

**Art Therapy and Its Influence on The Lives of Children with SEN:  
Teachers' Perspectives'**

Shynar Aktanova

Graduate School of Education, Nazarbayev University

Code: Inclusive Education

Dr. Janet Helmer

May 7, 2021



NAZARBAYEV  
UNIVERSITY  
Graduate School  
of Education

53 Kabanbay Batyr Ave.  
010000 Astana,  
Republic of Kazakhstan  
October 2020

Dear Shynar Aktanova,

This letter now confirms that your research project entitled:

*'Art therapy and its influence on the lives of children with SEN: teachers' perspectives'*

has been approved by the Graduate School of Education Ethics Committee of Nazarbayev University.

You may proceed with contacting your preferred research site and commencing your participant recruitment strategy.

Yours sincerely

Dr Janet Helmer

On behalf of Zumrad Kataeva  
Chair of the GSE Ethics Committee  
Assistant Professor  
Graduate School of Education  
Nazarbayev University

Block C3, Room 5006  
Office: +7 (7172) 70 9371  
Mobile: +7 777 1929961  
email: [zumrad.kataeva@nu.edu.kz](mailto:zumrad.kataeva@nu.edu.kz)

---

**CITI Training Certificate**

Completion Date 06-Jun-2020  
Expiration Date 06-Jun-2023  
Record ID 36599306

This is to certify that:

**Shynar Aktanova**

Has completed the following CITI Program course:

**Social & Behavioral Research - Basic/Refresher** (Curriculum Group)  
**Social & Behavioral Research - Basic/Refresher** (Course Learner Group)  
**1 - Basic Course** (Stage)

Not valid for renewal of certification through CME. Do not use for TransCelerate mutual recognition (see Completion Report).

Under requirements set by:

**Nazarbayev University**

**CITI**  
Collaborative Institutional Training Initiative

Verify at [www.citiprogram.org/verify/?w6b4c6f22-52fe-4ac1-aa82-184505cebbfe-36599306](http://www.citiprogram.org/verify/?w6b4c6f22-52fe-4ac1-aa82-184505cebbfe-36599306)

## **Acknowledgement**

Throughout this two-year journey I have come a long way, changing and developing my mindset, growing into a better version of self. The completion of this Thesis could not have been possible without support of my dearest professors, colleagues, family and friends. My acknowledgement goes to people who were there for me, accompanying, supporting and motivating me along the way.

First of all, I would like to express my deep and sincere gratitude to dearest Professor Janet Helmer, who has been knowledgeable and wise thesis supervisor. Professor Helmer has always been providing support and valuable guidance throughout accomplishing this dissertation.

Secondly, I would like to acknowledge Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education for creating great study opportunities and inspiring academic atmosphere for students.

Also, I would like to thank my colleagues, groupmates and friends who have provided stimulating discussions and always kept in touch and making sure I succeed in my endeavours.

Finally, I am forever grateful to my family – I am lucky to have two people in my life, whom I can call Mum, and who have raised me with a great love, my Dad, who was a source of a great emotional support, and my little Sis, for her wise counsel and sympathetic ear. Also, I cannot imagine my life without the rest of my family – Granny and Granddad, uncles and aunts, sisters and brothers. I humbly express my appreciation to all who has encouraged and accompanied me in this regard.

Shynar Aktanova

## Abstract

Kazakhstan has recently introduced inclusive practices in the area of school education. Presently, the educational system is finding it quite challenging to implement inclusive schooling in mainstream schools for children with Special Educational Needs and Disabilities. However, the governing institutions, non-governmental organizations, and other stakeholders have taken first steps toward the aim of inclusive education and progress is being made.

Referencing Ainscow (2005), inclusion is an ever-evolving method of figuring out effective ways such as Art to cope with issues of equity and diversity. Art has the ability to play an important role in the transition to a more inclusive school system by assisting individuals with SEN and other diversities in overcoming various obstacles and barriers in their success. Art Therapy, which is derived from art and is a comparatively modern therapeutic method can assist children with a variety of needs. It is also new in within the educational realm. Therefore, the study has been focused on the influence of Art Therapy on the lives of children with Special Educational Needs.

The theoretical framework in this study is based on the Client centered approach and Gestalt Theory which places the child at core of the Art therapy sessions. The participants of this study are Art Therapy teachers working in the Art Therapy centers in two main Kazakhstani cities - Nur-Sultan and Almaty. A convenience sampling approach was justified as the researcher was interested in targeting a specific population – those using Art Therapy as an educational strategy for children with special needs. Data was collection through the use of a semi-structures interview allowed the researched to have an in-depth conversation on the focus of this study with the participants. The interview was conducted online with teachers of the Art Therapy centers due to the current situation with COVID-19 pandemic.

Findings revealed the possible potential of an Art Therapy as a beneficial therapy for children with SEN due its valuable therapeutic effect. Moreover, it enhances children's emotional and mental condition. As a result, better educational and social performance can be achieved. The findings also suggest the cooperative work of Governmental bodies and NGOs for the further successful implementation of Art Therapy within the Kazakhstani educational system.

**Keywords:** *Art therapy, Special Educational Needs, Inclusive Education, Client Centered Social approach, Gestalt approach, healing effect*

## Аннотация

Казахстан недавно внедрил инклюзивные практики в области школьного образования. В настоящее время система образования сталкивается с серьезными трудностями при внедрении инклюзивного обучения в общеобразовательных школах для детей с особыми образовательными потребностями и ограниченными возможностями. Однако руководящие учреждения, неправительственные организации и другие заинтересованные стороны предприняли первые шаги в направлении достижения цели инклюзивного образования, и в настоящее время наблюдается прогресс.

Ссылаясь на Эйнскоу (2005), инклюзия-это постоянно развивающийся метод определения эффективных способов, таких как искусство, для решения проблем равенства и разнообразия. Искусство способно сыграть важную роль в переходе к более инклюзивной школьной системе, помогая людям со Специальными Образовательными Потребностями и другими отклонениями в преодолении различных препятствий и барьеров на пути их успеха. Арт-терапия, которая является производной от искусства и является сравнительно современным терапевтическим методом, может помочь детям с различными потребностями. Это также ново в сфере образования. Поэтому исследование было сосредоточено на влиянии арт-терапии на жизнь детей с особыми образовательными потребностями.

Теоретическая основа этого исследования основана на клиентоориентированном подходе и теории гештальта, которая ставит ребенка в центр сеансов арт-терапии. Участниками данного исследования являются преподаватели арт - терапии, работающие в центрах арт-терапии в двух основных городах Казахстана-Нур-Султане и Алматы. Подход к удобной выборке был оправдан, поскольку исследователь был заинтересован в ориентации на конкретную группу населения – тех, кто использует арт-терапию в качестве образовательной стратегии для детей с особыми потребностями. Сбор данных проводился с помощью полуструктурированного интервью, которое позволило исследователям провести углубленную беседу с участниками о фокусе этого исследования. Интервью было проведено онлайн с преподавателями центров арт-терапии в связи с текущей ситуацией с пандемией COVID-19.

Полученные результаты выявили возможный потенциал арт-терапии в качестве полезной терапии для детей со Специальными Образовательными Потребностями благодаря его ценному терапевтическому эффекту. Кроме того, он улучшает эмоциональное и психическое состояние детей. В результате можно было бы добиться более высоких образовательных и социальных показателей.

Полученные результаты также свидетельствуют о совместной работе государственных органов и НПО для дальнейшего успешного внедрения арт-терапии в систему образования Казахстана.

**Ключевые Слова:** Арт - терапия, Особые Образовательные Потребности, Инклюзивное Образование, Клиентоориентированный Социальный подход, Гештальт-подход, лечебный эффект

## Аннотация

Қазақстан мектеп білім беру саласында инклюзивті тәжірибені енгізді. Қазіргі уақытта білім беру жүйесі ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар және мүмкіндіктері шектеулі балаларға арналған жалпы білім беретін мектептерде инклюзивті оқытуды енгізу кезінде елеулі қиындықтарға тап болуда. Алайда, басқару мекемелері, үкіметтік емес ұйымдар және басқа да мүдделі тараптар инклюзивті білім беру мақсатына жету үшін алғашқы қадамдар жасады және қазіргі уақытта прогресс байқалуда.

Эйнскоу (2005) сілтеме жасай отырып, инклюзия-теңдік пен әртүрлілік мәселелерін шешудің өнер сияқты тиімді тәсілдерін анықтаудың үнемі дамып келе жатқан әдісі. Өнер неғұрлым инклюзивті мектеп жүйесіне көшуде маңызды рөл атқара алады, бұл арнайы білім беру қажеттіліктері бар адамдарға және олардың жетістіктері үшін әртүрлі кедергілер мен кедергілерді жеңуге көмектеседі. Өнердің туындысы болып табылатын және салыстырмалы түрде заманауи терапевтік әдіс болып табылатын арт-терапия әртүрлі қажеттіліктері бар балаларға көмектесе алады. Бұл білім беру саласында да жаңа. Сондықтан зерттеу арт-терапияның ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері бар балалардың өміріне әсері туралы болды.

Бұл зерттеудің теориялық негізі клиентке бағытталған тәсілге және баланы арт-терапия сессияларының орталығына қоятын гестальт теориясына негізделген. Осы зерттеудің қатысушылары Қазақстанның негізгі екі қаласы - Нұр-Сұлтан және Алматы қалаларындағы арт-терапия орталықтарында жұмыс істейтін арт-терапия оқытушылары болып табылады. Ыңғайлы іріктеуге деген көзқарас ақталды, өйткені зерттеуші халықтың белгілі бір тобына – арт-терапияны ерекше қажеттіліктері бар балаларға арналған білім беру стратегиясы ретінде қолданатындарға назар аударуға мүдделі болды. Деректерді жинау жартылай сұхбат арқылы жүргізілді, бұл зерттеушілерге осы зерттеудің бағыты туралы қатысушылармен терең сұхбат жүргізуге мүмкіндік берді. Сұхбат COVID-19 пандемиясының қазіргі жағдайына байланысты арт-терапия орталықтарының оқытушыларымен онлайн режимінде өткізілді. Алынған нәтижелер арт-терапияның пайдалы терапия ретіндегі әлеуетін анықтады арнайы білім беру қажеттіліктері бар балалар үшін оның құнды емдік әсері арқасында. Сонымен қатар, бұл балалардың эмоционалды және психикалық жағдайын жақсартады. Нәтижесінде жоғары білім мен әлеуметтік көрсеткіштерге қол жеткізуге болады. Алынған нәтижелер, сондай-ақ Қазақстанның білім

беру жүйесіне арт-терапияны одан әрі табысты енгізу үшін мемлекеттік органдар мен ҮЕҰ бірлескен жұмысы туралы куәландырады.

**Түйінді сөздер:** Арт-терапия, ерекше білім беру қажеттіліктері, инклюзивті білім беру, клиентке бағдарланған әлеуметтік тәсіл, гештальт тәсілі, емдік әсер

## Table of Contents

List of Tables .....	12
Chapter One: Introduction .....	13
1.1. Statement of the problem.....	13
1.2. Art Therapy .....	13
1.3. Art therapy meaning and impact for the SEN children .....	14
1.4. Purpose of the study .....	16
1.5. Significance of the study .....	16
1.6. Definition of terms .....	17
1.7. Thesis Outline.....	17
Chapter Two: Literature review .....	17
2.1. Introduction .....	17
2.2. What is inclusive education? .....	17
2.3. Medicalization of the term “inclusion” .....	18
2.4. Art therapy in the educational context.....	19
2.5. Characteristics of Art Therapy .....	19
2.6. Historical Roots of Art as a Therapy .....	22
2.7. Art therapy as a stress reducing tool.....	24
2.8. Art as a developmental process .....	25
2.9. The use of Art Therapy field in Kazakhstan .....	26
Chapter Three: Methodology .....	27
3.1. Introduction .....	27
3.2. Research design and rationale .....	27
3.3. Research site.....	28
3.4. Sampling.....	28
3.5. Participants .....	28
3.6. Data collection tools .....	29
3.7. Data collection procedure.....	30
3.8. Data analysis.....	31
3.9. Ethical issues .....	31
3.10. Chapter summary.....	33
Chapter Four: Findings.....	33
4.1. Introduction .....	33
4.2. Interview response analysis.....	33
4.2.1. Theme 1. Personal viewpoint and experience .....	34
4.2.2. Theme 2: Benefits of art therapy .....	36
4.2.3. Theme 3: Challenges in delivering Art Therapy .....	38
4.2.4. Theme 4: Recommendations .....	39
4.3. Other ideas emerging from the data .....	40
4.4. Chapter summary.....	41

	11
Chapter Five: Discussion.....	43
5.1. Introduction .....	43
5.2. Personal viewpoint .....	43
5.3. Benefits of Art Therapy.....	44
5.4. Challenges in delivering Art therapy.....	45
5.5. Recommendations .....	45
Chapter Six: Recommendations and Conclusion .....	46
6.1. Introduction .....	46
6.2. Limitations.....	47
6.3. Recommendations for the future implications .....	48
References .....	49
Appendix A .....	56
Appendix B.....	61

**List of Tables**

Table 1 ..... 29  
Table 2 ..... 34

## Chapter One: Introduction

### 1.1. Statement of the problem

Recently, Kazakhstan has started the implementation of inclusive practices in education field. According to the State Program of Education Development of Kazakhstan 2011-2020, there are numerous of goals that the government has aimed for in order to implement and develop education. This is an official document that sets the direction and clarifies the responsibilities and roles of stakeholders in implementation of inclusivity in education. The implementation of inclusive education in mainstream schools for children with Special Educational Needs and disabilities has a long way to go in our country. Nowadays, in the modern Kazakhstani realities our governmental bodies, NGOs and other stakeholders have made little progress on the goal set for inclusive education. The Special Education branch of our system known as defectology is still trying to block a more inclusive education system by causing numerous of prejudices and stereotypes about people with Special Needs and Disabilities. This negative view towards this group is firmly stuck and solidified in the minds of post-soviet people. Nevertheless, as the legislative framework has been established considering the Law on Social Support, Medical and Pedagogical Correction to Children with Disability, Law on Education, the state Program and the State Program which is aiming to have 70% of schools become inclusive (Makoelle, 2020). As have been stated by Ainscow (2005), inclusion is an evolving process of exploring better ways to address issues of equity and diversity. One way to address this issue is through Art. Art has the potential to become a crucial part of the inclusive process helping people to overcome various challenges and barriers. Derived from Art is Art Therapy, which is a relatively new therapeutic method which can support people with diverse needs is also very new in this context.

### 1.2. Art Therapy

In the past, scientists tried to establish a link between art and psychoanalysis and the ways of influence of art therapy. Edwards (Case & Dalley, 2014), tried to trace the attitude towards art in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. He attempted to find the traces of art in religion, customs and anthropology.

In 1883, Freud discovered that through describing visual images his patients were communicating. To help them to reminisce forgotten memories, he required a “concentration technique” He described the therapeutic session “as though she was reading through a lengthy book of pictures” (Breuer & Freud, 2009). Freud’s theory of personality and development explains in which ways the person can be stuck at a certain level

not fulfilling his/her potential, how the emotional blocks and how distortions happen in human's mind (Rubin, 2001).

In 1930s, the art therapy departments were placed in mental hospitals for long term patients. Long-term hospitalization was the main psychiatric treatment for patients who were diagnosed with schizophrenia, psychosis, paranoia and delusional state of mind. For most of the times, they were neglected and forgotten (Skailles, 1997 as cited in Case & Dalley, 2014).

An educator and therapist, Margaret Naumburg was one of the first scholars who determined art therapy as a separate form of psychotherapy in 1940s (Rubin, 2001). In accordance with Malchiodi (2012), Naumburg interpreted art expression as a way of manifestation of unconscious imagery resonating with predominant psychoanalytic point of view of the early twentieth century. In everything she did Naumburg had been influenced by Freud's works. She asked her patients to draw/illustrate their dreams and talk about them during the sessions of art therapy. As a practitioner and professional, Naumburg were convinced in the idea of uncovering the unconscious (Malchiodi, 2012).

One of the significant therapists Ferris-Dufrene developed the way of dealing with behavioral issues during the art therapy and in the client's other areas, developing the client's ego scope through the use of suspension, self-control and construction channeling (Henley, 1992 as cited in Coleman et al., 1996). The aforementioned scholars and their approaches to the art or psychotherapy illustrated that there is a strong bond in these fields and these two types of therapy are the endeavor of various therapists from different areas to help and support their patients (Coleman et al., 1996).

History of psychiatry as well as history of Art has given a rise to certain models of art therapy practices. Edwards posit that diagnostic attitude towards imagery has its roots in eighteenth century neoclassicism. The description of feelings in art was formalized and allowed the painter and the audience to remain uninvolved. On the contrast, nineteenth century romantics possessed a positive conception and valued the artistic expression of inner feelings and experience which led to the belief of a healing nature of art (Case & Dalley, 2014).

### **1.3. Art therapy meaning and impact for the SEN children**

Typically, children with Special Educational Needs (SEN) are less adapted and accepted by their peers in the mainstream school environment and have less chances to be full-fledged members of society than those without SEN (Woolfolk, 2016). Thus, Art therapy has the potential to become the bridging tool that could help

numerous of children with Special Needs overcoming barriers not only in their emotional state but also in other spheres of life such as making progress in other subjects at school, being more sociable, active and open to the world and their anxiety and stress level getting to zero point due to their constant positive psychological and emotional state. Through Art they can express what they see, feel and experience in a form that would never appear in words and verbal language. So, when children with SEN cannot say it, they can express and communicate through Art. Besides, these issues are not the only issues that individuals with SEN experience throughout life. They also struggle with expressing themselves, they have low self-esteem, often times they are socially isolated and having emotional and mental issues related to challenges they might face with academic performance, communication and feelings of being odd in any context or not fully understanding social norm, expectations and regulations. All of these causes the highest level of stress that they and their families experience (Strnadova, 2006).

Malchiodi (2012) claimed that while art therapy may require skills like learning, obtaining the new information or art techniques, first of all the main emphasis is on the expression and development of the images that come from the inside of one particular person rather than those images that he/she sees in the outside environment.

Therefore, art therapy has become one of the successful forms of treatment and obtaining new skills and maintaining the emotional state for children with SEN and disabilities. Art therapy is gaining popularity and becoming an aiding tool that is helping to discover a student's artistic potential and break any emotional barrier appearing on the way. It helps children to show and express their feelings about the world around in a non-verbal way using only tools and art supplies. In cases when they cannot say a word they can express and communicate through their art. For children with SEN art therapy offers a bridge between a child's inner world and the outside world helping them to express their inner confusion safely accompanied and regulated by an adult.

To add up, one of the main goals of art therapy practitioners/therapists is to develop the imagination of its participants, help them growing on a personal level and teach the participants the ways of expressing their feelings through the use of art tools in a safe environment. Art making, kinesthetic manipulation and art appreciation are stress-diminishing practices that may help children and other individuals with SEN as well as those who has various physical or mental disabilities or those who is living under the high pressure and experiencing stressful conditions in life (Case & Dalley, 2014).

Art therapy includes drawing but also finger painting, doodling, sewing, sculpting, carving and even singing. Categories of students who can benefit from art therapy are:

- The students who are emotionally blocked/withdrawn and have difficulty in articulating and determine feelings;
- The students who have experienced a verbal trauma;
- The students who have SEN and disabilities

#### **1.4. Purpose of the study**

The purpose of this study is to identify the ways in which art therapy impacts and makes positive changes in lives of children with SEN and disabilities. Moreover, it would illustrate the opportunities of the Art therapy as a therapeutic tool in achieving a constantly stable psycho-emotional condition in children with Special Educational Needs and disabilities. Also, the successes and challenges of the Art therapy will be better understood. This research study exploited the narrative approach as it demands the collection of the stories told by the participants with later analysis of them. At this stage in the research the Art therapeutic methods being studied will be generally defined as Art therapy for children with Special Educational Needs (SEN).

Research questions:

- 1 What does the Art mean for children with SEN?
- 2 What are the challenges of Art therapy programs?
- 3 What are the outcomes and benefits of an art therapy for children with SEN
- 4 What are the future implications of the possible development of the Art therapy field in Kazakhstan?

The research questions will be addressed through the use of semi-structured interviews. The research study and give a full view on how the Art therapy impacts the different aspects of lives of children with Special Educational Needs and disabilities.

#### **1.5. Significance of the study**

The study is that the study has investigated the influence of art therapy on children with SEN and disabilities. It would define the influence of art therapy professionals and the ways they help the sessions to be full of insightful material, tools and ways of supporting the emotional needs of children with SEN. It would also contribute to the Governmental program that are aimed to support and develop art therapy and consider it as a serious aide program to help SEN children with their emotional, behavioral and psychological state.

Hence art therapy is becoming more and more popular among children with or without disabilities it may contribute to growing the number of people interested in it. With greater knowledge on the contribution to the emotional health of children, NGO's may pay greater attention and invest in it. As a result, the increased interest in this topic will encourage people to investigate and do further research on this topic. The more people know and are aware about the Art therapy the more investment and development the field of Art therapy will potentially get.

### **1.6. Definition of terms**

Art therapy has proven to be one of the most beneficial types of treatment for individuals to overcome their emotional, social and psychological issues. The Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, a 1990 federal law claimed "ensuring a free and appropriate public education in the least restrictive environment" to be a vital element of inclusive educational policy (Katsiyannis et al., 2001).

### **1.7. Thesis Outline**

The supportive literature will appear following introduction in this study as well as the data, sample, data collection instrument, research ethics and data analysis.

## **Chapter Two: Literature review**

### **2.1. Introduction**

This literature review outlines both the art therapy and psychotherapy and their developmental path and scholars who first introduced it. The previous chapter has briefly introduced the term of inclusive education as well as the Art therapy. In Kazakhstan, as well as in many Post-Soviet Union countries, there is no clear understanding of inclusive practices. The philosophy of inclusive education remains unfamiliar and unclear in Kazakhstani educational context. Reducing school exclusion must become a crucial part of Government's Social and Educational Policy and the local authorities have to make it as their own local and school level targets (OECD, 2018). This chapter will discuss various parts of works that are pertinent to this research.

### **2.2. What is inclusive education?**

In the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, education has been declared as a basic human right. Inclusive education is a declaration of everyone's basic right to access and not being excluded from schooling (United Nations, 1948).

According to Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action (UNESCO, 1994), inclusion is a necessity for the human dignity and full access of equal human rights.

The idea that inclusive education is not officially established a general education or civil rights convention presents a dilemma. It is suggested that this prevents inclusive education from shifting beyond its current focus on disabilities (United Nations, 1948).

One pedagogy that has been gaining interest in recent years is Art Therapy. It is gaining popularity in an inclusive education context not only abroad, but in Kazakhstan as well. It is effective in imparting essential skills for children with and without Special Educational Needs, for the development of their emotional and psychological stability (Greesov, 2004).

However, the Art therapy programs in Kazakhstan are just on the grassroot level. Nevertheless, Art therapy programs offer a useful and necessary approach for providing psychological support to children with a variety of behavioural difficulties or developmental disorders. Many psychotherapists both the past and present agree that it is better to bond with children through play and drawing (Medvedeva et al., 2001).

### **2.3. Medicalization of the term “inclusion”**

Reducing school exclusion and implementing inclusion is vital for the pupils with SEN and society as a whole. Visser et al. (2005) claimed that there is not so much known in regards to the characteristics of children and young people missing from school and education. Therefore, they are at risk of being excluded and falling out of the education system. Moreover, children with Special Educational Needs are the most vulnerable (Visser et al., 2005).

In Kazakhstan, one of the biggest problems in this regard is that people’s perception of inclusive education is viewed through the medical lens (Makoelle, 2020). However, if the right direction is taken by gradually moving away from the medical approach and viewing disability through a social lens then Art therapy has better chances of succeeding as a useful practice in inclusive education pedagogies.

According to recent data, special education is provided in 1098 special classes in secondary schools, 240 special schools, 101 correctional schools, 37 kindergartens and about 10,000 children are educated at home within a special individual learning program (Zholtayeva et al., 2013). Now, there are 56 medical psychological rooms in Kazakhstan, which provide support and help for children with Special Educational Needs and Disabilities. This support includes medical, psychological, pedagogical and social aspects.

## **2.4. Art therapy in the educational context**

According to French and Clein (French & Clein, 2012), a child's inner world joined through artistic expression is connected with the outer world. Despite all the evidence that exists on the Art Therapy efficacy (Kaplan, 2012) there is still confusion and misunderstanding regarding the professional side of the Art therapist. Thus, the concepts of art therapy and art lessons are often interconnected which causes misconception and misunderstanding of the two concepts such as Art therapy and psychotherapy. In order to achieve better understanding there has to be a constructive and an "intercultural" dialogue between school and Art Therapy professionals. If schools and art therapists would exchange knowledge and experiences, their pupils – mutual clients will benefit from it. The schools would provide their physical space, rooms and materials in order to incorporate Art Therapy into the educational system (Wengrower, H., 2001). It is assumed that school plays a crucial role in the child's life after family and friends, so it is suggested that providing the objective of the Art Therapy to a student further enables him to fulfill his potential (Brown & Prout, 1989). When pupils feel positive about themselves, they are able to fully focus on the process of learning and their future aspirations (Isis et.al. 2010).

Moreover, all the above-mentioned characteristics of the way how the Art therapy may turn into challenges in case if there will be no adequate perception of the Art therapy, everything else will be redundant (Ringeisen et al., 2003). Additionally, the effectiveness of Art Therapy was discussed by Gilroy (Gilroy as cited in Coiner & Kim, 2011). He stated that the development process of art facilitates cognitive and emotional maintenance, as well as the development of relationships and the reduction of negative behavior. Another point is provided by Hatch (2011), which consists of the inability of children to concentrate on the multiple tasks during Art Therapy sessions. Particularly, their focus is lost because of continuous received information.

## **2.5. Characteristics of Art Therapy**

As Art therapy has a heritage from both Art and Psychology there are possible benefits for the vulnerable children. Combining, and mixing these forms of therapy enables a wide spectrum of working styles. Art Therapy is a form of psychotherapy using art media as its primary mode of communication. It is quite a young form of therapy, which first began in the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century, rooted in art education evolved the practice of art and developmental psychology. Art therapy is about using diagnostic approaches in exploring a person's image. The main goal of its practitioners is to develop their client's imagination, help them grow on a personal

level and learn how to express their feelings in a proper way through the use of art tools in a safe environment (Case & Dalley, 2014).

According to AATA (American Art Therapy Association), Art Therapy is a profession which uses and blends art media, images, creative art and its processes with the person's responses to the art productions as reflections of an individual's personality, abilities, developmental level, interests and conflicts. The practice of Art Therapy is based on knowledge of human psychological and developmental theories that are implemented into the assessment and further treatment of cognitive, psychological, emotional states and fostering self-awareness, self-esteem, managing and maintaining behavior, social skills, reducing stress and anxiety, aiding in reality and space orientation. Nowadays, more and more curious clinicians, therapists and educators are attracted and interested in Art Therapy (AATA, 2017).

According to Case and Dalley (2014), Art Therapy is a one of the forms of psychotherapy that uses art media as its primary mode of communication. The main and important goal of its practitioners is to develop the imagination and creativity, help individuals grow on a personal level and learn how to express the feelings through the use of various art tools and physical manipulations such as drawing, painting and sculpting.

There is a great variety of Art Therapy methods and approaches. Art Therapy may have a focus on the creative active art-making process such as drawing, painting, sculpting, and dancing or may be based on the passive observation and analysis of Art objects. As for example, in the study of Curl (2008), the participants who were focusing on getting positive feelings during Art therapy sessions experienced greater stress relief rather than those ones who focused only on their negative thoughts and ideas.

Moreover, one of the main goals of Art Therapy practitioners/therapists is to develop the imagination of their participants, help them growing on a personal level and teach the participants the ways of expressing the feelings properly through the use of art tools in a safe environment (Case & Dalley, 2014). Stephanie Bull and Kevin O'Farrell in the book "Art Therapy and Learning Disabilities" (2012) discuss and bring together practicing clinicians who provide an inside view of using contemporary art therapy with SEN and people with disabilities. The central focus of the book is the people who have disabilities and learning difficulties. The case examples are provided with dialogues, snapshots and artworks to ensure that voices of people are presented.

Dewey et al. (1991) believed in the power of art. According to him "If there was an adequate expression of everything in words then the painting, music and dance would not ever exist". As feelings and thoughts are

not necessarily verbal and they are not stored as a verbal language in the brain then art therapy is very useful for individuals to connect and communicate their thoughts, and tell the stories that sometimes cannot be presented through words. To convey the thoughts, memories and stories through art is much easier for many of the individuals with Special Educational Needs.

Edith Kramer's theoretical model concentrated on art as therapy rather than in therapy as Naumburg proposed (Junge & Asawa, 1994, p. 31). Even though Kramer used psychoanalytic theory to create her approach in art therapy, the role of art therapist from that of psychotherapist was separated and there was no certain term for it. In her work, Edith Kramer saw it as a special form of art class and called her clients "students". She also stated that art therapists must have skills like true artists, teachers and therapists. The main goal that art therapy aims for is to give a person comfort, pleasure and satisfaction. There is a caution in the words of Kramer who said that art therapists do not interpret the unconscious meaning directly but should use their knowledge to help the children produce material that is emotionally loaded (Kramer, 2010). Art Therapy that includes creative expression is very useful especially in the situations where writing or talking is not possible or beneficial to healing. An individual may not have an adequate vocabulary to express his thoughts in the word form however, he may use creative expression as a tool (Henderson, 2007; Rogers, 1993).

According to Moon (2008) "all artworks are metaphoric depictions of the people who create them" (p. 3). In order to respond to the clients' artworks, he often created stories and poems about the images, encouraging clients to do the same. Through art people are able to express metaphors, symbolism and feelings with freedom. Visual metaphors foster opportunities to inform, engage and gently support and navigate clients in potentially psychologically safe ways.

The word "Metaphor" came from Greek and means "to carry across". Metaphors help to build a universe of infinite possibility. It can change the perception of events and experiences. To be precise, metaphors link the basic elements of conscious, unconscious, defenses, and self-actualization. For instance, there is a difference between asking the client to explain why he's "being defensive" or ask him to draw "the walls". The act of drawing these walls is much safer and less stressful way to deal with this kind of situations. Thus, visual images and metaphoric expressions presented through pictures have much more effect when it comes to dealing with any kind of anxiety (Gorelick, 1989).

Art therapy is also helpful in the development of relationships due to the fact that we are all humans and by nature we need to have social contacts (Vygotsky, 1987). In his classic work Jerome Frank (1991) described the "basic characteristics" shared by all psychotherapies: (a) a supporting friendship that offers treatment and compassion and mobilizes hope; (b) a special environment that offers refuge from ordinary demands; (c) an optimistic ideology of life and a logical interpretation of the problems; (d) effective procedures that demonstrate the power of therapist, revealed client's emotions and let him show mastery. Possessing these characteristics, therapists could become effective in their therapy sessions.

There is no doubt that we all need interpersonal relationships because it has an effect on all life aspects. Individuals with psychological and emotional issues especially need this due to them being vulnerable and affected by certain circumstances and challenges of dealing with their emotions (Reis et al., 2000). Empathy becomes the best communication tool, sort of a bridge when it comes to building a trustworthy environment. In art therapy the professionals work on creating art works that can be possibly translated into the relationships with others. Worries, doubts, fears, defense and other negative feelings expressed in the artistic language can be transformed into more positive feeling by digesting and accepting them at first which later on will be manifested in ongoing relationships with other people (Reis et al., 2000).

## **2.6. Historical Roots of Art as a Therapy**

Over the years, researchers have explored the connection between art and psychoanalysis. Edwards (Case & Dalley, 2014) draws the parallels between art and psychoanalysis back to their roots in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

According to Freud the therapeutic sessions that he led were connected to his theory of personality and development and there were certain reasons why some people cannot follow their life targets, aims and why they are stuck and blocked from fulfilling their potential (Rubin, 2001).

Carl Jung's studies, works, practices, and analysis are one of the most influential and dominant in the psychology. Jungian analysis has often been portrayed as an extended version of Freud's intra-psychic theories (Huss, 2015). Jung's contribution to an Art therapy is his idea that people who are both "sane" and "insane" create, believe and use symbols and myths and sometimes live by them. In his therapeutic practices, Carl Gustav Jung often used a mandala exercise. This practice is still relevant to some Art Therapy today (Junge, 2010).

A client-centered therapy developed by the American psychologist Carl Rogers is also another important dimension in an Art Therapy. Rogers believed in life right here and right now, hence current emotions and feelings are more important than the past ones. He believed that the close personal approach along with the warm and supportive, genuine and understanding environment are keys for therapeutic change. Self-actualization is a crucial concept in a client-centered therapy, which has a tendency of all human beings to move forward, grow, and fulfill their potential (Rogers, 1951 as cited in Case & Dalley, 2014).

Like the client-centered approach, Gestalt approach is also focusing on the present moment, however, recalling the moments and feelings from the individual's past. Gestalt Theory is about perception and it is about the whole that is more than the sum of its parts. The Gestalt is a German word that means the shape, figure and form and it is originated in the 1920s. It is focused on the higher order cognitive processes related to behaviorism (Yontef & Jacobs, 2008). Gestalt therapy was founded by Fritz (Frederick) Perls in collaboration with Laura Perls and Paul Goodman and began as a revision of psychoanalysis. Having humanistic and experiential approach, Gestalt therapy has become very closely related to the client-centered therapy that of Rogers with more compassionate, supportive and kind therapists. The active personal engagement of both therapist and a client into the process is making its way towards increasing awareness, freedom and self-orientation and direction of the client. It makes it different from the other type of therapy which refers to the beforehand-set goals.

Gestalt therapy focuses and aims for self-acceptance and growth coordinated with what is happening at the current moment (Yontef & Jacobs, 2008).

One of the pioneers of art therapy in the 1940s is Hill, who has made a great influence on an art becoming a healing therapy. Adrian Hill became the father of art therapy and he documented this in 1945 in his book "Art Versus Illness" (Hill, 1948 as cited in Case & Dalley, 2014).

An American psychology educator and therapist, Margaret Naumburg was one of the first scholars who separated and segregated art therapy as a separate form of psychotherapy in 1940s. Along with Edith Kramer Naumburg was the founder of American Art therapy back in 1950s (Junge, 2010) her book called "Studies of the "Free" Expression of Behavior Problem Children as a Means of Diagnosis and Therapy" was published in 1947. In this book Naumburg was describing art as a method of symbolization and communication together with the verbal psychodynamic treatment (Junge, 2010, p. 41).

Although two scholars – Naumburg and Kramer were developing and promoting different theories – psychoanalytic psychotherapy and psychologically informed art education, they both were at the origin of creation American Art therapy. After a while, in 1969, the American Art Therapy Association (AATA) was founded.

The first master program in art therapy in the USA was offered at Hahnemann Hospital and Medical College (Drexel University) in Philadelphia, 1967. Art Therapy was first able to stand as a legitimate practice, combining and consisting of aspects of both art and therapy, in 1970, when the American Art Therapy Association organized its first annual conference (The First AATA Conference Program, 1994).

American Therapist Malchiodi (2012) assumed that whereas art therapy may require skills like learning, obtaining the new information or art techniques, first of all the main emphasis are on the expression and development of the images that come from the inside of one particular person rather than those images that he/she sees in the outside environment.

## **2.7. Art therapy as a stress reducing tool**

There are two main components of creating a piece of art such as art making and kinesthetic manipulation. Art making, kinesthetic manipulation and art appreciation are stress-diminishing practices that may help children and other individuals with SEN as well as those who have various physical or mental disabilities or those who is living under the high pressure and experiencing stressful conditions in life (Abbott et al., 2013).

The artistic focus, in particular may reduce stress levels due to a cathartic release of positive emotion. Also, it has been found out that a task that includes artistic component is more effective in stress reduction rather than a non-artistic task (Curl, 2008). However, evidence for the active coping approach as more stress reducing rather than passive coping approach was not found. Therapeutic use of art has been detected and proven based on creativity, kinesthetic manipulation and artistic focus for reducing stress. Same therapeutic impact of contemplating beauty (Leder et.al, 2004 as cited in Abbott et al., 2013) can be extended. In the study, authors picked aesthetically pleasant pictures and scenes from nature while such things like stress, anxiety or mental disorder relate to imbalanced state. The use of aesthetically appealing pictures proved that art therapy whether it is contemplative or active may play a significantly huge role in taking to anxiety and stress down to the minimum point and help people with SEN and disabilities.

The specific focus of cognition can be a contributing component in short-term stress and strain reduction through making art (Curl, 2008 as cited in Abbott et al., 2013). In the study of Curl (2008) it was found that the participants concentrating on their positive feelings experienced greater stress relief rather than those ones who were focused on their negative thoughts and situations. When they create something new it is called a “creative high” and it diminishes the level of stress straight away (Foster, 1992 as cited in Curl, 2008).

In his book “Art versus illness”, Hill (1948) has claimed the therapeutic effect: *“I became... a diligent and leisurely composer of precise pencil productions, each of which, in the terms of my restricted medium, sought to express my personal reactions to the unreality of my existence”* (Hill, 1945, p.14 as cited in Case & Dalley, 2014). For Hill, art played a meaningful role in his recovery and which helped him to pass the time and convey his complaint about his situation.

In summary, one of the main goals of Art Therapy practitioners/therapists is to develop the imagination of its participants, help them growing on a personal level and teach the participants the ways of expressing the feelings in a proper way through the use of art tools in a safe environment (Case & Dalley, 2014).

The experience of a creative process is a learning experience, according to Rubin (2001). Moreover, Rubin says children can experience an immediate sample of well-being at its finest which implies the feeling of aliveness and peak of positive emotions. Art helps children to release their excessive energy through sublimation and conflict resolution. Also, children can develop independence and autonomy because responsibility was taken both for process and product. Additionally, the child is learning to accept and value his symbolic self, discovering and developing his uniqueness. There is no risk engaging with media as it doesn't talk back. Being proud of an art work, showing, sharing and talking about it to the closest people are the things that make a child happy, bringing joy and pleasure (Rubin, 2001). Contrariwise, the study by Conger and Kanungo (1988) presented the limitation of the artistic activity such as self-portraiture. The author claimed that clients through the process of self-portraiture has an influence on their psychological and emotional state.

## **2.8. Art as a developmental process**

Art also can be considered as a developmental process. Art Therapy incorporates knowledge of the children's cognitive stages to determine the psychological make-up and typical development of children or adults in order to produce an art therapy strategy. It requires attention to the psychosocial developmental state of an individual and helps to recognize cognitive, emotional and behavioral conflicts and concerns, which may

impede progressive learning (Gerber & Lyons, 1980). Rubin (2001) defines the artistic process as a learning experience.

According to Piaget (1969), the kinesthetic (sensory) level matches with sensorimotor level of cognitive development which mainly focuses on the expression through bodily movement as well as tactile sensations experienced in the art making process. In art, kinesthetic and sensory manipulation have a great impact on memory development (Lusebrink, 2004). Therefore, children who spend more time crafting their artistic skills have better chances to enhance their memory and other motoric skills. When children are developing, this is the way they process information, the materials that they physically manipulate help them to form internal images of the things they create (Lusebrink, 2004).

The perceptual / affective level reflects the relationship between the aspects of communication that are perceptual and affective and the influence of various media on that relationship. Neurologically focused, culturally conditioned, and distinct from the perceptions of other people are individual perceptions of reality. It is beneficial if individuals grasp the idea of representational diversity and are responsive to innovative perceptual experiences in order to have satisfying relationships (Hinz & Lusebrink, 2009).

The perceptual axis of this level reflects on the form or structural attributes of expression, such as the determination of limits, the distinction of shapes, and the pursuit of an acceptable representation for inner or outer experience. High structural content media (e.g., wood or mosaic) are more likely to elicit internal order in the individual than dynamic media (e.g., watercolor) where the individual needs to force a structure on the medium. Art Therapy encounters at the perceptual / affective stage should be structured to expand the viewpoints of participants to improve their capacity to see another person's point of view in a different visual expression. In addition, everybody should recognize and have access to knowledge about their emotional condition. Emotions are being used in decision-making, memory processing, and motivating behaviours (Ekman, 2003). Therefore, the blend of emotional, mental and psychological aspects of Art Therapy influences the cognitive processes development in students with SEN that was researched in the aforementioned studies.

## **2.9. The use of Art Therapy field in Kazakhstan**

According to the work by Kassen (2019), the present issues with the representation of Art Therapy lies in the lack of advertising, which means that most of the people have not heard of Art Therapy. Financial issues

appear as one of the most troublesome reason why people do not participate in an Art therapy. In this case, the budgeting for this sector has to be increased to make sure specialists will not have financial burden.

Concluding this chapter, it is evident that there is a potential for the development of the Art therapy in our country but only if some certain actions would be taken.

Art plays a central role in a human existing and place in this world, it became a mechanism of modern human existence itself. The humankind can obviously witness cases where history of art theories and practices and the art therapy itself join together. Furthermore, Art Therapy specialists play a role of contributors in the educational system. Particularly, inclusive education requires art as a dimension to provide additional support for children with SEN. Considering all the examined sources above, it can be stated that there is a lack of current literature in the researched field of study. Therefore, the outdated sources are used throughout the paper.

### **Chapter Three: Methodology**

#### **3.1. Introduction**

The purpose of the qualitative descriptive study is to investigate the influence of art therapy on the lives of children with SEN. The data was gathered by interviewing art therapy teachers. The researcher chose a qualitative research method. Qualitative methods were chosen as the best suited to learn about this topic. The goal being to understand how art therapy may be used with children with SEN. The chapter is organized into the following sections: research design and rationale; research site; participants and sampling procedures; data collection; ethical concerns and limitations.

#### **3.2. Research design and rationale**

The aim of this study is to determine the effect of the Art therapy and its methods on the lives of children with Special Educational Needs (SEN).

This research study employs a qualitative design through the use of interviews in order to determine if there employing art therapy with SEN children has a positive improvement in their lives. A qualitative design is good for the acquisition of an in-depth understanding of a specific topic. Using semi-structured interviews participants were able to reflect on their professional experience in this field; share their thoughts, successes and challenges; and share their beliefs about art therapy as a method to use with SEN children. This research study interviewed those working in art therapy centres allowing the interview to gather the opinions and thoughts on this phenomenon.

### **3.3. Research site**

The research took place in the Art therapy centres in both Nur-Sultan and Almaty. One of the Art therapy centre that is located in Almaty and aimed to help every child to overcome their negative experiences in life, become emotionally stable and healthy and heal their mental wounds. Also, the other one is located in Nur-Sultan and it's an Art therapy centre that is specialized not only in working with children with SEN but also with any child who would like to take Art therapy lessons. Another spot for the research was a psychological centre for children which is also located in Almaty and also aims to help children to overcome lots of psychological and emotional issues. These centers showed insight into how the work offered at these centers could help child with SEN.

### **3.4. Sampling**

The participants of this study were art therapy teachers who work at these centers. The non-probability homogeneous sampling method is used in this research study. In this research study art therapy teachers were a sampling group so they shared a common occupation and worked in the same field which makes homogeneous sampling applicable and useful. This type of sampling is easier to access and also considering the current situation with coronavirus it is the best suitable option for this qualitative research. Although a non-probability sampling has a risk such as sampling bias it is possible to avoid.

The research was conducted in art therapy centers, art schools and Foundations that are involved into teaching and helping children improve stressful situations and anxiety through art therapy (Abbott et al., 2013). In general, as Curl (2008) claimed, the artistic focus can be helpful in reducing levels of stress due to a cathartic release of positive emotion.

### **3.5. Participants**

The participants of the current research were five art therapy specialists who were working in the art therapy centres. As suggested by Creswell (2012), the minimum number of participants is 6 but, in my study, there is 5 art therapy center teachers as I could not reach more participants due to the pandemic (COVID-19) situation in the world.

The non-probability homogeneous sampling method was used in this research study due to the same occupation of the participants. This sampling is easier to access and also considering the current situation with coronavirus it is the best suitable option for this qualitative research that have employed semi-structured

interview (Robinson, 2014). I called the directors of each center to request their permission to do this research. I got a permission from them, and then I accessed the teachers and after that I have sent a recruitment script via email.

The table below represents the study sample in this research.

**Table 1.**

***Study sample***

Experience	13 y. of exp.	10 y. of exp.	5 y. of exp.	10 y. of exp.	Over 30 y. of exp.
Specialization	Art therapy; Sensory Integration	Art therapy and Psychology	Art therapy	Art therapy	Art expert

*Note.* The experience of participants is represented as y. of exp. (year of experience).

**3.6. Data collection tools**

The semi-structured interview was used as an instrument for the study as it will reveal and determine the possible potential of an art therapy. The semi-structured interview was conducted with teachers of the art therapy centers. The interview questions were developed after reviewing a survey from the research study of Kaimal et al. (2019), which is called “Evaluation a long and short-term art therapy interventions in an integrative care setting for military service members with post-traumatic stress and traumatic brain injury” (Kaimal et al., 2019).

So, for my own research study I have adapted this survey and change it to an interview format. Analyzing the data from semi-structured interviews has given me the opportunity to feel the mood, emotions and the participants’ state of mind. Besides, I see it as a brilliant opportunity to get a full picture on how participants perceive the Art therapy, how they feel about the Art therapy sessions in general, what they think about children task performance during the sessions of Art therapy and their perception on how it can be used to benefit children with Special Educational Needs.

The interview questions have been conducted online as well as the consent form which is also has to be completed by participants. It was an in-depth semi-structured interview that allows collecting a wide range of information. I have taken notes during the interview and also asked participants a permission for an audio

record the interview online. It became an additional tool for collecting data as it has ensured an accurate record of the interview.

### **3.7. Data collection procedure**

The interview was conducted during the research as a main data collection procedure. It was a semi-structured interview as it allows to delve deeper into the research topic issues so the interviewee is able to give more in-depth information. The interviewees are the specialists who are working in the art therapy centers. The researcher and participants made an appointment in order to find out the best suitable time for the interview. All the interviews were conducted in an online format via Zoom and Skype due to the Covid-19 situation in the country. It also supports the statement by Creswell (2012), who stated that the environment and surroundings are important for the interviewees as it gives them the feelings of comfort and security so the participants were asked to be in their usual places during the interview so participants felt themselves very well during the interview, they were in a good mood and I felt welcomed to ask the questions.

After acquiring the permission from the NUGSE Ethics Committee to conduct the study the participants were reached via email, Instagram Direct Messages and telephone calls. The consent form was sent via email to the participants to ensure that each of them get the information about the research aims before agreeing on participation in the research. They were also reminded that the participation in interview is voluntary and that they are able to withdraw whenever they wish and skip any uncomfortable question. The letter that was sent via e-mail contained the introduction from the researcher, the reason of contacting participants, the aim of the study, also the consent form that outlined the main features of the study. Also, due to the fact that the interview was conducted online via Zoom and Skype platforms, the researcher also asked for a permission to record the participants' voices on the voice recorder while talking to them in Zoom/Skype. This measure is important as it is made in order not to forget, skip, neglect or misinterpret any kind of information given by participants Each interview lasted for 35 minutes up to 50 minutes which made it sufficient for a participant to answer all the research questions.

As Cohen et al. (2007) suggested, the motivation for the interview makes people give the answers for the interview in a proper and preferable way. Specifically, for the participants in this research study was the fact that they will be able to help to raise awareness on such field as an Art therapy in Inclusive Education and help the researchers to reveal this unpopular topic.

Prior to the start of the interview, the researched outlined the purpose and procedures of the study again and then again provided consent form to be signed. (Appendix B)

### **3.8. Data analysis**

As soon as the information has been collected data analysis has started. Data analysis is not considered as a technical exercise as it does in quantitative research but it is an intuitive, dynamic and creative process. It also includes an inductive thinking, reasoning and theory construction. (Wong, 2008)

Hence, this research study is using qualitative methods and approaches it led to the hypothesis-generating research which means that the hypothesis was generated not tested. The Grounded theory was used in this research study as it uses theoretical coding to develop hypothesis after data is collected. It is using questioning rather than measuring a pre-conceived hypothesis.

General concepts and categories in participating groups are the concerns because it has emphasized on exploring social, individual, personal and unique experiences of the participants. The findings in this qualitative research study are paramount representing true and full picture of constructs under investigation (Creswell, 2003).

According to Cohen et al. (2007), data analysis in qualitative research is considered as time-consuming. The interview extracts from audio was used as a main source of data. Additionally, it has a lot of details that can be included into the analysis such as mood of participants, their facial expressions, voice and body language in general that I took into account when I was talking to them. The transcribed text has been checked for its accuracy, and there were some minor mistakes spotted that have been corrected. The data analysis has been organized by individuals and assigned numbers to protect their confidentiality.

Qualitative data analysis has its own challenges and peculiarities. When it comes to the data it has to be reduced in order to be reported as well as the fact that it must be well balanced between a need to be concise and maintain the richness and evidentiary of the data.

### **3.9. Ethical issues**

In order to start with the research data collection, the researcher obtained a Collaborative Institutional Training Institute (CITI training). Additionally, before starting the research ethical approval has to be completed and approved by ethical committee.

As the next step of the data collection, my priority was to find research participants for the interview. I used different ways to reach out the participants – I have found their profiles on Instagram, texted messages and emailed them. Luckily for me as for the researcher, out of ten potential participants five replied positively, agreeing on the interview date and time.

After this, prior to the start of the data collection participants were notified about the voluntary participation in the research interview. In respect with the principles described by Cohen et al. (2018) the researcher has to inform the participants about the confidential and voluntary nature of the research which means every participant has a right to stop the interview and withdraw from it at any time. Moreover, in accordance with the principles of confidentiality no participant was asked to write the name or address of the art therapy center in order not to cause any potential harm for a participant.

Before getting to the interview of the research topic, the “why” questions were asked for example, “why the research is going to be conducted”, “why this topic has been chosen by researcher” and “why the answers are so crucially important. Participants were also informed that their replies will only use for academic purposes.

All the files are being kept on the researcher’s laptop in order to protect participants’ confidentiality. In addition, to protect the data from being lost in case if laptop is lost or broken, all the data is kept in the separate folder in the Google cloud. The computer and the Google cloud, e-mails and any personal accounts of the researcher are kept in the strict confidentiality protected with a strong password. The interviewees were assigned number pseudonyms (P1 to P5) in order not to reveal personal information of the people and places they mentioned in accordance with the ethical requirements and confidentiality.

Limitations of this study is that only a small number of art-therapy centers exist in both Nur-Sultan and Almaty. There’s also the likelihood that not every teacher would be open enough to share the progress, hardships and the whole learning process of the children who study in the center. Besides, there are some potential risks, unforeseeable situations or circumstances that may occur during the research such as the inability of the participant to take part in the interview, broken or poor Internet connection. However, as the interviews went by, the issues that were met on the way have been successfully solved. For instance, out of ten participants only three of them replied, whereas initially the aim was five to six participants. After a while, the researches have reached out two more participants, luckily, they were available for the interview.

### 3.10. Chapter summary

This chapter has described how this research has been conducted. Some things such as the limitations of the study or the number of the interviewees are manageable yet so hard to predict in the current COVID-19 situation. It was challenging to find participants and collect the data.

Considering these unprecedented and unforeseeable circumstances researchers have to be resilient, flexible and resourceful in order to progress in their researches, move forwards and fulfill all the points that stated earlier. This chapter described the research design, sampling procedures, participants, ethics and limitations.

The findings for the study will be presented in the following chapter.

## Chapter Four: Findings

### 4.1. Introduction

This chapter presents the findings of the interviews based on the data analysis. The main themes that emerged from the analysis were the benefits and drawbacks of Art Therapy, attitudes towards Art Therapy in two Kazakhstani cities and the future of the Art Therapy in Kazakhstan.

The following research questions guided the study:

- 1 What does the Art mean for the children with SEN?
- 2 What are the challenges of the Art Therapy programs?
- 3 What are the benefits of an Art Therapy for the children with SEN?
- 4 What are the future implications of the possible development of the Art Therapy field in Kazakhstan?

### 4.2. Interview response analysis

Four major Theme Titles, each containing four themes, were established after the procedure of coding interview transcripts. (Table 2)

The analysis was guided with by using Saldana's "Coding Manual for Qualitative researchers" (2013), Creswell's "Research Design" (2003) and Booth & Ainscow's "Index for Inclusion" (2002). The "Personal viewpoint and experience" theme refers to the general view of the participants on the topic of Art therapy and emerges from the data, giving the reasons why they think Art therapy is applicable for children with Special Educational Needs. The "Benefits of Art Therapy" theme discusses participants' views on the Art therapy and its influence on the children with SEN. The "Challenges in delivering Art Therapy" theme provides the

information on the drawbacks in the field of the Art therapy and in inclusion in Kazakhstan in general. The “Experience and Personal Support” theme discussed the working experience of the participants, how they support those children in their Art therapy journey. Lastly, in the “Recommendations” theme participants discuss their visions on the possible development of the Art therapy, why it is still not that successful and recognizable.

These six major categories were used to rationalize a big variety of the codes developed after the analysis of the data.

The results of the analysis are listed in detail in Table 2, which summarizes the results of the analysis of the data according to categories and themes.

**Table 2.**

*Themes*

Research Themes
Personal viewpoint
Benefits of Art Therapy
Challenges in delivering Art Therapy
Recommendations

**4.2.1. Theme 1. Personal viewpoint and experience**

All of the participants in this research are highly experienced professionals with the working experience from 5 years up to over 30 years. While all are working in different places, each had experience of working with children with Special Needs. Most of them had worked with or were working with children with Pathological Demand Avoidance (PDA), Autism Spectrum Disorder (ASD), Peripheral Arterial Disease (PAD), children with cerebral palsy, deaf children and children with hearing impairment, Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), mental retardation, speech development, psychological and psychomotor development:

*I work in several places, there is a Center for Sensory Integration. There are children with Pathological Demand Avoidance (PDA), Autism Spectrum Disorder (ASD), and Peripheral Arterial Disease (PAD), children with cerebral palsy, etc. Art therapy works everywhere and with everyone. (P1)*

*According to another interviewee (P2): I have been working in Art therapy since 2014 with children who have neurological diseases, Autism Spectrum Disorder (ASD), Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), mental retardation, speech development, psychological and psychomotor development.” (P2)*

As the data has represented, the participants had an individual approaches to each child, adjusting to the current mood and situation, gradually building up the trajectory of the lesson. The necessity of “carefully studying their habits, strengths and weaknesses” (according to P3) became a crucial part of their therapy sessions:

*I just think that talented teachers always use this therapy and various methods related to art therapy. I think you just need to give teachers a little more opportunity to study this method, new skills, new knowledge that now exist on a global level, and enable teachers to use when he considers it necessary (P3).*

According to the participants’ responses, Art Therapy has influenced children in many ways. Art as the therapy itself should not be seen as having only positive or negative side. Participant 4 (P4), added:

*Art cannot be negative or positive, because it expresses certain thoughts, messages, ideas, and this is about life, all situations are different. If, for example, "The Death of Pompeii" will carry the meaning of purification, an opportunity to survive catharsis and come to something positive, while the other will drive you into a suicidal mood, therefore it cannot be said unequivocally.*

Having their stories told and experiences shared, the participants most commonly spoke about their involvement in art therapy, which represents the capacity of it. Thus, it was explained by participant 1 (P1):

*...Art therapy can be used apart from other types of therapy and still give a positive effect on the individual’s mood, progress and development overall, for everyone.”*

The first research question (RQ1) in this study sought to determine the importance of the Art therapy for children with Special needs. Thus, participant 2 (P2) has mentioned that whenever the child comes to the Art therapy center, all the bad thoughts, bad mood, and negative emotions improve. Thereby, it can be assumed that the Art therapy works as a stress-reducing, stress-relieving tool.

Also, Participant 3 (P3) added that the Art Therapy could be useful regardless of the diagnosis – everything depends on the personality of the child. Having lots of advantages, Art therapy can be adapted for any child, teenager or even an adult with special needs.

Participants agreed on that the Art therapy sessions have to be used together with other techniques and types of therapies, such as, for example, psychotherapy to better achieve highest academic potential and social performance of the child. Moreover, it has been found out that the Art Therapy works best especially with those who had severe Autism Spectrum Disorder and depressive conditions through portraying the emotions with a further elaboration. However, although most of the participants claimed that Art therapy works with everyone, Participant 4 (P4) had a contradictory opinion:

*...We cannot say what diagnoses art therapy copes with, everything is individual. Art - as a phenomenon that reflects life, reflects thinking, reflects the movement forward, but again, not always, not all art. This is useful for everyone, and for a person with and without special needs, so I would not distinguish it according to symptoms and diagnoses. In general, art therapy sessions should not be displayed somewhere in a separate form, this is a technique that must also be used along with other techniques and types of therapy as the therapist is not able to interpret the works only by himself."*

It is assumed that one of the limitations of art therapy is that the practitioner is more susceptible of misinterpretation regarding unbiased understanding of context.

Talking about limitations of Art Therapy, Participant 5 (P5) mentioned about using gadgets during Art Therapy sessions:

*...I believe that children could be fine during Art Therapy session without therapist's guidance, with the help of step-by-step instructions in gadgets. However, we must take into account the fact that children, using gadgets, degrade and their focus could be switched. Thus, they get a lot of stress."*

This claim reveals the necessity of the therapist to guide, support and help during the sessions, showing the direction and building up the trajectory of the session. Usage of technologies might raise the levels of stress and loss of focus.

To sum up, the data on the personal beliefs of the benefits the Art Therapy reveal that the participants agreed on the fact that Art therapy has an influence on children with SEN. Research participants acknowledge the universality of the Art Therapy but with some peculiarities. At the same time, they admit that Art Therapy has some limitations and peculiarities which can affect children.

#### **4.2.2. Theme 2: Benefits of art therapy**

As for the benefits that children had during their Art therapy sessions research participants were delighted to share the results about the “human-nature interpreter” aspect of Art therapy which means that with the help of the Art therapy it is easier to understand the hidden aspects of human nature such as emotions, both negative and positive, fears, traumas, troubles, and worries. One of the participants (P1) suggested that the creative process is a rewarding process as the therapists see the progress every child makes and it is memorable.

*... As a method, art therapy can be used when, in the process of creativity, a person himself comes across some thoughts, experiences, and can express them, manifest them in the form of creativity (P1.)*

Participants expressed they had witnessed the impact on the progress made by children with SEN. Thus, Participant 1 claimed:

*When I work with nonverbal children. When, for example, I start working with a child with ASD (autism), I can show by example, take a brush pencil in my hands and start drawing, and the child usually follows and copies my actions. Thus, he is involved and begins to work.*

As the data emerged from the findings in this study showed, the Art Therapy has contributed so that the child no longer had a severe illness called enuresis (*an inability to control urination*). Art Therapy played a pivotal role in his recovery. The specialist (Participant 1) monitored the emotional state of the child, who was very shy at first. After he was introduced to the world of Art, the situation with his emotional state as well as with his health condition started to improve.

Emotional well-being is as another aspect of the Art Therapy. From the participants’ words we can see that all of them noticed mood and emotional change in children with SEN during Art Therapy sessions.

Additionally, Participant 5 (P5) mentioned the impact of the Art therapy sessions on deaf children.

*... When I worked as a volunteer in the Soviet period, there was a specialized school for deaf children. There was one child who did not want to start working in any way, I started sculpting, cutting out of paper, making origami. Then the child gradually began to open up, following my example. Through art therapy, I helped a child even learn the multiplication table. This is the great power of art. Subsequently, I opened a class, and almost the entire school came, and everyone drew, sculpted.*

Participants also shared that Art Therapy produces a beneficial effect on the overall development of the child. According to participant 5 (P5):

*When, for example, a child sculpts or draws, it has a very positive effect on the brain and intellect. Art therapy teaches memorization, trains memory, develops and strengthens the mind. ...There are a lot of useful things in art therapy: the development of fine motor skills, the development of intelligence in general.*

Participant (P5) has also mentioned stress relief effect of the Art therapy sessions:

*During the session children describe their emotions and feelings. Based on it, I make conclusions what is bothering a person, what are his fears at the moment and give tasks to do. In the process of creation, they discover the hidden sides of their personalities. (P5)*

In general, the benefits dimension revealed some useful aspects and advantages of Art Therapy, such as understanding and interpreting emotions through the prism of Art Therapy, stress relief effect and positive effect on the child's development.

#### **4.2.3. Theme 3: Challenges in delivering Art Therapy**

When questioned about the challenges of delivering Art Therapy a common response was about the importance of using Art Therapy in a therapeutic way by trained professionals due to its ineffectiveness when used without a professional knowledge, guidance and assistance:

*When art therapy comes to the masses, it ceases to be so effective. And indeed, it is. When I was studying, there were very few mandalas, for example (note: colouring in the form of a circle with patterns), but now you can buy this at any grocery store that has stationery. Unskilled use of the art therapy. ...It is used by the masses for pleasure but needs an art therapist to be used for healing / health benefits. (P1)*

Another aspect mentioned in the Challenges theme was the lack of equipment and support from the government: *“School rooms are not designed for art therapy. There are no space, resources, equipment, specialists.” (P1)*

Participant 2 (P2) supported the idea of Participant 1 (P1) stating:

*Budgeting all art therapy centers in the country because without its' support, we will not be able to build the foundation for its future. ...I believe that not only school psychologists have to do the art therapy sessions but also an art therapy specialist who has been trained to lead art therapy sessions with children who have Special Needs (P2.)*

Moreover, it has also been mentioned about the workload of the school psychologists who could be actually doing Art therapy instead of different unhelpful and useless work. ...*School psychologists that could do the art therapy sessions, are "loaded" with a lot of paperwork, and often they do not fulfil the duties that they should perform (P3).*

As it has been emerged from the claims of participants, they differ in their opinions – some think that Art therapists have to be professionally trained, the others claim that the Art Therapy sessions could be led by school psychologists.

Another challenge is that Art Therapy happens in a non-inclusive environment. According to Participant 3 (P3) words, *“the disadvantage and main challenge of an Art therapy is when art therapy is conducted in a non-inclusive environment.”*

Since inclusive education in Kazakhstan is still on its early development, it is assumed that Art therapy will continue exist in a non-inclusive environment until the situation improves.

It was also shared that the world of Art therapy is quite large, and it is not only about drawing although there continues to be a lot of misconceptions, prejudices and wrong opinions about the Art Therapy.

Participant 5 (P5) shared: *“.... Basically, the perception of people on art therapy is that art therapists are people who have the wrong psyche, or they are very strange. I tried to prove the opposite through my work. Many refer to great artists as if they led the wrong way of life. The misconception is that art therapists will not teach anything useful.”*

In summary, the participants would like to see the Kazakhstani Government as the main supporter for the Art Therapy as it is still a lot of obstacles and issues that is hard to overcome all alone and not much is known about it or its possible benefits by the general public.

#### **4.2.4. Theme 4: Recommendations**

Based on the participants' answers, they recommend Art Therapy to their closest ones (family, relatives and friends) to take Art Therapy sessions. The more people know about Art Therapy the more awareness it can raise. Participants have mentioned that if there is a chance to further promote Art Therapy, they would become part of it and would go to the centres personally and help other specialists.

The data highlighted that the participants share same belief that if children with SEN and without it, and in general, all people have the Art therapy in their lives it would be very beneficial and useful for them.

One of the participants (P4) would like to develop their project “Jewellery Girls” that specializes on girls with psychological traumas as there is not enough of such kind of projects. The participant would gladly recommend this Art Therapy circle to anyone who would like to have a stress relief and emotional stability in their lives.

*Girls who have experienced violence gather, and creating some kind of jewellery, they, on the one hand, realize their ability to create something, and on the other hand, in the process of creation, discussing these problems, remove part of the burden of problems, they speak. Therefore, once again, art therapy, as a method among other methods, is great, you just need to use it on time as a necessary ingredient. (P4)*

Professional learning and qualifications are necessary and all the participants share this opinion.

However, the participants differ in other ideas— some think that to run Art therapy sessions a person needs to have a special qualification or degree. In simple words, specialization in Art Therapy is needed. Others believe that school psychologists can lead and manage Art Therapy sessions. Nevertheless, they all agreed that Art Therapy teachers have to possess many techniques and tools in order to understand children’s needs and then build up a therapeutic session based on this knowledge, and apart from that, will improve their qualifications.

Governmental support and proper budgeting were another concerning aspect of the Art Therapy development because there is a lack of it. All of the five participants have mentioned this dimension in their interview answers. “...Additional art therapy rooms should be created with the support of Government... There is not enough equipment, facilities, shortage of specialists.” (P5)

Another participant has added to this: “The Government has to give a helpful hand to all of the correctional psychological and pedagogical room, budgeting all the art therapy centers in the country because without its’ support we will not be able to build it concretely for the future.” (P2)

Discussing all recommendations in this category, it is clear to see that Art Therapy needs constant and continuing support from the Government as this is a huge field and it will not be able to carry on without a proper budgeting. Awareness on the Art Therapy needs to be raised as a little amount of people know and heard about it. There are lots of misconceptions appearing on the way about it.

### **4.3. Other ideas emerging from the data**

One of the participants has mentioned the usage of innovations/gadgets actively during the sessions such as Tik Tok (service for creating and viewing short videos). The participant has created videos on different topics for children as well as for their parents.

*When I took advanced training courses, "Tik Tok" (note. Service for creating and viewing short videos) was not yet available, which can be used in art therapy. There is art therapy, there is still such therapy when we create. This includes a photo collage and why not make video collages on the Tik Tok platform?" (P1)*

Thus, the participant highlighted the importance of using new technology in the XXI century. It has been also mentioned that if not us, who will keep up with the times: *"If not us, who will give our modern children what they understand most?" (P1).*

However, in the answer of same participant (P1) the following idea about the *...The child will not say: "Hmm, okay, I have autism, what is there useful in this application?" The independent usage of technologies by a child with SEN is not possible at the moment due to the risk of emotional breakdown and misinterpretation of the information that a child has gotten. Therapist is also needed to provide help during a session."*

Considering this, technologies can be applied carefully because some children who have for example, Autism Spectrum Disorder, would be bothered and disturbed by gadgets. Technologies can be applied and integrated during the sessions, but with awareness of children's current emotional state.

According to some of the participants opinion, an Artificial Intelligence cannot substitute human because only working in collaboration, progress can be reached. They have also added that there is no healthy existence without a human contact and socialization.

*...There is no live communication, socialization. For a child, and in general, for any individual, it is very important to be in society, to develop in a team. If, for example, children see each other's work, they begin to follow a positive example (P5).*

Overall, the ideas that specialists shared during the interviews show that they set targets for each individual during their sessions.

#### **4.4. Chapter summary**

The key findings of the study were summarized in this chapter, presented as a collection of categories, themes, and quotations that discuss the research subject and research questions. To visually show the four categories, which are 'Attitudes', 'Challenges', 'Advantages' and 'Suggestions' and themes within each group, a table of codes was created.

The insights of the study participants on Art Therapy and how it impacts the lives of children with SEN have shown a number of ways in which professionals can create opportunities for the advancement of Art Therapy.

The data emerged in “benefits” dimension represented the vision of every participant on how Art therapy contributed to the overall development of the children. The findings in “Challenges” dimension revealed multiple issues that exist within the Art Therapy field. The main one is the lack of Governmental support in terms of proper budgeting for it. This major issue causes other problems and limitations which affect the beneficial sides of the Art therapy.

As this paper discusses the influence of Art Therapy on the lives of children with Special Educational Needs it does so through the prism of Client Centered Social approach and theory of Gestalt. Considering this fact, the theoretical framework had been justified to be used in every session of the specialists. Therefore, Rogers’ Client Centered Social approach and Gestalt approach share common roots and philosophy and both rely on the human potential and possible human growth, and believe that this is a result of the warmth and authenticity (congruency) in relationships of a therapist and a client.

Art Therapists shared their view on the development of Art Therapy in our country, especially at school level and with those children identified as having special educational needs. This claim is connected to the research question 4 (RQ4), where participants shared their opinion on the future of the Art Therapy in our Kazakhstan. Nevertheless, due to the misinterpretation of the Art works of children by therapists, the effect on children’s emotional and mental state is controversial. Some participants claimed that through Art therapy is beneficial as it provides emotional involvement which in turn, contributes their mental state. The others stated that Art therapy and the Art in general could not be seen from one angle only due to the misinterpretation and misunderstanding from the therapist side. As all human beings, therapists also have emotions, and in some ways, they can be biased, too.

Whereas Art Therapy remains being off the school curricula, the data showed no evidence in secondary schools as all participants work in Art Therapy Centers. Besides, the responses revealed the mixed nature of Art Therapy which include not only Art, but also psychology, defectology and other kinds of therapies. Considering this, it can be assumed that if Art lessons in schools and Art Therapy change their trajectory and become more inclusive, children with SEN will be not be excluded but benefit from it. In this case, the inclusion of Art Therapy contributes to schools, and more specifically, inclusive education and children with SEN.

The findings presented in this chapter are going to be discussed further in the Discussion chapter.

## **Chapter Five: Discussion**

### **5.1. Introduction**

This chapter represents a deeper analysis and a comprehensive discussion of the findings described in the previous chapter. The previous chapter has revealed the findings and this chapter explores the influence of an Art therapy on the lives of children with Special Educational Needs. The answers to the research questions have been given in the Findings chapter. Theoretical framework positioned in this study reflected and were connected with the studies of Carl Rogers' Client Centered Approach and theory of Gestalt. Rogers developed his theory based on his work with emotionally, psychologically troubled, traumatized individuals. "What am I" and "what can I do" are ideas that have to be valued in a person. Since Gestalt therapy postulates visual perception, it can be applied to the art therapy.

As the data has been collected from the interviews for the current study, it is evident that the Art therapy influences the lives of children with SEN in many ways. The unifying characteristic for all of the participants is their contribution to the Inclusive education in general as they work with children who have SEN. Greesov (2004) discussed the effectiveness of Art Therapy on children's emotional and psychological state through transferring necessary skills such as social adaptiveness, creative and critical thinking. In correspondence of the author's concept, participants stated that their sessions of Art Therapy provided their children with the above-mentioned skills.

The following discussion is based on four major themes that have been emerged in Findings chapter and connected to the researches discussed in the Literature review. The themes are Personal viewpoint, Benefits of Art Therapy, Challenges in delivering Art Therapy and Recommendations.

### **5.2. Personal viewpoint**

Collecting the evidence on participants' experience and personal viewpoint on the Art Therapy revealed the influence of Art Therapy on the lives of children with SEN and has been supported in the literature review. Participants agreed on that during their professional practice the Art Therapy changed the lives of children with SEN. For instance, one of the participants mentioned the influence of the Art therapy on the child's mood and emotional state during the sessions, pointing out that the child's mood changes from being depressive to positive as soon as coming for a lesson. This statement was largely described by Kramer (Junge, 2010), claiming that the main aim of Art is to give a psychological and emotional comfort.

Nevertheless, some participants mentioned the limitations of art therapy such as bias and misinterpretation of children's Art works. For the therapist, it is important not to dive into interpretation of a piece of Art work, since it may preclude or even deprive the client of the enjoyment of learning and discovering for themselves (Case & Dalley, 2014, p.65).

Another study by Conger and Kanungo (1988) claimed that therapeutic effect of some Artistic activities such as self-portraiture can appear as contraindicated if the clients have tendencies to focus on their faults and limitations, which also have been found during the research.

### **5.3. Benefits of Art Therapy**

One of the highlighting dimensions in the research is benefits. The findings have been compared to the literature and benefits of the Art Therapy found its evidence.

In his book, "Art versus illness" (Hill, 1948 as cited in Case & Dalley, 2014), Hill stated that the Art has contributed to the healing process. Thus, while recovering from tuberculosis, Hill overcame his boredom through the "*simple act of drawing*" (Hill, 1945, p.14 as cited in Case & Dalley, 2014). Same therapeutic effect was mentioned by one of the participants who had a student with a severe illness and Art Therapy sessions helped him to shift his focus on the artistic activity. It turned out that the visual images represented in pictures have much more effect when it comes to dealing with any kind of anxiety (Gorelick, 1989).

Another benefit of the Art Therapy, as has been found out during the research, a stress reducing aspect of it. In consonance with Case and Dalley (2014), the first priority of any Art therapy specialist is to develop clients' imagination, creativity and personal growth by providing them with artistic tools. This claim was found true during the research Findings analysis.

Additionally, some of the participants highlighted the efficacy of Art Therapy when working with children with Autism Spectrum Disorder. The study by Gilroy (Gilroy as cited in Coiner & Kim, 2011) supported participants' claims.

#### **5.4. Challenges in delivering Art therapy**

Despite many advantages of the Art Therapy, there are also some imitations and unique characteristics of the Art therapy that can reduce the effectiveness and hinder the work of the Art therapists.

According to the findings, there is no clear picture of using an Art Therapy in educational context widely. Mostly, the work is concentrated in the centers founded by NGOs, specialists, artists and psychotherapists, which has been reflected in the data findings.

Except of the above-mentioned, there is a lack of Governmental support, which causes multiple issues in delivering Art Therapy. Consequently, Art Therapy field don't get enough budgeting which could be used for the room equipment, special tools for therapy sessions, spacious rooms and many other useful things.

There were several cases described by participants when they witnessed a negative change in the mood of their students. While specialists applied technologies during the sessions, some of the children experienced immediate emotional change. It aligns with the statement by Hatch (2011) about stress levels in children who use gadgets. Thus, usage of technologies can lessen the child's ability to multi-task during the sessions. Due to the constantly incoming information children are unable to focus (Hatch, 2011, p. 19-20).

Nevertheless, there are prejudice, confusion and misunderstanding regarding Art Therapy field that is caused by the educational system structure, people's perception of Inclusive Education, in general. The data showed that participants were getting comments on their work as Art Therapy specialists, which were not complimenting. The comments were about useless nature of Art Therapy, that it should be taught in special organizations along with psychiatric sessions. The misconceptions and prejudices lay deep in the minds of Post-Soviet people. The perception of Inclusive Education is still too medicalized (Makoelle, 2020).

#### **5.5. Recommendations**

It would not be accurate to claim that Art Therapy exists only due to NGOs and specialists who want to deliver knowledge to children with SEN, as some of the participants mentioned they worked within the Governmental organizations. However, local authorities and Governmental Organizations need to pay close attention to the Inclusive Education field, in general.

There is one of the challenging things in Inclusive Education that is making the classroom available for all children with SEN. This happens due to the aforementioned lack of governmental support, which causes lack of proper budgeting, that in turn, leads to lack of equipment and professionals in the Art therapy field.

Regarding Art Therapy sessions, all children need an individual approach, which is sometimes challenging to implement as it is a human factor. Specialists need to take into account that no matter which art therapy model is being used, personal skills and abilities may take place as patients or clients engage with art materials and think about themselves through the practice of using these materials in a purposeful way.

As one of the research participants explained, inclusive education reform cannot happen without catalyst. As the data revealed, Art therapists play the role of catalysts of the process in change educational field, especially Inclusive Education. Considering this, specialists inform about the Art therapy field, raising awareness on Inclusive Education and Art Therapy in particular, through their work with students, convincing those who surround them that it is beneficial for all. In order, parents, as representatives of civil society members, could promote inclusive cultures among wider communities.

## **Chapter Six: Recommendations and Conclusion**

### **6.1. Introduction**

The previous chapter discusses the findings related to the theoretical framework proposed by Carl Rogers (Rogers,1980) and theory of Gestalt, whereas this chapter gives a comprehensive summary of the present study. The main goal of the current study was to determine how the Art therapy influences and changes the lives of children with Special Educational Needs. The Art therapy practitioners used Gestalt approach and Roger's Client Centred approach in their professional practices.

The research questions posed in this study are:

- 1 What does the Art mean for children with SEN?
- 2 What are the challenges of Art therapy programs?
- 3 What are the outcomes and benefits of an art therapy for children with SEN?
- 4 What are the future implications of the possible development of the art therapy field in Kazakhstan?

The conclusions on the findings, the limitations of the study, as well as recommendations for the further study that have been explored in this study are presented in this chapter.

This study focused on the influence of the Art therapy on the lives of children with Special Needs. The study has shown that it has also focused on the process of creating artistic things by children, as well as how professionals can create opportunities for them, if they have proper budgeting and support. The findings reflect that Art therapy centers are involved into the process of creating inclusive environment, especially for those who needs it the most. The children, in turn, do the best they can and become more confident, emotionally stable and open. One of the participants has even mentioned the positive impact on the child who had some severe health issues, and the Art therapy had a healing effect.

Another chapter, the literature review has stated that the combination of Art and Psychology can develop the client's imagination as well as help to learn how to express their feelings in a proper way through the use of art tools in a safe environment (Case & Dalley, 2014), and the research findings demonstrated that the Art therapy practitioners also make it a core of their professional practices.

## **6.2. Limitations**

Limitations of this study is that only a small number of art-therapy centers exist in both Nur-Sultan and Almaty, and there is no representation of Art therapy centers in other cities which makes the study not generalizable. The qualitative nature of the study makes the generalizability even less feasible.

At the initial stage of the current research, there was the likelihood that not every teacher would be open enough to share the progress, hardships and the whole learning process of the children who study in the center. Besides, there were some potential risks, unforeseeable situations or circumstances that could occur during the research such as the inability of the participant to take part in the interview, broken or poor Internet connection. However, as the interviews went by, the issues that were met on the way have been successfully solved. For instance, out of ten participants only three of them replied, whereas initially the aim was five to six participants. After a while, the researches have reached out two more participants, luckily, they were available for the interview.

Additionally, since only specialists from the Art therapy centers were involved into the participation in interview, much remain unclear about the work of Art therapists in schools or special correctional centers for children with SEN and disabilities. Since there are Art therapy centers in other Kazakhstani cities operating is a question worth to be researched, their experience in promoting Art therapy practices in Inclusive environment

would be different as the interaction with the government, NGOs and other local authorities, as well as the access to the resources might be limited.

### **6.3. Recommendations for the future implications**

Having researched the topic of the influence of the Art therapy on the lives of children with SEN, it is evident that it is such a wide topic that has a lot of potential to be studied further by specialists in Inclusive Education, SEN and Art professionals. In order to collect more information on this topic, such as providing a bigger sample size, it can be suggested that another research method could be used to delve deeper into topic. Conduction of a large-scale study employing quantitative methods that would have the set of themes developed in the current study would allow to produce more generalizable data.

To add up, as it has been mentioned in the limitations chapter, some issues appeared in the present study such as small number of existing Art therapy centers may be solved in the nearest future if only the problem with financial support, budgeting and awareness will be solved.

The previous chapters showed how much the topic is worth to be explored and developed. Thus, the study suggests the potential need for the consideration of the Government the support of Art therapy services in educational settings as the Art therapeutical methods turn out to play a pivotal role in any child's emotional, psychological and mental health and overall development. To add up, the literature review chapter provided the information on the additional courses for the Art therapy specialists, however, the study says, it is only at its initial level (Kassen, 2019). Using a variety of tools, their personal experience and professional point of view, the specialists in Special Educational Needs facilitate the development of the Art therapy field. They act as "changing agents" (Pantić & Florian, 2015) in the Inclusive education context. Incorporating Art therapy into the general education context would make tangible progress within the whole educational system, allowing all children to have additional mental, emotional and psychological relief.

## References

- Abbott, A., Shanahan, M., & Neufeld, R. W. J. (2013). Artistic tasks outperform nonartistic tasks for stress reduction. *Art Therapy, 30*(2), 71-78. <http://doi.org/10.1080/07421656.2013.787214>
- Ainscow, M. (2005). Understanding the development of inclusive education system. *Electronic Journal of Research in Educational Psychology, 3*(3), 5–20.  
<https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228935522>
- American Art Therapy Association. (2017, June). [Booklet].  
[https://www.arttherapy.org/upload/2017\\_DefinitionofProfession.pdf](https://www.arttherapy.org/upload/2017_DefinitionofProfession.pdf)
- Bleakley, A. (2005). Stories as data, data as stories: making sense of narrative inquiry in clinical education. *Medical Education, 39*(5), 534–540. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2929.2005.02126.x>
- Booth, T., & Ainscow, M. (2002). *Index for inclusion: Developing learning and participation in schools*. Centre for Studies on Inclusive Education (CSIE).  
<https://www.eenet.org.uk/resources/docs/Index%20English.pdf>
- Breuer, J., & Freud, S. (2009). *Studies on hysteria*. Hachette UK.
- British and Irish Sandplay Society (2021). *Jungian sandplay*. British and Irish Sandplay Society.  
<https://www.sandplay.org.uk/content/jungian-sandplay-0>
- Bull, S., & O'Farrell, K. (2012). *Art Therapy and learning disabilities: Don't guess my happiness*. Routledge. <https://www.routledge.com/Art-Therapy-and-Learning-Disabilities-Dont-guess-my-happiness/Bull-OFarrell/p/book/9780415583244>
- Case C., & Dalley T. (2014). *The handbook of Art Therapy* (3rd ed.). Routledge.  
<https://www.routledge.com/The-Handbook-of-Art-Therapy/Case-Dalley/p/book/9780415815802>

- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research methods in education* (6th ed.). Routledge.  
<https://gtu.ge/Agro-Lib/RESEARCH%20METHOD%20COHEN%20ok.pdf>
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2018). *Research methods in education* (8th ed.) Routledge.  
<https://www.routledge.com/Research-Methods-in-Education/Cohen-Manion-Morrison/p/book/9781138209886>
- Coiner, J., & Kim, K. H. (2011). Art Therapy, Research, and Evidence-Based Practice. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, 6(3), 249–254. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15401383.2011.607081>
- Coleman V., & Farris-Dufrene, P. (1996). *Art Therapy and Psychotherapy. Blending two therapeutic approaches*. Routledge. <https://www.routledge.com/Art-Therapy-And-Psychotherapy-Blending-Two-Therapeutic-Approaches-1st/Coleman-Farris-Dufrene/p/book/9781560324898>
- Conger, J. A., & Kanungo, R. N. (1988). The empowerment process: Integrating theory and practice. *The Academy of Management Review*, 13(3), 471–482. <https://doi.org/10.2307/258093>
- Cozolino, L. (2014). *The neuroscience of human relationships: Attachment and the developing social brain* (2nd ed.). WW Norton & Company. <https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2014-07704-000>
- Creswell, J. (2003). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches* (2nd ed.). SAGE Publications.  
[https://books.google.kz/books/about/Research\\_Design.html?id=nSVxmN2KWeYC&redir\\_esc=y](https://books.google.kz/books/about/Research_Design.html?id=nSVxmN2KWeYC&redir_esc=y)
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative* (4th ed.). Pearson. <http://lcwu.edu.pk/ocd/cfiles/TESOL/MS-TSL-505/EducationalResearchPlanningConductingandEvaluatingQuantitativeandQualitativeResearch.pdf>

Curl, K. (2008). Assessing stress reduction as a function of artistic creation and cognitive focus. *Art Therapy: Journal of American Art Therapy Association*, 25(4), 164-169.

<http://doi.org/10.1080/07421656.2008.10129550>

Dewey, J., Simon, H. F., & Levine, B. (1991). *The Collected Works of John Dewey: 1882-1953* (Vol. 18). SIU Press.

Ekman, P. (2003). *Emotions revealed*. Henry Hold Publishers.

<https://zscalarts.files.wordpress.com/2014/01/emotions-revealed-by-paul-ekman1.pdf>

Flynn, V., & Huss, M. T. (2015). Teaching forensic clinical psychology. In D. S. Dunn (Ed.), *The Oxford handbook of undergraduate psychology education* (pp. 613–627). Oxford University Press.

<https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199933815.013.048>

Frank, J. (1991). *Persuasion and healing*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press.

[https://findings.org.uk/docs/Frank\\_JD\\_1\\_findings.pdf?s=eb&r=&c=&sf=sfnos](https://findings.org.uk/docs/Frank_JD_1_findings.pdf?s=eb&r=&c=&sf=sfnos)

French, L., & Klein, R. (Eds.). (2013). *Therapeutic practice in schools: Working with the child within: a clinical workbook for counsellors, psychotherapists and arts therapists*. Routledge.

<https://books.google.kz/books?hl=en&lr=&id=uCCpAgAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR3&dq>

Galletta, A. (2013). *Mastering the semi-structured interview and beyond: From research design to analysis and publication*(Vol. 18). NYU Press.

<https://books.google.kz/books?hl=en&lr=&id=NdbtHg6sPgIC&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq>

Gerber, N., & Lyons, S. J. (1980). A developmental approach to assessment in adult art psychotherapy. *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, 7(2), 105-112. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0197-4556\(80\)90016-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0197-4556(80)90016-7)

Gorelick, K. (1989). Rapprochement between arts and psychotherapies: metaphor and mediator. *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, 16, 149-155.

<https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Perspective%3A-Rapprochement-between-the-arts-and-the-Gorelick/ac1e7abee9b861a1d974d4d248c7f6638fc5fd45>

Granot, A., Regev, D., & Snir, S. (2018). Jungian theory and its use in art therapy in the viewpoints of Israeli Jungian art therapists. *International Journal of Art Therapy: Inscape*, 23(2), 86-97 <https://doi.org/10.1080/17454832.2017.1360371>

Hatch, C. E. (2011). Determining the Effects of Technology on children. Senior Honors Projects, 1-50. <http://digitalcommons.uri.edu/srhonorsprog/260>

Henderson., P. G. (2007). *Creativity, expression and healing: An empirical study using mandalas within the written disclosure paradigm*. [Master's Thesis, Texas A&M University]. OAKTrust. <https://oaktrust.library.tamu.edu/bitstream/handle/1969.1/ETD-TAMU-1604/HENDERSON-THESIS.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>

Hinz, L., Lusebrink, V. (2009). *Expressive therapies continuum: A framework for using art in therapy*. Routledge.  
<https://books.google.kz/books?hl=en&lr=&id=YyapDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq>  
<https://www.european-agency.org/sites/default/files/salamanca-statement-and-framework.pdf>

Isis, P. D., Bush, J., Siegel, C. A., & Ventura, Y. (2010). Empowering students through creativity: Art Therapy in Miami-Dade County public schools. *Art Therapy*, 27(2), 56–61.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07421656.2010.10129712>

Junge, M. B. (2010). *The modern history of Art Therapy in the United States*. Springfield: Charles C. Thomas. Publisher.  
<https://books.google.kz/books?hl=en&lr=&id=WH8gCAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR1&dq>

Junge, M. B. & Asawa, P. P. (1994). *A history of Art Therapy in the United States*. American Art Therapy Association (1st ed.).

- Kaimal G., Jones, P. J., Dieterich-Hartwell, R., Acharya, B., & Wang, X. (2019). Evaluation of long and short-term art therapy interventions in an integrative care setting for military service members with post-traumatic stress and traumatic brain injury. *The Arts in psychotherapy*, 62, 28-36. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aip.2018.10.003>
- Kassen, G. (2019). Application of art methods in the system of art services in Kazakhstan. *Journal of Educational Sciences*, 57(4), 35-45.  
[https://scholar.google.gr/citations?user=OvFRJngAAAAJ&hl=ru#d=gs\\_md\\_cita-d&u=%2Fcitations%3Fview\\_op%3Dview\\_citation%26hl%3Dru%26user%3DOvFRJngAAAAJ%26citation\\_for\\_view%3DOvFRJngAAAAJ%3A7PzIFSSx8tAC%26tzm%3D-360](https://scholar.google.gr/citations?user=OvFRJngAAAAJ&hl=ru#d=gs_md_cita-d&u=%2Fcitations%3Fview_op%3Dview_citation%26hl%3Dru%26user%3DOvFRJngAAAAJ%26citation_for_view%3DOvFRJngAAAAJ%3A7PzIFSSx8tAC%26tzm%3D-360)
- Katsiyannis, A., Yell, M. L., & Bradley, R. (2001). Reflections on the 25th Anniversary of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act. *Remedial and Special Education*, 22(6), 324–334. <https://doi.org/10.1177/074193250102200602>
- Leder, H., Belke, B., Oeberst, A. & Augustin, D. (2004). A model of aesthetic appreciation and aesthetic judgements. *British Journal of Psychology*, 95(4), 489-508.  
<http://doi.org/10.1348/0007126042369811>
- Lusebrink, V., B. (2004). Art therapy and the brain: An attempt to understand the underlying processes of art expression in therapy. *Art Therapy*, 21(3), 125-135.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07421656.2004.10129496>
- Makoelle, T. M. (2020). School's Transition Toward Inclusive Education in Post-Soviet countries: Selected cases in Kazakhstan. *Sage Open*, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244020926586>
- Malchiodi, C. A. (2012). Developmental Art Therapy. In C. A. Malchiodi (Ed.), *Handbook of Art Therapy* (2nd ed.) (pp. 114-129). The Guilford Press.  
<https://www.guilford.com/excerpts/malchiodi2.pdf>

- Medvedeva, E. A., Levchenko I. Yu., Komissarova, L.N., & Dobrovolskaya T.A. (2001). Art pedagogika i art terapiya v specialnom obrazovanii. [Art pedagogic and art therapy in special education] Moscow, Russian Federation: Academiya.  
[https://studme.org/243406/pedagogika/artpedagogika\\_i\\_artterapiya\\_v\\_spetsialnom\\_i\\_inklyuzivnom\\_obrazovanii](https://studme.org/243406/pedagogika/artpedagogika_i_artterapiya_v_spetsialnom_i_inklyuzivnom_obrazovanii)
- Moon, B. (2008). *Introduction to art therapy: Faith in the product* (2nd ed.). Charles C Thomas Publisher. [https://www.istanbulsanatlayasam.org/uploads/1/4/2/7/14276347/1\\_-\\_intro\\_to\\_art\\_tx\\_by\\_moon.pdf](https://www.istanbulsanatlayasam.org/uploads/1/4/2/7/14276347/1_-_intro_to_art_tx_by_moon.pdf)
- OECD (December, 2018). Education policy outlook: Kazakhstan.  
<http://www.oecd.org/education/Education-Policy-Outlook-Country-Profile-Kazakhstan-2018.pdf>
- Pantić, N., & Florian, L. (2015). Developing teachers as agents of inclusion and social justice. *Education Inquiry*, 6(3), 333-351. <https://doi.org/10.3402/edui.v6.27311>
- Piaget, J., & Inhelder, B. (1969). *The Psychology of the Child*. NY: Basic Books.
- Pons, A., Amoroso, J., Herczyński, J., Kheyfets, I., Lockheed, M., & Santiago, P. (2015). *OECD reviews of school resources. Kazakhstan*. The World Bank.  
[https://www.oecd.org/education/school/OECD%20School%20Resources%20Review\\_Kazakhstan\\_FINAL\\_CRC\\_with%20cover.pdf](https://www.oecd.org/education/school/OECD%20School%20Resources%20Review_Kazakhstan_FINAL_CRC_with%20cover.pdf)
- Reis, H. T., Collins, W. A., & Berscheid, E. (2000). The relationship context of human behavior and development. *Psychological Bulletin*, 126(6), 844–872. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.126.6.844>
- Ringeisen, H., Henderson, K., & Hoagwood, K. (2003). Context matters: Schools and the "research to practice gap" in children's mental health. *School Psychology Review*, 32(2), 153–168.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02796015.2003.12086188>

Rogers, C., R. (1980). *Way of Being*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

[https://books.google.kz/books?id=ymS0e1jZmtMC&printsec=frontcover&hl=ru&source=gbs\\_ge\\_summary\\_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false](https://books.google.kz/books?id=ymS0e1jZmtMC&printsec=frontcover&hl=ru&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false)

Rubin J.A. (2001). *Approaches in Art Therapy: Theories and Technique* (2nd ed., Vol. 32). Brunner-Routledge.

Saldana, J. (2013). *Coding Manual for Qualitative researchers*. SAGE Publications.

<http://emotrab.ufba.br/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/Saldana-2013-TheCodingManualforQualitativeResearchers.pdf>

Strnadova, I. (2006). Stress and resilience in families of children with specific learning disabilities. *Review of Compulsory Education*, 17(2), 35-50.

The Salamanca Statement and Framework for action on special needs education (1994). UNESCO.

Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948). United Nations.

<https://www.un.org/sites/un2.un.org/files/udhr.pdf>

Wong L. P. (2008). Data analysis in qualitative research: a brief guide to using Nvivo. *Malaysian Family Physician*, 3(1), 14–20. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4267019/>

Woolfolk, A. (2016). *Educational Psychology* (13th ed.). Pearson Education Limited.

Yontef, G. & Jacobs, L. (2008). Gestalt therapy. *Current Psychotherapies*, 342-382.

Zholtayeva, G., Stambekova, A., Alipbayeva, A., & Yerzhanova, G. (2013). Inclusive education in Kazakhstan: Selected issues. *CBU International Conference Proceedings*, 1, 196-204.

<https://doi.org/10.12955/cbup.2013.34>

## Appendix A

### A sample of a coded transcript

#### Central research question 6

#### Sub-question:

1. Benefits and challenges of the art therapy for children with SEN

Participant 1	Coding	Notes
<p>1. <b>How long</b> have you <b>been working</b> with Art therapy? <i>I have been teaching art therapy <b>for 13 years</b>. I have worked in various places.</i></p> <p>2. What <b>comes</b> to <b>your mind</b> first when you <b>hear</b> “Art therapy?” <i>Creativity, relaxation and positive mood</i></p> <p>3. In your opinion, what do you think participants <b>experienced</b> during art therapy sessions overall? Follow up question: Who is <b>the quickest learner</b>, a child or an adolescent? <i>They <b>like and enjoy it</b>. <b>Children are the best</b> (of all) <b>to perceive</b> art therapy, they will immediately join the work, with adolescents it is a little more difficult. Children are not afraid to draw, teenagers start to evaluate their own work, it seems to them that something is not right and it is all wrong. Thus, children are most susceptible to this type of therapy.</i></p> <p>4. Is the concept of Art as a therapy more positive or negative for you? Why? <b>The concept of art therapy</b> is more positive, as is often the nature of my specialty I can learn about human problems through the art therapy, in contrast to what a person says.</p>	<p>Experience: 13 years Cont: 3 sch.</p> <p>Perception</p> <p>Benefits: enjoy and like Quick learners</p> <p>Pos.conc.of Art therapy: Trustworthy information</p> <p>Art therapy is for everyone</p>	

<p>5. What symptoms are addressed most effectively by art therapy? Why? <i>I work in several places, there is a Center for Sensory Integration, there are children with PDA, PDA, ASD, PAD, children with cerebral palsy, etc. Art therapy works everywhere. It is important to be savvy in this, you need to learn about art therapy, you need to draw and understand a lot from your experience. Art therapists need to improve their qualifications. When I took advanced training courses, "TikTok" (note. Service for creating and viewing short videos) was not yet available, which can be used in art therapy. There is art therapy, there is still such therapy when we create. This includes a photo collage and why not make video collages on the TikTok platform?</i></p> <p>6. What are the advantages and drawbacks of Art therapy in your opinion?</p> <p><i>When I was studying, my teacher said: "when art therapy comes to the masses, it will cease to be so effective. And indeed it is. When I was studying, there were very few mandalas, for example (note: colouring in the form of a circle with patterns), but now you can buy this at any grocery store that has stationery. Disregard. Devaluation. When it becomes popular, it comes to people who don't understand it. It is used by the masses for pleasure but needs an art therapist to be used for healing/health benefits. And if earlier painting of mandalas could give an exact result, now people say "again, why should I paint it?" If a specialist does not prepare high-quality</i></p>	<p>Diagnoses/symptoms (that Art therapy copes with)</p> <p>Challenges: devaluation poor support from Government</p> <p>Unprofessional view on the art therapy</p>	
---	---	--

<p><i>materials, for example, pencils that “scratch” the sheet and are of poor quality, this will not bring the client any pleasure from the drawing process.</i></p> <p>7. What are the most <b>common misconceptions</b> regarding art therapy?</p> <p><i>There are particular misconceptions in art therapy. One of them is the <b>unskilled use of art therapy</b>. When this is literally “wasted” and “misused”.</i></p> <p>8. What are the struggles of children and teachers on the “bad mood days”? How do you cope with it?</p> <p><i><b>Phones</b> are the go-to for bad moods. It forces me to come up with something new, integrating <b>new technologies, gadgets</b> into art therapy sessions.</i></p> <p>9. What do you think is most useful and helpful about art therapy? Why? <i>It can show <b>the real-self of clients, revealing all of the hidden information</b></i></p> <p>10. What is the most significant progress a child has made during his art therapy sessions? Why it was significant and you remembered it? <i>When I work with <b>nonverbal children</b>. When, for example, I start working with a child with ASD (autism), I can show by example, take a brush / pencil in my hands and start drawing, and the child usually follows and copies my actions. Thus, he is involved and begins to work.</i></p> <p>11. What do you perceive as the value of art therapy in an integrative model of care? Could it be used as a separate method of care?</p>	<p>Technologies Gadgets</p> <p>Revealing the unknown</p> <p>Progress made by a client: a nonverbal child</p> <p>Positive influence</p> <p>Meeting individual needs</p>	
--	--	--



teachers and given the opportunity to integrate art therapy into school lessons, it would be great support for students. **School rooms are not designed for art therapy.** There is **no space, resources, equipment, specialists.**

15. If yes, how would you, personally like to support or provide art therapy in schools? *I would do it like a kind of a **psychological circle**. To do this, **social media** (e.g. Instagram) could be used to make children interested in it. Art therapy teachers can be very interesting people who could invite creative people for interviews, I generally have a lot of ideas about this. Once, I got into an interesting stream of "social inclusion" by Keith Loring, where I actually learned what inclusion is.*

16. Would you recommend the art therapy to others? Why? *My relatives, acquaintances and friends, do everything **together with me.** **They are actively involved.** In art therapy, you need to know thousands of tools in order to feel a person's needs, as this is very important. You need to be the kind of specialist who could choose the keys to each client, an individual approach is important, it's like psychotherapy. Therefore, education (specialization) in art therapy is very important.*

Recommendations  
Family & friends  
involvement

## Appendix B

### Recruitment Script

Hello,

I am Shynar Aktanova.

I am getting Master's Degree at Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education. I am contacting you to see if you might be interested in participating in a research study. This research is being done as part of my Master's project and my supervisor's name is Associate Professor, Janet Helmer.

I am conducting a study on teacher's general understanding, attitudes and perceptions of art therapy and the ways it influences the lives of children with Special Educational Needs. The study is entitled: **Art therapy and its influence on the life of children with SEN: teachers' perspectives**.

To participate you need to be an art therapy center teacher who is employed in an Art Therapy Center. Your participation in the research will involve short interview lasting no more than 30-45 minutes to discuss your understanding, attitudes, and possible support or disapproval of Art therapy in Kazakhstan. The consent form with your signature will be kept in a separate folder. All of the material used in the research will be de-identified prior to being translated.

Your participation is voluntary and irrespectively of your opinions all the results will be analyzed and used to contribute to the discussion of this research topic.

The research has been reviewed and approved by the Nazarbayev University Research Ethics Committee. The data collected will be used to consider teachers' attitudes towards influence of art therapy on how it may influence the life of children with SEN since there is a little research conducted on this topic. Each each small bit of information will be valuable to consider as this topic is investigated.

If you are interested in more information about the study or would like to volunteer, please reply to this email or call 8 775 756 17 46.

## Приглашение к участию в исследовании

Здравствуйтесь,

Я Шынар Актанова.

Я получаю степень магистра в Высшей педагогической школе Назарбаев Университета. Я связываюсь с вами, чтобы узнать, заинтересованы ли вы в участии в исследовании. Это исследование проводится в рамках моего магистерского проекта, и моего научного руководителя зовут Джанет Хелмер, доцент (Janet Helmer, associate professor).

Цель моего исследование определить общее понимание учителей, их восприятие и отношение к арт терапии, ее возможной роли в общем развитии детей со специальными образовательными возможностями. Тема исследования: **Влияние арт терапии на жизнь детей со специальными образовательными потребностями: взгляд учителя.**

Участник исследования должен быть учителем центра арт терапии в городах Алматы или Нур-Султан. Ваше участие в исследовании заключается в интервью продолжительностью не более 30-45 минут для обсуждения вашего понимания, отношения, а также возможной поддержки или неодобрения арт терапии и ее влияния на жизнь детей со специальными образовательными потребностями. Форма согласия с вашей подписью будет храниться в отдельной папке. Перед переводом весь материал, использованный в исследовании, будет деидентифицирован.

Ваше участие полностью добровольное и все результаты будут проанализированы независимо от вашего мнения.

Исследование было рассмотрено и одобрено Комитетом по этике научных исследований Назарбаев Университета. Собранные данные будут использованы для анализа и определения отношения учителей к арт терапии и ее влияния на жизнь детей со специальными образовательными потребностями. По этой теме существует мало исследований, поэтому важно и ценно мнение каждого участника.

Если вас интересует дополнительная информация об исследовании или вы хотели бы участвовать, ответьте на это письмо или позвоните по телефону 8 775 756 17 46.

## Зерттеуге қатысуға шақыру

Сәлеметсіз бе,

Мен Шынар Ақтанова.

Мен Назарбаев Университетінің Жоғары білім беру мектебінде магистр дәрежесін аламын. Мен сізбен байланысып отырмын, егер сіз зерттеу жұмысына қатысуға қызығушылық білдірсеңіз. Бұл зерттеу менің магистрімнің жарнамасы аясында жүргізіліп жатыр, менің жетекшімнің аты - Джанет Хельмер, доцент.

Менің зерттеуімнің мақсаты - мұғалімдердің жалпы түсінігін, олардың арт-терапияға деген көзқарасы мен оның ерекше білім беру мүмкіндіктері бар балалардың жалпы дамуындағы мүмкін рөлін анықтау туралы зерттеу жүргізіп жатырмын. Зерттеу тақырыбы: **Арт-терапияның ерекше мүмкіндіктері бар балалардың өміріне әсері: мұғалім көзқарасы.**

Қатысу үшін сіз Алматы немесе Нұр-Сұлтан жұмыс істейтін арт терапия орталықта мұғалімі болуыңыз керек. Бұл сіздің түсінігіңізді, көзқарасыңызды, талқылауға мүмкіндік береді. Сіздің зерттеуге қатысуыңыз сіздің сұхбатыңызды, көзқарастарыңызды және арт-терапияны қолдайтындығын немесе қолдамайтындығын және оның білім беру қажеттілігі бар балалардың өміріне әсерін туралы талқылау үшін 30-45 минуттан аспайтын қысқа сұхбатты қамтиды. Сіздің қолыңызбен келісу парағы бөлек папкада сақталады. Зерттеу барысында пайдаланылған барлық материалдар аудармадан бұрын анықталады.

Сіздің қатысуыңыз толығымен ерікті және сіздің пікіріңізге қарамастан, барлық нәтижелер талданады.

Зерттеулер Н. Ә. Назарбаев атындағы университеттің ғылыми-зерттеу этикасы комитетінде қаралды және мақұлданды. Жиналған деректер мұғалімдердің арт-терапияға деген көзқарасын және оның ерекше білім беру қажеттілігі бар балалардың өміріне әсерін талдау және анықтау үшін маңызды болады.

Егер сіз зерттеу туралы көбірек ақпарат алғыңыз келсе немесе ерікті болғыңыз келсе, осы электрондық поштаға жауап жазыңыз немесе 8 775 756 17 46 нөміріне қоңырау шалыңыз.

## Consent form

### **Art therapy and its influence on the lives of children with SEN: teachers' perspectives**

**DESCRIPTION.** You are invited to participate in a research study on the attitudes of art therapy teachers towards the art therapy and its influence on the lives of children with Special Educational Needs that is being investigated as part of my Masters study at Nazarbayev University, Graduate School of Education. The purpose of this study is to investigate how art therapy teachers understand art therapy and the role of art therapy in the lives of children with SEN from teachers' point of view.

With your permission the interview will be audio recorded for the purpose of having an exact record. You will be sent a copy of the transcription prior to the analysis to confirm that data is accurate. Your name and any other details that can identify you will not be revealed. The audio recording will be deleted upon the completion of the research and the de-identified transcripts will be retained by the researcher in a password protected folder on a password protected computer. Only the researcher and the research supervisor will have access to the data. The results of the study will be used for scholarly purposes only.

**TIME INVOLVEMENT:** The interview will last approximately 30 - 40 min. Your overall participation will take no more than 60 minutes.

**RISKS AND BENEFITS:** There is a minimal risk of breaching confidentiality. To minimize this risk the transcriptions will be kept electronically in an encrypted folder in the researcher's password protected personal computer. To protect anonymity numbers will be assigned to each transcript instead of their names. The identity of participants and their assigned numbers will be stored separately in a password protected file on the researcher's laptop and the cloud. This will minimize the risk of identification of the participants in case of theft or loss of the device. The benefits which are expected to result from this study are that as a participant you will have a chance to contribute to possible changes in the educational policy on art therapy. The research will contribute to the existing knowledge and enrich the literature on this topic. The study may be useful for other agencies and districts working towards implementation of art therapy in Kazakhstan.

**PARTICIPANT'S RIGHTS:** If you have read this form and have decided to participate in this project, please understand your participation is voluntary and you have the right to withdraw your consent or discontinue participation at any time without penalty or loss of benefits to which you are otherwise entitled. The alternative

is not to participate. You have the right to refuse to answer particular questions. The results of this research study may be presented at scientific or professional meetings or published in scientific journals.

**CONTACT INFORMATION:**

**Questions:** If you have any questions, concerns or complaints about this research, its procedures, risks and benefits, contact the Master’s Thesis Supervisor for this student work. The supervisor is Janet Helmer, Associate Professor, Nazarbayev University| Graduate School of Education, phone: +7 7172 704970, email: [janet.helmer@nu.edu.kz](mailto:janet.helmer@nu.edu.kz) | site: [nu.edu.kz](http://nu.edu.kz)

**Independent Contact:** If you are not satisfied with how this study is being conducted, or if you have any concerns, complaints, or general questions about the research or your rights as a participant, please contact the NU GSE Research Committee to speak to someone independent of the research team at +7 7172 709359. You can also write an email to the NU GSE Research Committee at [gse\\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz](mailto:gse_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz)

Please sign this consent form if you agree to participate in this study.

- I have carefully read the information provided;
- I have been given full information regarding the purpose and procedures of the study;
- I understand how the data collected will be used, and that any confidential information will be seen only by the researchers and will not be revealed to anyone else;
- I understand that I am free to withdraw from the study at any time without giving a reason;
- I understand that I do not have to answer any question that makes me uncomfortable
- With full knowledge of all foregoing, I agree, of my own free will, to participate in this study.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date:

I agree for the researcher to audio record the interview

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date:

Researcher:

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date:

## Форма согласия

### Влияние арт терапии на жизнь детей со специальными образовательными потребностями: взгляд учителя

**ОПИСАНИЕ.** Вам предлагается принять участие в исследовании отношения и восприятия учителей в центрах арт терапии непосредственно к самой арт терапии и ее возможной роли в общем развитии детей со специальными образовательными возможностями. Целью данного исследования является изучение того, как учителя центров арт терапии понимают арт терапию и как они видят свою роль педагогов и как влияние арт терапии может распространиться в нашей стране. Интервью будет записано на аудиозаписи с вашего разрешения, чтобы иметь точную запись. Вам будет отправлена копия транскрипции перед анализом, чтобы подтвердить точность данных. Ваше имя и любые другие данные, которые могут идентифицировать вашу личность, не будут раскрыты. Аудиозапись будет удалена по завершении исследования, а неопознанные стенограммы будут сохранены исследователем в защищенной паролем папке на защищенном паролем компьютере. Только исследователь и научный руководитель будут иметь доступ к данным. Результаты исследования будут использованы только в научных целях.

**ВРЕМЯ:** Интервью продлится около 40 минут. Ваше общее участие займет не более 60 минут.

**РИСКИ И ПРЕИМУЩЕСТВА:** риск нарушения конфиденциальности минимален. Чтобы минимизировать этот риск, транскрипции будут храниться в электронном виде в зашифрованной папке на персональном компьютере исследователя, защищенном паролем. В целях защиты анонимности каждой транскрипции будут присвоены номера, а не их имена. Идентификационные данные участников и присвоенные им номера будут храниться отдельно в защищенном паролем файле на портативном компьютере исследователя и в облаке. Это минимизирует риск идентификации участников в случае кражи или потери устройства. Выгоды, которые можно разумно ожидать в результате этого исследования, заключаются в том, что, как у участника, у вас будет возможность внести изменения в образовательную политику. Исследование внесет вклад в существующие знания и обогатит литературу по этой теме. Исследование может быть полезно для других агентств, работающих над внедрением арт терапии и ее применении в Казахстане.

**ПРАВА УЧАСТНИКА:** если вы прочитали эту форму и решили участвовать в этом проекте, пожалуйста, помните, что ваше участие является добровольным, и вы имеете право отозвать свое согласие или прекратить участие в любое время без штрафа или потери преимуществ. Вы так же можете не участвовать в проекте. Вы имеете право отказаться отвечать на конкретные вопросы. Результаты этого исследования могут быть представлены на научных или профессиональных встречах или опубликованы в научных журналах.

### **КОНТАКТНАЯ ИНФОРМАЦИЯ:**

**Вопросы:** если у вас есть какие-либо вопросы, опасения или жалобы по поводу этого исследования, его процедур, рисков и преимуществ, свяжитесь с руководителем магистерской диссертации по поводу этой студенческой работы. Руководитель -

Джанет Хелмер | Доцент Назарбаев Университет | Высшая школа образования Телефон: +7 7172 704970  
электронная почта: [janet.helmer@nu.edu.kz](mailto:janet.helmer@nu.edu.kz) | сайт: [nu.edu.kz](http://nu.edu.kz)

**Независимый контакт:** если вы не удовлетворены тем, как проводится это исследование, или если у вас есть какие-либо опасения, жалобы или общие вопросы относительно исследования или ваших прав как участника, пожалуйста, свяжитесь с исследовательским комитетом NU GSE, чтобы поговорить с кем-либо, независимым от исследовательская группа по телефону +7 7172 709359. Вы также можете написать письмо в исследовательский комитет NU GSE по адресу [gse\\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz](mailto:gse_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz)

Пожалуйста, подпишите это согласие, если вы согласны участвовать в этом исследовании.

- Я внимательно прочитал предоставленную информацию;
- Мне предоставили полную информацию о цели и процедурах исследования;
- Я понимаю, как будут использоваться собранные данные, и что любая конфиденциальная информация будет видна только исследователям и не будет раскрыта никому;
- Я понимаю, что могу отказаться от участия в исследовании в любое время без объяснения причин;
- Я понимаю, что мне не нужно отвечать на вопросы, которые вызывают у меня дискомфорт
- С полным знанием всего вышеизложенного я согласен по своей доброй воле участвовать в этом исследовании.

Подпись: \_\_\_\_\_ Дата подписания:

Я согласен, чтобы исследователь записал интервью на аудио

Подпись: \_\_\_\_\_ Дата подписания:

Исследователь: \_\_\_\_\_ Дата подписания:

## **Келісім нысаны**

**Арт-терапияның ерекше мүмкіндіктері бар балалардың өміріне әсері: мұғалім көзқарасы.**

**СИПАТТАМА:** Сіздің түсінігіңізді, көзқарасыңызды және арт-терапияны қолдайтындығын немесе қолдамайтындығын және оның білім беру қажеттілігі бар балалардың өміріне әсерін туралы зерттеуге қатысуға шақырамыз. Бұл зерттеудің мақсаты – арт терапия мұғалімдерінің арт терапияны қалай түсінетіндігін және олардың терапия беруді қолдаушылар ретіндегі рөлдерін қалай көретіндігін зерттеу. Сұхбат нақты жазбаны алу үшін сіздің рұқсатыңызбен аудио жазба түрінде болады. Сізге транскрипцияның көшірмесін талдаудың алдында деректердің нақты екендігін растау үшін жібересіз. Сіздің атыңыз және сіздің жеке басыңызды анықтайтын кез-келген басқа мәліметтер ашылмайды. Зерттеу аяқталғаннан кейін аудио жазба жойылады және анықталмаған транскриптор зерттеушіде парольмен қорғалған компьютерде парольмен қорғалған папкада сақталады. Тек зерттеуші мен ғылыми жетекші мәліметтерге қол жеткізе алады. Зерттеу нәтижелері тек ғылыми мақсатта қолданылады.

**УАҚЫТҚА ҚАТЫСУ:** Сұхбат шамамен 40 минутқа созылады. Сіздің жалпы қатысуыңыз 60 минуттан аспайды.

**ҚАУШТЕР МЕН ПАЙДАСЫ:** Құпиялылықты бұзудың ең аз қаупі бар. Бұл қауіпті азайту үшін транскрипциялар зерттеушінің құпия сөзбен қорғалған дербес компьютеріндегі шифрланған папкада электронды түрде сақталады. Анонимді қорғау үшін әрбір транскрипцияға олардың аттарының орнына нөмірлер беріледі. Қатысушылардың жеке куәлігі және оларға берілген нөмірлер зерттеушінің ноутбукында және бұлтта парольмен қорғалған файлда бөлек сақталады. Бұл құрылғы ұрланған немесе жоғалған жағдайда қатысушыларды анықтау қаупін барынша азайтады. Зерттеу нәтижелері бойынша күтілетін артықшылықтар - қатысушы ретінде сіз білім беру саясатына өзгерістер енгізуге мүмкіндік аласыз. Зерттеулер бар білімге ықпал етеді және осы тақырыптағы әдебиеттерді байытады. Зерттеу Қазақстанда жыныстық білім беруді жүзеге асырумен айналысатын басқа агенттіктер үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін.

**ҚАТЫСУШЫНЫҢ ҚҰҚЫҚТАРЫ:** Егер сіз осы форманы оқып, осы жобаға қатысуға шешім қабылдаған болсаңыз, сіздің қатысуыңыз ерікті екенін түсініңіз және сіз өз келісіміңізден бас тартуға немесе кез келген уақытта қатысуға қатысуды тоқтата тұруға құқысыз, егер сіз басқаша болған жағдайда жеңілдіктер мен жеңілдіктеусіз құқылы. Сіздің нақты сұрақтарға жауап беруден бас тартуға

құқығыңыз бар. Осы зерттеу жұмысының нәтижелері ғылыми немесе кәсіби отырыстарда ұсынылуы немесе ғылыми журналдарда жариялануы мүмкін.

## **БАЙЛАНЫС АҚПАРАТЫ:**

**Сұрақтар:** Егер сізде осы зерттеулерге, оның процедураларына, тәуекелдері мен артықшылықтарына қатысты сұрақтарыңыз, мазасыздықтасыңыз немесе шағымдарыңыз болса, магистранттың дипломдық жұмыс жетекшісіне осы студенттік жұмыс үшін хабарласыңыз. Ғылыми жетекшісі - Джанет Хельмер | доцент, Назарбаев Университеті | Жоғары білім беру мектебі. Телефон: +7 7172 704970, электрондық пошта: [janet.helmer@nu.edu.kz](mailto:janet.helmer@nu.edu.kz) | сайт: [nu.edu.kz](http://nu.edu.kz)

**Тәуелсіз байланыс:** Егер сіз осы зерттеудің қалай жүргізіліп жатқанына қанағаттанбайтын болсаңыз немесе сізде қандай да бір алаңдаушылық, шағым немесе зерттеу сұрақтары немесе сіздің қатысушы ретіндегі құқықтарыңыз болса, NU GSE зерттеу комитетіне хабарласып, тәуелсіз адаммен сөйлесуіңізді өтінеміз. +7 7172 709359 бойынша зерттеу тобы. Сіз сондай-ақ NU GSE зерттеу комитетіне [gse\\_researchCommittee@nu.edu.kz](mailto:gse_researchCommittee@nu.edu.kz) электронды пошта арқылы хат жаза аласыз.

Егер сіз осы зерттеуге қатысуға келіссеңіз, осы келісімге қол қоюыңызды сұраймыз.

- Мен берілген ақпаратты мұқият оқып шықтым;
- Маған зерттеудің мақсаты мен рәсімдері туралы толық ақпарат берілді;
- Мен жиналған деректердің қалай қолданылатынын және кез келген құпия ақпаратты зерттеушілер ғана көретінін және басқа ешкімге ашылмайтынын түсінемін;
- Мен кез-келген уақытта себепсіз оқудан шығуға еркін екенімді түсінемін;
- Мен өзімді ыңғайсыздандыратын кез-келген сұраққа жауап берудің қажеті жоқ екенін түсінемін
- Жоғарыда айтылғандарды толық біле отырып, мен өз еркіммен осы зерттеуге қатысуға келісемін.

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні:

Мен зерттеушінің сұхбатты аудиожазбаға түсуіне келісемін

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні:

Зерттеуші:

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: