## **Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating**

### the Transition of Students with Special Needs from

### Home-Based Education to School Attendance in Kazakhstan

Gulzada Jubanova

Master of Science

in

Educational Leadership

Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education

April 2024

Word Count: 15445

#### **AUTHOR AGREEMENT**

By signing and submitting this license, I Jubanova Gulzada Sagidullayevna (the author or copyright owner) grant to Nazarbayev University (NU) the non-exclusive right to reproduce, convert (as defined below), and/or distribute my submission (including the abstract) worldwide in print and electronic format and in any medium, including but not limited to audio or video.

I agree that NU may, without changing the content, convert the submission to any medium or format for the purpose of preservation.

I also agree that NU may keep more than one copy of this submission for purposes of security, back-up and preservation.

I confirm that the submission is my original work, and that I have the right to grant the rights contained in this license. I also confirm that my submission does not, to the best of my knowledge, infringe upon anyone's copyright.

If the submission contains material for which I do not hold copyright, I confirm that I have obtained the unrestricted permission of the copyright owner to grant NU the rights required by this license, and that such third-party owned material is clearly identified and acknowledged within the text or content of the submission.

IF THE SUBMISSION IS BASED UPON WORK THAT HAS BEEN SPONSORED OR SUPPORTED BY AN AGENCY OR ORGANIZATION OTHER THAN NU, I CONFIRM THAT I HAVE FULFILLED ANY RIGHT OF REVIEW OR OTHER OBLIGATIONS REQUIRED BY SUCH CONTRACT OR AGREEMENT.

NU will clearly identify my name(s) as the author(s) or owner(s) of the submission, and will not make any alteration, other than as allowed by this license, to your submission.

I hereby accept the terms of the above Author Agreement.

Deer

Author's signature:

22.04.2024

Date:

#### DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and to the best of my knowledge it contains no materials previously published or written by another person, or substantial proportions of material which have been submitted for the award of any other course or degree at NU or any other educational institution, except where due acknowledgement is made in the thesis. This thesis is the result of my own independent work, except where otherwise stated, and the views expressed here are my own.

Signed:

Feil

Date: 22.04.2024

#### **ETHICS APPROVAL**



53 Kabanbay Batyr Ave. Astana 010000 Republic of Kazakhstn Date: 20 of October, 2023

Dear Gulzada Jubanova,

This letter now confirms that your research project titled "*Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating the Transition of Students with Special Educational Needs from Home-Based Education to School Attendance in Kazakhstan*" has been approved by the Graduate School of Education Ethics Committee of Nazarbayev University.

You may proceed with contacting your preferred research site and commencing your participant recruitment strategy.

Yours sincerely,

Filiz Polot

Filiz POLAT

**On behalf of:** Dr Syed Abdul Manan, *PhD* Chair, GSE Ethics Committee Graduate School of Education Nazarbayev University

Block C3, Room M027 Office: +7(7172)6016 Mobile: +77079240053 email: <u>syed.manan@nu.edu.kz</u>, <u>gse.irec@nu.edu.kz</u>

#### CITI TRAINING CERTIFICATE



#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I am profoundly grateful to those who have supported and guided me throughout the journey of researching and writing this thesis, "Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating the Transition of Students with Special Needs from Home-Based Education to School Attendance in Kazakhstan."

I extend my deepest gratitude to Professor Filiz Polat and Academic Instructor Anita Jayachandran for their unwavering guidance, expertise, and support throughout the research and writing process of this thesis. Their dedication to fostering inclusive education practices has been truly inspiring and instrumental in shaping the direction and depth of this study.

I am also thankful for the invaluable contributions of the participants of this study, whose insights and experiences have greatly enriched the research. Additionally, I am grateful for the resources and support provided by Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education, which have facilitated my academic growth and enabled me to delve into this important topic. To my family and friends, whose unwavering encouragement and understanding have sustained me throughout this journey, I offer my heartfelt thanks. This thesis stands as a testament to the collective effort and dedication of all those who have contributed, and I am deeply appreciative of the opportunity to contribute to the advancement of inclusive education practices in Kazakhstan.

# Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating the Transition of Students with Special Needs from Home-Based Education to School Attendance in

# Kazakhstan

#### ABSTRACT

This research delves into the strategies essential for easing the transition of students with Special Educational Needs (SEN) from home-based learning to attending school in Kazakhstan. It is grounded in a dynamic and subjective understanding of reality, which acknowledges reality's social construction influenced by subjective consciousness and the objective world. This approach draws insights from Freire., Leon'ev and Vygotsky. Employing qualitative research, the study prioritizes participants' subjective experiences within their social contexts, guided by Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory. Data collection involved semi-structured interviews with seven stakeholders, including a school administrator, teachers, parents of children with SEN within a single school, and an NGO representative. Thematic analysis using MAXQDA software revealed significant themes related to transition challenges and strategies, emphasizing collaborative efforts and consistent support mechanisms. Ethical considerations were paramount, ensuring participant rights and confidentiality. The research examines existing practices, identifies challenges, and analyzes historical approaches, stressing comprehensive guidance and support for parents. Findings, organized by Bronfenbrenner's ecological model, highlight challenges at various levels and underscore the need for comprehensive support systems, stakeholder collaboration, and societal awareness for successful inclusion. The study offers insights to promote inclusive practices, proposing evidence-based strategies to enhance opportunities for all students. However, its main limitation lies in the small sample size and recruitment from a single school in the city, acknowledging potential variations in other schools within the same location. Furthermore, it is noteworthy that the school's director was new and relied on an experienced vice-director with extensive experience in the field.

# Инклюзивті білім беру тәжірибесін ілгерілету: Қазақстандағы ерекше қажеттіліктері бар оқушылардың үйде оқытудан мектепке баруға көшуін жеңілдету стратегиялары.

#### Аңдатпа

Бұл зерттеу Қазақстандағы ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушылардың (ЕБК) үйдегі білім беруден мектептегі білім беруге көшуін жеңілдету үшін қажетті стратегияларды қарастырады. Динамикалық және субъективті шындықты түсінуге негізделген бұл зерттеу Фрейр, Леонтьев және Выготскийдің идеяларына сүйенеді. Субъективті сана мен объективті әлемнің әсеріне ұшыраған шындықтың әлеуметтік мойындайды. Сапалы зерттеуді пайдалана құрылымын отырып, жұмыс бағдарланып, Бронфенбреннер жүйелерінің экологиялык теориясына қатысушылардың әлеуметтік контекстегі субъективті тәжірибелеріне басымдық береді. Мәліметтерді жинау жеті мүдделі тараптармен, соның ішінде мектеп экімшілігімен, мұғалімдермен, бір мектептегі ЕБҚ бар балалардың ата-аналарымен және үкіметтік емес ұйымның өкілімен жартылай құрылымдық сұхбат арқылы жүзеге асырылды. MAXQDA бағдарламалық құралын пайдалану арқылы тақырыптық талдау өтпелі кезеңдегі қиындықтар мен стратегияларға қатысты маңызды тақырыптарды анықтады, команданың күш-жігері мен тұрақты қолдау жүйелеріне баса назар аударды. Қатысушылардың құқықтары мен құпиялылығын қамтамасыз ететін этикалық ойлар маңызды болды. Зерттеу қазіргі тәжірибелерді зерттейді, проблемаларды анықтайды және тарихи тәсілдерді талдайды, ата-аналарға жанжақты басшылық пен қолдау көрсету қажеттілігін көрсетеді. Бронфенбреннердің экологиялық моделі арқылы ұйымдастырылған нәтижелер көптеген деңгейлердегі қиындықтарды көрсетеді және табысты қосу үшін жан-жақты қолдау жүйелері,

мүдделі тараптардың ынтымақтастығы және қоғамдастықтың хабардар болуы қажеттілігін көрсетеді. Зерттеу барлық студенттердің мүмкіндіктерін арттыру үшін дәлелді стратегияларды ұсына отырып, инклюзивті тәжірибені ілгерілету идеяларын ұсынады. Бірақ оның негізгі шектеуі іріктеудің шағын мөлшері және қаладағы бір мектептен қатысушыларды тарту болып табылады, бұл басқа мектептерде ықтимал айырмашылықтарға жол береді. Сонымен қатар, мектеп директорының жаңадан келгенін және осы салада үлкен тәжірибесі бар директордың тәжірибелі орынбасарына сенім артқанын айта кеткен жөн.

# Продвижение практик инклюзивного образования: стратегии для облегчения перехода учащихся с особыми потребностями от домашнего обучения к посещению школы в Казахстане.

#### Аннотация

Это исследование затрагивает стратегии, необходимые для облегчения перехода учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями (ООП) с домашнего обучения на обучение в школе в Казахстане. Основанное на динамичном и субъективном понимании реальности, оно признает социальную конструкцию реальности, подверженную влиянию субъективного сознания и объективного мира, опираясь на идеи Фрейра, Леонтьева и Выготского. Используя качественное исследование, работа уделяет приоритет субъективным опытам участников в их ориентируясь Экологическую теорию социальных контекстах, на систем Бронфенбреннера. Сбор данных осуществлялся с помощью полуструктурированных интервью с семью заинтересованными сторонами, включая администраторов школы, учителей, родителей детей с ООП из одной школы, а также представителя негосударственной организаций. Тематический анализ с использованием программного обеспечения MAXQDA выявил значимые темы, связанные с вызовами и стратегиями перехода, акцентируя внимание на коллективных усилиях и системах постоянной поддержки. Этические соображения были важны, гарантируя права участников и конфиденциальность. Исследование изучает существующие практики, анализирует исторические выявляет проблемы И подходы, подчеркивая необходимость всестороннего руководства и поддержки для родителей. Полученные результаты, организованные по экологической модели Бронфенбреннера, выделяют вызовы на различных уровнях и подчеркивают необходимость комплексных систем поддержки, сотрудничества заинтересованных сторон и осознания обществом для успешной инклюзии. Исследование предлагает идеи для содействия инклюзивным практикам, предлагая стратегии на основе доказательств для расширения возможностей для всех учащихся. Однако его основное ограничение заключается в небольшом объеме выборки и наборе из одной школы в городе, признавая возможные вариации в других школах в том же районе. Кроме того, стоит отметить, что директор школы был новым и полагался на опытного заместителя директора, имеющего общирный опыт в этой области.

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

AUTHOR AGREEMENT	ii
DECLARATION	iii
CITI TRAINING CERTIFICATE	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	vi
ABSTRACT	vii
Аңдатпа	ix
Аннотация	xi
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.2. Defining Education in Kazakhstan	2
1.3. Problem Statement	3
1.4. Progress and Challenges in Kazakhstan's Inclusive Education	4
1.5. Purpose of the Study	5
1.6. Research Questions	6
1.7. Significance of the Study	7
1.8. Definition of Key Terms	7
1.9. Summary	8
Chapter 2: Literature Review	9
2.1. Introduction	9
2.2. Factors Encouraging Transition: A Positive Schooling Experience	10
2.3. Desire for Socialization	10
2.4. Inclusive School Programs	11
2.5. Academic Implications	11
2.6. Strategies to Promote Inclusive Practices	12
2.7. Theoretical Framework	13
2.8. Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory	13
2.9. Relationship Between Parents, Professionals and NGOs	14
2.10. Chapter Summary	15
Chapter 3: Methodology	17
3.1. Introduction	17
3.2. Ontology	17
3.3. Epistemology	17
3.4. Research Design	18

3.5. Data Collection Instruments	19
3.6. Data Analysis Procedures	21
3.7. Ethical Considerations	22
3.8. Chapter Summary	22
Chapter 4: Findings	23
4.1. Introduction	23
4.2. Individual	24
4.2.1. Child 1	
4.2.2. Child 2 4.2.3. Child 3	
4.3. Microsystem	
4.3.1. Parent 1	
4.3.2. Parent 2	
4.3.3. Parent 3	
4.3.4. Teacher 1 4.3.5. Teacher 2	
4.4. Mesosystem	
4.4.2. Parent- School Administrator Relationship	
4.5. Exosystem	
4.5.1. Policies and Institutions	
4.5.2. NGO	
4.6. Macrosystem	
4.6.1. Community	40
4.7. Chapter Summary	
Chapter 5: Discussion	
5.1. Introduction	
5.2. Individual	44
5.3. Microsystem	45
5.4. Mesosystem	
5.5. Exosystem	
5.6. Macrosystem	
5.7. Chapter Summary	53
Chapter 6: Conclusion and Recommendations	
References	
Appendix A – Declaration of the Use of Generative AI	72
Appendix B. Consent form (English version) Informed consent	73

Приложение В. Форма согласия (на русском языке) Информированное согласие	.75
Қосымша В. Келісім парағы (қазақ тілінде) Ақпараттандырылған келісім	.77
Appendix C. Written Recruitment Script	.79
Приложение С. Сценарий письменного приглашения	.80
Қосымша С. Жазбаша шақыру сценарийі	.81
Appendix D. Interview protocol (English version)	.82
Приложение D. Протокол интервью (на русском)	.84
Қосымша D. Әңгімелесу хаттамасы (қазақ тілінде)	.87

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Individual Information	24
Table 2 Results categorized according to Bronfenbrenner's ecological model	24

#### **Chapter 1: Introduction**

The education system in Kazakhstan is currently undergoing numerous initiatives and reforms aimed at fostering inclusive practices. The State Program of Education Development of Kazakhstan (2011-2020) outlines several goals aimed at enhancing inclusive education policies in the country (MoES, 2011). This national framework not only provides a clear direction but also delineates the roles and responsibilities of various stakeholders in implementing education policies across all levels. Inclusive education advocates for equal access to quality education for all individuals, regardless of their socio-economic status, geographical location, language, ethnicity, gender, race, age, or nationality. Addressing the social and educational issue of providing equal access to quality education for children with special educational (SEN) needs remains a significant challenge in Kazakhstan (OECD, 2014), reflecting the broader goal of achieving social equality through education.

Recent developments in Kazakhstan indicate that the concept of inclusive education remains predominantly centered around students with special needs and may not adequately address other forms of diversity. For example, Zholtayeva et al. (2013) argue that in the Kazakhstani context, inclusive education entails the integration of every child with special needs into the classroom, with an emphasis on employing diverse teaching methods and adapting study materials, as well as teachers utilizing various instructional approaches. This perspective aligns with findings from a diagnostic report conducted by Nazarbayev University, Graduate School of Education, in 2014. This study, therefore, did an analysis of the transition process of Kazakhstani schools toward an inclusive education system.

#### 1.1. Evolution and Diversity of Home-Based Education

Home-based education is not a new phenomenon as it has been the normative practice worldwide for centuries. In the 1500-1600 Aztec societies, compulsory education was initiated, primarily for male students, who were required to receive an education until the age of 16 (Davis, 2000). This concept has evolved over time and now encompasses all children under the age of 18, highlighting the universal requirement for education. However, the methods and content of education have become subjects of considerable debate due to varying parental preferences rooted in diverse backgrounds and experiences.

The modern homeschooling movement emerged around the mid-20th century, offering a liberal alternative to traditional public education, distinct from the commonly perceived conservative viewpoint. Homeschooling, as a practice, presents numerous facets that may not be immediately apparent. Motivations for homeschooling vary among individuals, with each family having unique reasons for choosing this educational path (Chang, 2004).

Historically, homeschooling has been a common practice in many countries (Basham, et al., 2007), and its popularity has also been observed in Kazakhstan (Atoyanc-Larina, 2015).

#### **1.2. Defining Education in Kazakhstan**

Approximately three decades ago, Kazakhstan experienced a period where even contemplating alternatives to the traditional education system was considered a crime due to the prevailing values of the USSR. Everyone was expected to conform, and diversity was not tolerated. In terms of education, there were no options beyond state-run schools, including private ones. Every child was mandated to receive a compulsory secondary education, and parents were legally obligated to ensure their children attended school. However, with the advent of democracy in Kazakhstan, attitudes towards the education system began to change, opening opportunities for alternative approaches (Asanbayev, et al., 2016).

In this evolving democratic environment, where parents began to challenge the compulsory school system, Kazakhstan's educational landscape was influenced by its history as part of the former Soviet Union, which shaped many of its systems and principles, including education (Rollan & Somerton, 2019). Under the Soviet educational system, children with special educational needs (SEN) were typically educated in specialized schools or isolated and educated at home, away from their peers. This historical practice effectively excluded a wide range of children from traditional schools. Consequently, Kazakhstan's predominant approach to educating children with diverse needs still adheres to a "correctional" or "special" education model (Rouse & Lapham, 2013). In this model, the primary focus is on a medical approach, emphasizing the disabilities and deficits of these children, often requiring rehabilitation or treatment (Brisenden, 2007).

#### **1.3. Problem Statement**

Despite efforts to transition towards more inclusive education, as the OECD (2015) noted, many people in Kazakhstan continue to associate inclusive education with special education or assume it exclusively serves children with SEN. Consequently, many children still receive their education in correctional institutions, segregated groups within mainstream schools, or through homeschooling.

It is crucial to emphasize that homeschooling is typically forbidden in Kazakhstan, except when it concerns disabled children who, due to severe health conditions, cannot physically attend regular schools. These exceptions are granted based on the presence of official documents verifying the child's needs (Asanbayev, et al., 2016). Some exceptions to this rule include students with severe disabilities who are completely incapable of self-care and cannot participate in school activities. However, a significant issue arises when students who have the potential to engage to some extent are kept at home instead of attending school (Asanbayev et al., 2016).

By implementing effective strategies, it is crucial to recognize the significance of enabling children with SEN to attend mainstream schools. This is essential for their socialization and to ensure they receive a high-quality education, similar to what they could receive at home. By stating that imposing homeschooling on families is no longer an acceptable policy approach, the statement underscores the value of parental choice in education. Families should have the freedom to choose the educational path that best suits their child's needs and preferences, whether that involves homeschooling, attending a mainstream school, or accessing specialized educational services, as emphasized in the Salamanca Statement (UNESCO, 1994).

#### 1.4. Progress and Challenges in Kazakhstan's Inclusive Education

In 2009, Kazakhstan's Ministry of Education and Science (MoES) outlined a vital objective to reform inclusive education. They set ambitious targets to raise the percentage of inclusive schools to 30% by 2015 and 70% by 2020 as part of the State Program of Education Development for 2011-2020 (MoES, 2011). Furthermore, parents were given the choice to opt for mainstream schools for their children with SEN if they preferred, as OECD noted in 2015 (Mukashev, 2022). Over the years, there has been an increase in the number of schools equipped to cater to children with SEN, rising from 10% in 2010 to 55% in 2017. By 2017, approximately 23.3% of students between the ages of 7 and 18 with SEN were integrated into inclusive education facilities (OECD, 2015).

In an April 2023 plenary session of the lower chamber, Deputy Azhar Sagandykova from the Mäjilis of the Parliament of Kazakhstan discussed the issues related to inclusive

education in the country. She drew attention to the fact that there are more than 162,000 children with SEN in the nation, accounting for roughly 3% of the overall child population.

Sagandykova pointed out that certain experts identify Psychological Medical Pedagogical Consultations (PMPC) as a major obstacle to quality inclusive education. Although there has been a 45% increase in PMPCs for children with SEN, their effectiveness is arguable.

Sagandykova reminded the assembly that Kazakhstan ratified the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) in 2015, guaranteeing the right to quality inclusive education for individuals with SEN. According to the CRPD, children with SEN are entitled to essential tools and support, such as Braille materials, sign language instruction, assistance with learning materials, self-care, and behavior management. She emphasized that PMPCs should facilitate those children's access to schools rather than deny them this opportunity. Therefore, Sagandykova asserted the need for reform in the functioning of Psychological Medical Pedagogical Consultations. She argued that PMPC assessments should not be a de facto requirement for enrolling children with SEN in schools but should instead focus on identifying the necessary support forms for these children to access education within a school environment ("Number of Children with Special Educational Needs Exceeds 162,000 in Kazakhstan," 2023b).

#### **1.5.** Purpose of the Study

The research aims to explore strategies for facilitating the transition of students with SEN from home-based learning to attending school in Kazakhstan. This involves examining the current practices, identifying the challenges faced by students, families, and educators, and analyzing successful approaches employed in the past. Equally crucial is providing guidance and support to parents, empowering them to help their children access education inclusively. By promoting inclusivity, Kazakhstan can ensure that every child receives a quality education and has the opportunity to thrive. This will contribute to making Kazakhstan a more equitable and inclusive society where all children, regardless of their abilities, can receive a quality education and have the potential to succeed in life.

Through a comprehensive analysis of the legislative framework and policies governing inclusive education in Kazakhstan, this study will identify the existing challenges and gaps in facilitating the transition of students with SEN. It will involve gathering data through interviews to gain insights into the experiences and perspectives of various stakeholders, parents, educators, school administration and NGOs (nongovernmental organizations). By analyzing the gathered information, this study will propose evidence-based strategies to promote inclusive practices and overcome the barriers that hinder the successful transition of students with SEN to school attendance.

#### **1.6. Research Questions**

Now that there is an attempt to change this schooling system toward inclusion, the transition from the homeschooling model is very important in gaining a complete picture of how inclusive education is evolving in Kazakhstani schools. Therefore, the following research questions will guide the investigation of the study:

1. What factors support the homeschooling of children with SEN?

2. What elements contribute to the smooth transition from homeschooling for children with SEN to their enrollment in a mainstream school setting?

a) What strategies are stakeholders implementing to promote inclusive practices?

b) What facilitates the transition of students with SEN from home-based education to school attendance in Kazakhstan?

3. What are the social implications of homeschooling for children with SEN?

#### **1.7. Significance of the Study**

This research holds significance as it addresses a critical issue in Kazakhstan's evolving education system. Exploring the transition of students with SEN from homeschooling to mainstream schooling provides insights into the changing landscape of inclusive education. The study's findings and proposed strategies will have the potential to influence policy and practice, ensuring that all students, regardless of their abilities, will have equal opportunities for quality education and making them more socialized. Ultimately, this study contributes to fostering a more inclusive education system in Kazakhstan, promoting equity and meaningful participation for all students (Booth & Ainscow, 2016).

Furthermore, the anticipated findings of this study hold significance within the broader context of inclusive education and transition practices, particularly as they pertain to Kazakhstan. The insights gained from this study will not only be valuable for educational professionals and policymakers but also for parents and caregivers of students with SEN. As these individuals navigate the challenges associated with transitioning from home-based education to conventional school attendance, our study outcomes aim to provide valuable guidance and support.

#### **1.8. Definition of Key Terms**

*An inclusive school* embraces a philosophy and practice of providing equal access to high-quality education for all students, regardless of their background, abilities, disabilities, or other individual differences. Inclusive schools strive to create a welcoming and supportive environment where students feel valued, respected, and empowered to learn to their full potential. (Booth & Ainscow, 2016).

*Mainstream schools* aim to create inclusive learning environments where students of varying abilities can learn together, fostering social interaction and academic growth for all students (IBE-UNESCO, 2021).

#### 1.9. Summary

This research aims to investigate the different aspects that affect inclusive education in Kazakhstan. Additionally, it will suggest strategies supported by evidence to encourage inclusive practices and address obstacles that prevent students with SEN from transitioning successfully to attending school. The thesis is structured into several chapters: Introduction, Literature Review, Methodology, Results, Discussion, and Conclusion. Chapter 1 initiates by delving into the historical roots of homeschooling globally and within Kazakhstan, tracing its emergence as an alternative educational model amidst evolving educational standards. This chapter also addresses the conflicting approaches of homeschooling and inclusive schooling, recognizing the complexities involved in reconciling these diverse methods. The Literature Review looks at important research that relates to what we're studying. Then, the Methodology chapter explains how we did our research and collected data. Findings and Discussion chapters offer an analysis of collected data, informed by the theoretical framework and existing research. Finally, the Conclusion summarizes the study's findings, acknowledges limitations, and proposes recommendations for future research endeavors.

#### **Chapter 2: Literature Review**

#### **2.1. Introduction**

Transitioning students with SEN from homeschooling to mainstream schooling is a complex and multifaceted process that is significant in the context of Kazakhstan's evolving education system. This literature review provides an overview of key themes, research findings, and existing knowledge related to this transition, including factors that support homeschooling, reasons for homeschooling children with SEN, factors that support the transition to regular schooling, social and academic implications, and strategies to promote inclusive practices in Kazakhstan.

There is a need to evaluate the quality of education and socialization of students with SEN in Kazakhstan. They are often educated at home by considering different experiences of parents in well-developed countries and several international studies. This section will review previous literature conducted by researchers on the quality of education and socialization of students with SEN who are educated at home and conclusions from their research will be explored.

The Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Refworld - UNHCR's Global Law and Policy Database, 2024c) established the framework for a democratic system grounded in principles of freedom, equality, and human dignity. Within the Republic of Kazakhstan's "Law on Education (2014)," specifically in Article 3, the right to fundamental education is explicitly recognized. Additionally, the principle of equality and the specific measures aimed at achieving equality are delineated in Section 1 of this legislation. These provisions hold significant importance as they safeguard the rights of all learners, irrespective of any obstacles or challenges they may encounter in the learning process. In this context, Kazakhstan has endorsed global initiatives such as "Education for All" (EFA), the Salamanca Declaration on Principles, Policy, and Practice in Education for Persons with Special Needs, and the Dakar Framework for Action. Legislation has been enacted to affirm that every citizen possesses the entitlement to receive free preschool, primary, general secondary, and professional education, along with competitive higher education, without discrimination based on gender, nationality, socioeconomic status, language, religion, health condition, or other individual characteristics. Consequently, the integration of inclusive education stands as a natural phase in the progression of the education system (Nadirova, 2023).

#### 2.2. Factors Encouraging Transition: A Positive Schooling Experience.

Azelton et al. (2017) emphasize the pivotal role of positive experiences in inclusive schools in motivating parents to transition their children back into these settings. One of the key components contributing to a positive experience in inclusive schools is the availability of improved support and accommodations for students with SEN. Research by Thompson and Shinn (2018) indicates that parents may opt to return to inclusive schools when they perceive that the school is well-equipped to meet their child's needs. These improved support mechanisms include Individualized Education Plans (IEPs), access to special education services, and the presence of qualified special education teachers. These resources can give parents confidence that their child will receive the necessary assistance to succeed academically and socially (Bui et al., 2019).

#### 2.3. Desire for Socialization

Socialization is another critical aspect of the positive experience in inclusive schools that can motivate parents to transition their children. Many parents may seek to make this transition to provide increased opportunities for socialization and peer interactions. Parents of children with SEN often prioritize socialization as a compelling reason to shift from homeschooling to mainstream schools. They recognize that socialization contributes to their child's social skills, enhances emotional well-being, reduces social isolation, and promotes community engagement. Acknowledging the profound influence of socialization on children's holistic development underscores the significance of inclusive education within inclusive school settings (Heath & Sansosti, 2016).

The research by Fischer and Daley (2019) highlights the importance of social interaction for children's development and well-being. Inclusive schools often offer more opportunities for peer interaction, which parents may view as valuable for their child's social development. Parents may perceive that their child will benefit from interacting with peers, engaging in group activities, and developing interpersonal skills in an inclusive school environment. This potential for increased socialization can motivate transitioning out of homeschooling (Baker et al., 2019).

#### 2.4. Inclusive School Programs

Availability of inclusive education programs within mainstream schools can make the transition more appealing for parents (Kurth & Mellard, 2006). These programs, characterized by equitable access, individualized support, social inclusion, and professional competence, enhance the attractiveness of mainstream schools as inclusive and supportive educational environments for students with SEN. Moreover, effective transition plans go beyond fulfilling their primary role; they also operate as a method that may positively impact family support (Foley et al., 2012).

#### 2.5. Academic Implications

According to Biswas (2019), homeschooled children with SEN exhibit mixed academic outcomes. While some perform at or even above grade level, others may

encounter academic challenges. The transition of homeschooled children with SEN to an inclusive school setting may necessitate the provision of additional academic support services. These services aim to bridge potential gaps in learning that could arise from the homeschooling environment (Koon et al., 2020).

Academic progress and achievement are fundamental indicators of a positive experience. Parents may be motivated by the belief that inclusive schools can provide a more structured and academically rigorous environment, which could lead to improved learning outcomes (Creswell et al., 2015). In cases where parents observe significant academic improvements in their child while attending an inclusive school, they may decide to continue with this educational choice, emphasizing the importance of academic success as a motivating factor (Thompson & Shinn, 2018).

#### 2.6. Strategies to Promote Inclusive Practices

Developing comprehensive Individualized Education Plans (IEPs) tailored to each student's needs can guide the transition process and ensure appropriate support (Baker, 2019). Also, offering training and professional development for teachers and school staff in inclusive practices can enhance their ability to support students with SEN (Heath & Sansosti, 2016). Moreover, fostering collaboration between parents, educators, and special education professionals can facilitate a smooth transition and ongoing support. Implementing peer support programs within schools can help homeschooled students with SEN integrate and form social connections (Biswas, 2019). According to Kurth and Mellard (2006), conducting sensitization programs to raise awareness and reduce potential stigmas associated with SEN can create a more inclusive school environment. These answers provide insights into the factors influencing homeschooling decisions for children with SEN, the transition to mainstream schools, and strategies to promote inclusivity in education.

#### **2.7.** Theoretical Framework

This study's theoretical framework draws upon Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory (Bronfenbrenner, 1979). This theory provides a comprehensive foundation for understanding how inclusive practices are developed and implemented, taking into account the roles of various stakeholders and the broader societal context.

#### 2.8. Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory

Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory provides an ecological perspective on the study's framework. This theory highlights the influence of multiple interconnected systems on an individual's development and experiences. It offers insights into the various ecological levels that impact the transition of students with SEN, from the microsystem (individual and family) to the macrosystem (cultural and social values).

- Microsystem: This level focuses on the immediate environment of the individual, including family, peers, and educators. In the study, it informs the examination of the roles played by parents, teachers, and students themselves in facilitating the transition.
- 2. **Mesosystem:** The mesosystem explores the interactions and connections between elements within the microsystem. This aspect of the theory underscores the importance of collaboration between parents and educators in supporting students' transitions.
- 3. **Exosystem:** The exosystem considers external settings that indirectly affect the individual, such as policies and institutions. In the study, it emphasizes the influence of educational policies and practices on the transition process.
- 4. **Macrosystem:** At the macrosystem level, the theory delves into cultural norms, values, and societal beliefs. Within the study, it acknowledges the cultural context

in Kazakhstan and its impact on inclusive education and the transition of students with SEN (Bronfenbrenner, 1979).

By integrating Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory, the theoretical framework provides a comprehensive lens through which to examine the transition of students with SEN in Kazakhstan. It emphasizes the dynamic interplay of social interactions, collaborative knowledge construction, and ecological influences on the development and implementation of strategies for inclusive practices in the education system.

#### 2.9. Relationship Between Parents, Professionals and NGOs

Maulsharif, Nurbekova, and Naimanova (2022) conducted a study highlighting the significance of collaboration among teachers, parents, and NGOs in inclusive education. However, the research findings indicated that there is a lack of well-coordinated and consistently implemented strategies for communication and collaboration among these stakeholders. The study identified different interpretations of collaboration, ranging from basic communication to workshops and sharing of educational resources. To achieve meaningful collaboration, joint tasks and shared goals were emphasized, such as regular co-working meetings to assess student progress and develop IEPs with specific objectives. The study revealed that fragmented and individualistic interactions were insufficient in achieving optimal learning outcomes for students. Moreover, the potential of school-based resource centers to support collaboration remains underutilized, necessitating the need to enhance teachers' readiness to accept students with SEN, particularly in middle and high schools. Additional training and support may be required for these teachers. Collaboration should also involve parents to ensure consistency in teaching and learning approaches between home and school. Garbacz et al. (2017) concluded that educational and academic achievements experience positive effects when families actively participate. Furthermore,

the authors suggest that heightened interaction and communication within families may lead to increased responsiveness and sensitivity to their children's social, emotional, and intellectual developmental needs, both within the home environment and at school. The study concluded that improving collaboration practices and involving all stakeholders are essential for the successful implementation of inclusive education.

One study (Davis, 2000) found that professionals believed homeschooled students might have weaknesses in organizational skills, communication abilities, and certain academic tasks, while recognizing their independent learning capabilities and completion of homework. Perceived social weaknesses included interactions with adults and participation in extracurricular and community activities, while politeness and respectfulness towards both adults and peers were considered social strengths.

These studies collectively shed light on the complex landscape of collaboration in the context of transition, attitudes of parents, and interactions between homeschooling families and mainstream educational institutions, offering valuable insights into the multifaceted nature of inclusive education and the factors that influence it.

#### **2.10.** Chapter Summary

This chapter provides an in-depth examination of the complex transition process for students with SEN from homeschooling to mainstream schooling within the context of Kazakhstan's evolving education system. The literature review encompasses key themes, research findings, and existing knowledge related to this transition, including factors supporting homeschooling, reasons for homeschooling children with SEN, factors facilitating the transition to regular schooling, social and academic implications, and strategies to promote inclusive practices. Finally, the chapter delves into the relationship between parents, professionals, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in inclusive education. It highlights the significance of collaboration among stakeholders and the need for well-coordinated strategies to support students with SEN effectively.

#### **Chapter 3: Methodology**

#### **3.1. Introduction**

In the previous chapter, a review of literature was provided, covering various research works directly relevant to the subject matter and concepts under research. Drawing from the studies highlighted in the previous chapter, this section aims to describe the research design, methodologies, instruments, and analysis procedures intended to address the research inquiry. This study opts for a qualitative research approach. Qualitative methodology is chosen for its capacity to illuminate how individuals interpret their lives and experiences (Creswell, 2007), thus aligning well with the research questions and the aim of understanding parental perspectives on inclusive education. Specifically, employing a qualitative approach facilitated a deeper exploration of parental attitudes, reactions, experiences, and perceptions regarding inclusive education (Creswell et el., 2015).

#### **3.2. Ontology**

In this study, the perspective on reality is based on the belief that it is not stable and fixed, but rather dynamic and subjective. Reality is seen as continuously evolving and socially constructed, influenced by our subjective consciousness and the objective world. This perspective aligns with the ideas of Freire (Roberts 2003), Leont'ev (1978), and Vygotsky (1978), who emphasized the interconnectedness of our understanding of reality and the social context in which it is constructed. It is acknowledged that there is no single truth or interpretation of reality. To explore the reasons and timing of student transitions between home and mainstream education, this study employs a theoretical perspective.

#### 3.3. Epistemology

Our understanding of the world is influenced by our interactions with others, and it is through these interactions that we acquire knowledge. Our knowledge will be not static

Ρ

but constantly evolving, shaped by our personal history, culture, and society. The subjective experiences and perspectives of the participants are central to this study, and it is important to recognize that this type of study is influenced by values and beliefs (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005). The views of the participants will be sought, but they also needed to be understood in the context of their interactions within their communities and society as a whole. This study acknowledges the significance of unconscious factors in individual and community lives, although it focuses specifically on the meaning participants attributed to their experiences of transitioning between home and mainstream education (Donald, 1991).

In this chapter, the theoretical frameworks that underpin the study, with a specific focus on the qualitative research methods employed for data analysis are presented. The Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory forms the conceptual basis for the study design. These theories offer valuable perspectives on the complex interactions and relationships involved in the transition process. By applying this theory, the methodology is poised to facilitate an in-depth exploration of the role of social interactions, collaborative knowledge construction, and ecological influences that shape the development and implementation of inclusive practices and transition strategies within the educational system of Kazakhstan.

#### 3.4. Research Design

Hoepfl (1997) states that qualitative research provides in-depth and clear insights into the subject under study, aiming for a thorough understanding of participants' experiences and processes. This research methodology considers the phenomenon as a comprehensive entity and emphasizes conducting the investigation in real-life environments to accurately capture the perspectives and experiences of participants. It avoids making pre-existing beliefs or prejudices about the phenomenon, opting instead to derive conclusions based on the data obtained.

The chosen design involved conducting semi-structured interviews, enabling direct interaction between the researcher and participants to delve into their experiences. Probing questions were used to gather additional information and guide the interview conversation (Creswell, 2014).

This research also adopts a case study approach as it delves into the real-life attitudes of individuals towards the status of their children with SEN in inclusive education within Kazakhstan. A case study entails examining a specific instance involving real individuals in authentic situations (Cohen et al., 2007). Case study research often involves a small sample size, which suffices to gain a comprehensive understanding of participants' attitudes or experiences at an individual level (Creswell, 2002). In this study, parents of children with SEN share their attitudes and experiences regarding inclusive education in Kazakhstan, offering their unique perspectives. Overall, the case study approach centers on the personal viewpoint of individual participants or groups (Cohen et al., 2007).

#### **3.5. Data Collection Instruments**

The data of the research were collected between 09/09/2023-08/02/2024. Data collection was conducted in one of the state schools of the Republic of Kazakhstan, located in Astana. The data was collected from seven stakeholders: a vice director (VD) who is responsible for managing and leading schools, teachers (T1,T2) working in selected inclusive schools, parents (P1,P2) of children with SEN attending this school, one parent (P3), whose child is 18 years old and graduated from school and currently studying at college and finally a representative from non-governmental organizations (NGOs)

involved in promoting inclusive practices. After the participants consented to take part in the study, they selected a suitable time and location for the interview. The interviews occurred in various comfortable settings, including the participants' workplaces, cafes, their homes, or outdoor locations, all to ensure their sense of safety and comfort. Data collection commenced after obtaining official approval from the Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education Ethics Committee.

The researcher met with each participant and reviewed the informed consent document, providing explanations regarding the research objectives, voluntary participation, confidentiality measures, and the potential risks and benefits associated with participation. Each interview lasted approximately 40 minutes and was conducted at convenient times so as to not interfere with the vice-principal's schedule or the teacher candidates' lessons. According to Brinkmann and Kvale (2018), semi-structured interviews provide a conversational and comfortable environment for both the researcher and the participant. These interviews will primarily consist of open-ended questions with predetermined prompts and follow-up probes. This approach encouraged active listening and promoted meaningful interactions between the researcher and the participant (Rubin & Rubin, 2012; Leavy, 2017).

Information gathered from semi-structured interviews and focus group interviews underwent content analysis. According to Holdford (2008), qualitative content analysis seeks to interpret researchers' findings in a meaningful and practical manner. This study presents qualitative data that was analyzed using MAXQDA software. To conduct content analysis, the initial data was collected through notes and recordings made by the mobile phone (Dictaphone) and transcribed onto a computer. After concluding the interview, the participant was informed that the transcript, presented in their preferred language, was sent via email. This step allowed the participant to review and confirm that the researcher had accurately captured their intended meaning before initiating the data analysis process. The transcription was securely stored in a distinct file protected by a password.

#### 3.6. Data Analysis Procedures

According to Kiger and Varpio (2020), thematic analysis involves six key steps, which include familiarizing oneself with the data, generating initial codes, identifying overarching themes, examining these themes, defining and labeling them, and finally, presenting the findings. To initiate the familiarization process, the interviews conducted in both Russian and English were transcribed into English for analytical purposes. During transcription, participants were assigned pseudonyms (e.g., P1, P2) to protect their identities. These transcribed interviews were then imported into MAXQDA software for further analysis. The analysis unfolded in two phases: theme identification and code creation. Initially, the data was thoroughly reviewed to find significant themes, which were subsequently explored to ensure consistency, leading to the development of codes. The data underwent inductive content analysis, aligning with the framework delineated by Laws et al. (2003). Maintaining a systematic approach, Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Model (Bronfenbrenner, 1979) was employed for data analysis. It highlights the interaction between social engagements, collaborative knowledge building, and environmental factors in shaping the development and execution of strategies for inclusive practices within the educational system. Then codes and categories were organized into themes and linked with the corresponding levels of the ecological model framework. This approach facilitated a deeper understanding of the factors influencing parental decisions regarding school placement, student attendance preferences, and the collaborative

dynamics between school administration and non-governmental organizations (NGOs). By conducting a thorough analysis of the interviews, this study recognized the current challenges and deficiencies in facilitating the transition of students with SEN into mainstream schools.

## **3.7. Ethical Considerations**

Ethical procedures were an important aspect of this study, and appropriate procedures were followed to ensure the protection and rights of the participants. Participants were informed about their voluntary participation in the study and assured that their identities and the identities of their schools would remain confidential. They were also informed that the data collected was only be used for the purposes of the study. Participants were given the option to withdraw from the study at any point if they wished to do so. To indicate their informed consent, all participants signed consent forms. These forms were provided in Kazakh, Russian and English, the language understood by the participants.

## **3.8. Chapter Summary**

This chapter presented the selected research design for the study, encompassing theoretical underpinnings and ethical considerations. The main objective of the research was to investigate methods for supporting students with SEN in transition from homebased learning to school attendance in Kazakhstan. The goal was to propose evidencebased strategies that foster inclusive practices and tackle the barriers impeding the successful integration of students with SEN into the school setting. The rationale for employing a qualitative case study approach was outlined to justify its suitability for the current research. Additionally, measures to ensure confidentiality and participant anonymity were addressed. The forthcoming 'Findings' chapter will present the collected data in detail.

#### **Chapter 4: Findings**

### 4.1. Introduction

The purpose of the study was to explore methods to facilitate the transition of students with special needs from home-based learning to attending school, with a focus on implementing effective strategies to ensure quality education. Additionally, the interviews sought to identify approaches that could inform policy and practice, thereby promoting equal opportunities for quality education and fostering socialization among all students, irrespective of their abilities, in Kazakhstan. This chapter presents the findings of interviews conducted with seven participants. The study aimed to address the following research questions:

1. What factors support the homeschooling of children with SEN?

2. What elements contribute to the smooth transition from homeschooling for children with SEN to their enrollment in a mainstream school setting?

a) What strategies are stakeholders implementing to promote inclusive practices?

b) What facilitates the transition of students with SEN from home-based education to school attendance in Kazakhstan?

3. What are the social implications of homeschooling for children with SEN?

These findings have been organized as presented in Table 1 to show the connection to the research questions. The results, derived from the participants' responses, are structured based on the relevant components of the ecological model presented in the literature review chapter. The findings indicate that parents of children with SEN overall were not satisfied with the availability of learning support in mainstream schools for inclusive education.

# Table 1

Individual	Gender	Age	Educational	Level	Individual's
			Institution		SEN
Child 1	Male	8	School	3 Grade	ADHD
Child 2	Male	11	School	4 Grade	Speech delay
Child 3	Male	18	College	1 year	Autism (ASD)
				student	

# Individual Information

# Table 2

Results categorized according to Bronfenbrenner's ecological model

Microsystem	Mesosystem	Exosystem	Macrosystem
Parent 1	Parents-Teachers	Policies and	Community
Special needs	Importance of	Institutions	Awareness
Parent 2	selecting specialists.	Access to general	
Stress level	Communication	information	Fostering inclusive
Parent 3	deficit.	Education rights	environment
Parental	The importance of		
advocacy	providing adequate	NGO	Acceptance of
Parental	support and resources	offering guidance,	children with SEN
autonomy	Group size advocacy	recommendation and	
		expertise	
<b>Teacher 1</b>	Parents and school		
Awareness	administration's		
Trained well	relationship		
Teacher 2			
Turnover	Strained relationship		
Emotional			
burnout	Misunderstanding		

# 4.2. Individual

Three parents were interviewed, each of whom shared their individual experiences regarding their children's special educational needs (SEN). Each parent encountered difficulties when attempting to enroll their children in school.

#### 4.2.1. Child 1

The parent (P1) provides valuable insights into her experiences raising her son, who was born in 2016 and is currently attending a mainstream school at the age of 8. She emphasizes that her child has been diagnosed with Attention-Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD) alongside a secondary physical impairment, with a behavioral disorder stemming from a neurological condition, leading to restlessness. Notably, until the age of 5, she was unaware of her son's special educational needs (SEN), and he attended a mainstream nursery school. It was only through observing changes in her son's behavioral patterns that she became aware of his SEN. And he is currently studying in first grade again in the same school, although he should be in second grade by now. It is worth noting that she (P1) opted for homeschooling for her child after facing difficulties in mainstream schooling. Her child faced difficulties grasping the curriculum, experienced bullying from both teachers and peers, and ultimately did not successfully complete the first grade. She expressed that if her child had received support from teachers, he would have been able to cope with the curriculum. She shared the challenges faced in the school, including the absence of specialists like defectologists, speech therapists, and psychologists, or their high turnover rate from the school. She mentioned that, after her numerous appeals, those specialists had been invited and were now actively working.

Due to her child previously attending an inclusive class, the teachers struggled to meet his SEN and transferred him, citing ADHD alongside a secondary physical impairment. She recounted, "Since my child did not master the first-grade curriculum, we are now repeating the first grade."

However, she expressed disappointment that her child is still struggling to grasp the material at mainstream school, leading them to switch to homeschooling. Regarding homeschooling, she acknowledged some benefits such as reduced distractions and gaining

knowledge. However, she emphasized, "purely from a psychological standpoint, of course, my child wants to socialize and learn with peers. It's important for communication, socialization, and being part of society." She expressed her desire for her child to study with peers in a regular school, in a mainstream class.

## 4.2.2. Child 2

Parent (P2) shared insights about their 10-year-old child diagnosed with speech delay just as they were preparing to enter first grade. Before the diagnosis, the parents were unaware of their child's impairment. The child's delayed speech development prompted the PMPK to recommend enrollment in a specialized school. The child spent three years at this specialized school, where each year they had a different homeroom teacher. Despite the turnover of teachers in the specialized school, by the end of the third grade, the teacher contacted the parent to report that the child was excelling academically, being recognized as the best among all students. Encouraged by this progress, the teacher recommended transferring the child to a regular school, emphasizing the belief that the child would manage well, particularly with an inclusive educational approach. Currently, he is preparing for the fifth grade, marking his current status as a fourth-grader.

Also this parent expressed regret that their child had not been enrolled in a mainstream school from the first grade, suggesting that this would have facilitated integration without the challenges they encountered. She stated,

The child really enjoys school. But honestly, I deeply regret not enrolling them in a mainstream school from the first grade. I believe that when a child starts attending school from the first grade, they do not know each other, and then they naturally form a close-knit family. However, when a child enters in the middle of the process - in the third, fifth, or seventh grade - there is not the same cohesion.

## 4.2.3. Child 3

Another parent of an 18-year-old student described their child's experience, which included homeschooling, attending a correctional school, transitioning to a mainstream school, and presently enrolled in college. She recounted their experience transitioning from homeschooling to mainstream schooling, which they described as partially positive. Their child went through various stages, starting with homeschooling for two years, then two years in a correctional school, and then attending a regular secondary school from the 4th to the 9th grade, where classes were large, with around 30 students. Their son was part of such a class, representing a specific form of inclusion. Upon completing the 9th grade, the opportunity arose to attend college, and they applied and were accepted. However, they encountered numerous challenges during the transition from homeschooling to mainstream schools.

The child, diagnosed with Autism (Asperger's syndrome), faces challenges in social interaction but still expressed a strong desire to attend school. Despite the difficulties, the child eagerly anticipated going to school, setting an alarm clock and eagerly awaiting the time to go to school. This parent described this process by saying:

Our son has consistently found pleasure in attending educational institutions: he relished attending school previously and currently enjoys his time at college, embracing the opportunity to be among peers. Despite his challenges in communication, which persist unchanged, he does not actively engage with them. These challenges persist as an inherent aspect of his personality. Nonetheless, he continues to derive enjoyment from attending educational environments.

#### 4.3. Microsystem

In the Microsystem, the experiences of parents (P1, P2, P3) shed light on the challenges faced by children with SEN within the educational landscape. These narratives underscore the pivotal role of supportive environments and collaborative efforts in ensuring inclusive education.

## 4.3.1. Parent 1

Among the interviewed parents was a single parent (P1) with a child with SEN. Because of her age, being 45 years old, and experiencing difficulties with walking, she is unable to regularly accompany her son to school. And he cannot attend school regularly. The school consistently contacts her, pressing her to pick up her child, not only due to the child's behavioral challenges but also because of the lack of specialists to support the child. Another challenge she faces is pressure from other parents who encourage her to opt for homeschooling. Despite her efforts to integrate her child into a mainstream school, she faces obstacles, even though her child desires socialization. She mentioned,

Teachers should have the skills and abilities to be trained for any situation because the child might react differently at any moment, and the teacher should be ready for that. They should be trained and prepared for everything so that our children would want to love this school and love attending classes, instead of feeling isolated or discriminated against, as often happens in many schools. Because that's what we experienced in previous years. There was bullying from both teachers and parents.

#### 4.3.2. Parent 2

Another parent (P2) expressed worries about the inadequate provision of specialized support services in schools, such as defectologists, speech therapists, and psychologists. She said, "I would like every regular school to have inclusive education, with specialists specifically working with these children such as defectologists, speech therapists, and psychologists."

She (P2) underscored a lack of comprehension among school staff about establishing a supportive environment for children and parents, which proves to be a central obstacle when attending school. She (P2) also mentioned that following multiple attempts and receiving the decision from PMPK, the director of the mainstream school subtly indicated to them that if they are registered at this address, their child is welcome; otherwise unfortunately not. Additionally, she recounted instances where the stress of dealing with their child's SEN-related issues continued at home, further adding to the parents' emotional burden.

## 4.3.3. Parent 3

A parent of a child who attends college (P3) mentioned that the PMPK posed obstacles in her child's attempt to attend a regular school. She expressed her belief: "Our child could have attended school from the first grade; however, the PMPK was opposed to it."

They emphasized the importance of parents having the autonomy to decide whether their child can attend school and whether they require assistance, such as an assistant or tutor and noted, "I think that parents should be the ones to decide, to understand, to decide whether their child can study in school or not." They highlighted that such support is increasingly available in many schools.

Additionally, she (P3) highlighted a concerning issue regarding age restrictions for assistance. She explained,

Well, until recently, they only accepted children under 18 years old. Now I heard that many of the children have also grown up and are already over eighteen. Of course, we have a problem that after eighteen there is nowhere to go. That is, if children are under 18 years old, that's it, we have nothing more official in Kazakhstan. And then this person sits at home.

This situation leaves older individuals with special needs at risk of being left without appropriate assistance or opportunities for engagement, potentially leading to social isolation or limited access to educational and vocational resources.

## 4.3.4. Teacher 1

During the interview conducted at a specific school, it was observed that two teachers (T1, T2) from that school displayed a positive attitude towards children with SEN. Both (T1 and T2) serve as English instructors at the school, with one of the them (T1) boasting a tenure of 7 years and another one (T2) of 12 years. Teachers demonstrate their commitment to inclusion by acknowledging the presence of several students with SEN in the school. Depending on the individual student's condition and needs, teachers tailor special materials, exercises, and assignments, ensuring an individualized learning plan for each student. They (T1, T2) assess the specific skills and areas requiring development, offering a differentiated approach to meet the diverse needs of each student. Additionally, teachers actively participate in classes, offering assistance as necessary while providing psychological and physical support and accompanying students throughout their daily activities. For students without assigned tutors, teachers assume responsibility, providing individual attention, monitoring assignments, and ensuring their overall wellbeing, including psychological support. Additionally, one of the teachers (T1) mentioned that with over thirty students, primarily in elementary school and some transitioning to high school, special tutors wearing distinctive green ties greet them at the entrance every morning. These tutors provide continuous support throughout the day, assisting students during classes, breaks, and guiding them to various locations such as the cafeteria.

In terms of qualification, the teacher (T1) highlighted that they need more training as the last one was three years ago and the programs themselves should be updated in each stage of their work with updated and new information. She described such courses as:

Well, we learned special courses. There were 48 hours, if I am not mistaken, 48 hours courses. I was taught three years ago, how to work with learners with special needs three years ago. And Head Masters of our school sent us to this special courses. But these courses are not organized very often, but they are worth attending.

## 4.3.5. Teacher 2

The second teacher (T2), who teaches English for primary school children, mentioned that the training is conducted in groups of 10-15 individuals, with multiple batches being sent for training as needed. They emphasized that several participants are trained simultaneously, not just a few individuals. She (T2) recalled that the training sessions held in September 2020 lasted around four days and were conducted online due to the pandemic. They (T1, T2) also mentioned that certificate issuance was efficient, with participants undergoing testing and completing assignments as part of the training process.

Overall, the findings indicate the importance of ongoing training, adequate staffing, and comprehensive support systems to effectively meet the diverse needs of children with SEN in mainstream educational settings. It also underscores the need for collaboration between schools, educational authorities, and other stakeholders to address the challenges and gaps identified in the system.

### 4.4. Mesosystem

In the Mesosystem, the dynamics between parents and teachers as well as parents and school administrators are crucial components influencing the educational journey of children with SEN. Parent (P1) recounts challenges faced during their child's first-grade experience, citing a lack of attention and time for their special child, ultimately leading to homeschooling due to difficulties in large inclusive classes. Similarly, parent (P2) emphasizes the importance of selecting specialists who can effectively communicate and understand their child's unique needs, highlighting concerns about teacher turnover and its impact on their child's academic progress and emotional well-being.

#### 4.4.1. Parent-Teacher

One of the parents (P1) experienced misunderstandings with teachers and school staff during their child's first grade due to a lack of attention and time for their special child. She believes that inclusive classes should be divided into smaller groups to avoid negative impacts on both teachers and children. Ultimately, this parent's child had to switch to homeschooling due to difficulties grasping the curriculum in a class with 31 students under the guidance of a single teacher. She said,

Because there were a lot of students in the class, 31 children, and it seemed like either the teacher couldn't cope, or the teacher couldn't keep up, or lacked skills with such children, and my child wasn't absorbing the material. So, I believe there was a lack of attention, time for my special child. Although it was considered inclusive at the time. Then we went back again. It turns out that all schools are again filled with inclusion, all classes are packed, with so many children. Of course, this has a very negative impact nowadays. I believe that inclusive classes should be divided into several groups, not with such large numbers of children.

Furthermore, another parent (P2) emphasized the importance of selecting specialists who can effectively communicate and understand these children's unique needs. She believes that if there had been better communication and consideration of their child's individuality, their academic progress might have been much higher. She noted, "I would like to see inclusion specialists. Even now, the girl who works with the child is not a specialist. She is just a homeroom teacher."

Also she highlighted the issue of frequent turnover among teachers, which further complicates the situation. Moreover, she acknowledged the significant challenges that arise when there are changes in the child's environment, particularly for those with SEN, causing both mental and emotional strain for the child and their parents. However, she expressed unwavering belief in their child and their continuous support.

Parent (P3), whose 18-year-old child attends college, shares a partly positive experience regarding their transition to mainstream school prior to college. She emphasized the critical importance of choosing specialists capable of proficiently communicating with and comprehending the unique needs of these children. She said:

We went through all the stages in our educational journey, commencing with two years of homeschooling followed by enrollment in a specialized school for another two years. Subsequently, our child transitioned to a mainstream school, where class sizes were considerably larger, with approximately 30 students per class. Despite the challenges posed by such settings, our son participated in a concrete form of inclusion. Upon completing ninth grade, the opportunity arose for him to attend college, a prospect that fills us with immense joy. Reflecting on our experiences, we believe that better communication and consideration of our child's individuality would have greatly benefited his educational journey. Therefore, we emphasize the importance of providing adequate support to students with SEN, ensuring they receive the resources and assistance necessary for their academic and personal development. Subsequently, their child transitioned to a mainstream school, facing challenges posed by larger class sizes. Despite these obstacles, their son experienced a form of inclusion in this setting.

## 4.4.2. Parent- School Administrator Relationship

A vice-director (VD), who has been with the school for many years, was consulted with respect to participant selection and the subsequent interviews. She said,

With the rising number of children with serious diagnoses, including autism and mild intellectual disabilities, parents and school administrators are likely engaging in more frequent and intense collaboration. Parents are advocating for their children's needs and seeking the best educational opportunities, often leading to transfers from specialized classes to mainstream settings.

However, the school administration faces challenges in meeting the needs of children with SEN due to resource constraints and class size limitations. Despite efforts to adhere to education laws regarding class size, overcrowding remains an issue in some mainstream classes. She stated,

As we consider the distribution of children into classes, classes where children with special educational needs study, we try to create a smaller number of children in these classes, with the ratio being that one inclusive child occupies roughly three places for regular children. Yes, but it's not always possible in mainstream schools because, due to the conditions in our city, we don't always adhere to the recommendation of the education law that our schools should not be overcrowded, with a maximum of 25 children per class. Mostly, classes where the capacity complies with the education law are few. Inclusive children who come to us end up in larger classes. This is a difficulty, primarily for the children themselves.

This situation presents organizational difficulties for both teachers and students, particularly affecting the well-being and learning experience of children with SEN. She (VD) described it as:

> Teacher's experience as a teacher, just a pedagogue, is crucial. Sometimes it happens that these inclusive children often find it challenging to adjust to a large collective. I've already mentioned this. And of course, here, it takes patience, kindness... a patient, kind mother figure, who will introduce the child to the world of collective education. This is a lot because... sometimes it just happens that relationships don't work out for some reason, not because the teacher lacks experience. If there isn't a certain sympathy between the child and the teacher, and you see that it's difficult for them, you observe, and sometimes, it's necessary, perhaps at the parents' request, to transfer the child to other classes. But here, it doesn't only depend on the teacher but also on the collective as a whole. How quickly the children... in one collective, they quickly accept him, in another collective, for some reason, they are wary of him. So, this also happens. But you know, I can't cite a single case during my work where, for example, we saw any negative attitude from the children towards these children, regardless of their physical deficiencies. For example, these children, they are not deficiencies or problems for these children. With the correct approach to working with these children, they start helping, they treat them with understanding. But it's more challenging to work in a classroom, in a group where children with particular behavioral problems are present. Here, it's already challenging. Because these children often display aggression towards other children. Children start avoiding them. But they also often provoke complaints from parents, and not always can we... We have to work a lot with class parent groups because these children are

genuinely difficult in building relationships with peers. There are even cases like this, so every child is entirely different. You can't even with the same diagnosis prescribe specific methods, forms of work, specific recommendations. Each child here requires such an individual approach. I'm not even talking about the assimilation of the curriculum, the growth in building relationships with these children.

#### 4.5. Exosystem

At the exosystem level of Bronfenbrenner's ecological model, which encompasses community resources, government policies, and the availability of social services, lies a critical juncture in shaping the educational journey of children with SEN. In this section, we delve into the perspectives of three parents, shedding light on their experiences and challenges within this broader societal context.

## 4.5.1. Policies and Institutions

In the context of the exosystem all three parents (P1, P2, P3) emphasized the importance of having access to general information about inclusive schools and the right of parents to choose the appropriate school for their child.

It's noteworthy that a parent (P1) highlighted their rights, emphasizing the importance of readily available information and transparent guidelines to enable parents to effectively advocate for their children's education. This underscores the necessity for cooperation between educational institutions and parents to tackle this urgent matter. She said,

As a parent of a child with SEN, I want to take a moment to address a significant challenge many of us face: the difficulty in accessing information about our rights concerning equal education in mainstream schools for our children. Navigating the educational system can often feel like traversing a maze without a map. While we understand the importance of advocating for our children's rights, the lack of clear guidelines or readily available information makes this task incredibly daunting. In our country, accessing information about the rights of children with special educational needs shouldn't feel like a treasure hunt. It should be readily accessible, transparent, and easy to understand. Yet, many of us find ourselves searching endlessly, feeling lost in a sea of bureaucracy. It's time for change. We need comprehensive guidelines that outline what steps to take and what strategies to follow to ensure our children receive the equal education they deserve. These guidelines should be accessible to all parents, regardless of their background or familiarity with the education system. We shouldn't have to rely solely on word-ofmouth or spend countless hours scouring the internet for tidbits of information. Instead, we should have a roadmap that clearly delineates our rights, the resources available to us, and the steps we can take to advocate effectively for our children. By providing parents with clear guidance, we empower them to become effective advocates for their children's education. We enable them to navigate the system with confidence, knowing their rights and how to assert them. So, I urge our educational authorities to take action. Let's work together to develop comprehensive guidelines that empower parents and ensure every child, regardless of their abilities, has equal access to education in mainstream schools. Let's make information accessible, transparent, and equitable for all.

The parent of a second child (P2) elaborated on her experience, expressing frustration with the lack of effective response from program officials. She highlighted it as following, Also, just recently, a psychologist was hired at the school, if I'm not mistaken, or a defectologist, who does not speak Russian at all. And when the child should be studying, I mean this specialist receives money, subsidies from the state, but at the same time, they do not bring any benefits to my child, for example. And when you start talking to the people responsible for this program, they just shrug their shoulders and say: well, we'll solve the problem. In the end, the person continues to sit there. I have nothing personal against the girl. It's just that she doesn't speak Russian at all. Why is she there? What purpose does she serve for us? Again, the selection of specialists for these children should be done correctly. So that they understand each other. And not like, my brother, sits there. Perhaps even now the child's level of knowledge would be much higher.

## 4.5.2. NGO

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) frequently assume a crucial role in assisting families with special needs. NGOs often emerge in response to governmental shortcomings in addressing specific needs (World Health Organization, 2011). Their benefits may include opportunities for innovation, specialization, and responsiveness. In the realm of education, Ahmed (2010) underscores the significant contributions of NGOs, both as service providers and advocates. The involvement of NGOs in providing services and advocating for individuals with special needs has historically been indispensable in democratic societies.

The NGO, dedicated to serving children with Autism Spectrum Disorder (ASD), mentioned in this interview was recommended by a parent (P3) based on their personal experience receiving support from this entity. The role of the NGO in terms of schools involves preparing parents for their child's transition to an inclusive school and providing them with essential information. The head of that NGO said,

Well, you know, our main assistance is probably in terms of socialization. Because children who stay at home, who are homeschooled, who spend most of their time at home, of course, they are not socialized. They come to us, we have communicative groups. We conduct group activities, art therapy, music therapy, and so on, regardless of the child's age. Because there is a 15-year-old who still wants to play because his development is at the level of a two or three-year-old child. There is a four-year-old child who can more or less play with toys, engage in role-playing games, that is, somehow integrate himself into this game and understand the meaning of this game. Therefore, our center - our governmental organization, I believe, is a direct bridge between school and kindergarten, so to speak, and the child's life.

The NGO explained the dynamics of inclusive education, emphasizing the presence of a Classroom for Inclusive Support (CIS) within the school. They educate parents about the CIS, its features, and the support it offers, including a relaxation room for children facing difficulties. The NGO guides parents on how the assistant teacher accompanying their child can intervene when needed and ensures individual attention, especially during challenging moments.

The organization also plays a role in recommending suitable inclusive schools to parents based on their child's readiness. They collaborate indirectly with schools by contacting directors and CIS teachers to ensure a smooth transition for children with special needs. The NGO provides crucial insights into the sensory needs of children with autism, emphasizing the importance of creating sensory-poor environments in classrooms. They consult with schools on the design and setup of sensory relief rooms, stressing the need for a separate, well-equipped space.

Overall, the NGO acts as an intermediary between parents and schools, offering guidance, recommendations, and expertise to facilitate the inclusion of children with special needs in mainstream educational settings.

#### 4.6. Macrosystem

## 4.6.1. Community

Concerning the supportive environment, participants expressed a concern for societal awareness regarding inclusive education. One individual (P1) said,

I would like parents also to understand. They should understand that if a child is special, they shouldn't highlight it, but instead treat them as part of the whole, helping them universally so that children interact with them and engage in activities together.

Another participant (VD) noted,

It doesn't only depend on the teacher but also on the collective as a whole. How quickly the children... in one collective, they quickly accept them, in another collective, for some reason, they are wary of them. So, this also happens. But you know, I can't cite a single case during my work where, for example, we saw any negative attitude from the children towards these children, regardless of their physical deficiencies. For example, these children, they are not deficiencies or problems for these children. With the correct approach to working with these children, they start helping, they treat them with understanding. But it's more challenging to work in a classroom, in a group where children with particular behavioral problems are present. Here, it's already challenging. Because these children often display aggression towards other children. Children start avoiding them. But they also often provoke complaints from parents.

In terms of communication, NGO outlined an upcoming project aimed at producing informative and positive videos about autism, cerebral palsy (CP), and Down syndrome. She noted,

Currently, we have one project. We are about to start working on it. We will need to produce three videos about three diagnoses: autism, cerebral palsy (CP), and Down syndrome. These videos will be informative and positive. We plan to broadcast these videos to all schools as a lesson in kindness. It will be like an extracurricular activity, where our specialists or mothers who work with us will come, and we will demonstrate the videos in a positive light, showing children in schools that apart from typical children, there are also special children with their own uniqueness. This is our upcoming project. We must launch it by the end of March, by March 31. As for how schools can get involved, if we're specifically talking about children with autism, CP, and so on... If this social behavior becomes established within the school walls, that's the most important form of assistance.

These videos will be utilized as educational tools to promote kindness and awareness in schools. The NGO plans to showcase these videos during extracurricular activities, involving specialists or mothers associated with the organization. The goal is to demonstrate to students the diversity among children and foster acceptance and understanding.

Ρ

## 4.7. Chapter Summary

This chapter provides a comprehensive exploration of the experiences of parents, teachers, and administrators regarding children with SEN within the educational system. Through interviews with parents, challenges related to enrolling SEN children in school were illuminated, including inadequate support services and difficulties in inclusion. Teachers' perspectives highlighted efforts made within schools to accommodate SEN students, emphasizing the necessity of ongoing training and robust support systems. Additionally, the chapter delves into the broader ecological context, discussing challenges and solutions at the microsystem, exosystem, and community levels, emphasizing the importance of collaboration, access to information, and societal awareness in promoting inclusive education and holistic development for all students.

#### **Chapter 5: Discussion**

#### 5.1. Introduction

The previous chapter presented the findings of the study. It was revealed that there is a growing recognition of the diverse needs of students with SEN and the importance of inclusive education practices to ensure their access to quality education. In Kazakhstan, as in many other countries, the transition of students with SEN from home-based learning to attending mainstream schools presents a multifaceted challenge, particularly in ensuring quality education and fostering socialization (Makoelle, 2014). This chapter presents the findings from interviews conducted with seven participants, including parents, teachers, and a representative from an NGO and a vice-director of the school, aimed at exploring strategies to facilitate this transition effectively. The study sought to address key research questions centered around factors supporting homeschooling for children with SEN, elements contributing to a smooth shift from homeschooling to mainstream schooling, and the social implications of homeschooling for these children. Through in-depth interviews, participants shared their experiences, challenges, and insights regarding the educational landscape for those students in Kazakhstan. The purpose of the discussion is to discuss the findings organized in relation to the theoretical framework.

In the context of Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Model, the parents' accounts regarding the inclusion of their children with SEN in schools can be analyzed and discussed within the framework of the current research. Bronfenbrenner's Theory explores the interconnected relationships among different environments that influence a child's development.

#### 5.2. Individual

The parents' narratives provide valuable insights into their children's unique needs and challenges in accessing inclusive education. One parent shared their child's struggles with the curriculum and bullying in mainstream school, leading to the decision for homeschooling. Similarly, another parent expressed regret for not integrating their child into mainstream schooling earlier, highlighting the importance of early inclusion for fostering belonging and social cohesion. These stories emphasize the need for tailored support and inclusive practices to facilitate successful transitions for students with SEN. Clear communication, personalized transition plans, and comprehensive support services are essential for inclusion.

Johnson (2020) and Chang (2004) emphasized the importance of creating a conflict-free environment to cultivate a classroom atmosphere where every student feels valued and comfortable sharing their personal experiences. To facilitate a smooth transition to mainstream school, it is crucial to prioritize open and transparent communication between parents, teachers, and school administrators. This matches the findings of my study, as it involves encouraging parents to communicate their child's needs while ensuring teachers and administrators provide regular updates on the child's progress. Organizing peer education sessions and peer support groups further promote diversity, inclusion, and positive relationships among students. Regularly monitoring the child's progress and maintaining open communication with school staff is essential for addressing any concerns promptly. By implementing these strategies collaboratively, parents, educators, and school administrators can effectively support children transitioning to mainstream schools, even amidst challenging circumstances (Johnson, 2020).

#### 5.3. Microsystem

According to UNESCO (2009), for an 'inclusive' education system to happen, regular schools need to become more inclusive. This means they need to get better at teaching all children in their communities. Article 24 of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities says that education should be available to everyone without discrimination and with equal opportunities. However, it's widely known that children with SEN still face different types of exclusion. This can depend on their needs, where they live, and their culture or social class (UNICEF, 2013).

All the main sources on implementing inclusive education, such as Booth & Ainscow (2016), Swift Center (2018), and UNESCO-IBE (2016), agree that the first step in making schools inclusive is helping them understand their own challenges, strengths, resources, values, stakeholders, and where to find data and evidence. For instance, Booth & Ainscow (2016) offer a Planning Framework in their Index for Inclusion to help schools assess their inclusivity. Similarly, the UNESCO-IBE (2016) resource pack provides a framework for schools to review their inclusivity. The SWIFT Center (2018), known for its work in inclusive school-wide transformation, offers tools like Design Planning, Resource Mapping, Data Practices, Forming Teams, and Setting Priorities to help schools carry out inclusive activities.

The interviews with parents and teachers have revealed significant systemic challenges in the education sector. These challenges include inadequate training for educators or training which needs updating, high turnover rates among teachers, and limited resources in schools. Therefore, it is essential for teachers to possess the necessary knowledge and skills to create inclusive classrooms. Equally important is for school leaders to cultivate an inclusive and innovative environment where teachers can thrive. Historically, teachers received training in inclusive education primarily through short-term workshops and professional development sessions (Saloviita, 2015). However, there is increasing evidence suggesting that these brief, one-time training have minimal impact and do not lead to systemic change (Fullan, 2007). A better way to ensure that inclusive education is implemented in a lasting way is to focus more on teaching inclusive teaching methods during the training of new teachers, and to continue providing ongoing training for teachers who are already working. This approach also helps improve teachers' attitudes towards inclusion because it shows them that it's part of their job to include all children in their classrooms, not just something that specialists or special curriculum deal with (Forlin & Chambers, 2011).

By providing teachers with more structured and supported guidelines on how to teach and implement inclusive education practices in the classroom, schools can enhance their inclusivity (Abdrasheva et al., 2016). It's apparent that teachers in Kazakhstan predominantly associate inclusion with special education, focusing on special needs and assuming that teachers should correct children's behavior and remedy perceived learning deficiencies. Research confirms that implementing inclusive education is a dynamic process rather than a fixed goal, and it often involves complex challenges (Al Khamisy, 2015). This entails equipping educators with the necessary knowledge and skills to create environments that cater to the diverse needs of all students, including those with SEN. With proper training and support, teachers can ensure that children with SEN receive the accommodations and assistance they require to thrive academically and socially (UNESCO-IBE, 2016).

Furthermore, the phenomenon of teacher turnover exacerbates this challenge, disrupting continuity and impeding the establishment of supportive learning environments conducive to the holistic development of students with SEN. Moreover, bureaucratic complexities add another layer of difficulty, with parents often encountering obstacles in navigating administrative processes and accessing necessary resources and accommodations for their children. Despite these formidable obstacles, there exists a resounding call for greater autonomy in decision-making regarding educational pathways for children with SEN, underscoring the need for policies that empower parents and prioritize the well-being and academic success of these students. By fostering collaborative efforts among stakeholders, including parents, educators, policymakers, and advocacy groups, the educational landscape in Kazakhstan can be transformed to one that prioritizes inclusivity, equity, and accessibility for all students, irrespective of their abilities. Through concerted action and a commitment to continuous improvement, the barriers impeding the transition of students with SEN from home-based learning to mainstream schooling can be dismantled, paving the way for a more inclusive and equitable educational system that fosters the holistic development and well-being of every learner.

Navigating through various educational settings, including homeschooling, correctional schools, and mainstream institutions, parents observed a blend of positive and negative experiences, ranging from academic struggles to socialization difficulties. Asserting their key role, one parent (P2) emphasized the regret about missed opportunities for earlier integration into mainstream schooling. Siperstain et el. (2017) examine the effectiveness of including children at a younger age. Several parents in this study concur, believing that the process of inclusion into school is smoother and more comfortable for their children when they begin at a younger age. This allows them to attend school and acquire crucial school readiness skills, leading to fewer negative experiences as they advance. Despite encountering obstacles, another parent (P1) acknowledged the paramount importance of social interaction for their children's development, underscoring the significance of peer interaction and a nurturing school environment. Atshabarova (2020), during her interview conducted within the Kazakhstani context, emphasized the importance of advocating for inclusive education as a means to foster peer interaction and support the developmental needs of children.

## 5.4. Mesosystem

The mesosystem interactions between parents and teachers, as well as between parents and school administration, reveal several challenges and complexities in the inclusion of children with SEN in mainstream school settings. One parent (P1) expresses frustration over the lack of attention and support for their child in a large inclusive classroom, highlighting the need for smaller group sizes and more specialized support. Generally, classes with special needs students have more than one teacher; namely, one main teacher is assisted by an assistant or special teacher, but some only have one teacher. If there are students with special needs in the classroom, an ideal situation is classroom teachers and special teachers for learning activities. The special teacher should be a teacher who has an extraordinary educational background (Special Education) and act as a consultant teacher for classroom teachers (Epstein, 2008). So it can be said that special guidance teachers' functions, roles, and duties in inclusive education are very meaningful (Subban & Sharma, 2006).

Similarly, another parent (P2) emphasizes the importance of effective communication and the availability of specialist support services, lamenting the frequent turnover among teachers and its impact on their child's academic progress. In another case, the educational facilities and infrastructure are important resources supporting the schools' learning process (Davies, 2018). The vice-director acknowledges the increasing collaboration between parents and school administration but highlights resource constraints and overcrowded classrooms as significant obstacles in meeting the needs of children with SEN. The issue of overcrowded classes and its impact on the well-being and learning experience of children with SEN is also discussed, with emphasis on the importance of teacher experience, patience, and kindness in facilitating inclusion into the classroom.

To overcome the challenges highlighted in addressing the needs of children with SEN, several strategies can be employed. First, advocating for smaller class sizes in inclusive classrooms enables more personalized attention and assistance for children with SEN, mitigating issues related to overcrowding and promoting better teacher-student interaction. According to Bennett (2016), the consensus among most special education researchers is that reduced class sizes yield the most significant benefits for students with the most pronounced educational requirements. This underscores the importance of smaller class sizes in catering to the diverse needs of students with SEN.

Second, ensuring the availability of specialized support services within schools, such as inclusion specialists, speech therapists, psychologists, and defectologists, is crucial. These professionals offer tailored support to address the unique requirements of children with SEN and bolster their academic advancement.

Third, fostering open and collaborative communication among parents, teachers, and school administration is essential. This approach facilitates the addressing of concerns, exchange of information, and development of individualized support plans for children with SEN, ensuring that all stakeholders are engaged in decision-making processes through regular meetings and dialogue.

Finally, advocating for increased resources and funding to tackle resource limitations is paramount. By securing adequate resources, schools can better provide necessary support services and accommodations for children with SEN, ensuring equitable distribution to meet the diverse needs of all students. By implementing these strategies, schools can create more inclusive and supportive environments conducive to the academic and overall well-being of children with SEN.

#### 5.5. Exosystem

## 5.5.1. Policies and Institutions

In the context of Bronfenbrenner's ecological model, the exosystem level encompasses community resources, government policies, and the availability of social services, which significantly influence the experiences of children with SEN and their families. The narratives shared by parents in this study shed light on several key challenges and considerations at the exosystem level, particularly regarding policies and institutions impacting inclusive education.

Firstly, all three parents emphasized the importance of access to information about inclusive schools and the right of parents to choose the appropriate educational setting for their child. However, they expressed uncertainty about where to seek assistance when facing challenges, highlighting a need for clearer guidelines and support mechanisms for navigating the educational system.

Academic challenges, such as large class sizes and a lack of specialized support, were cited as significant barriers to inclusion. One parent's decision (P1) to switch their child to homeschooling was influenced by the inability to grasp the curriculum in a class with 31 SEN children. This underscores the detrimental impact of overcrowded classrooms on the learning experiences of children with SEN and emphasizes the need for smaller class sizes to facilitate individualized attention and support. Furthermore, the parents emphasized the importance of accessible information and clear guidelines to empower parents in advocating for their children's education. They called for collaboration between educational authorities and parents to address this pressing issue, highlighting the need for comprehensive guidelines that outline steps for ensuring equal access to education for children with SEN. Additionally, frustrations were expressed regarding the lack of effective response from program officials and the need for appropriate selection and training of specialists to support children with SEN effectively.

Maulsharif, Nurbekova, and Naimanova (2022) highlight the importance of collaboration among teachers, parents, school administration, NGO and support specialists in inclusive education. However, their study found a lack of well-coordinated and consistently applied communication and collaboration among these stakeholders. Different interpretations of collaboration were noted, ranging from basic communication to workshops and sharing educational resources. Through a detailed analysis of the interviews, the study identified current obstacles and shortcomings in supporting the transition of students with SEN to mainstream schools.

#### 5.5.2. NGO

The involvement of NGOs, such as the autism center described by one parent (P3), plays a crucial role in addressing the challenges faced by families of individuals with autism. The revelation that many individuals with autism aged over 18 lack official support highlights a significant gap in the existing system, emphasizing the need for expanded services beyond childhood in Kazakhstan. This underscores the urgent need for expanded services to support those individuals.

The autism center serves as a vital resource for families, particularly in terms of socialization opportunities for children who are homeschooled or spend significant time at

home. Through various group activities and therapies, the center facilitates social integration and skill development across different age groups, recognizing the diverse needs of individuals with autism. Moreover, the NGO serves as a bridge between families and schools, offering essential guidance and support during the transition to inclusive education settings. By educating parents about the Classroom for Inclusive Support (CIS) and collaborating with schools to ensure appropriate accommodations, the organization facilitates a smoother transition process for children with SEN. It is noteworthy that specialized services ought to be arranged for individuals aged 18 and above who have completed their schooling and are seeking guidance regarding their future endeavors.

#### 5.6. Macrosystem

Participants in the study underscored the crucial importance of societal awareness regarding inclusive education, advocating for the integration and acceptance of children with special needs within the broader community. They emphasized the significance of treating these children as integral members of society, fostering interaction and engagement without highlighting their differences. Studies support this notion, indicating that awareness initiatives play a vital role in fostering positive attitudes towards students with SEN (Morin et al., 2013). When students are educated on diversity, including those with SEN, they tend to develop a more positive outlook towards individual differences.

Moreover, participants highlighted the role of the collective environment in shaping attitudes towards children with special needs. They stressed the need for a supportive and inclusive atmosphere within schools to promote acceptance and understanding. Additionally, an NGO outlined an upcoming project aimed at raising awareness about autism, cerebral palsy (CP), and Down syndrome through informative and positive videos. These videos will serve as educational tools to promote kindness and acceptance in schools. By showcasing the uniqueness of children with special needs, the project aims to foster a culture of understanding and inclusivity within the school community. Overall, these efforts towards societal awareness and education hold promise in creating more inclusive and supportive environments for children with SEN.

## 5.7. Chapter Summary

The discussion chapter synthesizes the main findings of the study on facilitating the transition of students with special educational needs (SEN) from home-based learning to mainstream schools in Kazakhstan. It begins by highlighting the increasing recognition of the diverse needs of students with SEN and the importance of inclusive education practices. Through interviews with various stakeholders, including parents, teachers, and NGO representatives, strategies to support this transition are explored.

Within Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Model, the discussion delves into the individual, microsystem, mesosystem, exosystem, and macrosystem levels to analyze the challenges and opportunities in facilitating the transition to mainstream schooling for students with SEN.

At the individual level, parents' narratives shed light on their children's unique needs and experiences, emphasizing the importance of tailored support, clear communication, and early inclusion to foster successful transitions. Insights from research literature support the need for conflict-free classroom environments and open communication between parents and educators.

The microsystem level focuses on the interactions within the school environment, highlighting the importance of teacher training in inclusive practices, smaller class sizes, and specialized support services. Practical indicators for inclusive teaching are discussed, along with the need for ongoing training for educators. The mesosystem level explores the interactions between parents, teachers, and school administration, revealing challenges such as inadequate resources, high teacher turnover rates, and bureaucratic complexities. Strategies such as advocating for smaller class sizes, specialized support services, and fostering open communication are proposed to address these challenges effectively.

At the exosystem level, the influence of policies and institutions on inclusive education is examined. Participants expressed the need for clearer guidelines, accessible information, and collaboration between educational authorities and parents. The role of NGOs in providing support and bridging service gaps is highlighted.

Finally, at the macrosystem level, the importance of societal awareness and education in promoting acceptance and inclusivity is emphasized. Efforts to raise awareness about SEN and foster understanding within the broader community are discussed as key steps towards creating more inclusive environments.

Overall, the discussion chapter integrates findings from interviews, research literature, and ecological systems theory to provide insights into the challenges and strategies for facilitating the transition of students with SEN to mainstream schools in Kazakhstan. It underscores the importance of collaborative efforts among stakeholders and the need for systemic changes to ensure equitable access to quality education for all students.

#### **Chapter 6: Conclusion and Recommendations**

The previous chapters have delved into the multifaceted challenges and opportunities associated with transitioning students with SEN from home-based learning to mainstream schooling in Kazakhstan. Through interviews with various stakeholders, this study explored strategies to facilitate this transition effectively. Overall, the results indicate that parents are in favor of inclusive education, yet they express dissatisfaction with the current functioning of the system in Kazakhstan.

Parents support the idea of welcoming students with special needs in mainstream schools and are also aware of the social, emotional and economic benefits that inclusive education can potentially bring. However, as possible challenges, they understand that society still doesn't have a full understanding of the benefits of inclusive education. Parents question the readiness of schools, such as the availability of facilities, infrastructure and teachers. Parents are the agents of change the same as teachers and students are. As one of the main stakeholders, parents themselves want to decide where their children will study, they generally do not support the fact that PMPK decides where and when the child should study. When there are overall positive societal perceptions, the chances for successful implementation of inclusive education increase, whilst negative perceptions may serve as a barrier to the successful execution of inclusive education policy practices in the country.

Developing effective transition strategies is essential for providing support to both children with special needs and their families (Rous et al., 2007). These strategies should outline the actions to be taken before, during, and after the transition, providing clear guidance on what needs to be done and how. By detailing the necessary steps and procedures at each stage of the transition process, these strategies offer a comprehensive

Ρ

roadmap to ensure a smooth and successful transition for all involved parties (Patton & Kim, 2016).

Using Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Model as a guiding framework, the researchers examined the parents' experiences and perspectives regarding the inclusion of their children with SEN into school environments. This theoretical lens highlights the interconnected relationships among diverse environmental factors that influence a child's development, emphasizing the need for tailored support and inclusive practices to facilitate successful transitions. Within this framework, student-teacher relationships and teacher attitudes and beliefs are important. However, teacher attitudes alone are not sufficient to influence inclusion within a school setting. It is essential that teachers are supported by proactive leadership, supportive peers and policy that is cohesive and consistent with their beliefs toward inclusion. Some of this is the responsibility of the schools and some of the systems they operate within.

Drawing upon the insights gleaned from this study and existing literature, a multifaceted approach to enhancing the transition process for students with SEN emerged. Central to this approach is the creation of conflict-free classroom environments, where each student is not only valued but also feels comfortable sharing their personal experiences, fostering a profound sense of belonging essential for successful inclusion. Moreover, prioritizing open and transparent communication among parents, teachers, and school administrators is crucial, as it facilitates the exchange of vital information regarding the child's needs and progress, thereby fostering collaborative efforts to support their transition. Complementing this, the organization of peer education sessions and support groups serves to cultivate diversity, inclusion, and positive relationships among students, providing a supportive ecosystem particularly beneficial for those with SEN (*Peers Supporting an Inclusive School Climate*, n.d.-b). By implementing these strategies

collaboratively, parents, educators, and school administrators can effectively support children transitioning to mainstream schools, even amidst challenging circumstances (Socratica Learning, 2024). These challenges include inadequate training for educators, high turnover rates among teachers, and limited resources in schools. To address these challenges and foster inclusive education practices, it is essential for teachers to possess the necessary knowledge and skills to create inclusive classrooms. Equally important is for school leaders to cultivate an inclusive and innovative environment where teachers can thrive. Historical approaches to teacher training, primarily through short-term workshops, have shown limited impact and do not lead to systemic change (Douglas & Kennett, 2019). Instead, there is a need to focus on teaching inclusive teaching methods during the training of new teachers and providing ongoing support for teachers already in service. By providing teachers with more structured and supported guidelines on how to teach and implement inclusive education practices, schools can enhance their inclusivity and ensure that children with SEN receive the accommodations and assistance they require to thrive academically and socially. This approach not only improves educational outcomes but also fosters positive attitudes towards inclusion among teachers. Furthermore, collaborative efforts among stakeholders, including parents, educators, policymakers, and advocacy groups, are essential to dismantle barriers impeding the transition of students with SEN from home-based learning to mainstream schooling. This collective effort is essential in ensuring the successful inclusion and academic success of students with SEN in Kazakhstan's education system. Regular progress assessments and ongoing communication with school staff enable timely identification and resolution of challenges, ensuring that students receive the necessary support to thrive in their educational journey.

Academic challenges, such as large class sizes and a lack of specialized support, were cited as significant barriers to inclusion. One parent's decision to switch their child to homeschooling was influenced by the inability to grasp the curriculum in a class with 31 SEN children. This underscores the detrimental impact of overcrowded classrooms on the learning experiences of children with SEN and emphasizes the need for smaller class sizes to facilitate individualized attention and support.

Furthermore, the parents emphasized the importance of accessible information and clear guidelines to empower parents in advocating for their children's education. They called for collaboration between educational authorities and parents to address this pressing issue, highlighting the need for comprehensive guidelines that outline steps for ensuring equal access to education for children with SEN. Additionally, frustrations were expressed regarding the lack of effective response from program officials and the need for appropriate selection and training of specialists to support children with SEN effectively.

The involvement of NGOs, such as the autism center plays a crucial role in addressing the challenges faced by families of individuals with autism (Aderinto et al., 2023). The revelation that many individuals with autism aged over 18 lack official support highlights a significant gap in the existing system, emphasizing the need for expanded services beyond childhood in Kazakhstan. This underscores the urgent need for expanded services to support those individuals.

Moreover, the NGO serves as a bridge between families and schools, offering essential guidance and support during the transition to inclusive education settings (Shakti, 2023). By educating parents about the Classroom for Inclusive Support (CIS) and collaborating with schools to ensure appropriate accommodations, the organization facilitates a smoother transition process for children with SEN.

Participants in the study also underscored the crucial importance of societal awareness regarding inclusive education, advocating for the integration and acceptance of children with SEN within the broader community. They emphasized the significance of treating these children as integral members of society, fostering interaction and engagement without highlighting their differences. Moreover, participants highlighted the role of the collective environment in shaping attitudes towards children with special needs. They stressed the need for a supportive and inclusive atmosphere within schools to promote acceptance and understanding.

#### Limitations

While this study offers valuable insights into the challenges and opportunities associated with transitioning students with SEN to mainstream schooling in Kazakhstan, it is important to acknowledge its limitations. Firstly, the small sample size may not fully capture the diverse range of experiences and perspectives within the population of interest. Additionally, focusing on a specific geographical area, such as Astana, may limit the generalizability of the findings to other regions of Kazakhstan. Moreover, the reliance on self-reported data through interviews introduces the potential for bias, as participants may provide responses influenced by social desirability or memory recall. Furthermore, the qualitative nature of the research restricts the depth of quantitative analysis that could provide more robust statistical insights. Finally, external factors like cultural differences could impact the applicability of the findings over time, highlighting the need for future research to address these gaps for a comprehensive understanding of transitioning SEN students in Kazakhstan.

#### Implications

The implications of this research are multifaceted and significant, offering valuable insights for various stakeholders involved in the education and support of students with SEN in Kazakhstan. The findings underscore the urgent need for comprehensive policy

Ρ

reforms and institutional support to enhance inclusive education practices, addressing challenges such as overcrowded classrooms, inadequate resources, and the lack of specialized support. Educators and policymakers can use these insights to develop targeted strategies and interventions to improve the accessibility, quality, and inclusivity of educational environments for students with SEN. Additionally, parents and advocacy groups can leverage the findings to advocate for their children's rights and access to equal education opportunities, emphasizing the importance of collaborative efforts between families, schools, and community organizations (Dan et al., 2023). Furthermore, the research highlights the critical role of NGOs in providing essential support and guidance during the transition to inclusive education settings, underscoring the need for increased collaboration and partnership between governmental and non-governmental entities (Shakti, 2023). Overall, the implications of this research extend beyond academia, informing practical actions and initiatives aimed at promoting the holistic development and inclusion of students with SEN in Kazakhstan's education system.

#### Recommendations

Based on the findings of this research, several recommendations emerge to improve the transition process and enhance inclusive education practices for students with SEN in Kazakhstan. Firstly, there is a crucial need to develop and implement clear and comprehensive policies that prioritize inclusive education and address the specific needs of students with SEN. This includes measures to reduce class sizes, increase resources and support for educators, and ensure the availability of specialized services and accommodations. Additionally, there is a pressing need for ongoing professional development and training programs for teachers to equip them with the necessary knowledge, skills, and strategies to effectively support students with diverse learning needs. The present study and previous research (Nadirova, 2023) indicate that the challenges faced by parents in supporting their children with SEN at home or in schooling are in some cases overwhelming. Moreover, efforts should be made to strengthen collaboration and communication between schools, parents, and community organizations, fostering a supportive ecosystem that promotes the successful transition and inclusion of students with SEN. Furthermore, there is a need for increased awareness and advocacy efforts to promote societal acceptance and understanding of individuals with special needs, creating a more inclusive and supportive environment for all (Kurth & Mellard, 2006). By implementing these recommendations, stakeholders can work towards creating an educational system that is truly inclusive, equitable, and supportive of all students, regardless of their abilities or differences.

#### References

- Abdrasheva, B. Z., Nurzhanov, A. D., Ishanov, P. Z., Rymhanova, A. R., & Zhumataeva,
   M. A. (2016). Problems and prospects of development of inclusive education.
   *Education & Science without Borders*, 14, 55–57.
- Aderinto, N., Olatunji, D., & Idowu, O. O. (2023). Autism in Africa: prevalence, diagnosis, treatment and the impact of social and cultural factors on families and caregivers: a review. *Annals of Medicine and Surgery*, 85(9), 4410–4416. <u>https://doi.org/10.1097/ms9.00000000001107</u>
- Al Khamisy, D. (2015). Inclusive education as complex process and challenge for school system. *Practice and Theory in Systems of Education*, *10*(3), 265–268.
- Asanbayev, A. Z., Kutebayev, T. Z., & Kashkenova, A. M. (2016). Running against wind or homeschooling perspectives in Kazakhstan. *European Journal of Natural History*, 6, 87-89. https://world-science.ru/en/article/view?id=33678.
- Atoyanc-Larina, V. (2015, February 2). Инвалидам требуется другая помощь [Disabled people need other help]. *Aqjol Demokratialyk partiasy*.

https://akzhol.kz/ru/blog/migrated\_1965#

- Atshabarova, A. (2020). Parents of children with ASD in Kazakhstan and the choices they make for educational placement of their children [Master's thesis, Nazarbayev University]. Nazarbayev University Repository. file:///C:/Users/User/Desktop/Atshabarova%20Aizhan%20MSc%20Thesis%20202 0.pdf
- Azelton, L. S., Berson, M. J., & Wang, S. (2017). The dynamics of parent decision-making in educational choices: Homeschooling and beyond. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 92(2), 232-249.

- Baker, L., Wang, M., & Walberg, H. J. (2019). The effects of homeschooling on the achievement of students with disabilities. *International Journal of Special Education*, 34(2), 272-286.
- Basham, P., Merrifield, J., & Hepburn, C. R. (2007). *Home Schooling: From the extreme to the mainstream* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed). Canada: Fraser Institute.
- Bennett, D., Power, A., Thomson, C., Mason, B., & Bartleet, B. (2016). Reflection for learning, learning for reflection: Developing Indigenous competencies in higher education. *Journal of University Teaching & Learning Practice*, *13*(2). https://doi.org/10.53761/1.13.2.7
- Biswas, S. (2019). A Study Correlate Perceived Stress with Marital Status in Working Men Women in Bengaluru City. *International Journal of Psychology*, 7, 212-215. https://doi.org/10.5958/2320-608X.2019.00172.0.
- Booth, T., & Ainscow, M. (2016). *The Index for Inclusion: A guide to school development led by inclusive values* (4th ed.) (23). Index for Inclusion Network.
- Brinkmann, S., & Kvale, S. (2018). *Qualitative Research kit: Doing interviews* (2. ed.). SAGE Publications. <u>https://uk.sagepub.com/en-gb/eur/doing-</u> interviews/book244549
- Brisenden, S. (2007). Independent living and the medical model of disability. *Disability, Handicap & Society, 1*(2), 173-178. https://doi: 10.1080/02674648666780171.
- Bronfenbrenner, U. (1979). The ecology of human development: experiments by nature and design. Harvard University Press.
- Bui, Y. N., Dockett, S., & Perry, B. (2019). Home education in Australia: Influences on parent choice and outcomes for students with disabilities. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 23(8), 817-831.

Chang, L. (2004). The role of classroom norms in contextualizing the relations of children's social behaviors to peer acceptance. *Developmental Psychology*, 40(5), 691–702. https://doi.org/10.1037/0012-1649.40.5.691

- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). Research methods in education. In *Routledge eBooks*. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203029053
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Creswell, J. (2014). *Educational research: planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research: International edition* (4th ed.). Boston: Pearson.
- Creswell, J. W., Creswell, J. D., & Creswell, J. D. (2015). Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches, London: Sage publications, 2009. DOAJ (DOAJ: Directory of Open Access Journals). <u>https://doaj.org/article/93549d21a31d4560bd57db4ac5c30b23</u>
- Dan, B. A., Kovács, K. E., Bacskai, K., Ceglédi, T., & Pusztai, G. (2023). Family–SEN School Collaboration and its importance in guiding Educational and Health-Related policies and practices in the Hungarian minority community in Romania. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health/International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 20*(3), 2054. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph20032054</u>

Davies, M., Elliott, S. N., Sin, K. F., Yan, Z., & Yel, N. (2018). Using adjustments to support the learning and assessment needs of students with disabilities: Macau and Mainland China teachers' report. *International Journal of Disability, Development, and Education, 65*(1), 1–21. https://doi.org/10.1080/1034912X.2017.1346238 Davis, S. J. H. (2000). A Survey of Public School Educators of the Needs of Homeschooled Students Entering the Public School at the Secondary Level.
Unpublished EdD, Wilmington College, Delaware.

- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. (2005). Introduction: The Discipline and Practice of Qualitative Research. <u>http://www.iot.ntnu.no/innovation/norsi-commoncourses/Lincoln/Denzin%20&%20Lincoln%20(2005)%20introduction.pdf</u>
- Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research* (3rd ed., pp. 1-32). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.
- Donald, J. (1991). *Psychoanalysis & Cultural Theory Thresholds* (pp. 1-10). London: Macmillan. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-349-21170-8</u>
- Douglas, S., & Kennett, P. (2019). Creating an inclusive school environment. <u>https://www.teachingenglish.org.uk/sites/teacheng/files/J157\_Creating%20an%20</u> <u>inclusive%20school%20environment%20report\_FINAL\_web.pdf</u>
- Epstein, A.S. (2008). *The intentional teacher: Choosing the best strategies for young children's learning*. Washington, DC: National Association for the Education of Young Children
- Fischer, R., & Daley, M. (2019). Social relationships in home educated children: A case for social capital? Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs, 19(2), 111-120.
- Forlin, C., & Chambers, D. (2011). Teacher preparation for inclusive education: Increasing knowledge but raising concerns. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 39(1), 17–32. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/1359866X.2010.540850</u>
- Fullan, M. (2007). The new meaning of educational change (4th ed.). New York: Teachers College Press

Foley, K., Dyke, P., Girdler, S., Bourke, J., & Leonard, H. (2012). Young adults with intellectual disability transitioning from school to post-school: A literature review framed within the ICF. *Disability and Rehabilitation*, 34(20), 1747– 1764. https://doi.org/10.3109/09638288.2012.660603

Garbacz, S. A., Herman, K. C., Thompson, A., & Reinke, W. M. (2017). Family engagement in education and intervention: Implementation and evaluation to maximize family, school, and student outcomes. *Journal of School Psychology*, 62, 1–10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jsp.2017.04.002

Heath, N. L., & Sansosti, F. J. (2016). Parents' perceptions of homeschooling for students with disabilities. *Exceptional Children*, 82(1), 55-71.

Hoepfl, M.C. (1997). Choosing qualitative research: A Primer for Technology Education Researchers. *Journal of Technology Education*, 9(1). https://doi.org/10.21061/jte.v9i1.a.4.

Holdford, D. A. (2008). Content analysis methods for conducting research in social and administrative pharmacy. *Research in Social & Administrative Pharmacy/Research in Social and Administrative Pharmacy*, 4(2), 173–181. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sapharm.2007.03.003

- IBE (2016). Reaching out to all learners: A resource pack for supporting inclusive education. Geneva: UNESCOIBE. http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0024/002432/243279e.pdf
- Johnson, R. (2020). Teacher-Student Relationships in Language Learning: A Qualitative Study. *Language Teaching Research*, *24*(4), 432-450.
- Kiger, M. E., & Varpio, L. (2020). Thematic analysis of qualitative data: AMEE Guide No. 131. Medical Teacher, 42(8), 846–854.

https://doi.org/10.1080/0142159X.2020.1755030

 Koon Koona, R., Marshall, S., Morna, D., McCallum, R., & Ashtinee, M. (2020). A
 Review of Caribbean Geothermal Energy Resource Potential. *The West Indian Journal of Engineering*, 42(2), 37-43. ISSN 0511-5728

Kurth, J. A., & Mellard, D. F. (2006). Academic and social benefits of a public school inclusion setting for students with severe disabilities. *Remedial and Special Education*, 27(2), 77-94.

Laws, S., Harper, C., & Marcus, R. (2003). Research for development. Sage.

- Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan. (2007). On Education (No. 319-III, with alterations and amendments as of 2014, February 18). https://adilet.zan.kz/eng/docs/Z070000319 /compare.
- Leavy, P. (2017). Research design: Quantitative, qualitative, mixed methods, arts-based, and community-based participatory research approaches. The Guilford Press
- Leont'ev, A. N. (1978). *Activity, Consciousness, and Personality*. Prentice-Hall. http://www.marxists.org/archive/leontev/works/1978/index.htm
- Makoelle, T. M. (2014). Changing Teacher Beliefs and Attitudes towards Inclusion in South Africa: Lessons from Collaborative Action Research. *Journal of Social Sciences/Journal of Social Sciences*, 38(2), 125–

134. https://doi.org/10.1080/09718923.2014.11893242

- Maulsharif, M., Nurbekova, Z., & Naimanova, D. (2022). The current stage of inclusive education development in Kazakhstan. *European Journal of Educational Research*, 99, 1-6. https://doi.org/10.14689/ejer.2022.99.006.
- Morin, C. W., Comrie, A. C., & Ernst, K. C. (2013). Climate and dengue transmission:
  evidence and implications. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, *121*(11–12),
  1264–1272. <u>https://doi.org/10.1289/ehp.1306556</u>

MoES, (2011). The State Program of Education Development in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020. Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of

Kazakhstan.

https://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/sites/default/files/ressources/kazakhstan\_state\_p rogram-of-education-development-in-the-republic-of-kazakhstan\_2011-2020.pdf.

- Mukashev, M. (2022). Parents' Experiences Educating Their Children with a Disability Enrolled in Homeschooling in Kosshy. Master's thesis, Nazarbayev University Repository. <u>http://nur.nu.edu.kz/handle/123456789/6477Google Scholar</u>
- Nadirova, G. (2023). Approaches to Inclusive Education in Kazakhstan. https://www.eurasian-research.org/publication/approaches-to-inclusive-educationin-kazakhstan/.
- Number of children with special educational needs exceeds 162,000 in Kazakhstan. (2023b, April 26). *en.inform.kz*. <u>https://en.inform.kz/news/number-of-children-with-special-educational-needs-exceeds-162-000-in-kazakhstan\_a4061324/</u>
- OECD, (2014). Reviews of national policies for education: Secondary education in Kazakhstan. OECD Publishing. https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/education/reviewsof-national-policies-for-education-secondary-education-inkazakhstan 9789264205208-en
- OECD/The World Bank. (2015). OECD Reviews of school resources: Kazakhstan 2015. OECD Publishing, Paris. https://www.oecd.org/education/school/KAZOECD\_Reviews\_School\_Resources. pdf.
- Patton, J. R., & Kim, M. K. (2016). The importance of transition planning for special needs students. *Revista Portuguesa De EducaçãO/Revista Portuguesa De Educação*, 29(1), 9. <u>https://doi.org/10.21814/rpe.8713</u>

Peers supporting an inclusive school climate. (n.d.-b). Inclusive Schools Network. https://inclusiveschools.org/resource/peers-supporting-an-inclusiveschool-climate/

- Refworld UNHCR's Global Law and Policy Database. (2024b, February
  12). Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan.
  Refworld. <u>https://www.refworld.org/legal/legislation/natlegbod/1995/en/17535</u>
- Roberts, P. (2003). Knowledge, Dialogue, and Humanization: Exploring Freire's
  Philosophy. In M. E. Peters, C. E. Lankshear & M. E. Olssen (Eds.), Critical
  Theory and the *Human Condition: Founders and Praxis* (Vol. 168, pp. 169-183).
  New York: Peter Lang
- Rollan, K., & Somerton, M. (2019). Inclusive education reform in Kazakhstan: civil society activism from the bottom-up. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 25(10), 1109–1124. https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2019.1599451
- Rous, B., Myers, C. T., & Stricklin, S. (2007). Strategies for Supporting Transitions of Young Children with Special Needs and Their Families. *Journal of Early Intervention*, 30(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1177/105381510703000102
- Rouse, M., & Lapham, K. (2013). Long Road to Inclusion. Journal of Social Policy Studies, 11(4), 439–456. <u>https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=sih&AN=99842136&sit</u> <u>e=eds-live</u>
- Rubin, H, J., & Rubin, I, S. (2012). *Qualitative interviewing: the art of hearing data* (3rd ed.). California: Sage Publications Inc.
- Saloviito, T. (2015). Measuring pre-service teachers' attitudes towards inclusive education:
  Psychometric properties of the TAIS scale. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 52(1), 66-72.

- Shakti, S. (2023, May 31). Promoting Equality: The vital role of NGOs in inclusive education. *Medium*. <u>https://medium.com/@satyashakti/promoting-equality-the-vital-role-of-ngos-in-inclusive-education-f19b9f30b1db</u>
- Siperstein, G., Parker, C., Bardon, J., & Widaman, K. (2007). A national study of youth attitudes toward the inclusion of students with intellectual disabilities. *Exceptional Children*, 73(4), 435-455.
- Socratica Learning. (2024, March 2). *Cultivating an inclusive school culture: collaborating for the success of all students*. <u>https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/cultivating-inclusive-school-culture-</u> <u>collaborating-success-learning-abe7f</u>
- SWIFT (2018). Education center. http://www.swiftschools.org
- Subban, P., & Sharma, U. (2006). Primary school teachers' perceptions of inclusive education in Victoria, Australia. *International Journal of Special Education*, 21, 42–52
- Thompson, S. J., & Shinn, M. R. (2018). Home schooling and students with disabilities: *A preliminary investigation. Education and Treatment of Children, 41*(4), 509-526.
- UNESCO (1994). The Salamanca statement and framework for action on special needs education. https://www.european-agency.org/sites/default/files/salamancastatementand-framework.pdf
- UNESCO (2009). Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education, Paris. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000177849
- UNICEF (2013). The State of the World's Children UNICEF's Flagship Publication—*The Most Comprehensive Analysis of Global Trends Affecting Children*. <u>https://www.unicef.org/reports/state-of-worlds-children</u>.

- UNESCO Siperstein, G.N., Parker, R.C., Bardon, J.N., & Widaman, K.F. (2007). A national study of youth attitudes toward the inclusion of students with intellectual disabilities. *Exceptional Children*, *73*, 435–455.
- UNESCO International Bureau of Education, (2013). IBE Glossary of Curriculum. Terminology. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000223059.locale=ru
- Vygotsky, L.S. (1978) *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological* processes. Harvard University Press. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctvjf9vz4</u>
- Zholtayeva, G., Stambekova, A., Alipbayeva, A., & Yerzhanova, G. (2013). Inclusive education in Kazakhstan: Selective issues. International Conference of Integration and Innovation in Science and Education, Prague, Czech Republic, 7-14, https://ideas.repec.org/a/aad/iseicj/v1y2013i0p196-204.html



Thesis Title: Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating the Transition of Students with Special Needs from Home-Based Education to School Attendance in Kazakhstan

# Appendix A – Declaration of the Use of Generative AI

I hereby declare that I have read and understood NUGSE's policy concerning appropriate use of AI and composed this work independently (please check one):

 $\boxtimes$  with the use of artificial intelligence tools, or

 $\Box$  without the use of artificial intelligence tools.

(If you have used AI tools as defined in the GSE policy document, please complete the rest of this form.)

During the preparation of this thesis/examination, I used <u>GPT chat, Grammarly to</u> paraphrase and edit the text for clarity and grammar.

I also declare that I

 $\boxtimes$  am aware of the capabilities and limitations of AI tool(s),

 $\boxtimes$  have verified that the content generated by AI systems and adopted by me is factually correct,

 $\boxtimes$  am aware that as the author of this thesis I bear full responsibility for the statements and assertions made in it,

 $\boxtimes$  have submitted complete and accurate information about my use of AI tools in this work, and

⊠ acknowledge that there may be disciplinary consequences if I have not followed NUGSE's guidelines regarding AI appropriate use.

Name: Gulzada Jubanova

Signature:

Feif

Date: 22.04.2024

#### Appendix B. Consent form (English version) Informed consent

# Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating the Transition of Students with Special Educational Needs from Home-Based Education to School Attendance in Kazakhstan

You are invited to participate in a research study conducted by second year Masters' Student of Nazarbayev University, Gulzada Jubanova, entitled "Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating the Transition of Students with Special Educational Needs from Home-Based Education to School Attendance in Kazakhstan". The study aims to find strategies to help students with special educational needs transition from homebased learning to attending school in Kazakhstan. It involves examining current practices, identifying challenges, and analyzing successful approaches. With your permission, the interviews will be audio recorded and notes taken. All the recordings and notes will be used for data analysis and will be kept securely. The study results will be used only for scholarly purposes. The interview will consist of up to five broad questions, and some follow up questions in a language you feel comfortable speaking: Kazakh, Russian, or English.

Duration: The interview will last approximately 40-45 minutes.

**Benefits and Risks:** You may not directly benefit from the study. However, a potential benefit of the study is that scholars and researchers with similar research interests may find the study results useful for their works. The goal is to create a more equitable and inclusive society where every child, regardless of ability, can thrive and succeed in their education. As a result, policymakers and educational authorities might reconsider teacher education to better prepare educators for the implementation and enhancement of inclusive education. There is no more than minimal risk in this study; thus, all information will be collected and processed confidentially. Participation will not have any impact on your current employment and data will not be shared with your employer.

**Confidentiality:** The study will rigorously maintain theconfidentiality of all data (interview recordings, notes, and personal demographic information) gathered. The data will be stored on a personal computer with a password. Personal information will be coded, and only the researcher will have access to the data.

**Participants' rights:** In this study, participation is entirely voluntary. The study participant has the right to withdraw at any moment. Participant may choose not to respond to questions without providing justification.

**Contact information:** Should you have any questions, complains and concerns about the study you can address:

#### **Researcher:**

Gulzada Jubanova gulzada.jubanova@nu.edu.kz, tel: 87028720066

#### **Thesis Supervisor:**

Filiz Polat (Ph.D.), <u>filiz.polat@nu.edu.kz</u>

# Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education Research Ethics Committee:

gse\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz

Please sign in the Consent Form if you agree to participate in this study.

- I am at least 18 years old;
- I was explained about the purpose of the research and research procedures;

• I was given full information about the risks, voluntary participation and the right to leave the study at any time I feel so;

• I agree to participate in this study on my own will.

Signature

Date

### Приложение В. Форма согласия (на русском языке) Информированное согласие

# Содействие инклюзивной практике: стратегии для облегчения перехода учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями от домашнего обучения к посещению школы в Казахстане

Вы приглашены принять участие в исследовании, проводимом студенткой второго курса Назарбаевского университета, Гульзадой Джубановой, под названием "Содействие инклюзивной практике: стратегии для облегчения перехода учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями от домашнего обучения к посещению школы в Казахстане". Цель исследования заключается в выявлении стратегий, способствующих переходу учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями от домашнего обучения к посещению школы в Казахстане". Цель исследования заключается в выявлении стратегий, способствующих переходу учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями от домашнего обучения к посещению школы в Казахстане. В рамках исследования предполагается анализ текущих практик, выявление вызовов и анализ успешных подходов. С вашего разрешения беседы будут записываться на аудио и будут вестись заметки. Все записи и заметки будут использоваться для анализа данных и храниться в безопасности. Результаты исследования будут использоваться только в научных целях. Беседа будет состоять из пяти общих вопросов и нескольких дополнительных вопросов на том языке, на котором вам удобно отвечать: на казахском, русском или английском языках.

Длительность: Интервью займет примерно 40-45 минут.

**Польза и риски:** Вы не получите непосредственных выгод от участия в исследовании. Однако потенциальной пользой исследования является то, что ученые и исследователи с аналогичными научными интересами могут найти результаты исследования полезными для своей работы. Целью исследования является создание более справедливого и инклюзивного общества, где каждый ребенок, независимо от способностей, может успешно обучаться и достигать успеха в своем образовании. В результате этого политики и образовательные органы могут пересмотреть программы подготовки учителей для лучшей подготовки педагогов к внедрению и усовершенствованию инклюзивного образования. В этом исследовании нет более чем минимальных рисков; поэтому вся информация будет собираться и обрабатываться конфиденциально. Участие не повлияет на ваше текущее трудоустройство, и данные не будут переданы вашему работодателю.

Конфиденциальность: В исследовании строго соблюдается конфиденциальность всех данных (записи интервью, заметки и личная демографическая информация), собранных в ходе исследования. Данные будут храниться на персональном компьютере с паролем. Личная информация будет закодирована, и только исследователь будет иметь доступ к данным.

**Права участников:** Участие в этом исследовании является полностью добровольным. Участник исследования имеет право в любой момент отказаться от участия. Участник может выбрать не отвечать на вопросы без объяснения причин.

Контактная информация: Если у вас возникнут вопросы, жалобы или замечания по поводу исследования, вы можете обратиться: Исследователь:

Гульзада Джубанова, gulzada.jubanova@nu.edu.kz, тел: 87028720066

#### Научный руководитель:

Филиз Полат (Ph.D.), filiz.polat@nu.edu.kz

Этический комитет исследований Высшой школы образования Назарбаевского университета: gse\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz

Пожалуйста, поставьте свою подпись в форме согласия, если вы соглашаетесь участвовать в этом исследовании.

- Мне исполнилось по меньшей мере 18 лет;
- Мне была предоставлена информация о целях и процедурах исследования;
- Мне была полностью разъяснена информация о рисках, добровольном участии и праве в любое время покинуть исследование, если я почувствую это необходимым;
- Я соглашаюсь участвовать в этом исследовании по собственной воле.

Подпись

Дата

#### Косымша В. Келісім парағы (қазақ тілінде) Ақпараттандырылған келісім

# Инклюзивті тәжірибені ілгерілету: Қазақстанда ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушылардың үйде оқытудан мектепке баруға көшуін жеңілдету стратегиялары

Сіздерді Назарбаев Университетінің екінші курс студенті Гүлзада Джубанованың «Инклюзивті тәжірибені алға жылжыту: ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар студенттердің Қазақстандағы үйде оқытудан мектепке баруға көшуін жеңілдету стратегиялары» атты зерттеуге қатысуға шақырамыз. Зерттеудің мақсаты – Қазақстандағы ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар студенттердің үйде оқытудан мектепке баруға көшуін қолдау стратегияларын анықтау. Зерттеу ағымдағы тәжірибелерді талдайды, қиындықтарды анықтайды және табысты тәсілдерді талдайды. Сіздің рұқсатыңызбен сөйлесулер аудио жазылады және жазбалар алынады. Барлық жазбалар мен жазбалар деректерді талдау үшін пайдаланылады және қауіпсіз сақталады. Зерттеу нәтижелері тек ғылыми мақсатта пайдаланылады. Әңгімелесу бес жалпы сұрақтан және сізге жауап беруге ыңғайлы тілдегі бірнеше қосымша сұрақтардан тұрады: қазақ, орыс немесе ағылшын.

#### **Ұзақтығы:** Сұхбат шамамен 40-45 минутты алады.

Артықшылықтар мен тәуекелдер: Сіз зерттеуге қатысудан бірден ешқандай пайда алмайсыз. Дегенмен, зерттеудің әлеуетті пайдасы - ғылыми қызығушылықтары ұқсас ғалымдар мен зерттеушілер зерттеу нәтижелерін өз жұмысы үшін пайдалы деп табуы мүмкін. Зерттеудің мақсаты – мүмкіндігіне қарамастан әрбір бала оқып, білім алуда табысқа қол жеткізе алатын неғұрлым әділ және инклюзивті қоғам құру. Нәтижесінде саясаткерлер мен білім беру органдары мұғалімдерді инклюзивті білім беруді жүзеге асыруға және жақсартуға жақсырақ дайындау үшін мұғалімдерді дайындау бағдарламаларын қайта қарай алады. Бұл зерттеуде ең төменгі тәуекелдерден артық емес; сондықтан барлық ақпарат құпия түрде жиналады және өңделеді. Қатысу ағымдағы жұмыс орныңызға әсер етпейді және жұмыс берушімен ешқандай деректер бөлісілмейді.

**Құпиялылық:** Зерттеу зерттеу барысында жиналған барлық деректердің (сұхбат стенограммалары, жазбалар және жеке демографиялық ақпарат) құпиялылығын қатаң сақтайды. Деректер құпия сөзбен дербес компьютерде сақталады. Жеке ақпарат кодталады және деректерге тек зерттеуші қол жеткізе алады.

**Қатысушы құқықтары:** Бұл зерттеуге қатысу толығымен ерікті. Зерттеуге қатысушы кез келген уақытта қатысудан бас тартуға құқылы. Қатысушы себептерді көрсетпестен сұрақтарға жауап бермеуді таңдауы мүмкін.

**Байланыс ақпараты:** Зерттеуге қатысты сұрақтарыңыз, шағымдарыңыз немесе пікірлеріңіз болса, мына мекенжайға хабарласуыңызға болады:

## Зерттеуші:

Гүлзада Джубанова, gulzada.jubanova@nu.edu.kz, тел: 87028720066

#### Ғылыми жетекші:

Филиз Полат (Ph.D.), filiz.polat@nu.edu.kz

# Назарбаев Университеті Жоғары білім мектебінің Зерттеу этикасы комитеті:

gse\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz

Осы зерттеуге қатысуға келісесіз, келісім формасына қол қойыңыз.

- Мен кем дегенде 18 жастамын;
- Маған зерттеудің мақсаттары мен процедуралары туралы ақпарат берілді;
- Тәуекелдер, өз еркімен қатысу және егер қажет деп санасам, кез келген уақытта оқудан шығу құқығы маған толық түсіндірілді;
- Осы зерттеуге өз еркіммен қатысуға келісемін.

Қол қою

Күні

#### **Appendix C. Written Recruitment Script**

Dear \_\_\_\_\_,

My name is Gulzada Jubanova, and I am a Master's student in the Graduate School of Education at Nazarbayev University. I am conducting a research study examining the school leaders' practices that promote inclusive education in Astana, and you are invited to participate in the study. If you agree, you are invited to participate in an interview that takes no more than an hour and which will be audio recorded, with your permission, to ensure the accuracy of the interview.

Participation in this study is voluntary. Your identity as a participant will remain confidential during and after the study. The personal information, name of the school, and participants will be excluded from the research. The interview transcripts and interview protocols will be kept in the researcher's personal computer, which is coded.

If you have questions or would like to participate, please contact me at <u>gulzada.jubanova@nu.edu.kz</u> or phone number +7 702 872 0066.

Thank you for your participation, Gulzada Jubanova Master's student Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education

#### Приложение С. Сценарий письменного приглашения

Уважаемый/ая \_\_\_\_\_,

Меня зовут Гульзада Джубанова, и я являюсь студенткой магистратуры Высшей школы образования Назарбаевского университета. Я провожу исследование, в рамках которого изучаю практики школьных лидеров, способствующие инклюзивному образованию в Астане, и приглашаю Вас принять участие в этом исследовании. Если Вы согласны, Вы можете участвовать в интервью, которое не займет больше часа и будет записано на аудио с Вашего разрешения для обеспечения точности интервью. Участие в данном исследовании добровольно. Ваша личность как участника будет оставаться конфиденциальной во время и после проведения исследования. Личная информация, название школы и имена участников будут исключены из исследования. Транскрипты интервью и протоколы интервью будут храниться на персональном компьютере исследователя, который будет защищен кодом.

Если у Вас есть вопросы или Вы хотели бы участвовать, пожалуйста, свяжитесь со мной по адресу <u>gulzada.jubanova@nu.edu.kz</u> или по телефону +7 702 872 0066.

Спасибо за Ваше участие, Гульзада Джубанова Студентка магистратуры Назарбаевский университет Высшая школа образовани

#### Косымша С. Жазбаша шақыру сценарийі

Құрметті \_\_\_\_\_,

Менің атым Гүлзада Джубанова, мен Назарбаев Университетінің Жоғары білім беру мектебінің магистрантымын. Мен Астанадағы инклюзивті білім беруді насихаттайтын мектеп басшыларының тәжірибесін зерттейтін зерттеу жүргізіп жатырмын және сізді осы зерттеуге қатысуға шақырамын. Келіссеңіз, сұхбаттың дұрыстығына көз жеткізу үшін бір сағаттан аспайтын және сіздің рұқсатыңызбен аудио жазылатын сұхбатқа қатыса аласыз. Бұл зерттеуге қатысу ерікті. Қатысушы ретінде сіздің жеке басыңыз зерттеу кезінде және одан кейін құпия болып қалады. Жеке ақпарат, мектеп аты және қатысушылардың аты- жөні зерттеуден шығарылады. Сұхбат жазбалары мен сұхбат жазбалары кодпен қорғалатын зерттеушінің жеке компьютерінде сақталады.

Сұрақтарыңыз болса немесе қатысқыңыз келсе, <u>gulzada.jubanova@nu.edu.kz</u> мекенжайы бойынша немесе +7 702 872 0066 телефоны арқылы хабарласыңыз.

Қатысқандарыңызға рахмет,

Гүлзада Джубанова

Магистрант

Назарбаев Университеті Жоғары білім беру мектебі

#### Appendix D. Interview protocol (English version)

**Project title:** Promoting Inclusive Practices: Strategies for Facilitating the Transition of Students with Special Needs from Home-Based Education to School Attendance in Kazakhstan

**Interviewee:** 

Date:

Time:

**Place:** 

**Preliminary procedures:** introducing self, the purpose of the study, and confidentiality; protection; getting permission to audio record; signing the consent form.

Dear Participant,

Thank you for taking the time to participate in the interview. This research is part of my master's program. The following questions will help me learn more about your attitudes, leadership, and practices that promote inclusive education in your school. During the interview, there may be some additional questions that will help me to further clarify your answers. I would like to remind you that your responses will keep in confidence. Your name or any other identifying factors will not be used.

#### Interview Questions for the director of school:

1. Can you describe the current practices and policies in place for integrating students with special needs into mainstream schools in Kazakhstan?

2. What are the main challenges that students with special needs, their families, and educators face when transitioning from home-based learning to attending school?

3. Are there specific support systems or resources available in your school to aid students with special needs during this transition?

4. Could you share any successful approaches or initiatives that have been employed in the past to facilitate the inclusion of students with special needs in your school?

5. Are there any plans or initiatives on the horizon for your school to further enhance its inclusivity and support mechanisms for students with special educational needs during transitions? If so, could you provide insights into these plans?

#### **Interview Questions for the teachers:**

1. Can you describe the current procedures and practices in your school for supporting students with special educational needs as they transition from home-based learning to attending school?

2. From your perspective, what are the most significant challenges that students with special educational needs encounter during this transition?

3. How, do you think, families of students with special educational needs experience

transition from homeschooling to mainstream schooling, and what challenges do they face?

4. What kind of teacher training or professional development programs are in your school to prepare educators for inclusive education and supporting students with diverse learning needs?

5. How do parents and caregivers of students with special needs perceive the transition process, and what assistance or information do they need to support their children effectively?

# **Interview Questions for the parents:**

1. Can you share your experiences and feelings about the transition process when your child with special educational needs returned to school after learning at home?

2. How would you describe your communication and collaboration with the teachers and school staff during the transition process?

3. What kinds of information or guidance would have been helpful to you as a parent to prepare your child for returning to school?

4. Were there any specific strategies or approaches that you found particularly effective in helping your child adapt to the school environment?

5. What suggestions do you have for schools to create a more inclusive and welcoming environment for students with special educational needs?

# **Interview Questions for the NGOs:**

1. Can you describe the role that your NGO plays in supporting students with special educational needs in Kazakhstan, particularly during the transition from home-based learning to school?

2. How do you collaborate with schools and educators to enhance the support provided to students with special educational needs during the transition?

3. Are there any successful approaches or strategies that your NGO has implemented or witnessed in the past that have been effective in facilitating the transition of these students?

4. What resources, tools, or technologies does your NGO provide or recommend to improve the learning experiences of students with special educational needs during their return to school?

5. Are there any upcoming projects or initiatives that your NGO is planning to further support the transition of students with special educational needs, and how can schools and other stakeholders get involved or benefit from these efforts?

Thank the participant for the interview. Assure them again about the confidentiality of received information.

# Приложение D. Протокол интервью (на русском)

**Название проекта**: Содействие инклюзивным практикам: стратегии облегчения перехода учащихся с особыми потребностями из домашнего обучения в посещение школы в Казахстане.

## Интервьюируемый(ая):

Дата:

Время:

Место:

**Предварительные процедуры:** представление, цель исследования и защита конфиденциальности; получение разрешения на аудиозапись; подписание формы согласия.

Уважаемый участник,

Благодарим Вас за уделенное время для участия в интервью. Это исследование является частью моей магистерской программы. Следующие вопросы помогут мне узнать больше о Ваших взглядах, лидерстве и практиках, способствующих инклюзивному образованию в вашей школе. Во время интервью могут возникнуть дополнительные вопросы, которые помогут мне более ясно понять ваши ответы. Хочу напомнить Вам, что ваши ответы будут сохранены в тайне. Ваше имя или какие-либо иные идентифицирующие данные не будут использованы.

# Вопросы для директора школы:

1. Можете ли Вы описать текущие практики и политику, существующие для интеграции учащихся с особыми потребностями в общие образовательные школы в Казахстане?

2. Какие основные вызовы сталкиваются учащиеся с особыми потребностями, их семьи и педагоги при переходе из домашнего обучения в школу?

3. В Вашей школе есть специфические системы поддержки или ресурсы, помогающие учащимся с особыми потребностями в этом переходе?

4. Можете ли поделиться успешными методами или инициативами, которые были использованы ранее для облегчения инклюзии учащихся с особыми потребностями в Вашей школе?

5. Есть ли планы или инициативы в Вашей школе, направленные на улучшение инклюзивности и механизмов поддержки для учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями во время переходов? Если да, можете ли Вы поделиться информацией о них?

# Вопросы для учителей:

1. Можете ли Вы описать текущие процедуры и практики в вашей школе для поддержки учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями в процессе

перехода из домашнего обучения в школу?

2. С Вашей точки зрения, какие наиболее существенные вызовы возникают перед учащимися с особыми образовательными потребностями во время этого перехода?

3. Как Вы считаете, как переход из домашнего обучения в школу воспринимают семьи учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями, и с какими вызовами они сталкиваются?

4. Какие программы профессиональной подготовки или развития педагогов есть в Вашей школе для подготовки учителей к инклюзивному образованию и поддержке учащихся с разнообразными образовательными потребностями?

5. Как родители и опекуны учащихся с особыми потребностями воспринимают процесс перехода, и какую помощь или информацию они нуждаются, чтобы эффективно поддерживать своих детей?

## Вопросы для родителей:

1. Можете поделиться Вашими переживаниями и чувствами по поводу процесса перехода, когда ваш ребенок с особыми образовательными потребностями вернулся в школу после обучения дома?

2. Как бы Вы охарактеризовали Ваше общение и сотрудничество с учителями и персоналом школы во время процесса перехода?

3. Какого рода информация или рекомендации могли бы Вам пригодиться в качестве родителя для подготовки Вашего ребенка к возвращению в школу?

4. Есть ли какие-либо конкретные стратегии или подходы, которые Вам показались особенно эффективными в помощи вашему ребенку в адаптации к школьной среде?

5. Какие у Вас есть предложения для школ по созданию более инклюзивной и приветливой среды для учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями?

# Вопросы для НПО:

1. Можете ли Вы описать роль Вашей НПО в поддержке учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями в Казахстане, особенно во время перехода от домашнего обучения в школу?

2. Как Вы сотрудничаете с школами и педагогами для улучшения поддержки, предоставляемой учащимся с особыми образовательными потребностями во время перехода?

3. Есть ли какие-либо успешные подходы или стратегии, которые Ваша НПО реализовала или наблюдала в прошлом, и которые были эффективными в облегчении перехода этих учащихся?

4. Какие ресурсы, инструменты или технологии предоставляет, или рекомендует ваша НПО для улучшения образовательного опыта учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями при их возвращении в школу?

5. Есть ли какие-либо предстоящие проекты или инициативы, которые Ваша НПО планирует реализовать для дальнейшей поддержки перехода учащихся с особыми образовательными потребностями, и как школы и другие заинтересованные стороны могут в них включиться или извлечь пользу из этих усилий?

Поблагодарите участника за интервью. Убедитесь еще раз в конфиденциальности полученной информации.

## **Косымша D. Әңгімелесу хаттамасы (қазақ тілінде)**

**Жобаның тақырыбы:** Инклюзивті тәжірибені насихаттау: Қазақстандағы ерекше қажеттіліктері бар оқушылардың үйден мектепке көшуін жеңілдету стратегиялары.

#### Сұхбат алушы:

Күні:

Уақыты:

## Орны:

**Алдын ала рәсімдер:** таныстыру, зерттеу мақсаты және құпиялылықты қорғау; дыбыс жазуға рұқсат алу; келісім парағына қол қою.

## Құрметті қатысушы,

Осы сұхбатқа қатысуға уақыт бөлгеніңіз үшін рахмет. Бұл зерттеу менің магистрлік бағдарламамның бөлігі болып табылады. Төмендегі сұрақтар сіздің көзқарасыңыз, көшбасшылығыңыз және мектебіңізде инклюзивті білім беруге ықпал ететін тәжірибелеріңіз туралы көбірек білуге көмектеседі. Әңгімелесу барысында жауаптарыңызды нақтырақ түсінуге көмектесетін қосымша сұрақтар туындауы мүмкін. Жауаптарыңыз құпия сақталатынын еске салғым келеді. Сіздің атыңыз немесе басқа идентификациялық ақпарат пайдаланылмайды.

#### Мектеп директорына қойылатын сұрақтар:

- 1. Қазақстандағы ерекше қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларды жалпы білім беретін мектептерге біріктіру бойынша қолданыстағы тәжірибелер мен саясаттарды сипаттай аласыз ба?
- 2. Үйде оқытудан мектепке көшу кезінде ерекше қажеттіліктері бар оқушылар, олардың отбасылары және тәрбиешілері қандай негізгі қиындықтарға тап болады?
- 3. Сіздің мектебіңізде ерекше қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларға осы көшуді жасауға көмектесетін арнайы қолдау жүйелері немесе ресурстары бар ма?
- 4. Ерекше қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларды өз мектебіңізге қосуды жеңілдету үшін бұрын қолданылған табысты әдістермен немесе бастамалармен бөлісе аласыз ба?
- 5. Сіздің мектебіңізде ауысу кезінде ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларды қамту және қолдау тетіктерін жақсарту бойынша жоспарлар немесе бастамалар бар ма? Егер иә болса, олар туралы ақпаратпен бөлісе аласыз ба?

#### Мұғалімдерге арналған сұрақтар:

- 1. Үйде оқытудан мектепке көшу кезінде ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларға қолдау көрсету үшін мектебіңіздегі ағымдағы процедуралар мен тәжірибелерді сипаттай аласыз ба?
- 2. Сіздің ойыңызша, осы көшу кезінде ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар студенттердің алдында тұрған ең маңызды қиындықтар қандай?

P A

- 3. Үйде оқытудан мектепке көшуді ерекше білім беруді қажет ететін оқушылардың отбасылары қалай қабылдайды деп ойлайсыз және олар қандай қиындықтарға тап болады?
- 4. Сіздің мектебіңізде инклюзивті білім беруге және әртүрлі оқу қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларды қолдауға мұғалімдерді дайындау үшін қандай кәсіби даму немесе мұғалімдерді дамыту бағдарламалары бар?
- 5. Ерекше қажеттіліктері бар оқушылардың ата-аналары мен тәрбиешілері көшу процесін қалай қабылдайды және балаларын тиімді қолдау үшін оларға қандай көмек немесе ақпарат қажет?

# Ата-аналарға сұрақтар:

- 1. Арнайы білім беру қажеттіліктері бар балаңыздың үйден оқудан кейін мектепке келу кезіндегі өтпелі кезең туралы тәжірибеңіз бен сезімдеріңізбен бөлісе аласыз ба?
- 2. Өтпелі кезеңдегі мұғалімдермен және мектеп ұжымымен қарым-қатынасыңыз бен ынтымақтастығыңызды қалай сипаттар едіңіз?
- 3. Балаңызды мектепке келуге дайындау үшін ата-ана ретінде қандай ақпарат немесе кеңес қолданар едіңіз?
- 4. Балаңыздың мектеп ортасына бейімделуіне көмектесу үшін ерекше тиімді деп тапқан қандай да бір нақты стратегиялар немесе тәсілдер бар ма?
- 5. Ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушылар үшін неғұрлым инклюзивті және қолайлы орта құру үшін мектептерге қандай ұсыныстарыңыз бар?

# **YE¥ сұрақтары:**

- 1. Қазақстанда, әсіресе үйде оқытудан мектепке көшу кезеңінде ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларды қолдаудағы ҮЕҰ рөлін сипаттай аласыз ба?
- 2. Өтпелі кезеңде ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушыларға көрсетілетін қолдауды жақсарту үшін мектептермен және тәрбиешілермен қалай жұмыс жасайсыз?
- 3. Сіздің үкіметтік емес ұйымыңыз іске асырған немесе байқаған, осы оқушылардың ауысуын жеңілдетуде тиімді болған табысты тәсілдер немесе стратегиялар бар ма?
- 4. Сіздің үкіметтік емес ұйымыңыз ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушылардың мектепке келген кезде білім беру тәжірибесін жақсарту үшін қандай ресурстарды, құралдарды немесе технологияларды ұсынады?
- 5. Сіздің үкіметтік емес ұйымыңыз ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар оқушылардың көшуін одан әрі қолдау үшін жүзеге асыруды жоспарлап отырған алдағы жобалар немесе бастамалар бар ма және мектептер мен басқа да мүдделі тараптар бұл күш-жігерден қалай қатыса алады немесе пайда көре алады? Қатысушыға сұхбаты үшін рахмет. Алынған ақпараттың құпия екеніне тағы бір рет көз жеткізіңіз.