the foreseeable future. And he accepted that. He agreed with me. And he said, yes, the teacher and tutor will be substituted by an AI. So that's why I don't think it is rewarding now.

So yeah, I can say that at some point, yes, it is rewarding because when you see students actually thankful for the results they get, they can be helpful for the success they receive with your help, for example. But again, with the tutors, it is much more like come and go. So students come, students go, students come, students go, they forget about you, totally forget about you, but they never forget their school teachers.

Researcher: Yeah, and sometimes people think this is not a serious job. Thank you, Natalia, for this fantastic interview. You provide me with so much data. I need to think

now about all of these and analyze them. Thank you for participating in my thesis research. I really appreciate it. So, we have less than a minute, so it might finish. Yeah. Thank you so much. Have a nice evening. Bye-bye.
Thank you.

