

**Kazakh Students' Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at  
Nazarbayev Intellectual School**

Altyn Mukhayeva

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree

of

Master of Arts

in

Multilingual Education

Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education

May, 2021

Word Count: 26,673

### Author Agreement

By signing and submitting this license, I Altyn Mukhayeva (the author or copyright owner) grant to Nazarbayev University (NU) the non-exclusive right to reproduce, convert (as defined below), and/or distribute my submission (including the abstract) worldwide in print and electronic format and in any medium, including but not limited to audio or video.

I agree that NU may, without changing the content, convert the submission to any medium or format for the purpose of preservation.

I also agree that NU may keep more than one copy of this submission for purposes of security, back-up and preservation.

I confirm that the submission is my original work, and that I have the right to grant the rights contained in this license. I also confirm that my submission does not, to the best of my knowledge, infringe upon anyone's copyright.

If the submission contains material for which I do not hold copyright, I confirm that I have obtained the unrestricted permission of the copyright owner to grant NU the rights required by this license, and that such third-party owned material is clearly identified and acknowledged within the text or content of the submission.

IF THE SUBMISSION IS BASED UPON WORK THAT HAS BEEN SPONSORED OR SUPPORTED BY AN AGENCY OR ORGANIZATION OTHER THAN NU, I CONFIRM THAT I HAVE FULFILLED ANY RIGHT OF REVIEW OR OTHER OBLIGATIONS REQUIRED BY SUCH CONTRACT OR AGREEMENT.

NU will clearly identify my name(s) as the author(s) or owner(s) of the submission, and will not make any alteration, other than as allowed by this license, to your submission.

I hereby accept the terms of the above Author Agreement.



\_\_\_\_\_  
Author's signature:

23.05.2021

Date:

**Declaration**

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and to the best of my knowledge it contains no materials previously published or written by another person, or substantial proportions of material which have been submitted for the award of any other course or degree at NU or any other educational institution, except where due acknowledgement is made in the thesis. This thesis is the result of my own independent work, except where otherwise stated, and the views expressed here are my own.

Signed: 

Date: 23.05.2021

## Ethics Approval



53 Kabanbay Batyr Ave.  
010000 Astana,  
Republic of Kazakhstan  
October 2020

Dear Altyn Mukhayeva

This letter now confirms that your research project entitled: **Kazakh Students' Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School** has been approved by the Graduate School of Education Ethics Committee of Nazarbayev University.

You may proceed with contacting your preferred research site and commencing your participant recruitment strategy.

Yours sincerely

**Syed Abdul Manan**

On behalf of Zumrad Kataeva  
Chair of the GSE Ethics Committee  
Assistant Professor  
Graduate School of Education  
Nazarbayev University

Block C3, Room 5006  
Office: +7 (7172) 70 9371  
Mobile: +7 777 1929961  
email: [zumrad.kataeva@nu.edu.kz](mailto:zumrad.kataeva@nu.edu.kz)

## CITI Training Certificate



Completion Date 03-Aug-2020  
Expiration Date 03-Aug-2023  
Record ID 37707039

This is to certify that:

**Altyn Mukhayeva**

Has completed the following CITI Program course:

**Social & Behavioral Research - Basic/Refresher** (Curriculum Group)  
**Social & Behavioral Research - Basic/Refresher** (Course Learner Group)  
**1 - Basic Course** (Stage)

Not valid for renewal of certification through CME. Do not use for TransCelerate mutual recognition (see Completion Report).

Under requirements set by:

**Nazarbayev University**

**CITI**  
Collaborative Institutional Training Initiative

Verify at [www.citiprogram.org/verify/?w0908b3b0-bd7c-4d36-a206-434461d803c4-37707039](http://www.citiprogram.org/verify/?w0908b3b0-bd7c-4d36-a206-434461d803c4-37707039)

### **Acknowledgments**

These two years of studying have profoundly contributed to the development of my personality both as a researcher and a human being. This is due to NUGSE MA professors, I am sincerely thankful for having the opportunity to be a part of this wonderful team. My gratitude is endless to my supervisor Syed Abdul Manan working with whom was a great experience full of support. Thank you, professor, for being such a supportive, patient, and wise supervisor who was always welcome to answer my questions and provide the best solutions for every concern. I would also like to express my appreciation to my MA peers. We have done a good job, I am so proud of all of you.

Most importantly, спасибо, Папа, за постоянную поддержку, любовь и веру в меня. Я безмерно благодарна, что ты делаешь все, чтобы я могла спокойно учиться, не отвлекаясь ни на что. Спасибо, Мама, за твои молитвы и за то, что вселила в меня любовь к английскому языку и постоянному развитию. I would not be there without you, I wish you were here to see this. Я люблю вас очень сильно. I am also thankful to Akkumis, my little sister, for being by my side during sleepless nights and preparing coffee.

And finally, I am very grateful for Dauren and the support he provided in the hardest times when I was ready to give up. Thank you for being proud, it means a lot to me.

## **Abstract**

### **Kazakh Students' Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School**

Proficiency in multiple languages has become an essential requirement of our globalizing world. Therefore, Nazarbayev (2007), the former president of Kazakhstan proposed the implementation of the project Trinity of Languages, envisioning that “Kazakhstan shall be perceived as a highly educated country whose population uses three languages: Kazakh – as the state language, Russian – as the language of international communication, and English – as the language of successful integration into the global economy” (para. 8). Hence, a network of 20 math and science-oriented trilingual schools was established in 2008 where content-oriented subjects have been taught through these three languages (Mehisto, 2015). Although trilingual education may support the country as it integrates into the global cultural economy, it entails challenges in simultaneously strengthening the status of the state language and maintaining linguistic variety as a key goal of the national program is to preserve Kazakh national identity (Nazarbayev, 2017). Scholars emphasize that language is an integral component of national identity, and education, via the language of instruction, aids in the formation of national identity. Hence, this mixed-methods research aimed to explore Kazakh students' identity formation in trilingual schools by analyzing how different mediums of instruction may influence their attitudes towards Kazakh. Results from an online-survey revealed that a year of studying influences students' national identities and highlighted a positive correlation between multilingual proficiency and attitudes towards Kazakh. Similarly, the qualitative data suggested the presence of a close link between language and identity formation via students' awareness.

Although trilingual education positively impacts national identities, it can be detrimental to the Kazakh language since the students demonstrated their preference for Russian and English. Therefore, the study concludes by suggesting that policy makers and school authorities may introduce cultural projects and awareness-raising activities to foster awareness among students to further strengthen and expand the role of the Kazakh language.



**Аңдатпа****Назарбаев Зияткерлік Мектебіндегі Үштілді****Білім Беру Бағдарламасы Аясында Қазақстандық Оқушылардың Жеке****Тұлғаларының Қалыптасуы**

Бірнеше тілді білу – біздің жаһанданған әлемнің талаптарының бірі.

Сондықтан Қазақстанның тұңғыш президенті Назарбаев (2007) "Қазақстан халқы үш тілді: қазақ тілін – мемлекеттік тіл ретінде, орыс тілін – халықаралық қатынас тілі ретінде және ағылшын тілін – әлемдік экономикаға ойдағыдай кірігу тілі ретінде пайдаланатын, жоғары білімді ел ретінде қабылдануға тиіс" деп "Тілдердің Үштұғырлығы" жобасын іске асыруды ұсынды (8-т.). Осылайша, 2008 жылы математика мен ғылымға бағытталған 20 үштілді мектептер желісі құрылды, онда пәндер үш тілде оқытылды (Мехисто, 2015). Үш тілді білім беру елді әлемдік мәдени экономикаға интеграциялауда қолдау көрсететініне қарамастан, ол мемлекеттік тілдің мәртебесін бір мезгілде нығайтуда және тілдік әртүрлілікті сақтауда проблемаларға әкеп соғуы мүмкін, өйткені ұлттық бағдарламаның негізгі мақсаты қазақтың ұлттық бірегейлігін сақтау болып табылады (Назарбаев, 2017). Ғалымдар тілдің ұлттық бірегейліктің ажырамас бөлігі екенін, ал оқыту тілі арқылы білім беру ұлттық бірегейліктің қалыптасуына ықпал ететінін атап өтті. Осылайша, аралас әдістерді пайдалана отырып жүргізілген осы зерттеу әртүрлі тілде оқытудың қазақ оқушылардың қазақ тіліне қатынасына және көзқарастарының қалыптасуына қалай әсер ететінін зерттеуге бағытталған. Онлайн-сауалнама нәтижелері оқу жылының студенттердің ұлттық бірегейлігіне әсер ететінін көрсетті және бірнеше тілді меңгеру мен қазақ тіліне деген қарым-қатынас арасында оң корреляцияны анықтады. Сол сияқты, сапалы деректер тіл мен оқушылардың санасы арқылы жеке басын қалыптастыру арасында тығыз байланыстың болуын көрсетеді.

Үштілді білім беру ұлттық бірегейлікке оң әсер еткеніне қарамастан, ол қазақ тілінің рөліне нұқсан келтіруі мүмкін, өйткені студенттер орыс және ағылшын тілдерін артық көреді. Осылайша, директивалық органдар мен мектеп билігі қазақ тілінің рөлін одан әрі нығайту және кеңейту мақсатында оқушылардың хабардарлығын арттыру үшін түрлі мәдени жобалар мен іс-шараларды ұйымдастыра алар еді.

## Аннотация

### Формирование Идентичности Казахских Студентов в Рамках Трехязычной Образовательной Программы в Назарбаев Интеллектуальной Школе

Владение несколькими языками это одно из требований нашего глобализирующегося мира. Поэтому Назарбаев (2007), бывший президент Казахстана, предложил реализовать проект “Триединство Языков”, предусматривающий, что "Казахстан должен восприниматься как высокообразованная страна, население которой использует три языка: казахский – как государственный язык, русский – как язык международного общения и английский – как язык успешной интеграции в мировую экономику" (п. 8). Таким образом, в 2008 году была создана сеть из 20 трехязычных школ, ориентированных на математику и естественные науки, где предметы преподавались на трех языках (Мехисто, 2015). Несмотря на то, что трехязычное образование может поддерживать страну в ее интеграции в мировую культурную экономику, оно может влечь за собой проблемы в одновременном укреплении статуса государственного языка и сохранении языкового разнообразия, поскольку ключевой целью национальной программы является сохранение казахской национальной идентичности (Назарбаев, 2017). Ученые подчеркивают, что язык является неотъемлемым компонентом национальной идентичности, а образование через язык обучения способствует формированию национальной идентичности. Таким образом, это исследование на основе смешанных методов было направлено на изучение формирования идентичности казахских учащихся в трехязычных школах путем анализа того, как различные языки обучения могут влиять на их отношение к казахскому языку. Результаты онлайн-опроса показали, что год обучения влияет на

национальную идентичность студентов, и выявили положительную корреляцию между владением несколькими языками и отношением к казахскому языку.

Аналогичным образом, качественные данные свидетельствуют о наличии тесной связи между языком и формированием идентичности через осознанность учащихся.

Несмотря на то, что трехязычное образование положительно влияет на национальную идентичность, оно может нанести ущерб роли казахского языка, поскольку студенты предпочитают русский и английский языки. Таким образом, директивные органы и школьные власти могли бы использовать различные культурные проекты и мероприятия для повышения осведомленности учащихся в целях дальнейшего укрепления и расширения роли казахского языка.

## Table of Contents

Author Agreement .....	i
Declaration .....	ii
Ethics Approval .....	iii
CITI Training Certificate .....	iv
Acknowledgments .....	v
Abstract .....	vi
List of Tables .....	xv
Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
Nation-building and Trilingual Education.....	1
Statement of the Problem.....	3
Statement of Purpose and Research Questions .....	4
Rationale and Significance of the Study.....	5
Outline of the Study .....	6
Chapter 2: Literature Review .....	7
Multilingualism across the World .....	7
Trilingual Education in Kazakhstan .....	8
National Identity.....	10
Civic and Ethnic Models of National Identity.....	12
National Identity in Kazakhstan .....	13
Identity and Language Learning .....	16
Language and the Development of the Global Awareness .....	17
Investment in Language Learning .....	19
National Identity and Medium of Instruction.....	20
Imagined Communities and Imagined Identities.....	22

Language Attitude and Medium of Instruction.....	23
Theoretical framework .....	26
Conclusion .....	27
Chapter 3: Methodology .....	28
The Use of the Mixed-methods Research.....	28
Research Design .....	29
Data Collection Instruments .....	30
Sampling .....	32
Data Collection Procedures .....	33
Data Analysis .....	35
Ethical Considerations.....	37
Conclusion .....	38
Chapter 4: Findings.....	39
Demographical Information of Respondents .....	40
Research question 1. What Changes do Students See in their Affiliation with Kazakh Ethnicity? .....	41
Trilingual Education Encourages Being Global Person .....	46
Strong Appreciation of the Ethnic Attributes.....	50
Labeling Kazakh Traditions as Conservative.....	54
Research Question 2. How do Studying in Russian and English as the Mediums of Instruction Affect Students' Identities over Time? .....	58
Strong National Identity .....	60
Research Question 3. How does Studying in Russian and English as the Mediums of Instruction Affect Students' Attitude towards the Kazakh Language? .....	68
Language Preferences .....	72

Conclusion .....	75
Chapter 5: Discussion .....	76
Language and Awareness of Global Culture .....	76
Trilingual Education as a Way to Strengthen Students' National Identities .....	78
Preference for Russian and English Languages .....	80
Conclusion .....	83
Chapter 6: Conclusion.....	84
Main Conclusions of the Study .....	84
Limitations .....	86
Further Implications and Recommendations .....	86
References .....	89
Appendix A .....	101
Appendix B.....	111
Appendix C.....	114
Appendix D .....	156

**List of Tables**

Table 1.....	40
Table 2.....	41
Table 3.....	42
Table 4.....	43
Table 5.....	44
Table 6.....	59
Table 7.....	69
Table 8.....	69
Table 9.....	70



## **Chapter 1: Introduction**

Identity is constructed through language (Hamid & Jahan, 2015) and education is one of the crucial domains of its construction. Educational components such as a curriculum, schooling, language and educational materials are viewed as “ideological agents of socialization with the potential for identity construction” (Hamid & Jahan, 2015, p. 76). Therefore, this research takes into consideration different mediums of instruction as the core element in students’ identity formation processes.

### **Nation-building and Trilingual Education**

The topics related to the formation of the Kazakh national identity are the focus of common debate in Kazakhstan. According to Sharipova (2019), “the country has inherited complex soviet legacy with large ethnic Russian minority and other ethnic groups that were either deported during the Stalinist period or came during the Virgin land campaign in the 1960s” (p. 1), thereby impacting the further process of the construction of national identity and language use in the post-independent Kazakhstan. With the dissolution of the Soviet Union, Kazakhstan alongside other post-Soviet countries, has encountered an issue concerning the creation of a new sense of national identity (Burkhanov, 2017; Kolbachayeva, 2019). Thus, since Kazakhstan became a rapidly developing nation, Kazakhstani policymakers have been addressing the creation of a Kazakh national identity as a high priority (Montgomery, 2013).

The above-mentioned processes have also had an impact on the linguistic side of the country. During the Soviet period, the policy of Russification was spread in Kazakhstan with the introduction of the Russian language as mandatory in all schools. This resulted in Russian becoming a widely spoken language by both Kazakhs and Russians (Montgomery, 2013). Moreover, the internationalization processes and the desire to be a competitive country also led to the gradual introduction of the English language in

different spheres. In 2010, Kazakhstan joined the Bologna process (Yergebekov & Temirbekova, 2012) with the aim to promote internationalization in higher education, and this was deemed necessary to give impetus to meet the demands of the modern world. Besides, in the strategy “Kazakhstan – 2050” (Nazarbayev, 2012), it is outlined that active measures have been undertaken to create conditions for learning the Russian and English languages alongside the Kazakh language. The strategy also declares that trilingual education should be encouraged at the state level. Thus, these policies have provided the ground for the active promotion of the three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English. Moreover, one of the essential abilities and requirements for every individual to freely operate in the modern globalizing world is considered to be proficiency in several languages. According to Nazarbayev (2017), one of the key aspects of the modernization process is the development of the nation’s competitiveness which also includes foreign language proficiency. Therefore, the former president Nursultan Nazarbayev (2007) in his message “New Kazakhstan in a New World” proposed the establishment of the project Trinity of Languages in 2006, pointing out that Kazakhstan needs to be considered as a highly competitive country with its population that has proficiency in three languages: “these languages are Kazakh – as the state language, Russian – as the language of international communication and English – the language of successful integration into the global economy” (para. 8). To achieve the defined goal, a network of 20 math and science-oriented trilingual schools was established in 2008 where different content-oriented subjects are taught through three languages (Mehisto, 2015). According to the former president, these schools are aimed at “enhancing the intellectual potential of the nation” (Mehisto, 2015, p. 110). Moreover, drawing on Amanbayeva and Meirbekova’s (2017) distinction of the positive sides of the trilingual education policy, it facilitates the entrance of our citizens to the international level, thus promoting the state’s economy.

### **Statement of the Problem**

Since Kazakhstan has gained independence after the dissolution of the Soviet Union in 1991, the number of ethnic Kazakhs has progressively increased and shifted from the minor ethnic group to the major one, constituting 63.1% of the population (Mehisto, 2015). Even though the percentage of ethnic Kazakhs is on the increase, and they form a major part of the whole population of Kazakhstan, the Kazakh language has not been necessarily considered as the first language of many Kazakhs (Mehisto, 2015). Therefore, this motivated the government to introduce various programs that aim at strengthening the status of the Kazakh language and increasing its usage. In the Patriotic Act named “Mangilik Yel”, which was adopted in 2016, it is outlined that the state language should be promoted as a ground to unite people, and the trilingual policy as a major impetus to enhance the country’s competitiveness (Nazarbayev, 2014). However, there might be some challenges regarding the country’s efforts to simultaneously “nationalize and globalize their education system” (Montgomery, 2013, p. 4), and as Holm-Hansen (1999) stated “Kazakhstani nation-builders are attempting to achieve several incompatible goals at the same time. They are trying simultaneously to ethnify the state and to integrate the population on a supra-ethnic basis” (pp. 223-224). The country has been attempting to maintain the Kazakh national identity by indicating its significance in different programs and making educational institutions as one of the main places to develop a sense of patriotism. Additionally, Kazakhstan aims to enter the international arena with the development of the linguistic proficiency of the nation by introducing English in the educational, social and economic spheres. Moreover, as Nazarbayev (2017) identified in the program “Rukhani Zhagyru”, one of its key goals is the preservation of the Kazakh national identity.

Hence, even though trilingual education supports the country's development on the international level, possible challenges at the national level may also have to be taken into account, particularly, whether it is possible to strengthen the status of the state language, build a strong national identity, and maintain linguistic variety at the same time. Trilingual education implies using the Kazakh, Russian and English languages as the medium of instruction (MOI). According to Smith (1991), language is an integral component of national identity and education is one of the major components in its establishment; therefore, the language of instruction can be a determining factor in national identity formation in education. Moreover, acknowledging Olaoye's (2013) argument that "language, whether indigenous or foreign, is a marker of identity" (p. 41), these different mediums of instruction policies might impact Kazakh students' national identity and their attitude towards the Kazakh language.

### **Statement of Purpose and Research Questions**

According to Belhiah and Al-hussien (2016), it is obvious that language, being a substantial constituent, takes an integral part in the formation of the identity of an individual and a nation. Therefore, the preservation and protection of the language from foreign influence may be considered as it is the crucial component in the process of building a national identity. In this conceptual backdrop, the purpose of this research is to explore ethnic Kazakh students' identity formation in trilingual schools and analyze how different mediums of instruction influence students' attitudes towards the Kazakh language. Therefore, the study is focused on answering these three main research questions:

1. What changes do students see in their affiliation with the Kazakh ethnicity?
2. How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' identities over time?

3. How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' attitudes towards the Kazakh language?

### **Rationale and Significance of the Study**

Being a student who studied in a Russian medium school, and further, studied through English as the MOI in a higher educational institution, I have realized the visible impact of this on my identity. Studying in Russian and English at a school level affected my worldview and way of thinking in general. Therefore, with the implementation of the trilingual educational policy, I found it essential for myself to investigate the influence of the policy on Kazakh identity formation.

The main goal of the research in education is to pay special attention to scientific investigation and to provide solutions to the issues in the educational sphere (Kapur, 2018). Therefore, the significance of this study is that it might enable educational stakeholders to predict the potential consequences of the instruction in the Russian and English languages in the secondary school, in particular, the Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools (NIS), in building a Kazakh national identity of students. Since the Republic of Kazakhstan is in its initial stages of nation-building, one of the main goals of the State is to build a strong Kazakh identity; therefore, the research will allow school authorities to consider as to what extent and how different languages of instruction influence the Kazakh national identity which could give them an insight towards the extent to which the language of instruction impacts identity formation of the younger generation and the attitude of ethnic Kazakhs towards their national language. Also, with the results of this research on the extent to which trilingual education influences the Kazakh national identity, schools will be able to organize different events with the aim of preserving national identity and fostering a positive attitude towards Kazakh language use.

Moreover, the research aims at addressing the gap in the literature concerning the

link between trilingual educational programs and Kazakh identity. The relationship between identity and language has previously been investigated by Norton (2013), Pavlenko (2003), Edwards (2009) and a large number of other researchers. Given the proven relationship between language learning and identity formation, it may be significant to investigate and survey the same relationship at the NIS school where three languages are taught. In addition, the study attempts to show if each additional year of studying at NIS influences students' identity formation. Therefore, its significance lies in the exploration of the possible influence of trilingual education on the national identities of students who study in two different years of schooling.

### **Outline of the Study**

The thesis consists of an introduction, literature review, methodology, results, discussion and conclusion. Firstly, the introduction will cover the details of the study, such as the background information on the topic, statement of the problem, research purpose and research questions, including the rationale for selecting this research area and its significance. The literature review chapter will examine the notion of national identity and its relationship to the Kazakhstani context. Furthermore, the analysis of relevant concepts, such as investment, imagined identity and imagined community will be presented. Next, the part on the methodology will justify the choice of mixed methods research with an explanatory sequential design which is based on a survey and interviews. In this part, the sample, sites, data collection and data analysis procedures will be defined. The results chapter will provide findings from both quantitative and qualitative research with the data discussed separately in the following section. Ultimately, the conclusion will be based on the summary of the findings, the limitations and implications of the study and recommendations for future investigations.

## **Chapter 2: Literature Review**

This chapter seeks to review the major theoretical and empirical research in the field of national identity, language learning and language attitude. The section will discuss how these concepts are connected and aim to identify the notion of national identity with regards to language learning and MOI and to analyze the constructs of investment, imagined community and community which are closely related to the identity formation processes. Firstly, definitions of trilingual education and information about its establishment in the Kazakhstani context will be presented. Then, the section on national identity will look at the main theories in this field – essentialist and constructivist. It will then progress to an elucidation of the ethnic and civic models of national identity as described by Smith (1991) and Brubaker (1994). The chapter will also present the literature on national identity in Kazakhstan, specifically the opposition of the two notions Kazakhness and Kazakhstanness, which represent the civic and ethnic models. The studies on the link between identity and language learning will be analyzed further followed by the previous research on the influence of language acquisition on the development of global awareness. Moreover, the link between national identity and the medium of instruction will be discussed. The chapter will then dwell on the concepts of investment, imagined communities and imagined identities and their correlation with identity. Finally, the theoretical framework of the current study will be provided at the end of this literature review chapter.

### **Multilingualism across the World**

Multilingualism currently stands as a substantial element in the educational sphere worldwide. During the UNESCO's General Conference which took place in 1999, the notion of "multilingual education" was authorized by UNESCO (Polatova et al, 2020). The term refers to education provided in at least three languages which include students'

first language and two other languages that are regional and international (UNESCO, 2003). However, according to García et al (2006), multilingual education refers to “education where more than two languages are used as the languages of instruction in subjects other than the languages themselves” (p. 16). Thus, the number of countries that have introduced a third language into their educational contexts is gradually increasing, and Kazakhstan is one of them.

Many children experience the acquisition of a third language in education (Cenoz et al, 2001). In the European context, multilingual schools employ several languages as the languages of instruction. Learning a third language is a widespread phenomenon in those communities that are bilingual or multilingual. In the multilingual settings of Africa and Asia, the use of a third or additional language is also a common practice, as the languages children use at home and in society may not coincide with the one that is employed for instruction at school (García, 2017; Manan & David, 2019; Manan et al, 2015).

With the increase of immigration in most European countries, the trilingual educational system has become a very common educational policy. Children’s repertoire varies from that of the community’s; therefore, they learn the community language alongside the additional language. According to Cenoz (2001), the introduction of a third language or trilingual education is not a recent phenomenon. This trend is gradually becoming widespread in those countries that are striving to implement a foreign language starting from primary school, and to increase the usage of minority languages in the field of education. Besides, according to Cenoz (2013), people learn those languages that are internationally employed since they might provide various opportunities, such as economic or social.

### **Trilingual Education in Kazakhstan**



As an essential aspect of national goals, education in Kazakhstan is given a high priority. Intended to develop the country's human capital, national and regional programs emphasize the entrance of education into the international arena and strive to comply with “world standards” (Yakavets & Dzhadrina, 2014). One of the steps towards these goals is the establishment of the trilingual education initiative according to which Kazakhstani people’s proficiency in Kazakh, Russian and English is the key to a bright future (Nazarbayev, 2018, para. 7). This presents Kazakhstan as the first country among those countries of Central Asia and the former Soviet Union to implement the use of these three languages for teaching different content subjects (Karabassova, 2020). Thus, the promotion of trilingual education has become an issue of national importance. The statuses of the given three languages were declared during the 12<sup>th</sup> Session of the Assembly of Nations of Kazakhstan in 2006 (Assembly of People of Kazakhstan, 2006). The former president was the first government official who presented the idea of trilingualism in Kazakhstan, which led to the establishment of “The Trinity of Languages”, identified as a cultural project. As former president Nazarbayev (2007) indicated, the reason for the development of the project was to present Kazakhstan all over the world as a highly competent country. Accordingly, the implementation of trilingual education is a major step and an effective way of providing the younger generation with more opportunities in a globalized world (UNESCO, 2003).

The initiative for the teaching of different subjects in three different languages was first piloted in 33 mainstream schools which were designated as “Daryn” schools (Karabassova, 2020). Moreover, the project for the establishment of intellectual schools with trilingual educational program was launched by the decree of the former president Nursultan Nazarbayev in 2008 (NIS, 2020). Starting this time, to test a newly constructed model of trilingual education, and using their experience to further transfer the model to

Kazakhstani mainstream schools, 20 Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools were established by the government (Karabassova, 2018). Thus, this network of trilingual schools became an experimental system with the purpose to develop, monitor, analyze and introduce innovative models of education by different school levels such as elementary, primary and high school (NIS, 2020). The educational standards in Kazakhstan were not structured “to introduce at the appropriate level modern forms of governance in education, to implement innovative educational programs and research projects” (NIS, 2020, para, 3); therefore, the law “On the Status of “Nazarbayev University”, “Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools” and “Nazarbayev Fund” was adopted in 2011, providing educators the possibility to organize their own teaching and assessment systems (NIS, 2020). The provided principle of academic freedom implies the acceleration of the development of an innovative system that contributes to the modernization of secondary education in Kazakhstan.

### **National Identity**

Verdugo and Milne (2016) pointed out the complexity of the research on national identity as a concept is surrounded with debates and disagreements. For example, according to Brubaker and Cooper (2000), the concept of national identity is understood to be slippery, thereby prompting some scholars to appeal for abandoning the notion completely. In this respect, Verdugo and Milne (2016) identified three substantial issues which caused these debates. Firstly, there are three angles through which the definition itself can be viewed. Secondly, identity includes various competing forms, such as social class, ethnicity, race and gender. Ultimately, differences between the notions of identity, nationalism and patriotism are also a focus of the debates. Nevertheless, researchers do agree on a national identity being “a sense of “belonging” to a nation or state, and most researchers would accept the point that this feeling of belonging is exposed to various

factors, among them being “relational, normative, contextual, kinship, and historical” (Verdugo & Milne, 2016, p. 2).

According to Verdugo and Milne (2016), three dominant views on national identity can be identified: “essentialist/primordialist, constructivist/postmodernist, and civic citizenship” (p. 3). Those scholars who adhere to the essentialist view examine national identity as “fixed, based on ancestry, a common language, history, ethnicity, and world views” (Verdugo & Milne, 2016, p. 4). One of the scholars supporting this view is Smith (1991), who defined national identity as followings:

National identity involves some sense of political community however tenuous. A political community in turn implies at least some common institutions and a single code or rights and duties for all the members of the community. It also suggests a definite social space, a fairly well demarcated and bounded territory, with which the members identify and to which they feel they belong (p. 9).

In addition, Smith (1991) provided a set of the key features of national identity: “1. an historic territory, or homeland; 2. common myths and historical memories; 3. a common, mass public culture; 4. common legal rights and duties for all members; 5. a common economy with territorial mobility for members” (p. 14). Hence, a nation can be identified as “a named human population sharing an historic territory, common myths and historical memories, a mass, public culture, a common economy and common legal rights and duties for all members” (Smith, 1991, p. 14). If, according to the essentialist view, identity is a fixed entity with the common features, it can be posited by postmodernists that identities are created, manipulated and dismantled under the goals of dominant groups (Brubaker, 1992). Anderson (1991) also refers to national identity as having a feeling of attachment to a nation which is in turn “an imagined political community” and is explained in the following way: “the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion” (p. 6). Hence, national identity is an imagined construct because

individuals in a specific territory or nation are not familiar and cannot interact among themselves as there are literally too many people to enable this process. The customs and variety of common ceremonies are used as a way for bonding and forming one unity, and, thus, people imagine that they are in a community with other members of their society. Moreover, Anderson (1991) highlighted the essential role of print in the creation of an imaginary identity and argues that the first nation-states of Europe were established due to such national prints as state documents or books. Thus, the current study will focus on identity being fluid with the possibility of altering over time as a consequence of various environmental factors.

### *Civic and Ethnic Models of National Identity*

Both Smith (1991) and Brubaker (1994) distinguished two models of national identity which are civic and ethnic. Smith (1991) identified them as Western and non-Western respectively, where the elements of the Western model are “historic territory, legal-political community, legal-political equality of members, and common civic culture and ideology” (p. 11). In this way, nations are entitled to a definite territory which has the legal regulations that ensure equity among community members and “a measure of common culture and a civic ideology, a set of common understanding and aspirations, sentiments and ideas, that bind the population together in their homeland” (Smith, 1991, p. 11). In contrast, the distinguishing feature of the non-Western or ethnic conceptualization of national identity is its particular focus on a “community birth and native culture” (Smith, 1991, p.11). Hence, the scholar provides the core elements of the ethnic model of national identity which includes “genealogy and presumed descent ties, popular mobilization, vernacular languages, customs and traditions” (Smith, 1991, p. 12). In this regard, according to the Western concept, an individual initially had to be a member of a definite nation, yet had the opportunity to decide to which it belonged, whereas in the non-

Western concept no such view is implied. Although an individual moved to another community, they inevitably remained in the nation of their birth. Thus, the ethnic conceptualization of national identity states that “a nation was first and foremost a community of common descent” (Smith, 1991, p. 11).

The same differentiation between civic and ethnic national identities has been presented by Brubaker (1994) through the analysis of France and Germany’s formation of nationhood. According to Brubaker (1994), French civic national identity attaches importance to the territorial aspect and political inclusion. Ethnic national identity in Germany, conversely, is based on blood and ethnicity. Thus, Brubaker (1994) stated that “in Germany the “conceived order” or “imagined community” of nationhood and the institutional realities of statehood were sharply distinct; in France they were fused. In Germany, nationhood was an ethnocultural fact; in France, it was a political fact” (p. 4).

Thus, we find that the topic of national identity is replete with debates and controversies. On one hand, some scholars view national identity as a traditional phenomenon that is based on ethnicity, birth, common history and language. On the contrary, another group indicates the flexible nature of national identity which can be influenced by different external factors for political reasons. In this way, the current study takes into consideration the facets of both points of view that national identity is changeable, but without denying the significance of the ethnic components of common history, language and ethnicity.

### ***National Identity in Kazakhstan***

With Kazakhstan’s independence, both Kazakhs and Russians, as two major national groups, appeared to have a conflict in connection to their conflicting worldviews. Aitymbetov et al (2015) indicated that “nation-state represents one nation” (p. 4). However, the existence of two nations and the desire of each to represent the state, in this

country, that of Kazakhstan, caused a discrepancy in the definition of the term nation-state. To determine this kind of national state, Brubaker (1996) proposed the concept of “nationalizing nationalism”. According to the scholar, nationalizing nationalism is a case where a state is considered by its leaders and elites as a nation-state with a specific nation, but simultaneously being an “incomplete” and “unaccomplished” one (p. 109). Therefore, the nation-state is perceived as not “national” enough in different aspects of high importance. As Aitymbetov et al (2015) pointed out, nationalizing nationalism takes place when “a state with the indigenous title nation has already been created, but the people due to certain reasons cannot approve their sovereignty and dominance in the political, cultural and other aspects, and other non-indigenous people of the state would unconditionally accept this domination” (p. 4). Thus, Kazakhstan, as a country of the post-communist world, can be characterized as nationalizing, which indicates the relationship between the titular nation and the state with respect to its identity.

With the proposal of a doctrine of National Unity of Kazakhstan in the Assembly of People of Kazakhstan in 2004, the idea of the “Kazakhstani nation” evoked cardinal shifts in the position of the Kazakh nation, as this posited the inclusion of all ethnicities residing in the country into one group, substituting the term Kazakh. However, in the Assembly of People of Kazakhstan (Aitymbetov et al, 2015), it was stated that the notions of Kazakhness and Kazakhstanness are interdependent. The importance of Kazakhness as a driving force in the construction of Kazakhstanness has been noted since “Kazakh culture has to be objectively the kernel around which will grow... the cultural community of all the Kazakhstani people” (p. 59). Thus, Kazakhness would be a ground for the integration of all ethnicities and citizens. However, some Kazakh nationalists who insisted on the ethnic conceptualization of national identity were opposed to the emergence of the combination “Kazakhstani nation” (Fierman, 2005, p. 395). Shakhanov (2009) expressed

his disapproval stating that this is “ultty zhoyudyň tote zholy – kazakhstandyk ult (The direct way to the destruction of the Kazakh nation – Kazakhstani nation)” (p. 4). This shows that modern Kazakhstan has faced many challenges and controversies in the process of its national identity formation.

Therefore, Laruelle (2014) drew attention to the national identity formation in Kazakhstan by highlighting the fact that the country is “a textbook case in terms of building a hybrid state identity” (p. 1). There are several identities with which Kazakhstan identifies itself: “as Kazakh, i.e. the political entity of the Kazakh nation and historical accomplishment, as Kazakhstani, i.e. as a multiethnic nation at the crossroads of the Eurasian continents, and as a transnational country integrated into world trends” (p. 1). This shows that Kazakhstan has been undertaking measures for the ethnicization and formation of civic identity. According to Sharipova (2019), ethnic identity is built through the means of the replacement of the names of streets’ and cities’ by local names and the promotion of local linguistic and cultural components, such as changing toponyms or the introduction of the project “Tugan Zher” (“Native Land”). However, taking into consideration the formation of a civic identity which is encouraged by political elites, the process is found to be incomplete. The reason for this is that the Kazakh people have had extensive experience of Soviet nationality policy; therefore, the question of the possibility of inculcating civic identity in the minds of the Kazakhstani citizens arises. However, a mixed-methods study conducted by Sharipova (2019) among Kazakhs and Russians from different parts of the country, demonstrated that the number of participants who are proud of their Kazakhstani identity has grown over the course of time. This trend can be attributable to the enhancement of living standards. Taking into consideration the Kazakhstani context, it leads to the conclusion that the concept of national identity is

diverse and complex as a result of its historical past and present active measures for maintaining national identity.

### **Identity and Language Learning**

It can be noted that the relationship between the concepts of identity and language is complementary as many identity theorists expressed that “identity constructs and is constructed by language” (Norton, 2006, p. 3). The close link between language and identity was also highlighted by Masri (2012) in that language is a part of the nation’s history, and that it acts as a system of symbols that serve for group members to construe the world; therefore, language remains the key component among other important elements which are involved in the identity formation process. Additionally, Pavlenko’s (2004) emphasized that “language is seen in this paradigm as the locus of social organization and power, and as a form of symbolic capital as well as a site of struggle where subjectivity and individual consciousness are produced” (p. 54). Subjectivity, according to Weedon (1997), is seen as “the conscious and unconscious thoughts and emotions of the individual, her sense of herself, and her ways of understanding, and her ways of understanding her relation to the world” (p. 28). Thus, it is argued that language is the place where a person constructs his own subjectivity, and since language learning implies the presence of interaction between students and teachers, social relationships are equally pivotal in the process of individuals’ identity formation. All speaking, writing and reading activities in the second language, carried out by language learners are not simple exchange of information, but “they are also organizing and reorganizing a sense of who they are and how they relate to the social world” (Norton, 2013, p. 4). Moreover, Norton’s (2013) thought on language which “is not only linguistic system, but a social practice in which experiences are organized and identities negotiated” supports the idea of language taking a pivotal role in the identity formation process (p. 17).



Considering the interrelation between identity and learning, Wegner (1998) describes that “learning will be seen as a situated process of participation in particular communities of practice, which may entail the negotiation of ways of being a person in that context” (as cited in Pavlenko & Norton, 2007). As learning shapes our personality and abilities, it is considered to be “an experience of identity” (Pavlenko & Norton, 2007, p. 670). Thus, learning entails not only the acquisition of different knowledge and skills, but also the developmental process of becoming a certain individual. Moreover, Pavlenko and Norton (2007) indicated the idea that learning shapes our personality and it is a path of becoming an individual instead of “a simple accumulation of skills and knowledge” (p. 670).

### ***Language and the Development of the Global Awareness***

The analysis of the literature revealed that language might be considered as a means to develop learners’ global awareness and cosmopolitan values, which afterwards, could result in the creation of global identities. Generally, the core elements of global awareness are knowledge about international affairs and the interconnection of people (Case, 1993; Kirkwood, 2001). Reysen and Katzarska-Miller (2013) distinguish the notion of global awareness as “knowledge of global awareness issues and one’s interconnectedness with others” (p. 861).

As Lenkaitis et al (2019) pointed out, globalization and the usage of English can tremendously influence the identity construction of language learners. Moreover, Henry and Goddard (2015) point out that this phenomenon has become the reason for the formation of hybrid identities. Through languages, learners enhance their cross-cultural awareness, their knowledge regarding world affairs, and their affinity feelings with other people, and as a result, this “paves the way to identification with global community” (Lenkaitis et al, 2019, p. 3). This means that global awareness leads to the formation of

global identity which is defined as “a sense of belonging to the entire human race” (p. 18). Furthermore, Mansoory (2012) concludes that people have the capability for the creation of global identities, and education and socialization are the main tools for its development.

The mixed-methods study conducted by Lenkaitis et al (2019) explored if virtual exchanges contributed to the development of learners’ global awareness and if this was an impetus for the formation of a global identity. It was discovered that virtual exchanges significantly influenced the development of participants’ global awareness. Due to the communication with their peers from remote countries, participants expanded their knowledge about the world and this contributed to strengthening the feeling of affiliation with people who reside in other parts of the world. (Lenkaitis et al, 2019). The study demonstrated that being globally aware can contribute to the construction of a global identity within target language learners.

Hamid and Jahan (2015) also studied the link between language and identity. The research examined the role of MOI in the formation of students’ vision of the world and their identities during globalization and analyzed the writing of those who studied through Bangladeshi and English as the MOI. Their findings suggested that (English medium) EM writers considered themselves as “global citizens with cosmopolitan views” as a result of EM education (p. 88). The global orientation of these participants was represented by their proficiency in English, “global consciousness and willingness to engage with their imagined communities” (Hamid & Jahan, 2015, p. 91). Additionally, Jahan and Hamid (2019) revealed that those who obtained education through English as the medium of instruction (EMI) developed elite global identities “with cosmopolitan values and belonging” (p. 19).

Thus, EMI might have a tremendous impact on shaping learners’ identities, their

beliefs and worldview. By the engagement in communication with people from other cultures, students can recognize interconnection with them (Reysen & Katzarska-Miller, 2013; Tsui & Ngo, 2016), thus developing their global awareness. Therefore, it can be concluded that education and socialization develop learners' global identities.

### *Investment in Language Learning*

Motivation is assumed as a common trait of those individuals who learn a language, and the reason for the failure of the target language acquisition is learners not having a sufficient commitment to the process of learning. However, the presence of unequal power relations between language learners and target language speakers is not reflected in theories in the field of motivation. Norton (2013) revealed that high motivation is not an indicator of the acquisition of the target language. Therefore, the scholar developed the concept of "investment" which provides "a way to understand learners' variable desires to engage in social interaction and community practices" and "signals the socially and historically constructed relationship of learners to the target language and their often ambivalent desire to learn and practice it" (p. 6). The scholar's definition of the notion of investment indicates it as language learners' efforts towards target language acquisition and this construct which provides a possibility to comprehend learners' intention to be a part of social engagement and language practices. Individuals invest in the acquisition of the target language to obtain "symbolic" and "material" resources where the former implies language, quality education and new acquaintances, and the latter refers to material goods. According to Bourdieu (1986), cultural capital encompasses the social assets of an individual which provides opportunities for social mobility. Therefore, investment in the target language implies the acquisition of new knowledge and resources, which in turn "increase the value of their cultural capital and social power" (Early & Norton, 2012, p. 198), thus providing

various identity options and opportunities to access various communities. Additionally, as Norton and Toohey (2011) state, with the increase of the value of language learners' cultural capital they "reassess their sense of themselves and their desires for the future" (p. 420). In this way, investment views language learners as owners of "complex identities" which gradually alter "across time and space" (Norton & Toohey, 2011, p. 420). This defines the intrinsic link between the constructs of investment and identity. Thus, while motivation is mainly examined as a psychological construct (Dörnyei, 2001), an investment must be reviewed through a sociological framework (Norton, 2013). The construct strives to build a constructive link between "learner's desire and commitment to learn a language, and their complex and changing identity" (p. 6). Investment in the acquisition of a language can be equated with an investment in shaping the identity of a learner.

In the study conducted by McKay and Wong (1996) on the development of the English language of four students who spoke Mandarin, the results showed the significant role of students' desires in the level of investment in the language. Students' commitment to the target language was affected by their needs. In addition, Kramsch (2013) points out that investment as "language learning commitment" is primarily based on "a learner's intentional choice and desire" (p. 195).

Thus, the profound role of investment can be seen in the identity formation of an individual. To obtain particular knowledge, learners start to make an effort to learn the target language, thus increasing the value of their cultural capital. It can be stated that these processes transform learners' identity, as an individual imagines a community to which he or she strives to adjust, thereby imagining his or her specific role. Hence, the notions of imagined community and imagined identity will be analyzed further.

#### ***National Identity and Medium of Instruction***

According to Hamid and Jahan (2015), “English has been perceived as a language of power and mobility in the “non-English speaking” part of the world since British colonial days” and this situation has achieved its peak in connection with globalization and has significantly influenced education in many countries. The majority of educational institutions have been implementing English in their curriculum or as a MOI.

The relationship between national identity and the medium of instruction has been studied by David and Tien’s (2009) in Malaysia. They examined two groups of respondents, those who were under 30 and those who were over 45 and who studied in Bahasa Melayu and English, respectively, as the MOI. Drawing on the findings of the given study, the younger generation’s patriotic sense was stronger as they studied through their national language. These results demonstrate the profound impact of the medium of instruction on learners’ national identity. Similarly, the recent study conducted by Dobrocka et al (2018) aimed at examining the usage of a school’s curriculum to shape national identity in former Czechoslovakia. The introduction of national songs in the school curriculum positively influenced students’ affinity to their nation. Hence, these investigations demonstrate that not only a MOI, but also the usage of national elements in a curriculum might have a crucial role in the construction of national identity.

Taking into account Lanehart’s (1996) point that “the language that a person speaks is the language that person identifies with. Language is a part of one’s culture and identity” and Qu’s (2005) idea that “when identity change involves a second language, it signifies confrontations between two cultures, or two sets of values derived from the two cultures” (as cited in Norton & Gao, 2008, p. 109), it might be concluded that a person’s identity within the first language might be opposed to the second language, as a result shaping one’s whole identity. It is important to emphasize that language takes an essential part in identity formation. This implies that being proficient in other languages might

influence an individual's identity. For instance, Sung (2019) investigated Chinese students' experiences of acquiring English in a multilingual context, with a particular focus on identity. The study revealed that international students appropriated the linguistic and cultural norms and practices of the community of local students to establish their identities and to integrate into that community as its valued members.

Undoubtedly, language acquisition implies studying the culture of the target language, and acquiring knowledge might somehow shape the worldview of a person. Some students, for their patriotic views, may refuse target languages that are introduced to them, whereas others may instead deny their dominant national identity and develop another one which has been affected by the foreign language (Pavlenko, 2003). Moreover, Belz (2003) points out that the usage of a specific "linguistic code (language, dialect or register)" might constitute a specific identity; therefore, when a person employs several languages, it might be considered as "the representation of multiple speaker identities" (p. 209). Accordingly, the literature suggests the close relationship between language and identity, and studies demonstrate possible influences of a language in education on students' identities.

### ***Imagined Communities and Imagined Identities***

The studies in the relationship between investment and identity primarily concern the concepts of imagined communities and imagined identities. Norton (2013) defines the term imagined community as a "group of people, not immediately tangible and accessible, with whom we connect through the power of the imagination" (p. 8). As Wenger (1998) states, our workplaces or educational institutions or, in other words, direct engagement in various community practices and social relationships, do not constitute the only way of being a member of a community; imagined community is another way of membership. Thus, Wenger (1998) refers to the concept of imagination as "a process of expanding our

self by transcending our time and space and creating new images of the world and ourselves” (p. 176). This leads to the idea that imagined community is reflected by learners’ desired places to enter where the language they learn is employed as the first language, and they imagine themselves negotiating with the target language speakers. Norton (2006) indicates that “the conception of an imagined community assumes an imagined identity” (p. 8); hence, the role of imagination is taken into consideration as pivotal in learners’ identities formation.

The significance of the notions of investment, imagined community and imagined identity were reflected by Norton (2013) in the study of a Vietnamese immigrant woman called Mai. Her imagined community was “the office” in the factory where she worked and her imagined identity was accordingly an office worker. With this aim to gain a promotion, she was taking an English course, which, in turn, focused on students’ past lives. Therefore, Mai faced an issue in creating a link within the practices of learning English and her imagined community.

Taken together, the literature reveals the close link between an individual’s identity, investment, imagined identity and imagined community. When a person is engaged in the language learning process, he may imagine his entrance into a community where this target language is employed. Accordingly, this community provides wide identity options which may transform learners’ senses of themselves.

### **Language Attitude and Medium of Instruction**

As English has reached the status of the “dominant medium of communication” and “lingua franca of the modern world”, more than 75 countries have adopted English as an official language (De Swaan, 2001). Many language scholars have been attracted by this ascendancy because it is becoming more obvious that English can profoundly impact language learners’ identities and their sense of self (Belhiah & Al- hussien, 2016).

According to the State Program for the Implementation of Language Policy in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025 (2019), the percentage of Kazakhstani citizens who have proficiency in Kazakh must reach 95% by 2025. Moreover, Nazarbayev (2012) emphasized the significance of the development and modernization of the Kazakh language as the most substantial factor to unite all the Kazakhstani citizens. Additionally, the Kazakh language is expected to obtain a leading role in all areas, and it should be developed “as a legacy for our descendants, integrating the experience of past generations with our living history” (Nazarbayev, 2012, p. 27). At the same time, this document emphasizes the necessity to undertake active measures for the creation of conditions to equally learn Russian and English alongside Kazakh. Accordingly, new perspectives and unlimited opportunities will be revealed for the Kazakhstani citizens. Thus, a trilingual education program was introduced for the achievement of the above-defined purpose. According to Karabassova (2020), the network of NIS schools implemented a model of trilingual education which implies the usage of Kazakh and Russian as the MOI in grades 7-10 and English for teaching in grades 11-12.

Baker (1992) found that a school can foster the language attitudes of students when a particular language and its culture are prioritized and valued. Lai (2004), in his study of language attitudes in post-colonial Hong-Kong, conducted questionnaire surveys among 484 and 564 students with English and Cantonese as the MOI respectively from 28 various secondary schools. Students’ attitudes towards the languages were reviewed from two orientations – integrative and instrumental, where integrative orientation implies the students’ interest in a language and their openness towards another culture and instrumental orientation implies the case when students are positively inclined towards a language for its perspective as for a future job or educational opportunity. The principle that Baker (1992) suggested can be applied to the case of the group with English as the



MOI in terms of the students' attitude towards English. English being a gatekeeper to quality higher education and "a symbol of the elite" was valued among students as they highlighted strongly established integrative orientation to English in comparison with their counterparts studying through Cantonese. However, in the case of CMI schools, the results did not reveal the students' inclination towards Cantonese, although it was intensively employed as the MOI. On the contrary, due to the role of English as a gatekeeper to enter a higher institution, CMI students highly valued this language. Lai (2004) indicates that "using a language will not be sufficient to change language attitudes if beliefs and values remain unchanged" (p. 210). Thus, as the results depict, the isolated usage of a language as a MOI is not sufficient to impose a favourable attitude towards the target language; instead, the relevant commitments and necessary efforts should be focused on the language and its culture.

Moreover, context plays a substantial role in fostering a particular language attitude. In the context of Kazakhstan, policymakers distinguish Russian and English languages as applicable for the development of human capital, thereby they strongly emphasize the establishment of bilingualism or multilingualism (Terlikbayeva et al, 2021). Therefore, the Russian and English languages are considered more prestigious and indicators of success. As Terlikbayeva et al (2021) pointed out, Russian refers to "linguistic capital through which access to the wider labor-market and to a better life is achieved" and English is viewed as "the tool that would successfully integrate the country into the global economy" and these are the reasons for the implementation of trilingual policy (p. 19). As a result, this language pluralism may negatively influence the status of the Kazakh language. Moreover, putting a higher value on English affects not only the position of the titular language, but also has a profound effect on the national identities of learners (Tsui & Tollefson, 2017). This shows a close link between language and the

formation of national identity. Overall, the literature suggests that the MOI takes a substantial part in the formation of a particular language attitude only in combination with national or school policies and depending on this, students' national identity might be strengthened or weakened.

### **Theoretical framework**

This study will be based on an investigation of the national identity and trilingual education and will rely on Norton's poststructuralist notion of language learning and identity. According to this notion, an individual is depicted as "diverse, contradictory, dynamic, and changing over historical time and social space" (Norton & Toohey, 2013, p. 417). Identity, according to Block (2007), is taken into consideration as a process instead of being a fixed, unique and consistent phenomenon (as cited in Norton, 2013). Relying on the given concept, identity is not a defined construct that will not change, but it is a position that will transform over time in relation to various factors which occur around an individual; therefore, identity is "multiple, contradictory, and a site of struggle" (Norton, 2013, p. 164), and, language as one of these factors, is aimed at constructing our sense of ourselves and plays an essential role in the identity formation process. Every practical use of the target language allows learners to construct or reconstruct a sense of who they are and their relation to society. Hence, language learners are involved in the process of their identity formation. Moreover, "language is seen as central to the circulation of discourses, which are systems of power/knowledge that define and regulate our social institutions, disciplines and practices. In poststructuralist terms, language is not only a linguistic system but also a social practice in which meanings are debated and identities negotiated" (De Costa, 2016, p. 589). Generally, as Norton (2013) states, identity in poststructuralist terms "is the way a person understands his or her relationship to the world, how that relationship is

constructed across time and space, and how the person understands possibilities for the future” (p. 4). Therefore, the study looks at individuals’ identities as fluid and dynamic processes, rather than fixed unities.

### **Conclusion**

The literature review chapter covered the major topics concerning this study. It reviewed the concept of national identity and its civic and ethnic models, taking into consideration the Kazakhstani context. To be more precise, the notions of Kazakhness and Kazakhstanness were analyzed. Moreover, the studies showed the close link between language learning and national identity, where identity is considered as a dynamic and fluid concept. The chapter also looked at the notions of investment, imagined community and imagined identity since they are found as integral to the field of identity and language learning. Finally, the theoretical framework of the study which is the poststructuralist theory of identity is explained. Hence, the section provides the foundation for this study that can enable the researcher to answer the research questions.

### **Chapter 3: Methodology**

While the preceding chapter reviewed the literature on the topic, this chapter seeks to provide all the necessary details about the methodology of the study. The choice of the methodology is in line with the research purpose and research questions of the study. The study aims to examine how trilingual education shapes student' identities and their perception of national language and the research questions are:

1. What changes do students see in their affiliation with the Kazakh ethnicity?
2. How do studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' identities over time?
3. How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' attitude towards the Kazakh language?

For this purpose, I present the overview of the rationale for the methodology used and the research design it utilizes. Then, the research site, sample of the research and their justification are described. This is followed by the explanation of the procedures of data collection and data analysis. Towards the end, the ethical considerations that guided this study are outlined.

#### **The Use of the Mixed-methods Research**

The current study employs mixed methods research that combines data collection and data analysis of both quantitative and qualitative data. As Tashakkori and Teddie (2003) and Creswell (2014) describe, a mixed-method is a process of collection, analysis and integration of both types of data, quantitative and qualitative, in one study to gain an in-depth understanding of the research problem. This integration enables the researcher not

only to analyze statistical data but also to examine respondents' views and feelings (Bryman, 2011). The mixed methodology allows us to concentrate on the strengths of two sets of data and the use of different data collection instruments may increase 'the validity of results' (Manan, 2015, p. 61; Creswell, 2014; Johnson & Onwuegbuzie, 2004).

Therefore, this type of method was deemed relevant since it reconciles the "best of both quantitative and qualitative research (Creswell, 2014, p. 578). The quantitative data provides an overview of the relationship and correlation between variables, whereas the qualitative data allows further elaboration on the topic. This research equally relies on both quantitative and qualitative data since the former is employed to analyze if there is an influence of trilingual education and language proficiency on students' perception of national identity and national language and the latter is used for the broader examination of these influence and changes.

### **Research Design**

On the basis of the research purpose and research questions, the mixed methods with a sequential explanatory design is considered to be appropriate to employ for this research as it "captures the best of both quantitative and qualitative data – to obtain quantitative results from a population in the first phase, and then refine or elaborate these findings through an in-depth qualitative exploration in the second phase" (Creswell, 2014, p. 573; Ivankova et al., 2006; Subedi, 2016). As Creswell (2014) pointed out, this design allows collecting both sets of data "sequentially in two phases, with one form of data collection following and informing the other" (p. 572). The quantitative data provides an opportunity to address the issue of whether trilingual education influences the national identity and students' attitude towards the Kazakh language, whereas the qualitative data will enable observation of the process of how students' identities are changing. Therefore, with the collection of the quantitative data, a general and broader view of the research

problem will be provided, and, then the qualitative data will be employed to refine the qualitative results by “exploring few typical cases, probing key result in more detail, or following up with outlier or extreme cases” (Creswell, 2014, p. 573). Hence, this allows me to reveal and analyze exceptional cases if there are any, that are relevant for the study and to fully answer the research questions. The quantitative and qualitative data will be sequentially collected, and the qualitative data will take a supportive role to augment the quantitative data to fully answer the posed research questions (Creswell, 2014).

### **Data Collection Instruments**

Data collection instruments used in this study are survey and semi-structured interviews. For the collection of the quantitative data, the survey is utilized, whereas for the qualitative data semi-structured interviews have been considered as the most suitable. To gather quantitative data, a questionnaire with close-ended questions has been employed to explore the influence of the year of schooling in a trilingual educational program and level of proficiency in Kazakh, Russian and English on respondents’ national identity and their attitude towards the national language. The findings derived from the surveys can present “a general picture of the research problem” (Creswell, 2014, p. 572). Then, the semi-structured interviews as a means to collect the qualitative data “extend the general picture” and examine the process of shaping Kazakh students’ identities (Creswell, 2014, p. 572).

The questionnaire survey (see Appendix A) includes questions on the background information of the students and main questions on national identity and national language employing the five-point Likert scale (Brill, 2008) that are designed in NU Qualtrics. These close-ended questions have been used to elicit students’ agreement with different statements about trilingual education, identity and role of the Kazakh language. The questionnaires include five scale answers (strongly disagree, disagree, neutral, agree, and

strongly agree) to reveal their attitude towards trilingual education and national language. This scale enables observation of the extent to which they agree or disagree with particular items on trilingual education.

The survey was conducted via NU Qualtrics online as “electronic data collection provides an easy, quick form of data collection” (Creswell, 2014, p. 174). The link to complete the survey was sent to the participants and it did not include the information that could identify the individuals. At the end of the survey, there is a question on the possibility of a participant to take the participation further in the interview, and if “yes”, there is a place for inserting a phone number. After the researcher read all the responses, six participants from those who agreed were chosen based on their answers. For example, if the researcher sees that the particular participant’s answers reveal that his/her identity is more influenced by different mediums of instruction, and these participants agreed to continue, they would be contacted for conducting the interview. Thus, this allowed the researcher to understand deeply about these exceptional cases if there were any. Only six students’ identities were identified by the researcher as they participated in the interviews.

The semi-structured interviews (see Appendix B) have been used to explore students’ views on trilingual education with Russian and English as the MOI shaping their identity. As a “versatile research instrument” and frequently used method in qualitative research (Dörnyei, 2007, p. 134), an interview allows to receive necessary information in a communicative way. As Dörnyei (2007) indicates, a semi-structured interview “offers a compromise between two extremes” (p. 136), and for the purpose of staying in the frame of the topic the interviewee directs participants with prepared questions and poses additional questions as ‘probes’ to receive a further explanation of their answers. Moreover, as Creswell (2014) pointed out, the interview provides an opportunity for researchers to gather information that might be complicated to obtain through other

approaches and for respondents to present detailed answers. According to Percy et al (2015) and Majid et al (2017), due to interviews, researchers have a chance to investigate people's opinions, experiences and beliefs, generally subjective information, which is unavailable through statistical measurements. Hence, the semi-structured one-to-one interview is chosen as a tool for qualitative data collection because it is a comfortable way for the respondents to share their ideas and for a researcher to receive a rich amount of data (Creswell, 2014). Moreover, although the researcher has a set of prepared questions in advance, the form of the questions in the semi-structured interview is open-ended, which encourages an interviewee to thoroughly consider the issues, and freely speak on them (Dörnyei, 2007). Sample questions for revealing the student's identity formation in trilingual schools consist of open-ended questions, "so that the participants can best voice their experiences unconstrained by any perspectives of the researcher or past research findings" (Creswell, 2014, p. 240). Thus, open-ended questions allow interviewees to broadly give their responses without being navigated by the interviewer's opinion.

### **Sampling**

Since this study is focused on trilingual education and national identity, the research site for this mixed-methods study is one of the NIS schools. Participants for the surveys have been chosen on the basis of the nonprobability sampling, specifically the convenience sampling strategy. In accordance with the nonprobability sampling, "a researcher selects individuals because they are available, convenient, and represent some characteristics the investigator seeks to study" (Creswell, 2014, p. 163). This type of sampling allows a researcher to select participants that "are willing and available to be studied" and represent the required characteristics (Creswell, 2014, p. 163). The sample for the quantitative part includes 60 ethnically Kazakh students in total: 30 students from the



11<sup>th</sup> grade and 30 from the 12<sup>th</sup> grade. The survey is conducted among 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> – grade students, thereby providing an opportunity to compare the results of two age groups.

For the interview, the target respondents are chosen by maximum variation sampling among NIS students. The recruitment of the participants is also on a voluntary basis within those who participated in the completion of the surveys. According to Creswell (2014), this sampling strategy allows us to “identify characteristics and find individuals or sites that possess it” (p. 230). Therefore, being a student at NIS for at least two years, specifically, those students who study in grades 11 and 12, is the basic criteria for choosing respondents. Another criteria for participants is that they should be ethnically Kazakh. Three students from the 11<sup>th</sup> grade and three from the 12<sup>th</sup> grade are recruited among those who completed the survey. Thus, since interviews were conducted in the second phase, it allowed choosing those ‘exceptional cases’ from the participants of the surveys (Creswell, 2014).

My research focuses on investigating the influence of trilingual education on Kazakh students' national identity and their attitude towards the Kazakh language. Therefore I have chosen particularly this group of students studying at NIS where trilingual language program have been implemented. The primary reason for selecting this age range lies in the fact that this period is considered to be more exposed to different external factors in comparison with other age groups. Thus, it shows us how trilingual education is shaping students' identities based on the length of their studying experience with multiple media of instruction.

### **Data Collection Procedures**

After obtaining approval from the Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education Ethics Committee, I proceeded to ask for permission to conduct the study at the school from school authorities explaining the context of the study. The research area was

approached through a gatekeeper that according to Creswell (2014) is an “individual who has an official or unofficial role in the site” (p. 233). All the information on the research, its nature, detailed explanation of the criteria of the participants, consent forms, survey and interview protocols were delivered to the school at their request to check all the necessary documents. At the next stage, the consent forms were distributed to the teachers and further to the parents of the potential participants with the permission of the school and with the help of the appointee. The consent forms (see Appendix C) cover the description of the purpose of the research, the potential risks and benefits for the participants, their rights and the processes of anonymity and confidentiality. Students were asked to participate in an approximately ten-minute survey and a one-to-one 30-minute interview on a voluntary basis. After gaining parents’ permission for their children to be involved in the study, students were sent a link to complete the online survey. The child assent form for the survey was included at the beginning of it as a part of the questionnaire so they could easily familiarize themselves with the details of the study and continue the survey in case they agree with all the conditions. As Creswell (2014) states, the informed consent forms are used to inform participants and serve to guarantee “the protection of their rights” (p. 167). Each individual was informed about the possibility of participation in the given research, the length of the completion of the survey as well as the risks and benefits of the participation.

At the end of the survey, respondents were proposed to voluntarily participate in the interview by sharing their phone numbers. After the review of the quantitative data, six students were accordingly approached by WhatsApp to continue their participation in the study in a 30-minute one-to-one interview. The child assent forms for the interviews were provided to the potential interviewees. When the consents of participants were received, the date and program (Zoom, Skype, or any other platform) for the meetings were arranged

in accordance with their requirements. Participants were given the option to choose any language they deemed convenient for the interview: the Kazakh, Russian or English languages.

Before the interview, students were again informed about the main components of the study, including their rights to refuse to respond to any questions and stop their participation at any time. Also, they were assured about the confidentiality and non-traceability of the interview process – participants' identities are kept confidential, and names are substituted with pseudonyms. Then, with the permission of the interviewees, the conversations were recorded on a recording device. All six semi-structured were conducted via audio call in WhatsApp online platform: five of them were in Russian and one was in Kazakh.

### **Data Analysis**

The data collection was followed by the analysis of the quantitative and qualitative data. Even though both data were collected in a separate way, the results were combined and discussed jointly in the discussion section. The quantitative data was analyzed employing the SPSS program. The quantitative data was transferred from NU Qualtrics to the SPSS program for the purpose of conducting the statistical calculations. Before starting the analysis, the data was checked for errors and missing values as it could negatively influence the ultimate results (Creswell, 2014). Overall, there were 61 responses where only one had missing values and was deleted. To analyze the quantitative data, I used descriptive and inferential statistics. The descriptive statistics which “indicate general tendencies in the data, the spread of scores, or a comparison of how score relates to all others” (Creswell, 2014, p. 202) was used first to compute the overall number of participants in relation to gender and grade; whereas, inferential statistics are employed to “compare two or more groups on the independent variable in terms of the dependent

variable” (Creswell, 2014, p. 202). Inferential statistics included an independent sample t-test, Spearman rho’s rank-order coefficient and a Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient.

First, to make computations, the negative items on national identity were reversed and the total score of items on national identity and national language were calculated separately. Independent samples t-test was then conducted to review the relationship between a year of schooling, national identity and national language. This analysis was made with the purpose of identifying if there was a difference in the scores of students from 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades in relation to the national identity and national language. This enabled the researcher to determine if the time period of the study influenced students’ Kazakh identities and their attitude towards the Kazakh language. The total score of students’ proficiencies in Kazakh, Russian and English was also computed to identify its’ correlation with the results for the perception of national identity and national language. Therefore, Spearman rho’s coefficient was computed to assess the relationship between students’ overall proficiency in three languages and the strength of their Kazakh identities as well as their attitude towards the national language. Additionally, a Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient was employed to review the correlation between two continuous variables – students’ national identities and attitude towards national language (Muji, 2011).

All interviews were conducted via audio call, and the programs for transcribing were not able to identify interviewees’ voices. Therefore, the recordings were transcribed manually (see Appendix D). Relying on the suggestion of Cohen et al (2011), respondents’ hesitations and pauses were reflected in the transcriptions. For the qualitative data, a thematic analysis with six phases proposed by Braun and Clarke (2012) was utilized. The first step is “familiarizing yourself with the data” which consisted of reading and listening

to the recording and highlighting “items potentially of interest” (Braun & Clarke, 2012, p. 60). The second phase aimed at the creation of initial codes following by searching for the possible themes. At this stage, in vivo and descriptive coding were employed (Saldana, 2011). According to Saldana (2011), the first type refers to “a code based on the actual language used by the participant (p. 99). Those words or phrases that considered being important and related to the topic were utilized as codes. Another type of coding used for the analysis of the interview transcripts was descriptive which “simply summarize the topic of a datum (Saldana, 2011, p. 104). When the codes were revealed, they were categorized and listed in a separate document for the creation of relevant themes that were further checked and clearly named. Hence, the interviews were coded in accordance with the inductive approach or “narrowing data into few themes (Creswell; as cited in Creswell, 2014, p. 267). The final step was the production of the report and presentation of the findings.

### **Ethical Considerations**

The researcher observed all the possible standard protocols that would make sure ethical conservations. For instance, participation in this study was on a voluntary basis. Participants were assured about the aspects of anonymity, confidentiality and non-traceability of their identities. Since the survey was anonymous, none of the participants’ real identities was made public. To ensure confidentiality and anonymity, these participants’ names were substituted with pseudonyms. All the documents containing any personal information as the consent forms and students’ names are stored separately in a password-protected computer with the researcher being the only person to have access. All the necessary measures for the confidentiality of the participants’ personal data and gathered responses are maintained and this data is kept in a protected offline database. The

personal data of individuals is kept absolutely confidential without sharing it within school or university.

This current research includes more than minimal risk as the participants are the vulnerable population under 18. During the interviews, the participants were asked about their experiences of studying through different mediums of instruction, their opinions on trilingual education, their national identity and language preferences. Hence, the possibility and extent of discomfort that participants might encounter in the study were not greater than those that they may face in daily life. However, the topic of national identity might be taken into consideration as a personal one, especially for school children, which is one of the criteria for the recruitment of participants. Therefore, as Jacob and Furgerson (2015) indicated the significance of the rapport between interviewer and interviewees, a friendly atmosphere was created by starting a simple conversation with the respondents before asking questions on the topic. If the questions are found to be sensitive for the participants, they will have the right to discontinue participating in the study. Interviews were recorded only with the permission of the participants. The consent and assent forms and personal information are stored separately from the responses. The participants had the right to withdraw from a research study for any reason without being penalized and they were assured of this point so they can freely terminate their participation if they feel uncomfortable with any research elements. Hence, participants were not coerced into participating in the research; everything was on a voluntary basis.

### **Conclusion**

The methodology of the research study is based on the research aims to explore the influence of trilingual education on students' Kazakh identity and their attitude towards the Kazakh language. The mixed methods with the explanatory sequential design were chosen to respond to the three research questions. The quantitative part focuses on the relationship

between a year of studying, language proficiency, the strength of national identity and perception of the national language, whereas the qualitative part concentrated on the influence of trilingual education on national identities and national language. The quantitative data consisted of 60 responses, whereas interviews were obtained from six students who participated in the survey. The results from the analysis of the data are provided in the next chapter.

#### **Chapter 4: Findings**

The current chapter is aimed at presenting the main findings derived from the analysis of quantitative and qualitative data that was derived employing mixed methods research. The section is divided into three parts. Each part represents a particular research question with relevant quantitative and qualitative findings and appropriate themes. The results of quantitative data gathered via an online survey and the analysis of qualitative data obtained via semi-structured interviews were focused on answering the research questions presented below:

1. What changes do students see in their affiliation with the Kazakh ethnicity?
2. How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' identities over time?
3. How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' attitude towards the Kazakh language?

Quantitative data includes 60 responses where 30 of which are from 11<sup>th</sup> grade and 30 from 12<sup>th</sup> – grade students. The qualitative data includes the thematic analysis of six interviews the participants of which are from two different years of their study program. Thematic analysis was conducted employing Braun and Clarke's (2012) six steps. These steps include familiarizing with the qualitative data, creation of initial codes, identifying themes, revisiting possible themes, summarizing names of themes and writing a report.

Survey responses provide an overview of the relation and correlation between the following variables: grade, national identity and national language. The findings from quantitative data provide a possibility to observe the relationship between year of studying and national identity alongside with national language, and the presence of impact of the proficiency in several languages on the strength of national identity and attitude towards national language. Then qualitative data analysis reveals the way trilingual education influences the participants' perception about national identity and national language.

### **Demographical Information of Respondents**

The background information of respondents from both quantitative and qualitative data is presented in this part in the form of tables. The survey responses were gathered from 60 students from senior grades, that includes 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> years of studying. Table 1 indicates the total number of respondents and the number of male and female students for each grade. As it is depicted in table 1, there are 11 and 8 male respondents from the 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades and 19 and 22 female respondents from 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades respectively.

**Table 1**

*Grade – Gender Crosstabulation*

	<i>Gender</i>			<i>Total</i>
	<i>Male</i>	<i>Female</i>		
Grade	11	19		30
	12	22		30
Total	19	41		60

The variables of grade and gender were necessary for the quantitative analysis via SPSS to establish correlation and find out the relationship with the items on national identity and national language. Hence, the analysis enabled the researcher to separately compare the answers of students from two different groups in terms of year of studying and gender.



The qualitative data was examined alongside quantitative data in accordance with the triangulation design. There are overall six students with three from 11<sup>th</sup> and three from 12<sup>th</sup> grades. The age range of students varies from 16 to 17 with only two participants aged 16 and with only one male from 11<sup>th</sup> grade. Four out of six students defined Kazakh as their first language, for one of the respondents it is Russian and another one identified herself as a bilingual person.

**Table 2**

*Interview Participants' Background Information*

№	Participant	Grade	Gender	Age	First Language	Entrance to NIS
P1	Nazerke	11	Female	16	Kazakh	7 <sup>th</sup> grade
P2	Aslan	11	Male	17	Kazakh	7 <sup>th</sup> grade
P3	Sara	12	Female	17	Both Kazakh and Russian	7 <sup>th</sup> grade
P4	Malika	12	Female	17	Russian	7 <sup>th</sup> grade
P5	Madina	12	Female	17	Kazakh	7 <sup>th</sup> grade
P6	Almira	11	Female	16	Kazakh	7 <sup>th</sup> grade

Indicating background information about respondents' years of studying in Table 2 was crucial during the analysis. This enabled to compare the level of the strength of national identity and attitude towards the national language among two groups and then review if students' grades fostered these possible changes. Thus, this part presents demographic and background information of respondents from both quantitative and qualitative data and provides evidence to answer the research questions below.

**Research question 1. What Changes do Students See in their Affiliation with Kazakh Ethnicity?**

In this part, the relevant quantitative and qualitative results that answer the current research question are presented. Employing independent samples t-test, the relationship between national identity and grade was revealed. This allowed the researcher to examine if the amount of time spent in the trilingual education program has affected students' sense of their national identity. Moreover, Spearman rho's coefficient was utilized to review the correlation of national identity in relation to language proficiency in the Russian and English languages.

To review the relationship between the Kazakh identity and a year of studying, six items on national identity were reversed as the item "the more that I experienced trilingual education, the more it weakened my national Kazakh identity" and the total score of all items was calculated using SPSS. Then, independent samples t-test (Table 3) showed that there was a statistically significant difference ( $t(58) = -2.28, p = .026$ ) on national identity between the scores for students from 11<sup>th</sup> ( $M = 31.33, SD = .99$ ) and 12<sup>th</sup> ( $M = 34.40, SD = .90$ ) grades. These results indicate that there is a relationship between students' grades and the level of strength of national identity. In other words, the year of studying affects students' national identity. Although there is a significant relationship, it does not indicate if the effect is strong or weak. Therefore, Cohen's  $d$  was calculated as a measure of the size of the effect of the year of study on national identity. Taken together, these findings suggest that there is a difference in the level of strength of national identity between the respondents from 11<sup>th</sup> ( $M = 31.33, SD = .99$ ) and 12<sup>th</sup> ( $M = 34.40, SD = .90$ ) grades;  $t(58) = -2.28, p = .026, d = 0.59$ ). Overall, this means that a year of studying might have a moderate effect on national identity.

### **Table 3**

*Independent Samples Test. A Year of Studying and National Identity*

---

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variance		t-test for Equality of Means						
		<i>F</i>	<i>Sig.</i>	<i>T</i>	<i>Df</i>	<i>Sig.</i> (2-tailed)	<i>Mean</i> <i>Difference</i>	<i>Std.</i> <i>Error</i> <i>Difference</i>	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
									Lower	Upper
National identity	Equal variances assumed	.758	.388	2.281	58	.026	-3.06667	1.34415	5.75728	-.37606
	Equal variances not assumed			2.281	57.585	.026	-3.06667	.34415	5.75769	-.37564

Furthermore, a Spearman correlation coefficient was computed to assess the correlation between students' language proficiency in Russian and English and the total score of items on national identity. As it is depicted in Table 4, the *p* value is not statistically significant (*p* = .17), which suggests that there was no correlation between the language proficiency in Russian and English and the level of strength of national identity. Overall, this indicates that language proficiency and national identity do not influence each other.

**Table 4**

*Spearman's rho Correlation Coefficient. Russian and English Proficiency and National Identity*

		Russian and English proficiency		National identity
Spearman's rho	Russian English proficiency	Correlation Coefficient		1.000 .179

	Sig. (2-tailed)	.	.172
	<i>N</i>	60	60
National identity	Correlation		
	Coefficient	.179	1.000
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.172	.
	<i>N</i>	60	60

Additionally, Spearman rho's coefficient was computed to assess the relationship between the proficiency in Kazakh and national identity. According to the findings of the study, there was no correlation between the current variables ( $p = .25$ ).

**Table 5**

*Spearman's rho Correlation Coefficient. Kazakh Proficiency and National Identity*

		Kazakh	
		National	language
		identity	proficiency
Spearman's rho	National identity	Correlation	
		Coefficient	1.000
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.	
	<i>N</i>	60	
Kazakh language proficiency	Kazakh language	Correlation	
		Coefficient	.150
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.254	
	<i>N</i>	60	

Thus, as the quantitative analysis suggests, language expertise neither in Kazakh nor in Russian and English influences learners' national identity. If a Spearman rho's coefficient

was evaluated with the aim of assessing the link between language proficiency and national identity,

To summarize, the quantitative analysis facilitated the researcher with an opportunity to examine the possible influence of grade, proficiency in three languages on the respondents' national identities. As results showed, respondents from 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades did differ in their national identity. Hence, it indicates that students from 12<sup>th</sup> grade had stronger national identities when compared to those who are from 11<sup>th</sup> grade. Therefore, the more students experienced studying through Kazakh, Russian and English as the MOI, the more they strengthened their national identities. Also, students' proficiency level and their national identities were not correlated. Thus, the quantitative data provided a way to investigate the link between the variables, whereas the results of qualitative analysis served as a ground to understand students' identities.

Analyses of interviews revealed that all six respondents positively viewed trilingual education and took this policy as an opportunity to broaden their horizons and a resource for the development of their personality and country. Every respondent highlighted the broad spectrum of possibilities that trilingual education afforded to them. It includes access to content in the English language which in turn raised their awareness of the world situation, having opportunities to study abroad and having exposure to other cultures. Trilingual education was a great opportunity for them to develop academically. Nonetheless, the data unveils that with the acquisition of Russian and English languages, respondents accordingly became more sensitized and conscious about their cultures. This enabled them to make cultural comparisons. All the respondents indicated the presence of comparison between different nations, their culture and mentality, and all of them summarized for themselves positive and negative aspects of the Kazakh culture. The respondents appreciated the distinction of the Kazakh nation specifically in personality

traits. However, every interviewee expressed their opinion on the outdated views of Kazakh people on many things in this modern world. Thus, it can be stated that the analysis of the qualitative data provided significant and somewhat contrasting insights into the participants' affiliation with the Kazakh ethnicity. Therefore, three main related themes were determined: "Trilingual education encourages being a global citizen", "Strong appreciation of the ethnical attributes" and "Labeling Kazakh traditions as conservative".

### ***Trilingual Education Encourages Being Global Person***

Relying on the analysis of the participants' responses, it can be stated that trilingual education has shaped students' personalities in positive ways. Most of the participants indicated that experience of studying through different mediums of instruction enables them to become "a global citizen" and remain knowledgeable about the innovations that are happening worldwide. Moreover, for the respondents in the period of globalization, it is essential to be able to communicate in other languages, except the national one. In this way, proficiency in several languages is an indicator of an individual's development. For instance, Sara emphasized the necessity of having language skills:

Extract 1:

I'm all for it, I totally agree with it. I think in the modern world of globalization, it is simply necessary that a person speaks not only in their native language and in Russian, but also in English. And, in general, it would be cool if a person could choose what language he should learn...When a person speaks several languages, he becomes more versatile and this is a movement forward. (December 29, 2021)

From this particular quote, it is apparent that the respondent fully supported trilingual education and the opportunity to acquire several languages, and expressed a desire to learn more. It can be stated that a linguistically knowledgeable person is competitive and the presence of several language repertoires allows a person to expand frontiers of mind and vision of the world. Another respondent, Almira, alongside being a global citizen due to

the trilingual education, indicated the change in her personality depending on what language she employs. Thus, she states:

Extract 2:

When a person speaks another language, his personality changes. In the same way, I am sure that my personality changed when I spoke Russian, or Kazakh, or English. And all this has somehow shaped me, not my national identity, but my identity of myself, who I am and who I definitely want to be. And due to the trilingual education, I am more aware and could feel myself as a real “global citizen”.

Relying on this excerpt from the interview, the strong impact of the language repertoire on a personality is emphasized and the supportive position of these changes is clearly visible. Taking into consideration Lanehart’s (1996) claim that an individual identifies itself with the language it speaks, it is seen from this participant’s point of view that her personality is defined by the language she employs. Similarly, her identity was shaped as a result of the usage of the Kazakh, Russian and English languages. Since these three languages formed her personality of herself, it is to be noted that language “is also a site in which identity is constructed” (Weedon, 1987, p. 21). This argument also shows that language should not be considered only as a tool for communication, but also as a locus of an individual’s identity formation. Furthermore, from the quote, Almira regarded studying through a trilingual education program as an opportunity to become a “global citizen” and this demonstrates her favourable attitude.

Similarly, another respondent, Nazerke also shows a positive view about trilingual education:

Extract 3:

I think this is the best opportunity because it helps us create our worldview and it helps us become global citizen. And I think it will have a good impact on our country. (December 27, 2020)

Cenoz (2013) emphasized that international languages promote a country’s economic and social prosperity. When people acquire languages other than their first language, this

contributes to the development of the human capital of the country. In extract 3, the respondent indicated the advantageous influence of trilingualism on the country, and, as in the case of Almira and Nazerke considered this as an opportunity to construct the vision of the world and herself as a “global citizen”. Alongside respondents’ ideas on the positive influence of studying through different mediums of instruction on their worldview and constructing global identity, another interviewee such Sara mentions that the studying of different languages provides an opportunity to feel the connection with the whole world:

Extract 4:

There is a certain comparison in the head and it is very interesting that we can look at the Kazakh culture from the outside, at the traditions, understand that one peoples have some traditions, and others do not. And just to look at it, probably to feel like such an English person, there. (December 29, 2020)

According to Sara, studying languages is accompanied by the introduction to a variety of cultures and this causes cultural comparison among students. Therefore, they started to compare cultural aspects in the communities speaking the three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English, and identified for themselves its negative and positive sides in terms of traditions, mentality and worldview. In the case of Sara, the study of different aspects of other cultures and further comparison enabled her to feel as a part of English people. In light of this argument, the notion of imagined identity can be linked. Due to learning languages and various cultures, the participant situated herself as an English person, developing an imagined identity with the acquisition of the English language. A similar idea of the integration to the world was revealed in the interview with Almira:

Extract 5:

It (studying languages) makes me feel unity with the whole world because I understand that somewhere in England or somewhere in Russia there is a person like me, who is also 16 years old and who is also trying to learn and understand something. And this, you know, gives you the feeling that you are not alone, that there are always people around you.



The given extracts suggest that languages are not only used for broadening minds or study development, but they can also invoke a conscious sense of connection with the outside world. In this case, the concept of imagined community arises here. As Norton (2003) defined, imagined community refers to “group of people, not immediately tangible and accessible, with whom we connect through the power of the imagination” (p. 8) and the latter quote reported that the respondent had imagined connection, for instance, with the English or Russian people. Therefore, when the individuals started to acquire the languages, they undoubtedly began to imagine a particular position in which they want to be and a certain group to which they want to adjust and where their language practices would be activated.

Additionally, another interviewee Almas indicated that trilingual education, specifically communication with international people, impacted students’ general vision of the world. According to him, studying only in Kazakh limited a person and his insights into many things, whereas trilingualism in turn allowed exploring the world from different perspectives and expanding one’s way of thinking and cultural capital. The respondent stated:

Extract 6:

While studying through three languages, we will be able to meet different representatives of these languages. For example, we have international teachers who work under a contract and, thus, teach us lessons in English, yes. By getting knowledge from them, I can get their attitude to people, their manner, and their mentality. In this way, I can learn, as I said before, I can increase my horizons, so I learn more about people and I think that trilingualism, specifically in our studying, will affect the fact that a student will be able to see the world from different sides, and understand as I understood myself... So they can understand that the Kazakh language makes a person conservative and... That is, trilingualism will influence the student to become more developed and open his eyes. (December 28, 2020)

Communication with those people whose first language is English and observation of such aspects as “attitude to people”, “manner” and “mentality” were the student’s investment to the enhancement of their language and identity. All these acquired attributes increase their

level of cultural capital in terms of broad horizon and vision of the world and acquired rich content in the target language.

Based on the above extracts from interviews, it can be argued that trilingual education has affected students' identities in terms of their worldview, and this led not to limit them having only the Kazakh identity, but to consider themselves as global citizens. This is due to studying through different languages which broadened their horizons and enhanced their vision of the world. Even though the respondents identified themselves as having a global identity rather than only Kazakh, they frequently emphasized particular qualities inherent in Kazakh people. Studying the languages undoubtedly implied learning other cultures which caused cultural comparison. As a result, the students demonstrated a strong appreciation of the national attributes and defined the Kazakh culture as distinct and unique.

#### ***Strong Appreciation of the Ethnic Attributes***

This current theme was derived from the analysis of interviews since all six respondents emphasized particular qualities common to the Kazakh nation. This showed their positive attitude to the specific traits of the Kazakh person and Kazakh ethnicity in general. These qualities that are highly appreciated by students about their nation are "hospitality", "friendliness", "solid family institute", "upbringing distinction", "empathy", "strong family ties" and "collectivism". Analysis of their answers allowed the researcher to see that even though there is a tendency among students to recognize themselves as a global people, however, they still attach considerable value to the nation's attributes and identify them as "the nation's distinction". Most of the respondents highlighted such traits as "collectivism", "empathy", "hospitality" to be an ethnic distinction when compared to other nations and cultures. For instance,

Extract 7:

I wanted to say that we are not only friendly, but that is instilled in our culture that you need to help another person. For example, I've never been to America, but in general, watching YouTube, and other things I noticed that there is no public help, you can't just speak to someone about something. It is not acceptable for us, Kazakhs. There is even such a tradition if one family is in trouble, then everyone in the village helps. (December 29, 2020)

Significant point here is Sara's identification of herself as a part of the Kazakh nation. This can be supported by her words as 'we are' or 'for us, Kazakhs' and she perceived herself to be that empathetic person along with all Kazakhs. Furthermore, the respondent compared two cultures –English and Kazakh – and summarized the difference between them.

According to Sara, Kazakh people were an intrinsically supportive nation and closely connected to each other. However, although her positive perception of this attribute was obvious, she also indicated the negative side of it:

Extract 8:

And it follows that it is always customary to help, but on the other hand, it is to some extent... especially now, people have crossed this threshold and in most cases, they cross the personal boundaries of an individual. (December 29, 2020)

Sara emphasized the possible negative consequence of this trait, and that in most cases Kazakh people forget about individual boundaries. From this quote, it is visible that the respondent considered both positive and negative aspects of the particular quality and showed an ambiguous attitude towards this. Additionally, the idea of the cohesiveness of the Kazakh nation and their willingness to support each other was suggested by another respondent. Almas pointed out collectivism as a national difference with the reference to the Soviet period:

Extract 9:

In my opinion, not only Kazakhs, but also citizens of post-Soviet countries are more loyal to friendship and they are more patriotic. And they care about each other; they can support at any time, also believe, easily believe and rely on a person. That is, I want to say that the Kazakh is a kind person who can faithfully communicate with you, interact, and since in Europe or the United States, that is... they have less humanity than Kazakhs. I mean, what we had after communism, it has a very good influence on society. (December 28, 2020)

This example is indicative of the cultural comparison, where the respondent tends to compare Western and Eastern cultures in terms of the type of society. Almas stated that the Kazakh society was based more on a collectivistic approach which is the legacy of the Soviet period, whereas, European or American people are more individualists. According to Kabayeva et al (2018) and Nezhina and Ibrayeva (2013), collectivistic approach predominates in Kazakhstani society in comparison with individualistic and this prevalence “best ensures a positive resolution of many social problems” (Kabayeva et al, 2018, p. 759). Accordingly, both Sara and Almas underlined this quality to be the distinction of the Kazakh people’s mentality. Thus, the two quotes presented above indicate that respondents acknowledged these qualities to be a national distinction when compared to the West cultures. However, in contrast to Sara, Almas used the word ‘they’ to refer to Kazakhs and considered it as a separate group. Moreover, this tendency of using ‘they’ could be observed throughout the interview with this respondent.

Empathy as a positive side of the Kazakh person was also emphasized by Almira in the following quote:

Extract 10:

The positive side of the Kazakh person is perhaps that it is customary not to leave your person. I think this is the very positive side that we all have and that even if something does not work out with relatives, even if someone very much disappointed you, most Kazakhs just continue to have a relationship with this person, because for us the blood connection is more important than what happened between us. (January 15, 2021)

Moreover, Almira highlighted that those Kazakh traditions to help each other “make Kazakh ties very strong”. In this quote, the significance of blood relationships within Kazakhs and their continuity were indicated by the participant. Moreover, these excerpts from Almira and Sara show that they both employed words such as ‘for us’ or ‘we’ to indicate her affiliation to the Kazakh nation. The respondents did not separate themselves from that group, but instead, they demonstrated that they are a part of it.

Another interviewee, Nazerke, conveyed her positive attitude towards being Kazakh. This quote demonstrates her strong sense of Kazakh identity, love and belonging to her nation. Besides, she specified that such qualities as ‘humanity’ and ‘hospitality’ constitute a national distinction.

Extract 11:

Being a Kazakh person, in my opinion, has many positive aspects. Since I am Kazakh myself, I love my nation. And the most pleasant thing about this nation is its humanity and hospitality. Due to these qualities, we can distinguish ourselves from other nations. And we always want to help each other. I like this quality of Kazakhs. (December 27, 2020)

Relying on the quotes, empathy, family ties, humanity and hospitality are the distinct features of every Kazakh person. Additionally, Madina demonstrated an appreciation of the cultural heritage, traditions and clothing indicating that she has a strong cultural identity. Even though the respondent acknowledged the weak position of the country and language throughout the world, she emphasized that foreign people were surprised by the national distinction of the Kazakh people. In this regard, Madina stated:

Extract 12:

Our language and our country are not the most popular in the world, but it is not surprising that when people come to our country, they always remain in shock. I have never heard someone to say something bad about our country. I believe it is due to our ancestors, our traditions, and our national clothing. People visit and become enthralled because we are truly different from other nations. So, Kazakhs are associated with friendliness and hospitability. They remain in shock about how many guests we can invite. I have never noticed that other countries also respect, met guests in the way we do. In addition, our clothing is not just colored, they are decorated with our national ornaments, which are now one of the wealth of our nation. (December 30, 2020)

From the above extract, the respondent’s pride and emotional attachment to the Kazakh nation and its culture are clearly evident. It is noteworthy that all students highlighted similar qualities of a Kazakh person and indicated them as a cultural distinction. In terms of the affiliation to the Kazakh nation, there are ambiguous results: only one individual

separated himself from Kazakh people, whereas a large number of respondents determined themselves to be a member of this ethnicity.

Another participant Malika stressed not only the hospitality of the Kazakhs, but she also highlighted their ability to explicitly convey all the thoughts, which is indeed a valuable trait according to her words:

Extract 12:

Well... Kazakhs are all very hospitable, open people who openly express their opinions. This is very good, because ... everyone likes the simplicity and truthfulness of people's words. Also, every Kazakh knows all his traditions. I think so because they define our past and help us move forward. (December 29, 2020)

She also pointed out the significance of the Kazakh traditions since they are part of history and indicated that this knowledge has a positive impact on development. Malika same as the previous respondent has a strong cultural identity. Hence, this theme was aimed at demonstrating interviewees' positive attitudes and appreciation of the definite Kazakh nation's attributes. However, due to the comparison of the cultures they observed, students underlined not only positive, but also negative aspects of traditions, mentality and vision of the world.

### ***Labeling Kazakh Traditions as Conservative***

Relying on Hofstede's (2001) national culture theory, there are two types of cultures: low and high uncertainty avoidance cultures. According to this theory, high uncertainty avoidance cultures refer to more conservative nations. Using this theory as a framework, Nezhina et al (2013) defined Kazakhstan as a high uncertainty avoidance culture in which people are incapable to take risks and alter their traditional way of living. Although all the respondents showed a respectful attitude towards Kazakh ethnic traits, most of the respondents consider some Kazakh traditions and ways of thinking to be conservative and outdated. One of the participants highlighted the issue of having generation conflict between old and modern mindsets. This is related to Kazakh elders who

used to impose various social norms and behaviors. Madina raised this challenge in the following way:

Extract 13:

The elder generation does not understand us when we talk about other countries. When we say that life elsewhere is different, they wonder why we say like this. Because with the development, our understandings have started to change. That mentality which has been developed for years, now youth argue against it, because, you know, they say “it is wrong”, “it will be a shame” or “do not do this”. And with the development, with our knowledge of other countries, with other mentalities, we involuntarily want to introduce this. We like the mentality, behavior, attitude to something in other countries and we really like it. That is exactly the weak point. In our country, there is no such thing. Or upbringing. There is a lot of pressure on us here and why? We want to understand it. In any case, we must not forget about our mentality, which was formed over the years, we cannot change it. (December 30, 2020)

This quote is a striking example of the presence of the conflict between the elderly and younger generation in terms of the mentality, vision of the world and ways of living. When the respondent learned other languages she developed her knowledge about other cultures and this contributed to her thinking. Moreover, Madina indicated that the Kazakh upbringing was traditionally determined by social norms. In other words, society imposes standardized rules of behavior which led the pressure over the younger generation and their confrontation. Nevertheless, the respondent emphasized the significance of that outdated mentality as it is part of the Kazakh nation and its history. Even though a conservatism of the mentality was recognized, Madina indicated an inability to transform it.

Additionally, Sara referred to the family pressure over a person's development. According to this student, a person who grew in a Kazakh family highly valued family bonds and this quality was described as a positive aspect. However, as an individual who appreciated native Kazakh education, Sara pointed out another side of this, “He still has such a limit in his head that he is not able to do anything against his family, he cannot completely choose himself, for example. The same thing, for example, a girl cannot go abroad, because she is forced to have a family.” The respondent reveals the possible

limitation of being raised in a Kazakh family in terms of self-realization and decision-making. In addition, the issue of gender inequality was raised whereby females were limited and society expected a particular behavior from them. The conservatism of Kazakh culture and noticeable gender discrimination were also emphasized by Almas:

Extract 14:

Most of the traditions of our culture are conservative, in relation to girls, so I actually feel that girls and men are not equal in our culture. Here... for me, the downside is their peculiarity that they are conservative. (December 28, 2020)

In this quote, it is apparent that the participant viewed negatively the cultural characteristics of the Kazakh nation considering them as conservative in relation to females. According to Khamzina et al (2020), although Kazakhstan is consistently addressing the reasons for gender inequality, there are still significant gaps: males and females are not equal as regards family, public life, employment and economic sphere. The issue of gender inequality was also underlined by another student, Almira:

Extract 15:

In most cases, Kazakh traditions are irrational, and even from a moral perspective, they are mainly wrong. Yes, we cannot judge traditions, but in general, they are mostly wrong, this is the first thing. Secondly, the whole Kazakh culture is built on the fact that we always and everywhere have to love and respect men more than women. This goes against equality. (January 15, 2021)

Accordingly, Almira strongly emphasized the apparent unequal relation to the woman in comparison with men. The Kazakh culture is developed in the way that it predominantly encourages males. This excerpt demonstrated the signs of weak cultural identity and her rejection of Kazakh traditions. Living according to the norms prescribed by the society and pressure from the environment were also taken into account by the respondent in the following quote:

Extract 16:

Mostly, adult Kazakh people have deeply erroneous beliefs about a lot of things that exist in the world...Kazakhs do not have such a thing as saying 'no', to refuse



to do what you do not want to do. Also, you know, there is no possibility of self-realization, probably. Because they say "Zhurt ne aitady? Korshiler ne aytady?" ("What will others say? What will neighbors say?"). (January, 2021)

This statement showed her negative attitude towards Kazakhs' dependence on the opinion of surrounding and in the general way of living. The weak position of girls, low opportunities to realize themselves, irrelevant Kazakh people's views and cultural traits caused weakening of cultural identity. She also stated, "A culture that discriminates a person based on its age, gender, I do not believe that this culture can be considered correct at all or further considered." The respondent critically viewed the culture.

The majority of the respondents pointed out conservative views of Kazakh people and gender inequality in the Kazakhstani society. As it was stated previously, when participants acquire different languages, they observe other cultures and worldviews, which in turn deeply influences their way of thinking. According to this case, Almas expressed the following idea:

Extract 17:

For example, we have international teachers who work under a contract and, thus, teach us lessons in English, yes. By getting knowledge from them, I can get their attitude to people, their manner, their mentality. (December 28, 2020)

Trilingual education implies interaction with people whose first language is not Kazakh and consequently, students, as in the case of Almas or Madina (extract 13), adopted their vision of the world and way of thinking.

Almas indicated that a Kazakh is the one who "will spread the positive aspects of our traditions, that is, our culture's positive aspects". However, he did not define himself to be such a person, but because of the society and environment that imposes particular behavior, he had to pretend and adhere to these social norms.

Thus, this current theme covered critical perception of some aspects of the Kazakh culture which was the result of the acquaintance with various cultures and observation of

their vision of the world, mentality and way of thinking. As results suggest, the following points were taken into consideration by the respondents as irrelevant: compliance with the norms and rules established by the surrounding, the presence of social pressure and unequal relations between females and males and confrontation of the old and modern mindset.

To sum up, the analysis of quantitative data employing Spearman rho's coefficient and independent samples t-test, helped the researcher to review the relationship between a student's grade and its Kazakh identity, and the correlation between students' language proficiency in Kazakh, Russian and English languages and their Kazakh identity. The quantitative findings suggested that studying at trilingual education strengthens the students' Kazakh national identities, whereas, proficiency in languages and the strength of national identity do not correlate. The analysis of the qualitative data led to the emergence of three major themes: "trilingual education encourages being a global citizen", "strong appreciation of the ethnical attributes" and "labeling Kazakh traditions as conservative". Trilingual education's overall influence was prominent in students' visions of the world and cross-cultural comparison which caused both positive and critical attitudes towards certain cultural aspects.

### **Research Question 2. How do Studying in Russian and English as the Mediums of Instruction Affect Students' Identities over Time?**

This part of the chapter presents the quantitative and qualitative results to show the impact of trilingual education on students' national identities. Firstly, the overview of the analysis of the survey responses is presented following with the themes derived from the study of the interviews. Relying on the quantitative results indicated above, the independent samples t-test showed that a year of studying at NIS strengthens students' national identities. The analysis revealed that the scores of respondents from 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup>

grades on the items of national identity differ which shows the positive influence of trilingual education on strengthening students' national identity. Furthermore, the quantitative findings suggested that the proficiency in the three languages and national identity do not correlate with each other. This means that the students' proficiency in Kazakh, Russian and English do not define the strength of their national identities.

Additionally, a Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient was computed to assess the relationship between the students' national identities and their attitude towards the national language (Table 6). There was a strong positive correlation between the two variables ( $r=.59$ ,  $n=60$ ,  $p<.001$ ) which states that the stronger was students' national identities, the more positive was their attitude towards the national language.

**Table 6**

*Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient. National Identity and National Language Attitude*

		National language	
		National identity	attitude
National identity	Pearson Correlation	1	.591**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.000
	<i>N</i>	60	60
National language attitude	Pearson Correlation	.591**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	<i>N</i>	60	60

\*\**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).*

The quantitative findings provided an overview of the relationship between grade, national identity and perception of the national language, and the qualitative findings addressed the content of students' national identities. The qualitative part of the study

introduced positive results in relation to students' national identity. Most of the respondents – Malika, Madina and Sara from 12<sup>th</sup> and Nazerke from 11<sup>th</sup> grade – were confident about their Kazakh national identities, whereas the analysis of the interviews of Almas and Almira from 11<sup>th</sup> grade revealed some signs of weakened national identities in comparison with the former group. Smith (1991) pointed out the ethnic conceptualization of national identity encompasses national language, generational ties, and culture. Thus, the investigation of the content of national identity showed that respondents seemingly adhered to the ethnic components of Kazakh national identity. Five of the students were attached to the history of their country as part of their ethnical roots and all of them were closely connected to the customs and traditions of their nation. Traditions were considered by the respondents as an opportunity to unite people and reinforce the bonds of families and some of the respondents were emotionally attached to this cultural aspect as it reminded them of their childhood.

Although the students were closely connected to the cultural and ethnic components of their nation, they noticed changes that trilingual education led to. There are many aspects language learning affected: a vision of the world, perception of customs and traditions, mentality and future prospects. These changes resulted in that the signs of weakening national identity occurred. Some of the respondents demonstrated sympathy to the Western cultures and one student indicated the desire to leave the country. Nevertheless, most of the students strengthened their national identities as compared to the ones that were before admission to the trilingual school. Therefore, these results entailed the formation of one major theme - “strong national identity”.

### ***Strong National Identity***

The aim of this part is to provide the findings that indicate the signs of students' strong national identity. The strength of their Kazakh identities was recognized by their

strong attachment to the culture, knowledge and respect for the history, empathetic attitude to the future of their nation and desire to contribute to the prosperity of the country as its citizen. The analysis of interviews enabled the researcher to reveal the negative position of some of the respondents to the weakening of other students' national identities and their desire to emulate the West. Moreover, the positive influence of a strong school's national policy was indicated by half of the participants, and this supports Baker's (1992) idea that a school's promotion of prioritization and value of a particular language and its culture results in a corresponding language attitude. Malika, one of the students, stated:

Extract 18:

Well, it seems to me that with the admission to NIS, I learned my culture, my nation more. Because when I was studying at another school, we did not learn so much about our Kazakhstan, however, when we came here. We have a lot of different events in our school, not only in Kazakh, but also in Russian and English. We enrich our knowledge about our ethnicity, do different projects. For example, the subject Kazakhstan in the Modern World helps us understand more about different areas of our country and allows us to think more politically, and it gives us the opportunity to learn more about our country. (December 29, 2020)

In this quote, it is obvious that the school policy and the subjects proposed enhanced Malika's Kazakh national identity. Students were not only exposed to studying in three languages, but they were simultaneously encouraged to observe the Kazakh culture through a variety of events and this policy was found to be effective. Students were offered opportunities to develop their linguistic repertoires and their knowledge in three languages and revive their Kazakh national identities. Another respondent who indicated the huge role of the school's national policy is Sara. She shared her own experience of identity formation in the following quote:

Extract 19:

I really like the fact that our school has a lot of projects that develop the Kazakh identity. A lot of circles are dedicated to traditions. And at every concert there is always a Kazakh dance, there is always a Kazakh song and there is an orchestra that plays Kazakh kui. I understand that every day I cannot constantly spend 20 minutes reading Kazakh literature, because a priori I do not have time, for example,

to do a task in English. But, when you constantly hear... even during the break, we hear kui Akku and you remind yourself that you are, yes, a Kazakh, yes, for example, a slightly different culture from Russia, let's say, and this so slightly reinforces your patriotism, probably. (December 29, 2020)

Relying on the results of interview analysis, this respondent was determined as a person with a weakened national identity and from this quote, prioritization of English for study can be seen. However, even though she did not dedicate time to Kazakh, the school's extracurricular circles and events slightly evoked her Kazakh identity and reminded her about the ethnic roots. These two excerpts showed the school policy in regards to the proficiency in several languages and revival of national identity. In line with the positive influence of the school's national policy on her identity, Malika indicated that trilingual education also reinforces her Kazakh identity. This can be noticed in this quote:

Extract 20:

I think... since I grew up in a real Kazakh family, I can say that I am such a person with a strong national identity, because... some people probably think that since I study three languages, I am more westernized, but no, on the contrary, these languages help me to learn more and tell others about my culture. And this is not an obstacle to knowing the whole history, all the traditions of my nation. (December 29, 2020)

In the case of Malika, being grown up in a Kazakh family, she preserved and strengthened her national identity and viewed languages learned as the tools to not only develop but also to spread knowledge about the culture. Thus, this respondent can be characterized as a person with a strong ethnic identity that values ethnic roots and cultural aspect of the nation. Same as Malika, Nazerke expressed the position that trilingual education did not weaken one's national identity:

Extract 21:

I believe that after trilingual education, we change our view of the world, but still, we are Kazakhs, we should not forget the traditions and customs of our nation. We must preserve the culture. So, yes, I can say that I am sure about my Kazakh identity. (December 27, 2020)

The respondent acknowledges the influence of the trilingual educational program on their mindsets with the preservation of their Kazakh national identities. These interviewees show that studying through different mediums of instruction was not an ‘obstacle’ to be acquainted with the history and culture of own nation. On the contrary, they used this possibility to develop their knowledge about the world and their way of thinking and at the same time to enhance their national identity. Furthermore, Sara stressed that nowadays people, who were learning languages, unconsciously strived to maintain their national identities due to the active national policies undertaken by the Government. Thus, she stated, “And even I, being such a modern person. I'm 17 years old. If I had lived a little earlier in 2010, I think I would have thrown myself into Western culture. I would stand with tattoos, for example.” The respondent pointed out the significance of the period of the introduction of the English language as at the beginning of this process, she could lose her Kazakh identity. However, since national projects have been implemented and due to the school policy, she was reminding herself about her roots and striving to preserve her national identity. As the following quote shows:

Extract 22:

And now I study, for example, in English, I read in Russian, I always try to tell myself that you cannot forget your roots, you cannot forget your language, because a priori "blood's thicker than water" and I can't break away from myself. And, probably, most of my qualities are embedded in my culture, in my national identity. I can't give it up. I noticed just the same in my surrounding, I noticed that most people try to preserve it somehow go deeper into the Kazakh culture, to preserve, to know something. I think it's... everyone understands the importance of all this. It is very fashionable to say, “I don't need this”, “I don't need the Kazakh language”, but deep down we still can't keep away from it. And everyone understands that.  
(December 29, 2020)

Relying on this respondent's interview and its analysis, although she primarily showed her sympathy to the West, she understood the significance of her roots and culture. As Smith (1991) indicated that ethnic model of national identity is mainly focused on birth, but Sara also stressed a substantial role of ‘blood’ connection. Therefore, students, according to

Sara's views, made an effort to preserve their national identities and elaborate their knowledge about their nation. Even though students claimed the insignificance of these ethnical aspects, they eventually recognized the indivisible connection with the roots.

The strength of their national identities was also visible through the respondents' attitude towards some Kazakh traditions and history. All of the respondents indicated the substantial role of national holidays and traditions in their lives. Each of the holidays or traditions carried a certain value. For instance, Nazerke expressed her opinion about Kazakh culture:

Extract 23:

I think that the Kazakh nation is one of those nations that pay great attention to traditions and customs. Therefore, in my opinion, the Kazakh people are very peculiar in comparison with other nations. Because they still preserve their culture, and I think that they have a very deep history than other peoples. (December 27, 2020)

This shows her appreciation of the Kazakh nation, its culture and history. Additionally, the respondent indicated that each tradition had a meaningful role in her life. Another respondent, Madina, indicated the importance of Nauryz which demonstrates the Kazakh people's customs, traditional foods and national clothing. Thus, through the celebration of this holiday, people showed their sense of patriotism. Whereas for Madina the celebration of the traditional holiday was closely linked with patriotism, for other national traditions and holidays were connected with the feeling of unity and reminded their 'carefree childhood'. For instance, Almas stated, "Specifically unity in Kazakh traditions is important for me." Most of the traditions and customs of Kazakh culture led to the cohesion of the Kazakh people where everyone supported each other.

Respondents were not only emotionally involved with the culture of the Kazakh nation, but they also demonstrated their appreciation and respectful attitude to the particular historical periods of Kazakh people. The protests in Alma-Ata during



“Jeltoksan” (“December”) of 1986 were defined as the most significant in Kazakh history as this period resulted in Kazakh people’s independence from USSR. For instance, Almira indicated:

Extract 24:

I would call the most important event - the event of December 16, because I think this is that moment when the Kazakh people, or rather the Kazakh tili Arystary, took their fate, their nation in their own hands and said “no to everything” and, I am sure that at that time they were saying ‘no’ not only to the USSR, but in general they were saying ‘no’ to everything bad. And I think that was the most important moment. (January 15, 2021)

In this quote, this period was highlighted to be an important one since the Kazakh nation liberated themselves and gained independence. Sara expressed her own opinion about this period in these words:

Extract 25:

Well, I think here the very first thing I want to mention is the formation of the Kazakh Khanate when it happened in 1456. When the Kazakh people received the first title of the Kazakh khanate, which was maintained until the unification with Russia. And I also want to note the period of the 20th century, when the Kazakh intelligentsia fought for the rights of the Kazakhs. Most importantly, the first newspaper in the Kazakh language appeared, where there was propaganda like now, for example, Rukhani Zhangyru, all this, it has started at that time. In fact, the Kazakh intelligentsia was born much earlier than they should have, because all the laws that they adopted for the Alash Horde are still relevant at the moment. I mean, they’re great people, and I admire them. (December 29, 2020)

From extracts 24 and 25, the civic position of the interviewees may be identified, as they share their empathetic attitude towards the historical past regarding the territorial and political regulations. They indicated that the Kazakh intelligentsia formed a substantial foundation of regulations for the development of the independent country, and which were still relevant today. Moreover, they showed appreciation of the intelligentsia since they were great people who freed the Kazakh people and promoted the development of the Kazakh language. Additionally, the idea of the relevance of regulations of that period was stated by Malika in the following quote:

Extract 25:

I think the turning point was the formation of the party. The Turkestan Party and the Alash Party, when... our Kazakh intelligentsia represented by Alikhan Bokeikhanov, Saken Seifullin and Akhmet Baitursynov offered the ways of...the development of the Kazakh culture, the Kazakh people and, reading all these ideas, we can say that they are still relevant today. I think it was a turning point in our country, when people began to understand what the real situation of the Kazakhs is. The Kazakh intelligentsia tried... to give us independence, allow us to flourish as a Kazakh people. (December 29, 2020)

Thus, relying on students' responses, this period was found to be essential in the formation of the country. This excerpt demonstrates students' concerns about the fate of their country and their civic identities. Nazerke also expressed her negative attitude towards the joining of the Kazakh Khanate to Russia which eventually led to the russification of the Kazakh people. This period was the main reason for the change in Kazakh identity. As respondents say, if Kazakhs were able to protect themselves, everyone would now have preserved their national identities. These options show their concerns and consciousness about the russification of Kazakhstan.

According to the interviews, students not only showed their interest in the historical past of the country, but they also demonstrated their desire to use the knowledge gained due to the trilingual education program to contribute to the development of the country. Trilingual education enhanced their vision of the world and their way of thinking, kept them informed about the world news and situation, broaden their horizons and improved their linguistic skills. In other words, the competitive human capital of the country was developing and students expressed the desire to employ the acquired knowledge and skills for the development of the nation. For instance, Madina said, "I believe our mission is that we must do everything to make our country known, well, if we talk about the country, there is also the language, our traditions, and so on." The respondent stated that the mission of the younger generation was to be responsible for ensuring that the country would be well-known throughout the world and people would use English and Russian for spreading

knowledge about the Kazakh culture and language. Additionally, the respondent indicated the necessity of enhancing the Kazakh mentality, but not changing it. Thus, the students emphasized the enormous potential of trilingual education to introduce improvements and rather than to serve as a tool to change the national identity and country. Moreover, another respondent stressed, “Trilingual education has a good impact, for example, students often go abroad and strive to improve Kazakhstan with the help of this acquired knowledge.” Here, Nazerke emphasized another way of the development of the country, if the acquired knowledge is adequately used by the younger generation.

As the analysis showed, students primarily maintained strong national identities. However, there were some respondents who showed signs of weakening identities. For example, one of the respondents shared his desire to leave the country and almost all of the students had a critical perception of some aspects of the Kazakh culture. The respondents, primarily, maintained their national identities, but in some cases, they altered their attitudes towards particular beliefs and norms and demonstrated their negative attitude towards some customs, traditions and Kazakh mentality. The results revealed that there was no fixed or consistent identity, but rather as Norton et al (2011) considered, individuals were presented as “diverse”, “contradictory” and “dynamic” that were transforming over time (p. 417) due to the outside factors. Hence, the outside factors were the knowledge they absorbed and languages acquired, or, in general, the cultural capital which played an immense role in identity formation processes.

To sum up, this theme covered the analysis of the excerpts that demonstrated the strength of students’ Kazakh national identities. The immense role of the school’s national policy has been identified. Some of the respondents were experiencing a weakening of their national identities. However, students were reminding themselves of their ethnical roots and expanding their cultural knowledge due to the school’s national policy. In

addition, the strength of Kazakh identities was defined through their interest in history and their pride for the great people of Kazakhstan and the respect for particular traditions. Moreover, the thematic analysis revealed students' concern about the future of the country and willingness to contribute to its prosperity. The respondents preserved and enhanced their national identities changing their attitudes only towards some cultural aspects as customs and traditions and mentality. In other words, their perception of the world transformed without losing their sense of national identities.

### **Research Question 3. How does Studying in Russian and English as the Mediums of Instruction Affect Students' Attitude towards the Kazakh Language?**

The findings presented below are aimed at providing an answer on the influence of Russian and English as the MOI on students' attitude towards the Kazakh language.

Firstly, the results from the quantitative data analysis are presented following the qualitative findings. The quantitative data was derived as a result of the application of an independent samples t-test and Spearman rho's correlation coefficient. The former was conducted to view the relationship between a year of studying and attitude towards national language, whereas the latter was employed to examine the correlation of the students' attitudes towards the national language with the Kazakh language proficiency and the proficiency in three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English. To conduct this analysis, the total score of the responses to all the items on national language was computed via SPSS.

With the help of the independent-samples test, the possible difference in the attitude towards the national language between 11<sup>th</sup> ( $M = 18.4, SD = 0.54$ ) and 12<sup>th</sup> ( $M = 19.03, SD = 0.49$ ) grades' students was analyzed. According to the results, there are no differences in language attitude between the two groups of respondents, since  $p$  value is not statistically significant ( $p = .26$ ). Consequently, this quantitative data presented in table

8 indicated that attitudes of students from 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades do not differ in relation to national language.

**Table 7**

*Independent Samples T-Test. A Year of Studying and National Language*

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		t-test for Equality of Means						
		<i>F</i>	<i>Sig.</i>	<i>T</i>	<i>Df</i>	<i>Sig.</i> (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference	
									Lower	Upper
National language attitude	Equal variances assumed	1.322	.255	-.863	58	.391	-.63333	.73357	2.10173	-.83506
	Equal variances not assumed			-.863	57.440	.392	-.63333	.73357	2.10203	-.83537

Moreover, a Spearman rho’s correlation coefficient was computed to assess the relationship between students’ Kazakh language proficiency and national language attitude items (Table 8). There was a moderate positive correlation between the two variables ( $r = .31, n = 60, p = .015$ ). Overall, this means that the higher the students’ proficiency level in the Kazakh language, the more positive and stronger were their attitude towards Kazakh.

**Table 8**

*Spearman’s rho Correlation Coefficient. National Language Items and Kazakh Language Proficiency*

		Kazakh language proficiency	National language
Spearman's rho	Kazakh language	Correlation Coefficient	1.000
			.312*

proficiency	Sig. (2-tailed)	.	.015
	<i>N</i>	60	60
National	Correlation	.312*	1.000
language	Coefficient		
attitude	Sig. (2-tailed)	.015	.
	<i>N</i>	60	60

\*. *Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).*

Together with the level of the Kazakh language proficiency, a Spearman rho's correlation coefficient was calculated to evaluate the relationship between students' overall language proficiency in three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English, and national language attitude items. According to the table 10, it is revealed that there was modest positive correlation between the two variables ( $r = .27, n = 60, p = .037$ ). These numbers are indicators of the present correlation between language proficiency in three languages and attitude towards national language. Overall, this means that with the level of proficiency in three languages becoming higher, students' positive attitude towards the national language increased.

### Table 9

*Spearman's rho Correlation Coefficient. National Language Items and Overall Language Proficiency*

			Overall language proficiency	National language
Spearman's rho	Overall language proficiency	Correlation Coefficient	1.000	.269*
		Sig. (2-tailed)	.	.037
		<i>N</i>	60	60
	National language	Correlation Coefficient	.269*	1.000

Sig. (2-tailed)	.037	.
<i>N</i>	60	60

---

\*. *Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).*

Thus, the scores for students from 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades did not differ, which indicated that students' years of schooling did not impact their attitude towards the national language. However, there was a positive correlation between language proficiency and the attitude towards the national language. Hence, the quantitative analysis disclosed that the higher the proficiency in the three languages, the higher their attitude towards the national language. Ultimately, it was revealed that there was a positive relationship between the proficiency in three languages trilingual education and students' view of the national language.

Generally, because proficiency in several languages provides wider opportunities, all of the six respondents emphasized the necessity of several languages in their linguistic repertoire. However, it was revealed that some of the students were experiencing bilingual practices. For most participants, Kazakh became colloquial language which they utilized to communicate at home. Moreover, since students were focused on their current studies and future education, they were primarily prioritizing Russian and English. This was attributable mainly to the greater resources and study materials in Russian and English. Therefore, students were targeted at enhancing their skills in these two tongues.

On the other hand, the respondents indicated the significance of Kazakh as a part of their identity and main link with family. Also, students showed their regret for the Kazakh language that was pushed into the background and highlighted that these three languages complemented each other. In other words, they stressed the possible co-existence and continuity of the Kazakh, Russian and English languages. In this context, thematic analysis led to the formation of such a major theme as 'language preferences'.

### *Language Preferences*

It was observed that students prioritized the Russian and English languages for their current and future lives, using Kazakh only at home. This was mainly explained by the fact that the resources in Russian or English are more comprehensive and these languages hold higher economic, cultural and social capital than Kazakh (Bourdieu, 1986; Darvin & Norton, 2015). For instance, Sara stated:

Extract 30:

Most importantly, there is a lot of information in the English Internet space and at the moment, I have access to many foreign informational portals. For example, the Cambridge library, I can easily read some books on biology, chemistry and understand them normally. I know that there is no such thing in the Kazakh Internet space at all. There is a little content that can be found in the Kazakh language and, accordingly, it will be difficult for a person who knows only the Kazakh language to find information on the Internet. Studying is in the first place for me now and it is much easier to find information on a topic in Russian and English than in Kazakh. (December 29, 2020)

In this excerpt, the respondent demonstrated the prevalence of Russian and English in her education because of the resource constraints in the Kazakh language. She emphasized that English is becoming the world language and this led to the decision that she prioritized English for her future profession. Moreover, sympathy for English and the West was seen throughout the interview since she emphasized the practicality of educational methods in this tongue. She stated, “This is due to people who live in Western countries, in European countries,” conveying her positive attitude to the language and countries. Another respondent that indicated the same idea was Almira. According to her, these languages can be used also during the lesson of the Kazakh language:

Extract 31:

There are very few useful resources in the Kazakh language, so it mostly interferes with learning. And when there are additional languages and they can be used during the lessons, it means that you, first, practice them. Secondly, you can use all these resources and use these languages to explain what you think during the Kazakh lesson. (January 15, 2021)



Here insufficiency of educational materials in Kazakh caused switching to Russian and English during lessons. Additionally, the student highlighted the significance of Russian over Kazakh and the difficulty of the latter and this caused the feeling that Kazakh became her second language. Although her surrounding mainly used Kazakh, she experienced a language shift due to the lack of the resources and complexity of the language. Almira chose Russian and English to be the key languages in her future and stated, “At the moment, the Kazakh language is very important for me in terms of the fact that I will pass the MESK exam next year, but in general, there are no such plans for the Kazakh language.” Hence, the role of Kazakh was weakened with the introduction of Russian and English in her linguistic repertoire. Also, Sara expressed the regret for the Kazakh language being colloquial, since they used this language only at home:

Extract 32:

The Kazakh language is my native language and the main connection with this language is my family and friends. You know, most of my surrounding is people who have been speaking two languages since childhood. And we don't even notice when we switch to Kazakh or Russian. And it is very sad that now in fact English and Russian predominate and the Kazakh language has become such a domestic language. (December 29, 2020)

A similar trend was observed here: Russian and English languages dominate whereas Kazakh stays as a colloquial language. Also, Sara, same as Almira, emphasized the difficulty of the literary Kazakh language. Almas, another respondent who also maintain the same view:

Extract 33:

I realized that the Kazakh language is not needed over time. Until the 8th grade, I thought that knowledge of the Kazakh language is very good and always getting 100% in the history of Kazakhstan and the Kazakh language is cool. I was a fan of the Kazakh language; I thought it was very good that I should devote all my time, all my efforts to the Kazakh language and the history of Kazakhstan. But over time, I realized that I was behind in subjects like English. I realized that the Kazakh language should have remained in the background. Since I know the Kazakh language, I will not need Kazakh anywhere, since the Kazakh language is relevant only in Kazakhstan. But for a Russian, even a Belarusian citizen, this is not

necessary, since for them it is not relevant. I think that the Kazakh language has no prospects in the future. (December 28, 2020)

Almas does not seem to have lost his language skills in Kazakh, but he changed his attitude. Moreover, he said, “I think, like all students who study here, I put the English language in the first place.” Besides, the respondent expressed the desire not to stay in the country and the language would accordingly be used to introduce other ethnicities to the culture of Kazakh people. In the interview responses, there was a tendency that students referred having proficiency in several languages to being educated. Thus, one of the respondents stated the following:

Extract 34:

I have such an association that knowledge of only one Kazakh language is lack of education in Kazakhstan. In Kazakhstan, it is considered that the knowledge of three languages is education and higher intelligence. Even if I can't actually justify all this, I can just show all the people who know only Kazakh and those people who know at least Russian. They really differ in their intelligence and mentality. (December 28, 2020)

Proficiency only Kazakh was accepted as the indicator of lack of education and ignorance. As Terlikbayeva et al (2021) pointed out that Russian and English are considered to be more applicable for human development by the Kazakhstani policy-makers, or in other words, they primarily support bilingualism and multilingualism. Moreover, the language shift and prioritization of Russian and English is explained by the point that Kazakh is less prestigious and “not associated with social success” (Terlikbayeva et al, 2021, p. 1). Taken together, the Russian and English languages are considered as symbols of prestige as students assigned a higher value to them since they provided broader possibilities through the means of education and job prospects. For this reason, Kazakh was replaced since they had proficiency in it and utilized it only for communication with family.

To sum up, although quantitative findings suggested the positive correlation between language proficiency and national language attitude, the qualitative findings

demonstrated that the high language proficiency of some students in Kazakh did not define their attitude towards this language. Moreover, the analysis of qualitative findings disclosed the enormous influence of Russian and English languages on the position of Kazakh. Generally, students expressed their willingness to employ the national language more and contribute to its development; however, they dedicated most of their time to Russian and English considering them important for their future. Besides, trilingual education has resulted in bilingual practices of students where they used one language to complement another during speaking activities.

### **Conclusion**

Based on data from the questionnaire survey and interviews, the study concludes that linguistic proficiency in Kazakh, Russian and English positively influenced the national identities and strengthened attitudes towards the national language. An extra year of studying through the three languages as the mediums of instruction had an impact on students' affiliation with Kazakh ethnicity and their national identities, whereas there was no relationship between the former variable and respondents' perception of the Kazakh language. Overall, students preserved their national identities and closely connected to their ethnicity as it was part of their origin and identity. However, there was a visible impact of trilingual education on these components as students' identities and perception of language and culture were affected. The experience transformed their way of thinking, vision of the world, mentality and future prospects.

## **Chapter 5: Discussion**

The previous chapter presented the findings of the research. The quantitative data was obtained via survey and the qualitative data from semi-structured interviews with students who study through a trilingual educational program. This chapter discusses the results of the study drawing on relevant literature and theoretical framework. The purpose of this research was to study how trilingual education shapes students' identities and their perception of a national language. Therefore, the following research questions were framed to achieve the aims of the study:

1. What changes do students see in their affiliation with the Kazakh ethnicity?
2. How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' identities over time?
3. How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' attitude towards the Kazakh language?

This section is structured in accordance with the major themes of each research question.

### **Language and Awareness of Global Culture**

The first research question sought to study the changes students experienced in their ethnic affiliation over the course of their study in the trilingual education system. The findings suggested that students developed knowledge about the world through the Russian and English languages. They thought of themselves as global citizens and indicated that languages enabled them to feel an affinity with the other parts of the world. These results resonate with the model of global citizenship according to which being globally aware is an antecedent of identifying itself with global citizens, and obtaining knowledge about international affairs and feeling connected with others pave the way towards affiliation with a global community (Reysen & Katzarska-Miller, 2013). The research showed that

course content in Russian and English facilitated them to develop an awareness of the political or social condition worldwide which further developed students' global identities.

The study also suggests that due to the communication with international people and acquaintance with other cultures, students began to adopt some aspects of their attitudes towards many things and general vision of the world. The same results were revealed in the study by Lenkaitis et al (2019) who determined that students' virtual communication with peers living in other countries enhanced their knowledge and informed them about the world's condition and changes. Lenkaitis et al (2019) concluded that "increased global awareness can lead to the emergence of global identity among foreign language learners" (p. 9). The findings from the analysis of the interview data coincide with the conclusion made by Lenkaitis et al (2019) since students at NIS communicate with international teachers and develop their global awareness and 'interconnectedness with others' (Reyssen et al, 2013, p. 869; Tsui & Ngo, 2016).

Moreover, these results also resonate with the findings of a study conducted by Hamid and Jahan (2015) where the writers who obtained education in English as the MOI defined themselves as global citizens, holding cosmopolitan views. The same may be witnessed here that the students showed a global orientation through the means of westernized thinking, the English language proficiency, "global consciousness, and willingness to engage with their imagined communities" (Hamid & Jahan, 2015, p. 18; Jahan & Hamid, 2019). All of the respondents aimed to enter international universities where the target language would be employed and as Pavlenko and Norton (2007), Norton and Toohey (2011) and Norton (2013) pointed out that these imagined communities provide various identity options that they start to reconsider their self-perception. Additionally, the results of the current study are reflected in the research conducted by the same authors Jahan and Hamid (2019), where English as the MOI contributes to the

construction of students' elite global identity-forming their 'cosmopolitan values and belonging' (p. 404).

Languages enabled students to learn about other cultures and this led them to make a cultural comparison. The respondents identified positive sides of the Kazakh culture; however, they were critical regarding some aspects of it and confused about the outdated thinking, conservatism of some customs and traditions and demonstrated their positive perception of western thinking. Therefore, these findings support Qu's (2005) point that when identity transformation includes a second language, it represents a conflict between two cultures and sets of views.

Hence, trilingual education had a substantial role in the formation of students' global identities. Since students' perception of the world and attitude towards many things have changed, it can be concluded that identity is not a fixed phenomenon, but rather "dynamic" and "changing" (Norton & Toohey, 2011, p. 417) and "site of struggle" (Norton, 2013, p. 164) and language takes an immensely important part in students' reconstruction of the sense of who they are and how they relate to the society.

### **Trilingual Education as a Way to Strengthen Students' National Identities**

The second research question was aimed at identifying the relationship between trilingual education and national identity. As the quantitative findings suggest, the more students experienced studying through the trilingual education program, the stronger their national identities stood. This can be explained by the findings derived from the qualitative data. These results revealed that the school's national policy fostered a sense of national ownership through different projects and events dedicated to the Kazakh culture and language. These efforts enriched students' knowledge about the Kazakh culture. One of the respondents shared her experience that hearing traditional music and dance she was unconsciously reminding herself about her roots and this strengthened her ethnic identity.

The current study confirms the findings of a study on the usage of the school curriculum as a way to shape national identity in Czechoslovak (Dobrocka et al, 2018). Songs were utilized as a means to strengthen students' national identities and a sense of affiliation to the Slovak nation. Relying on the four respondents' words, NIS maintains an active national policy. This is achieved through the means of subjects as Kazakhstan in the modern world, cultural and language projects, traditional events, emphasis on traditional holidays and dance, or usage of Kazakh traditional song as a ring at school.

Another crucial finding is that one of the students highlighted the significance of the period and context in the national identity formation process. According to this participant, if trilingual education was implemented in the early 2000 and she studied at that time through it, she would probably be involved in Western culture. However, nowadays due to the national policy of the country, she strives to preserve her national identity. This supports the results of the mixed-method research conducted by Sharipova (2019) where the number of respondents who indicated that they are "very proud" of their Kazakh identity has grown over time. This may be attributed to enhanced quality of life, "the state rhetoric promoting a positive image of the country" (Sharipova, 2019, p. 5) and the positive influence of national policy.

Furthermore, the results of the study suggest that both ethnic and civic components are revealed in students' national identities. However, as Laruelle (2019) indicated elements of ethnic identity are more prevalent and prominent in comparison with civic or Kazakhstani identity. Students demonstrated the strength of their civic national identity through their beliefs in the prosperity of the country (Laruelle, 2019; Sharipova, 2019), the desire to contribute to the development of the country (Sharipova, 2019), its culture and language. Generally, students predominantly showed the strength of their national identities especially ethnic conceptualization of it. This includes the appreciation of ethnic

roots and blood, common history, and culture (Smith, 1991; Brubaker, 1994). Students shared their critical views about some aspects of the Kazakh customs, traditions and mentality. As a result of observing other cultures, students adopted other nations' views since the Kazakh's ways of thinking were considered as 'conservative' by four of them. As Early and Norton (2012) highlighted the notion of investment, new knowledge and resources in Russian and English that students acquire increase "the value of their cultural capital and social power" (p. 198). This development of their cultural capital enabled students to "reassess their senses of themselves and their desires for futures" (Norton & Toohey, 2011, p. 420; Belhiah & Al-hussien, 2016). Language learners are taken into consideration as individuals with 'complex identities' that transform over time. This confirms the close link between investment and identity and the fluid nature of the latter.

Thus, it can be concluded that as poststructuralist theory suggests, students presented themselves as "dynamic and changing over time and social space" (Norton & Toohey, 2011, p. 417; Norton, 2013) and language is not just a linguistic tool, but also "a social practice in which meanings are debated and identities negotiated" (De Costa, 2016, p. 589). Students' identities are shaped in relation to such factors as languages and school policy and as it is seen from the analysis, languages play a substantial role in the identity formation process.

### **Preference for Russian and English Languages**

The third research question concentrated on determining the influence of studying through three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English, on students' views about their national language. Findings suggest that there is a positive correlation between students' proficiency in three languages and the attitude towards the national language. This indicates that the higher their proficiency in the Kazakh, Russian and English languages, the more positive their attitude towards the Kazakh. Although the qualitative results



revealed that students have a high proficiency in the latter, two of them indicated that they encounter difficulties in the use of literary language. Five of the respondents highlighted that Kazakh has become a ‘colloquial language’ and they use it only at home with their family, and one of them indicated that with the entry to NIS, she started to use Russian words in her Kazakh speech. Students also shared their willingness to contribute to the enhancement of the role of the Kazakh language and read Kazakh literature. However, since they are focused on their studies and aim at education in high-quality universities in the future, therefore they attach more importance to the Russian and English languages, while the Kazakh language is considered necessary to pass the exam and complete relevant subjects. Some of the respondents relegated Kazakh to second place: one student shared her thought that this language seems to become her second tongue and another one highlighted that he started to concentrate on the significance of the English language. Therefore, he put more emphasis on the improvement of the level of English stating, “The Kazakh language should have remained in the background. Since I know the Kazakh language, I will not need Kazakh anywhere, since this language is relevant only in Kazakhstan”.

Students from the 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades are studying through English as the MOI (Karabassova, 2020) and they demonstrated both integrative and instrumental orientations towards English as they are interested in the culture and opportunities this language provides (Lai, 2004). The results coincide with the findings of the quantitative study conducted by Lai (2004), where it was revealed that the usage of the language as the MOI is sufficient to alter learners’ linguistic attitude only if “beliefs and values” are changed (p. 210). Therefore, MOI in combination with the relevant efforts might influence learners’ language attitudes. Students prioritize Russian and English languages since they provide wider opportunities and the knowledge of them is required in modern society as the basis

of the development of human capital. As Norton indicated when learners invest in the development of language proficiency, they do so recognizing the capital this language provides. Relying on Bourdieu's (1986) explanation of the capital which is indicated as "power", the Russian and English languages may hold economic, cultural and social power, where the former implies income, cultural is knowledge and education, and the latter means connection to the socially powerful networks. Hence, it can be concluded that the Russian and English languages provide wider "symbolic and material resources" (Darvin & Norton, 2015, p. 38) which is the reason for the tendency of preferring these languages among the younger generation.

Moreover, another finding is that proficiency only in the Kazakh language was accepted as the indicator of lack of education and ignorance. As Terlikbayeva et al (2021) pointed out that Russian and English are considered to be more applicable for human development by the Kazakhstani policymakers, or in other words, they primarily support bilingualism and multilingualism. A language shift and prioritization of Russian and English is explained by the position of the Kazakh language as less prestigious and "not associated with social success" (Terlikbayeva et al, 2021, p. 1). Taken together, the Russian and English languages are considered as symbols of prestige as students assigned a higher value to them since they provided broader possibilities through the means of education and job prospects. For this reason, Kazakh was replaced since they had proficiency in it and utilized it only for communication with family. As Sharipova's (2019) study revealed that despite Kazakh is considered to be an essential element of national identity and its role has grown considerably since the dissolution of the Soviet Union, its use is limited in everyday life.

Thus, students primarily prefer Russian and English and this trend is explained by the fact that there are many educational resources in these languages and a wide range of

possibilities. However, as Tsui and Tollefson (2017) pointed out, “the recognition of the important role of English, sometimes even over and above their national languages, has profound implications for their national and cultural identities which they all strive to protect” (p. 2) and this phenomenon undoubtedly shapes students’ identities. Several languages are involved in the students’ identity formation processes and the presence of a variety of languages may contribute to the conflict of different cultures and sets of values. As a result, students’ identities are reconstructed over time. Therefore, this study confirms a strong link between identity and language.

### **Conclusion**

This chapter discussed the major results of the study. Three major themes of the study were discussed. These include the discussion of the global identities of students, the strength of their national identities and their language preferences. Overall, various school projects which are dedicated to the Kazakh culture, history and language positively influenced students’ strengthening their national identities. Even though students tend to define themselves as global citizens, they demonstrated their affiliation to the history, people, and some aspects of culture and shared their desire and responsibility to enhance the status of the country. Thus, they showed the possibility of being a modern person holding a strong national identity. As for the language attitude, the role of Kazakh was limited in students’ everyday lives: most of their time is dedicated to Russian and English. This is due to the position and status of these languages. Moreover, relying on the poststructuralist theory of identity, the diverse and fluid nature of identity is revealed, and the substantial role of language as the locus of identity negotiation is depicted (Block, 2007; Norton, 2013; Norton & Toohey, 2011; De Costa, 2016).

## **Chapter 6: Conclusion**

The preceding chapter discussed the major findings of this study based on the 60 responses from an online-survey and data from six semi-structured interviews conducted with ethnic Kazakh students studying through a trilingual educational program. The purpose of this chapter is to present the substantial conclusions drawn from this study. This research was aimed at investigating how studying through the trilingual education program shaped students' identities and their attitudes towards national language, relying on Norton's poststructuralist theory of identity (2013). These research questions were designed to achieve the purpose of the study: (1) What changes do students see in their affiliation with the Kazakh ethnicity? (2) How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' identities over time? (3) How does studying in Russian and English as the mediums of instruction affect students' attitude towards the Kazakh language?

The final section of this study considers the main conclusions following with the limitations and ending with further implications and recommendations.

### **Main Conclusions of the Study**

One of the main findings of this study is that trilingual education positively influences students' national identities. As the quantitative results demonstrated, studying at NIS apparently strengthens students' affiliation to the Kazakh nation and generally their national identities. This positive outcome is achieved due to the school policy where schools offer different projects that are aimed at cultivating positive attitudes towards the Kazakh nation, culture and language. This finding makes one conclude that a school might enhance students' national identities when a particular language and culture are prioritized (Baker, 1992). Overall, the study showed that students primarily maintained strong ethnic identities, which was revealed by their recognition of the significance of blood connections

and ethnicity, whereas the features of the civic conceptualization of identity were demonstrated by their desire to contribute to the development of the country and language. Additionally, a strong feeling of affiliation to the Kazakh nation was analyzed through students' appreciation of the particular Kazakh people's attributes and pride in Kazakh history. Even though the respondents preserved and in some cases strengthened their national identities, some signs of the weakened affiliation to the Kazakh nation were also noted. This was demonstrated by the desire of one student to leave the country and respondents' critical view of some of the cultural aspects. Due to the observation of other cultures and socialization with international people, students recognized the differences between cultures and adopted some of their views.

Another substantial finding is the close link between language and identity. Languages that are studied in schools seem to have profoundly impacted the students' identities. The quantitative findings suggested that proficiency in the Kazakh, Russian and English languages does not impact national identity, but the analysis of qualitative data indicated that language learning influences different aspects as students' way of thinking, a vision of the world, perception of their nation, culture and language. Hence, language is found to be a place of identity construction and through learners understand their senses of themselves. Moreover, the languages enabled students to feel as global citizens who have global consciousness and connection with the outside world. Due to the Russian and English, students have apparently developed their global awareness which further contributes to the development of global identity.

Since students focused on their studies, further education and future job opportunities, they defined the Russian and English languages to be more important in comparison to Kazakh. Overall, most of the respondents highlighted their positive attitude towards Kazakh and its significance in their lives as the national language is the main

connector with their family. However, due to the resources the Russian and English provide and the capital they hold, students put more emphasis on the development of these languages in their repertoire and as a result, Kazakh is becoming the home language. Thus, the study showed the fluid nature of identity and that it needs to be considered as a process, not a fixed unity as well as that language is an essential part of identity and takes a significant role in its formation.

### **Limitations**

The limitations of this study lie in the small number of participants. The research might be conducted in different regions to view if geographical aspects and different contexts affect the final results. However, the participants were recruited only from one NIS; therefore, the generalization of the findings might be limited. Moreover, the research did not consider gender as one of the variables since there was an uneven number of males and females. Most of the participants were females and the differences between the two groups in the strength of national identities were not analyzed. Another limitation that is necessary to review is that the interview questions were not piloted. Piloting the interview questions could enable the researcher to see if they are clearly stated and comprehensible for interviewees and elaborate them. Additionally, the questionnaire might be elaborated further to examine if strengthening of the national identities is the function of age or the influence of the trilingual education program. Although the data from the interviews support the quantitative findings of the positive correlation between a year of studying and national identity, the quantitative finding could not solely support the idea that it is a year of studying that promotes the student's national identity.

### **Further Implications and Recommendations**

Since Kazakhstan is in its initial stages of nation-building, the country has been striving to maintain the Kazakh identity of the younger generation and develop competitive

human capital. Therefore, this study might be helpful for educational stakeholders in viewing students' identity formation processes with the trilingual educational program. Educational policymakers might want to address this research to see the possible outcomes of studying through the three languages on national identities. The results will give an opportunity to view to what extent the language of instruction might impact the identity formation of the younger generation and the attitude of ethnic Kazakhs towards their national language.

Moreover, this small-scale research shows that the Russian and English languages encourage the improvement of learners' way of thinking, enhance their horizons, and this contributes to the development of the competitive human capital of the country. Alongside this, the results demonstrated that the students' primarily preserved their Kazakh identities and their affinity feelings to the Kazakh nation. This revealed the positive influence and effectiveness of trilingual policy in building a competitive younger generation with a modernized Kazakh identity and this trend might be considered by policymakers for future implementation of the experience of trilingual policy into mainstream schools.

In the end, it may be concluded that although trilingual education positively impacts students' national identities, it has some negative implications for the Kazakh language. Due to the opportunities the Russian and English languages provide, students experience a language shift. This tendency among the younger generation is caused not only by studying through different MOI, but because of the general status of the Kazakh language in the country. Therefore, the role of the national language should be improved. To achieve this goal, school authorities and teachers might introduce different projects and events dedicated to the increase of the usage of the Kazakh language and a positive attitude towards it among students. More importantly, enhancing students' language awareness is

likely to help sensitize ethnic Kazakh students about the value of the language and culture in their overall national make-up.



### References

- Aitymbetov, N., Toktarov, E. & Ormakhanova, E. (2015). Nation-Building in Kazakhstan: Kazakh and Kazakhstani Identities Controversy, *Bilig*, 74, 1-20
- Amanbayeva, G. Y., & Meirbekova, M. K. (2017). Realization of trilingual politics in education system of the Republic of Kazakhstan. *ХАБАРИШЫБЫ*, 50.
- Anderson, B. (1991). *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. Verso. London.
- Assembly of People of Kazakhstan. (2006, October). *Native country in every heart*.  
<https://assembly.kz/en/prochee/session-12-october-2006-native-country-in-every-heart-/#>
- Baker, C. (1992). *Attitudes and language* (Vol. 83). Multilingual Matters.
- Belhiah, H., & Al- hussien, A. (2016). Instruction through the English Medium and its Impact on Arab Identity. *Arab World English Journal*, 7(2), 342–357.  
<https://doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol7no2.23>
- Belz, J. A. (2003). Identity, Deficiency, and First Language Use in Foreign Language Education. *of survey research methods* (pp. 428-429). SAGE Publications.
- Block, D. (2007). The rise of identity in SLA research, post Firth and Wagner (1997). *The Modern language journal*, 91, 863-876.
- Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. F. Richardson (ed.), *Handbook of theory and research for the sociology of education* (pp. 241–58). Greenwood Press
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2012). Thematic analysis. In H. Cooper, P. M. Camic, D. L. Long, A. T. Panter, D. Rindskopf, & K. J. Sher (Eds.), *APA handbooks in psychology. APA handbook of research methods in psychology, Vol. 2. Research designs: Quantitative, qualitative, neuropsychological, and biological* (pp. 57–71).

- American Psychological Association*. <https://doi.org/10.1037/13620-004>. Brill, J. (2008). Likert scale. In P. J. Lavrakas (Ed.), *Encyclopedia* Brubaker, W. R. (1992). Citizenship struggles in Soviet successor states. *International migration review*, 26(2), 269-291.
- Brubaker, R. (1994). *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany*. Harvard University Press.
- Brubaker, R. (1996). *Nationalism reframed: Nationhood and the national question in the new Europe*. Cambridge University Press.
- Brubaker, R., & Cooper, F. (2000). Beyond “identity.” *Theory and Society*, 29(1), 1–47. <https://doi.org/10.1023/a:1007068714468>
- Bryman, A. (2011). Research methods in the study of leadership. *The SAGE handbook of leadership*, 15-28.
- Burkhanov, A. (2017). Kazakhstan's national identity-building policy: Soviet legacy, state efforts, and societal reactions. *Cornell Int'l LJ*, 50, 1.
- Case, R. (1993). Key elements of a global perspective. *Social education*, 57(6), 318-325. <http://www.socialstudies.org/sites/default/files/publications/se/5706/570607.html>
- Cenoz, J. (2001). The effect of linguistic distance, L2 status and age on cross-linguistic influence in third language acquisition. In *Cross-linguistic influence in third language acquisition* (pp. 8-20). Multilingual Matters.
- Cenoz, J. (2013). Defining Multilingualism. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 33, 3–18. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s026719051300007x>
- Cenoz, J., Hufeisen, B., & Jessner, U. (2001). Towards Trilingual Education. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 4(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050108667714>

- Chandra, K. (2006). What is ethnic identity and does it matter? *Annual Review of Political Science*, 9(1), 397–424. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.polisci.9.062404.170715>
- Cohen, L., Manion, L. & Morrison, K. (2011). *Research methods in education*. Routledge.
- Darvin, R., & Norton, B. (2015). Identity and a Model of Investment in Applied Linguistics. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 35, 36–56. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0267190514000191>
- David, M. K., & Tien, W. 2009. Conceptualisation of Nationalism through Language—an Analysis of Malaysian Situation, *Language in India*, 9 (1), 303–16.
- De Costa, P. I. (2016). The power of identity and ideology in language learning. *Springer*.
- De Swaan, A. (2001), *Words of the World*, Polity Press.
- Dobrocká, S., & Szórádová, E. (2017). School curriculum as a means of shaping national identity: music education in the Slovak region of Czechoslovakia in the interwar period (1918–1939). *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 26(2), 165–179. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2017.1365751>
- Dörnyei, Z. (2001). *Motivational strategies in the language classroom*. Cambridge University Press.
- Dörnyei, Z. (2007). *Research methods in applied linguistics*. Oxford University Press.
- Edwards, J. (2009). *Language and identity: An introduction*. Cambridge University Press.
- Early, M., & Norton, B. (2012). Language learner stories and imagined identities. *Narrative Inquiry*, 22(1), 194–201. <https://doi.org/10.1075/ni.22.1.15ear>
- García, O. (2017). Critical Multilingual Language Awareness and Teacher Education. In J. Cenoz, D. Gorter & S. May (Eds.), *Language Awareness and Multilingualism* (pp. 263-280). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Pearson.

- Fierman, W. (2005). Kazakh Language and Prospects for Its Role in Kazakh “Groupness.” *Ab Imperio*, 2, 393–423.
- Fierman, W. (2006). Language and education in post-soviet Kazakhstan: Kazakh-medium instruction in urban schools. *The Russian Review*, 65(1), 98–116.
- Garcia, O., Skutnabb-Kangas, T., & Torres-Guzmán, M. (2006). Weaving spaces and (de) constructing ways for multilingual schools: The actual and the imagined. In García, O., Skutnabb-Kangas, T., & Torres-Guzmán, M. E. (Eds.), *Imagining multilingual schools* (pp. 3-48). Multilingual Matters.
- Hamid, M. O., & Jahan, I. (2015). Language, Identity, and Social Divides: Medium of Instruction Debates in Bangladeshi Print Media. *Comparative Education Review*, 59(1), 75–101. <https://doi.org/10.1086/679192>
- Henry, A., & Goddard, A. (2015). Bicultural or hybrid? The second language identities of students on an English-mediated university program in Sweden. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, 14(4), 255–274. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15348458.2015.1070596>
- Hofstede, G. H. (2001). *Culture consequences: Comparing values, behaviors, institutions, and organizations across nations* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Holm-Hansen, J. (1999). Political integration in Kazakhstan. In Pal Kolstø (Ed.), *Nation-Building and Ethnic Integration in Post-soviet Societies: An Investigation Of Latvia And Kazakstan* (pp. 153-226). Westview Press.
- Ivankova, N. V., Creswell, J. W., & Stick, S. L. (2006). Using Mixed-Methods Sequential Explanatory Design: From Theory to Practice. *Field Methods*, 18(1), 3–20. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1525822x05282260>

- Jacob, S. A., & Furgerson, S. P. (2015). Writing interview protocols and conducting interviews: tips for students new to the field of qualitative research. *Qualitative Report, 17*, 6. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2012.1718>
- Jahan, I., & Hamid, M. O. (2019). English as a medium of instruction and the discursive construction of elite identity. *Journal of Sociolinguistics, 23*(4), 386-408. <https://doi.org/10.1111/josl.12360>
- Johnson, R. B., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2004). Mixed Methods Research: A Research Paradigm Whose Time Has Come. *Educational Researcher, 33*(7), 14–26. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189x033007014>
- Kabayeva, Z., Imanmoldayeva, B., Mussabaev, S., Madalieva, Z. M., & Karanov, Z. (2018). The formation way of independent Kazakhstan from the individualism and collectivism perspective. *Opción: Revista de Ciencias Humanas y Sociales, (85)*, 757-779.
- Karabassova, L. (2018). Teachers' conceptualization of content and language integrated learning (CLIL): evidence from a trilingual context. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism, 1*–13. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2018.1550048>
- Karabassova, L. (2020). Understanding Trilingual Education Reform in Kazakhstan: Why Is It Stalled?. In *Education in Central Asia*, (pp. 37-51). Springer, Cham. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-50127-3\\_3](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-50127-3_3)
- Kapur, R. (2018). Significance of Research in Education
- Khamzina, Z., Buribayev, Y., Yermukanov, Y., & Alshurazova, A. (2020). Is it possible to achieve gender equality in Kazakhstan: Focus on employment and social protection. *International Journal of Discrimination and the Law, 20*(1), 5-20.

- Kirkwood, T. F. (2001). Our global age requires global education: Clarifying definitional ambiguities. *The social studies*, 92(1), 10-15.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/00377990109603969>
- Kramersch, C. J. (2013). Afterword. In B. Norton (Ed.), *Identity and language learning: Extending the conversation* (2nd ed., pp. 192–201). Multilingual Matters.
- Kolbachayeva J.Y. (2020). Regionalnyi, natsionalnyi i konfessionalnyi factory formirovaniya natsionalnoi identichnosti Kazakhstana [Regional, national and confessional factors of formation of national identity of Kazakhstan]. *Post-Soviet Issues*. 2019;6(4):398-408. <https://doi.org/10.24975/2313-8920-2019-6-4-398-408>
- Lai, M. L. (2004). Medium of instruction, identity and language attitude in post-colonial Hong Kong. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 13(2), 191-219.
- Laruelle, M. (2014). The three discursive paradigms of state identity in Kazakhstan. In: M. Y. Omelicheva (Ed.), *Nationalism and identity construction in Central Asia*. (pp.1-20). Lexington Books.
- Lanehart, S. L. (1996). The Language of Identity. *Journal of English Linguistics*, 24(4), 322–331. <https://doi.org/10.1177/007542429602400407>
- Lenkaitis, C. A., Loranc-Paszylk, B., & Hilliker, S. (2019). Global awareness and global identity development among foreign language learners: The impact of virtual exchanges. *MEXTESOL Journal*, 43(4), 1-11.
- Majid, M. A. A., Othman, M., Mohamad, S. F., Lim, S. A. H., & Yusof, A. (2017). Piloting for Interviews in Qualitative Research: Operationalization and Lessons Learnt. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 7(4). <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v7-i4/2916>
- Mansoor, S. (2012). Exploring global identity in emerging adults (Master's thesis).  
<http://www.divaportal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A549930&dswid=-6385>

- Manan, S. A. (2015). *Mapping mismatches: English-medium education policy, perceptions and practices in the low-fee private schools in Quetta Pakistan* [Doctoral dissertation, University of Malaya].
- Manan, S. A., & David, M. K. (2019). Deprescriptivising folk theories: critical multilingual language awareness for educators in Pakistan. *The Language Learning Journal*, 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09571736.2019.1657487>
- Manan, S. A., David, M. K., & Dumanig, F. P. (2015). Disjunction between language policy and children's sociocultural ecology – an analysis of English-medium education policy in Pakistan. *Language and Education*, 29(5), 453–473. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2015.1046882>
- Masri, T. I. (2012). *Level of proficiency in Arabic and English, and identity of Emirati students in UAE public schools* [Doctoral dissertation, American University of Sharjah]. <https://awej.org/images/Theseanddissertation/102.pdf>
- Mehisto, P. (2015). Kazakhstan: from twenty trilingual schools to thousands? In P. Mehisto, F. Genesee (Eds.) *Building Bilingual Education Systems* (pp. 109-130). Cambridge University Press.
- McKay, S. L., & Wong, S. L. C. (1996). Multiple Discourses, Multiple Identities: Investment and Agency in Second-Language Learning among Chinese Adolescent Immigrant Students. *Harvard Educational Review*, 66(3), 577–609. <https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.66.3.n47r06u264944865>
- Ministry of Education and Science (MoES). (2019). *The State Program for the Implementation of Language Policy in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025*. <http://academy-gp.kz/?p=9655&lang=en>.
- Montgomery, P. (2013). Language law limbo: Nationalization and globalization in Kazakhstan. Unpublished manuscript.

Muijs, D. (2011). *Doing quantitative research in education with SPSS*. SAGE Publications Ltd. ISBN: 9781849203241

*Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools*. (April 16). Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools.

<https://www.nis.edu.kz/en/about/history/>

Nazarbayev, N. A. (2007, February 28). *A new Kazakhstan in a new world: Address by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Mr. Nursultan Nazarbayev to the Republic of Kazakhstan*

[http://www.akorda.kz/ru/addresses/addresses\\_of\\_president/poslanie-prezidenta-respubliki-kazahstan-nnazarbaeva-narodu-kazahstana-28-fevralya-2007-g](http://www.akorda.kz/ru/addresses/addresses_of_president/poslanie-prezidenta-respubliki-kazahstan-nnazarbaeva-narodu-kazahstana-28-fevralya-2007-g).

Nazarbayev, N. A. (2012). *Strategy Kazakhstan 2050: New political course of the established state*, Speech delivered in Astana, December 14, 2012.

<http://www.kazakhembus.com/document/address-by-kazakhstan-president-nursultan-nazarbayev-strategy-kazakhstan-2050>

Nazarbayev, N. A. (2014, December 15). Patriotic act - "Mangilik Yel." *Kazakhstanskaya Pravda*. <https://kazpravda.kz/news/politika/patrioticheskii-akt--mangilik-el-polnii-tekst/>

Nazarbayev, N. A. (2018, January 10). *New opportunities under the fourth industrial revolution: State of the Nation Address by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Nursultan Nazarbayev*. Akorda.Kz.

[https://www.akorda.kz/en/addresses/addresses\\_of\\_president/state-of-the-nation-address-by-the-president-of-the-republic-of-kazakhstan-nursultan-nazarbayev-january-10-2018](https://www.akorda.kz/en/addresses/addresses_of_president/state-of-the-nation-address-by-the-president-of-the-republic-of-kazakhstan-nursultan-nazarbayev-january-10-2018)

Nazarbayev, N. A. (2017, April 12). *Course towards the future: modernization of Kazakhstan's identity*. Akorda.Kz.



[https://www.akorda.kz/en/events/akorda\\_news/press\\_conferences/course-towards-the-future-modernization-of-kazakhstans-identity](https://www.akorda.kz/en/events/akorda_news/press_conferences/course-towards-the-future-modernization-of-kazakhstans-identity)

Nazarbayev, N. 2017. *Third Modernization of Kazakhstan: Global Competitiveness: Address by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan Mr. Nursultan Nazarbayev to the Republic of Kazakhstan*. <https://www.zakon.kz/83346-poslanie-prezidenta-respubliki.html>.

Nezhina, T. G., & Ibrayeva, A. R. (2013). Explaining the role of culture and traditions in functioning of civil society organizations in Kazakhstan. *Voluntas: International Journal of Voluntary and Nonprofit Organizations*, 24(2), 335-358.

Norton, B. (2006). Identity as a sociocultural construct in second language research. *TESOL in context [special issue]*, 22-33.

Norton, B. (2013). *Identity and language learning: Extending the conversation*. Multilingual matters.

Norton, B., & Gao, Y. (2008). Identity, investment, and Chinese learners of English. *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication*, 18(1), 109-120.  
<https://doi.org/10.1075/japc.18.1.07nor>

Norton, B., & Toohey, K. (2011). Identity, language learning, and social change. *Language Teaching*, 44(4), 412–446. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0261444811000309>

Olaoye, A. A. (2013). The Role of Language in National Re-Branding: A Sociolinguistic Perspective. *I-Manager's Journal on English Language Teaching*, 3(3), 41–47.  
<https://doi.org/10.26634/jelt.3.3.2419>

Pavlenko, A. (2003). “Language of the Enemy”: Foreign Language Education and National Identity. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 6(5), 313–331. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050308667789>

Pavlenko, A., (2004). Gender and sexuality in foreign and second language education:

Critical and feminist approaches. In B. Norton and K. Toohey (Eds). *Critical pedagogies and language learning* (pp. 53-71). Cambridge University Press

Pavlenko, A., & Norton, B. (2007). Imagined communities, identity, and English language learning. In *International handbook of English language teaching* (pp. 669-680).

Springer, Boston, MA.

Percy, W., Kostere, K., & Kostere, S. (2015). Generic Qualitative Research in Psychology.

*The Qualitative Report*. Published. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2015.2097>

Polatova, S., Lekerova, G., Kistaubaeva, D., Zhanaliyeva, R., & Kalzhanova, A. (2020).

Trilingual education in Kazakhstani universities: Use of Kazakh, Russian and motivation towards learning English. *Issues in Educational Research*, 30(4), 1463-1483.

Qu, W. G. (2005). On issues concerning English and identity research in China. *The*

*Journal of Chinese Sociolinguistics*, 5(2), 93-116.

Reysen, S., & Katzarska-Miller, I. (2013). A model of global citizenship: Antecedents and outcomes. *International Journal of Psychology*, 48(5), 858-870.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00207594.2012.701749>

Saldana, J. (2011). *Fundamentals of qualitative research*. OUP USA.

Shakhanov, M. (2009). Ultti zhoyudin tote zholy–kazakstandyk ult [The direct way to the destruction of the Kazakh nation – Kazakhstani nation]. *Zhas Alash*, 75, 17.

Sharipova, D. (2019). Perceptions of National Identity in Kazakhstan: Pride, Language, and Religion. *The Muslim World*, 110(1), 89–106.

<https://doi.org/10.1111/muwo.12320>

Smith, A. D. (1991). *National identity*. University of Nevada Press.

- Subedi, D. (2016). Explanatory sequential mixed method design as the third research community of knowledge claim. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 4(7), 570-577.
- Sung, C. C. M. (2019). Negotiating participation and identity in a second language: Mainland Chinese students' English learning experiences in a multilingual university in Hong Kong. *Research Papers in Education*, 1–21.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02671522.2019.1677760>
- Tashakkori, A., & Teddlie, C. (2003). Issues and dilemmas in teaching research methods courses in social and behavioural sciences: US perspective. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 6(1), 61–77.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13645570305055>
- Terlikbayeva, N., & Menlibekova, G. (2021). The Dynamics of Language Shift in Kazakhstan: Review Article. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, 3(2), 12–22. <https://doi.org/10.32996/jeltal.2021.3.2.2>
- Tsui, A. P. Y., & Ngo, H. Y. (2016). Students' perceptions of English-medium instruction in a Hong Kong university. *Asian Englishes*, 19(1), 57–78.  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13488678.2016.1230484>
- Tsui, A. B., & Tollefson, J. W. (2017). 1 Language Policy and the Construction of National Cultural Identity. In *Language policy, culture, and identity in Asian contexts* (pp. 1-22). Routledge.
- UNESCO (2003). Education in a multilingual world: UNESCO education position paper. UNESCO. <http://www.unesco.org/new/en/communication-and-information/resources/publications-and-communication-materials/publications/fulllist/education-in-a-multilingual-world-unesco-education-position-paper/>

Verdugo, R. R., & Milne, A. (2016). Introduction: National identity: Theory and practice.

In Verdugo, R. R., & Milne, A. (Eds.), *National identity: Theory and research* (pp. 1-21) IAP.

Weedon, C. (1997). *Feminist practice and poststructuralist theory* (2nd ed.). Blackwell.

Wenger, E. (1998). *Communities of practice: Learning, meaning, and identity*. Cambridge University Press

Yakavets, N. and Dzhadrina, M. (2014). Educational reforms in Kazakhstan: 'Entering the world arena', in D. Bridges (Ed.), *Educational Reform and Internationalisation: The case of school reform in Kazakhstan*, (pp. 28-52). Cambridge University Press: Cambridge.

Yergebekov, M., & Temirbekova, Z. (2012). The Bologna Process and Problems in Higher Education System of Kazakhstan. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 47, 1473–1478. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.06.845>

**Appendix A**

Questionnaire in English

**Background information**

What is your gender?

- Male
- Female

What grade are you in?

- 9
- 10
- 11

How well do you speak the following languages on the scale from 1 to 5, where 1 is for low proficiency and 5 is for high? Please, choose the number for each language:

- Kazakh 1 2 3 4 5
- Russian 1 2 3 4 5
- English 1 2 3 4 5
- Other \_\_\_\_\_ (Please, specify which language) 1 2 3 4 5

**National Identity**

To what extent do you agree with the following statements	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
1. Studying Russian and English as the languages of instruction has made me realize that Russian and English languages are more important when compared with Kazakh language					
2. Studying Russian and English as the languages of instruction has made me realize that Kazakh language is equally important when compared with Russian and English languages.					
3. Studying Russian and English languages as the languages of instruction can make one less Kazakh					
4. Studying Russian and English as the languages of instruction can make one more Kazakh					
5. Studying Russian and English as the languages of instruction can make one more cosmopolitan and international in outlook than studying only in Kazakh					
6. I consider myself more of a global citizen than only Kazakh citizen after studying Russian and English as the languages of instruction					

- 
7. The more that I experienced trilingual education, the more it strengthened my national Kazakh identity
  8. The more that I experienced trilingual education, the more it weakened my national Kazakh identity
  9. The more I studied Russian and English as the languages of instruction, the more it fostered inferiority complex about Kazakh culture, music, customs and traditions
  10. The more I studied Russian and English as the languages of instruction, the more it fostered confidence about Kazakh culture, music, customs and traditions
  11. The experience of trilingual education neither fostered inferiority complex nor confidence about Kazakh culture, music, customs and traditions
- 

### **National Language**

**To what extent do you agree/disagree with the following statements?**

---

<b>Statements</b>	<b>Strongly disagree</b>	<b>Disagree</b>	<b>Neutral</b>	<b>Agree</b>	<b>Strongly agree</b>
-------------------	--------------------------	-----------------	----------------	--------------	-----------------------

---

The Kazakh language is an essential part of my identity and self-expression

It is essential for me to have very good knowledge in all four skills (Reading, Speaking, Writing and Listening) of the Kazakh language

Every citizen of Kazakhstan should have very good knowledge in all four skills of both Kazakh and Russian languages

Trilingual education must be conducted in every educational

---

---

institution of Kazakhstan

Trilingual education policy  
threatens Kazakh language usage

---

This study also includes a 30-minute interview. The participation in the interview is voluntary. If you would to participate in the interview, please, leave your phone number. The researcher will contact you for the explanation of the interview process.  
Phone number: \_\_\_\_\_

## Questionnaire in Kazakh

## Сауалнама Сұрақтары

**Жалпы ақпарат**

Жынысыңызды көрсетіңіз

- Ер
- Әйел

Сіз қай сыныпта оқисыз?

- 9
- 10
- 11

1-ден 5-ке дейінгі шкала бойынша (“1” тілді меңгерудің төмен деңгейін, “5” жоғары деңгейін көрсетеді) сіз келесі тілдерде қаншалықты жақсы сөйлейсіз? Әр тіл үшін нөмірді таңдаңыз:

- Қазақша 1 2 3 4 5
- Орыс 1 2 3 4 5
- Ағылшын 1 2 3 4 5
- Басқа \_\_\_\_\_ (тілді көрсетіңіз) 1 2 3 4 5

**Ұлттық Тұлға**

Сіз келесі мәлімдемелермен қаншалықты келісесіз?	Толық келіспеймін	Келіспеймін	Бейтарап	Келісемін	Толық келісемін
--	-------------------	-------------	----------	-----------	-----------------

1. Орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқу кезінде, орыс және ағылшын тілдері қазақ тілімен салыстырғанда маңызды екенін түсіндім
2. Орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқу кезінде, мен қазақ тілінің орыс және ағылшын тілдерімен салыстырғанда бірдей маңызды екенін түсіндім
3. Орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқу адамның “қазақтылығын” әлсіретуі мүмкін
4. Орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқу



- 
- адамның  
“қазақтылығын”  
күшейтуі мүмкін
5. Орыс және  
ағылшын  
тілдерінде оқу,  
қазақ тілінде  
оқуымен  
салыстырғанда  
адамның  
көзқарасын  
космополиттік  
және  
халықаралық ете  
алады
6. Мен орыс және  
ағылшын  
тілдерінде  
оқығаннан кейін  
өзімді тек  
Қазақстан  
азаматы емес  
әлемнің азаматы  
деп санаймын
7. Мен үштілді  
білім беру  
бағдарламасы  
бойынша  
неғұрлым көп  
оқыған сайын, ол  
менің ұлттық  
қазақ  
тұлғалығымды  
соғұрлым  
нығайтты
8. Мен үштілді  
білім беру  
бағдарламасы  
бойынша  
неғұрлым көп  
оқыған сайын, ол  
менің қазақтың  
ұлттық  
тұлғалығымды  
соғұрлым  
әлсіретті
9. Мен орыс және  
ағылшын  
тілдерінде  
неғұрлым көп
-

- оқыған сайын,  
 бұл қазақ  
 мәдениетіне,  
 музыкасына,  
 салт-дәстүрлеріне  
 қатысты  
 соғұрлым  
 кемшілік кешенін  
 тудырды
10. Орыс және  
 ағылшын  
 тілдерінде  
 неғұрлым көп  
 оқыған сайын,  
 қазақ  
 мәдениетіне,  
 музыкасына,  
 салт-дәстүрлеріне  
 деген соғұрлым  
 сенімім арта түсті
11. Үштілді білім  
 беру  
 бағдарламасы  
 бойынша білім  
 беру қазақ  
 мәдениетіне,  
 музыкасына,  
 салт-дәстүрлеріне  
 деген сенімсіздік  
 те, кемшілік те  
 кешенін  
 тудырмады

### Ұлттық Тіл

Сіз келесі мәлімдемелермен қаншалықты келісесіз / келіспейсіз?

Мәлімдемелер	Толық келіспеймін	Келіспеймін	Бейтарап	Келісемін	Толық келісемін
Қазақ тілі-менің тұлғамның және өзін-өзі корсетудің ажырамас бөлігі					
Мен үшін қазақ тілінің барлық төрт дағдысы бойынша өте білімді болуы өте маңызды					
Әрбір қазақстандық қазақ және орыс тілдерінің барлық					

---

төрт дағдысын өте  
жақсы меңгеруі тиіс

Үш тілде білім беру  
Қазақстанның әрбір  
оқу орнына енгізілуі  
тиіс

Үш тілді білім беру  
саясаты қазақ тіліне  
қауіп төндіреді

---

Бұл зерттеуге және де 30 минуттық сұхбат кіреді. Сұхбатқа қатысу ерікті болып табылады. Егер сіз сұхбатқа қатысқыңыз келсе, телефон нөміріңізді қалдыруға сұраймыз. Зерттеуші сұхбат процесін түсіндіру үшін сізбен байланысады.  
Телефон нөмірі: \_\_\_\_\_

## Questionnaire in Russian

## Вопросы анкеты

**Общая информация**

Укажите свой пол

- Мужской                      • Женский

В каком классе вы учитесь?

- 9                      • 10                      • 11

По шкале от 1 до 5, где 1 – относится к низкому уровню владения языком, а 5 – к высокому, насколько хорошо вы говорите на следующих языках? Пожалуйста, выберите номер для каждого языка:

- Казахский 1 2 3 4 5  
 • Русский 1 2 3 4 5  
 • Английский 1 2 3 4 5  
 • Другой \_\_\_\_\_ (Пожалуйста, укажите язык) 1 2 3 4 5

**Национальная Идентичность**

В какой степени вы согласны со следующими утверждениями?	Полност ью несоглас ен	Несогла сен	Нейтра льно	Соглас ен	Полност ью согласе н
--	---------------------------------	----------------	----------------	--------------	-------------------------------

1. Обучение на русском и английском языках заставило меня осознать, что русский и английский языки более важны по сравнению с казахским языком
2. Обучение на русском и английском языках заставило меня осознать, что казахский язык одинаково важен по сравнению с русским и английским языками.
3. Обучение на русском и английском языках может сделать кого-то менее казахом
4. Обучение на русском и английском языках может сделать кого-то более казахом
5. Обучение на русском и английском языках может сделать человека более космополитичным и интернациональным в мировоззрении, чем обучение только на казахском
6. Я считаю себя в большей степени гражданином мира, чем только гражданином Казахстана после обучение на русском и английском языках
7. Чем больше я обучался по программе трехязычного

- 
- образования, тем больше она укрепляла мою национальную казахскую идентичность
8. Чем больше я обучался по программе трехязычного образования, тем больше она ослабляла мою национальную казахскую идентичность
9. Чем больше я обучался на русском и английском языках, тем больше это вызывало комплекс неполноценности по отношению к казахской культуре, музыке, обычаям и традициям
10. Чем больше я обучался на русском и английском языках, тем больше это укрепляло уверенность в казахской культуре, музыке, обычаях и традициях
11. Обучение по программе трехязычного образования не вызывало ни комплекса неполноценности, ни уверенности в казахской культуре, музыке, обычаях и традициях
- 

### **Национальный Язык**

**В какой степени вы согласны/не согласны со следующими утверждениями?**

Утверждения	Полностью несогласен	Несогласен	Нейтрально	Согласен	Полностью согласен
-------------	----------------------	------------	------------	----------	--------------------

---

Казахский язык-это неотъемлемая часть моей идентичности и самовыражения

Для меня очень важно иметь очень хорошие знания по всем четырем навыкам казахского языка

Каждый казахстанец должен очень хорошо владеть всеми четырьмя навыками как казахского, так и русского языков

---

---

Трехязычное  
образование  
должно быть  
внедрено в каждое  
учебное заведение  
Казахстана

Трехязычная  
образовательная  
политика ставит  
под угрозу  
казахский язык

---

Это исследование также включает в себя 30-минутное интервью. Участие в интервью является добровольным. Если вы хотите принять участие в интервью, пожалуйста, оставьте свой номер телефона. Исследователь свяжется с вами для объяснения процесса интервью.

Номер телефона: \_\_\_\_\_

## Appendix B

## Interview Protocol in Three Languages

Categories	Interview Questions	Интервью сұрақтары	Вопросы интервью
Background information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. What is your name? How old are you?</li> <li>2. What grade are you in? How long have you been educated through the three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English?</li> <li>3. What is your first language?</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Есіміңіз кім болады және жасыңыз нешеде?</li> <li>2. Қай сыныпта оқисыз? Қашаннан бері үш тілді меңгеріп жүрсіз?</li> <li>3. Сіздің ана тіліңіз қандай? Өзіңдік қазақи тұлға сезімін сипаттайтын қандай ерекшеліктері бар?</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Как вас зовут? Сколько вам лет?</li> <li>2. В каком вы классе учитесь? Как долго вы обучаетесь на трех языках – Казахский, Русский и Английский?</li> <li>3. Какой у вас родной язык?</li> </ol>
Main questions	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. How do you feel about the introduction of multilingual education in our country? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) From your point of view, what are the advantageous of the introduction of trilingual education in Kazakhstan?</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. What are the characteristics of Kazakhstani person with strong Kazakhstani national identity? Do you consider yourself being such person? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) In What ways does trilingual education influence you being such person?</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Сіз біздің елімізде көптілді білім беруді енгізуге қалай қарайсыз? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) Сіздің көзқарасыңыз бойынша, Қазақстанда үштілді білім беруді енгізудің артықшылықтары қандай?</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. Қазақи ұлттық тұлға сезімі мықты қазақстандық адамның сипаттамасы қандай? Сіз өзіңізді осындай адам деп санайсыз ба? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) Үштілді білім беру оған қалай әсер етеді?</li> <li>ii) Сіз өзіңіздің қазақстандық тұлғалығыңызға қатысты өзіңізді сенімді сезінесіз бе немесе керісінше ме?</li> </ol> </li> <li>3. Қазақи адам</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Как вы относитесь к внедрению полиязычного образования в нашей стране? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) С вашей точки зрения, каковы преимущества внедрения трехязычного образования в Казахстане?</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. Каковы особенности гражданина Казахстана с сильной Казахской национальной идентичностью? Считаете ли вы себя таким человеком? <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) Каким образом трехязычное образование влияет на это?</li> <li>ii) Вы чувствуете себя более уверенно по</li> </ol> </li> </ol>

- 
- |  |   |  |
|--|---|--|
| <p>ii) Do you feel more confident about your Kazakh identity or vice versa?</p> <p>3. What are the positive sides of being Kazakh person?</p> <p>4. Which period of Kazakh nation's development is the most important for you?</p> <p>5. Which Kazakh traditions/holidays are important for you? If relevant: Why?</p> <p>i) How can studying Russian and English as the languages of instruction influence your perception of the Kazakh culture (customs, traditions, and holidays)?</p> <p>6. In your opinion, what impact will the promotion of English have on the development of the Kazakh language?</p> <p>7. Does studying in Russian and English affect your worldview?</p> <p>8. What language(s) do you prioritize for your future profession?</p> <p>9. What is Kazakh language for you? For your</p> | <p>болудың жағымды жақтары қандай?</p> <p>4. Қазақ ұлтының қандай даму кезеңі сіз үшін ең маңызды болып табылады?</p> <p>5. Қандай қазақ дәстүрлері / мерекелері сіз үшін маңызды? Орынды болса: Неге?</p> <p>i) Орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқу сіздің қазақ мәдениетін (әдет-ғұрып, салт-дәстүр, мереке) қабылдауыңызға қалай әсер етуі мүмкін?</p> <p>6. Сіздің ойыңызша, ағылшын тілінің ілгерілеуі қазақ және орыс тілдерінің дамуына қандай әсер етеді?</p> <p>7. Орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқу сіздің дүниетанымыңызға әсер ете ме?</p> <p>8. Сіз болашақ мамандығыңыз үшін қай тілге үлкен мән бересіз?</p> <p>9. Сіз үшін қазақ тілінің маңызы қандай? Сіздің болашағыңыз үшін?</p> <p>i) Сіздің өміріңіз үшін қазақ тілінің маңызы қандай?</p> <p>10. Үштілді мектепті аяқтағаннан кейін болашағыңызды қалай елестетесіз?</p> | <p>отношению к вашей казахстанской идентичности или наоборот?</p> <p>3. Каковы положительные стороны Казахского человека?</p> <p>4. Какой период развития казахской нации является для вас самым важным?</p> <p>5. Какие казахские традиции/праздники важны для вас? Если уместно: Почему?</p> <p>i) Как обучение на русском и английском языках может повлиять на ваше восприятие казахской культуры (обычаев, традиций, праздников)?</p> <p>6. На ваш взгляд, какое влияние окажет продвижение английского языка на развитие казахского и русского языков?</p> <p>7. Влияет ли обучение на русском и английском языках на ваше мировоззрение?</p> <p>8. Какой язык вы ставите в больший приоритет для своей будущей профессии?</p> |
|--|---|--|
-



---

	future?		
	i) What is the importance of Kazakh language for your life?		9. Какое значение имеет для вас казахский язык? Ради вашего будущего?
	10. How do you see your future after graduating from trilingual school?		i) Какое значение имеет казахский язык для вашей жизни?
			10. Каким вы видите свое будущее после окончания трехязычной школы?
Conclusion	Is there anything you want to add?	Сіздің қосарыңыз барма?	Вы бы хотели что-нибудь добавить?

---

## Appendix C

### Consent Forms

#### Informed Consent Form for the Director of the School #1

**Introduction.** Your school is invited to participate in a research study entitled “Kazakh Students’ Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School”.

**Procedures.** The purpose of this research is to explore Kazakh students’ identity formation in trilingual school and analyze how different languages of teaching influence students’ attitude towards the Kazakh language. Therefore, Kazakh students studying at the grades 11 to 12 are invited to participate in this study which involves the online survey and interviews. The completion of the survey will take approximately 10-15 minutes. The interviews will be one-to-one online and will take about 30 minutes. If there are any questions regarding the research and its components, online or face-to-face meeting will be organized.

**Risks.** The potential risks of participating in this study are minimal. There are no risks for the school as all the personal information of the students will be confidential and available only for the researcher. However, the topic of national identity and language can be considered as being the personal one. Therefore, participants might feel individual discomfort when answering several questions of the survey and interview. The participants will be proposed to meet face-to-face in the habitual place that is comfortable for them, so the researcher will be able to create a friendly atmosphere which is hard via internet, and, undoubtedly, keeping all the necessary measures for the safety. Moreover, students might think that their personal information and responses will be available for everyone. Therefore, they will be assured of the anonymity, confidentiality and non-traceability of all gathered data.

**Benefits.** The research might be beneficial for schools with trilingual education programs and findings might contribute to the educational research field. With the results of this research, schools with different languages of teaching might organize different events with the aim to preserve national identity and evoke positive attitude towards the Kazakh language. As for the participants, there are no direct benefits for them. Yet, this participation might develop a better awareness of their national identity formation and their position towards the national language.

**Compensation.** No tangible compensation will be given. A copy of the research results will be available at the conclusion of the study. The whole research will be available in the NU Repository website and, if necessary, the copy of the results of the study will be sent to the school.

**Confidentiality & Privacy.** Any information that is obtained during this study will be kept confidential to the full extent possible. The survey will be anonymous and only students’ responses will be available for the researcher without any identifiable data. The data obtained from the interview will be confidential. The personal data of students, gathered data and recordings will be kept separately in the password protected computer without shared access. The real names of students will be substituted by pseudonyms. In a written form and oral discussions no reference that could reveal your students’ identities will be made.

**Voluntary Nature of the Study.** Participation in this study is strictly voluntary, and if agreement to participation is given, it can be withdrawn at any time without prejudice.

**Points of Contact.** It is understood that should any questions or comments arise regarding this project, or a research related injury is received, the Master's thesis Supervisor, *Dr. Syed Abdul Manan*, +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz) should be contacted. Any other questions or concerns may be addressed to the Nazarbayev University Institutional Research Ethics Committee, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Statement of Consent.**

I, \_\_\_\_\_,

Give my voluntary consent to participate in this study.

The researchers clearly explained to me the background information and objectives of the study and what my participation in this study involves.

I understand that my participation in this study is voluntary. I can at any time and without giving any reasons withdraw my consent, and this will not have any negative consequences for myself .

I understand that the information collected during this study will be treated confidentially.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Researcher:

Signed \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

## Informed Consent Form for the Director of the School #2

Мектеп директорына арналған зерттеу жұмысы келісімінің ақпараттық формасы

**Кіріспе.** Сіздің мектебіңізді «Назарбаев Зияткерлік мектебіндегі үштілді білім беру бағдарламасы аясында қазақстандық оқушылардың жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуы» атты ғылыми-зерттеу жұмысына қатысуға шақырамыз.

**Процедуралары.** Бұл зерттеудің мақсаты - үштілді мектептегі қазақ оқушыларының жеке тұлғалық қалыптасуын және оқушылардың әр түрлі тілде оқытудың қазақ тіліне деген көзқарасына қалай әсер ететіндігін талдау. Сондықтан 11-12 сыныптардағы қазақ оқушыларын онлайн-сауалнама мен сұхбаттасуды қамтитын осы зерттеуге қатысуға шақырылады. Сауалнама шамамен 10-15 минутты алады. Сұхбат онлайн режимінде жүргізіліп, шамамен 30 минутты алады. Егер зерттеу мен оның компоненттеріне қатысты сұрақтар туындаса, онлайн немесе бетпе-бет кездесу ұйымдастырылады.

**Қауіптері.** Зерттеу жұмысына қатысудың қауіптері өте аз. Мектепке ешқандай қауіп жоқ, өйткені студенттердің барлық жеке мәліметтері құпия және тек зерттеушіге ғана қол жетімді болады. Алайда ұлттық тұлға мен тіл тақырыбы жеке тақырып ретінде қарастырылуы мүмкін. Сондықтан қатысушылар сауалнама мен сұхбат кезінде ыңғайсыздықты сезінуі мүмкін. Зерттеуші, қажетті қауіпсіздік шараларын сақтай отырып, достық атмосферасын құру үшін қатысушыларды өздеріне ыңғайлы жерде бетпе-бет кездесуге шақырады. Сонымен қатар, студенттер өздерінің жеке мәліметтері мен жауаптары барлығына қол жетімді болады деп ойлауы мүмкін. Осылайша, олар барлық жиналған деректердің анонимділігі, құпиялылығы және қадағаланбауы туралы хабардар болады.

**Артықшылықтары.** Бұл зерттеу үштілді білім беру бағдарламалары бар мектептер үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін және алынған нәтижелер білім беру саласындағы зерттеулерге ықпал етуі мүмкін. Осы зерттеудің нәтижелері бойынша әртүрлі тілде оқытатын мектептер ұлттық тұлғалықты сақтау және қазақ тіліне оң көзқарас қалыптастыру мақсатында түрлі іс-шаралар ұйымдастыра алады. Қатысушылардың өздеріне келетін болсақ, олар осы зерттеуге қатысудан тікелей пайда көре алмауы мүмкін. Алайда, бұл қатысу олардың ұлттық тұлғалықтарын және олардың ұлттық тілге қатысты ұстанымын жақсы түсінуге ықпал етуі мүмкін.

**Компенсация.** Материалдық өтемақы болмайды. Зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі зерттеу аяқталғаннан кейін қол жетімді болады. Толық зерттеу NU Repository сайтында қол жетімді болады және қажет болған жағдайда зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі мектепке жіберіледі.

**Құпиялылық.** Осы зерттеу барысында алынған кез-келген ақпарат мүмкіндігінше толық құпиялылықта сақталады. Сауалнама анонимді болады және зерттеушіге тек студенттердің жауаптары ешқандай сәйкестендірусіз қол жетімді болады. Сұхбат барысында алынған мәліметтер құпия болады. Студенттердің жеке деректері, жиналған мәліметтер мен жазбалар ортақ қол жеткізусіз парольмен қорғалған компьютерде бөлек сақталады. Студенттердің шың есімдері бүркеншік аттармен

ауыстырылады. Жазбаша және ауызша талқылауларда студенттердің жеке басын ашатын сілтемелер жасалмайды.

**Зерттеудің ерікті сипаты.** Бұл зерттеуге қатысу қатаң ерікті болып табылады және егер қатысуға келісім берілсе, ол қатысушыға зиян келтірместен кез келген уақытта кері қайтарылуы мүмкін.

**Байланыс ақпараты.** Осы жобаға қатысты қандай да бір сұрақтар немесе ескертулер туындаған немесе зерттеуге байланысты жарақат алған жағдайда магистрлік диссертацияның ғылыми жетекшісіне хабарласуыңызға болады, *доктор Сайед Абдул Мананга*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Кез келген басқа мәселелер Назарбаев Университетінің Институционалдық зерттеулер этикасы комитетіне жіберілуі мүмкін, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Келісім туралы өтініш.**

Мен, \_\_\_\_\_,

Осы зерттеуге қатысуға ерікті келісімді беремін.

Зерттеушілер маған жалпы ақпарат пен зерттеу мақсаттарын, сондай-ақ менің осы зерттеуге қатысуым туралы нақты түсіндірді.

Менің бұл зерттеуге қатысуым ерікті екенін түсінемін. Мен кез-келген уақытта және түсіндірусіз келісімді қайтарып ала аламын, және бұл маған ешқандай жағымсыз әсер етпейді.

Осы зерттеу барысында жиналған ақпарат құпия түрде қаралатынын түсінемін.

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

Зерттеуші:

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

## Informed Consent Form for the Director of the School

## Форма Информационного Согласия для Директора Школы

**Введение.** Ваша школа приглашается принять участие в научном исследовании под названием “Формирование идентичности казахстанских студентов в рамках трехязычной образовательной программы в Назарбаев Интеллектуальной школе”.

**Процедуры.** Целью данного исследования является изучение формирования идентичности казахских студентов в трехязычной школе и анализ того, как различные языки обучения влияют на отношение студентов к казахскому языку. Поэтому казахстанские студенты, обучающиеся в 11-12 классах, приглашаются к участию в данном исследовании, которое включает в себя онлайн опрос и интервью. Опрос займет примерно 10-15 минут. Собеседования будут проводиться один на один в режиме онлайн и займут около 30 минут. Если возникнут какие-либо вопросы относительно исследования и его компонентов, будет организована онлайн или очная встреча.

**Риски.** Потенциальные риски участия в этом исследовании минимальны. Никаких рисков для школы нет, так как вся личная информация студентов будет конфиденциальной и доступной только исследователю. Однако тема национальной идентичности и языка может рассматриваться как личная. Поэтому участники могут испытывать дискомфорт во время опроса и интервью. Участникам будет предложено встретиться лицом к лицу в удобном для них месте, чтобы исследователь смог создать дружескую атмосферу, которую трудно создать онлайн и, несомненно, соблюдая все необходимые меры безопасности. Более того, студенты могут подумать, что их личная информация и ответы будут доступны для всех. Таким образом, они будут осведомлены об анонимности, конфиденциальности и отсутствии прослеживаемости всех собранных данных.

**Преимущества.** Это исследование может быть полезным для школ с трехязычными образовательными программами, а полученные результаты могут внести свой вклад в область образовательных исследований. По результатам этого исследования школы с разными языками преподавания могут организовывать различные мероприятия с целью сохранения национальной идентичности и формирования позитивного отношения к казахскому языку. Что касается самих участников, то возможно они не получают никакой прямой выгоды от участия в данном исследовании. Тем не менее, это участие может способствовать лучшему пониманию формирования их национальной идентичности и их позиции по отношению к национальному языку.

**Компенсация.** Никакой материальной компенсации не будет. Копия результатов исследования будет доступна по завершении исследования. Полное исследование будет доступно на сайте NU Repository и, при необходимости, копия результатов исследования будет отправлена в школу.

**Конфиденциальность & Приватность.** Любая информация, полученная в ходе этого исследования, будет храниться в полной конфиденциальности в максимальной возможной степени. Опрос будет анонимным, и исследователю будут доступны только ответы студентов без каких-либо идентифицирующих данных. Данные,

полученные в ходе интервью, будут конфиденциальными. Личные данные студентов, собранные сведения и записи будут храниться отдельно в защищенном паролем компьютере без общего доступа. Настоящие имена студентов будут заменены псевдонимами. В письменной форме и устных обсуждениях не будет сделано никаких отсылок, которые могли бы раскрыть личность ваших студентов.

**Добровольный характер исследования.** Участие в этом исследовании является строго добровольным, и если согласие на участие будет дано, оно может быть отозвано в любое время без ущерба для участника.

**Контакты.** В случае возникновения каких-либо вопросов или замечаний относительно этого проекта или получения травмы, связанной с исследованием, следует обратиться к научному руководителю магистерской диссертации, *д-р Сайед Абдул Манан*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Любые другие вопросы или проблемы могут быть адресованы в Комитет по этике институциональных исследований Назарбаев Университета, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Заявление о согласии.**

Я, \_\_\_\_\_,

Даю свое добровольное согласие на участие в данном исследовании.

Исследователи четко объяснили мне общую информацию и цели исследования, а также то, что включает в себя мое участие в данном исследовании.

Я понимаю, что мое участие в этом исследовании является добровольным. Я могу в любое время и без объяснения причин отозвать свое согласие, и это не будет иметь для меня никаких негативных последствий.

Я понимаю, что информация, собранная в ходе этого исследования, будет рассматриваться конфиденциально.

Подпись: \_\_\_\_\_ Дата: \_\_\_\_\_

Исследователь:

Подпись \_\_\_\_\_ Дата \_\_\_\_\_

## Informed Consent Form for Teacher #1

**Introduction.** Your class invited to participate in a research study entitled “Kazakh Students’ Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School”.

**Procedures.** The purpose of this research is to explore Kazakh students’ identity formation in trilingual school and analyze how different languages of teaching influence students’ attitude towards the Kazakh language. Therefore, Kazakh students studying at your class are invited to participate in this study which involves the online survey and interviews. As the research involves students under 18, parents’ permission will be asked. With your help, I will distribute consent forms among parents of your students. If there are any questions regarding the research and its components, online or face-to-face meeting will be organized. The completion of the survey will take approximately 10-15 minutes. The interviews will be one-to-one online and will take about 30 minutes.

**Risks.** The potential risks of participating in this study are minimal. There are no risks for the class as all the personal information of the students will be confidential and available only for the researcher. However, the topic of national identity and language can be considered as being the personal one. Therefore, participants might feel individual discomfort when answering several questions of the survey and interview. The participants will be proposed to meet face-to-face in the habitual place that is comfortable for them, so the researcher will be able to create friendly atmosphere which is hard via internet, and, undoubtedly, keeping all the necessary measures for the safety. Moreover, students might think that their personal information and responses will be available for everyone. Therefore, they will be assured of the anonymity, confidentiality and non-traceability of all gathered data.

**Benefits.** The research might be beneficial for schools with trilingual education programs and findings might contribute to the educational research field. With the results of this research, schools with different languages of teaching might organize different events with the aim to preserve national identity and evoke positive attitude towards the Kazakh language. As for the participants, there no direct benefits for them. Yet, this participation might develop a better awareness of their national identity formation and their position towards the national language. For you as a teacher, this research might be beneficial in understanding your students’ identities and their language preferences.

**Compensation.** No tangible compensation will be given. A copy of the research results will be available at the conclusion of the study. The whole research will be available in the NU Repository website and, if necessary, the copy of the results of the study will be sent to the school.

**Confidentiality & Privacy.** Any information that is obtained during this study will be kept confidential to the full extent possible. The survey will be anonymous and only students’ responses will be available for the researcher without any identifiable data. The data obtained from the interview will be confidential. The personal data of students, gathered data and recordings will be kept separately in the password protected computer without shared access. The real names of students will be substituted by pseudonyms. In a written form and oral discussions no reference that could reveal your students’ identities will be made.

**Voluntary Nature of the Study.** Participation in this study is strictly voluntary, and if agreement to participation is given, it can be withdrawn at any time without prejudice.



**Points of Contact.** It is understood that should any questions or comments arise regarding this project, or a research related injury is received, the Master's thesis Supervisor, *Dr. Syed Abdul Manan*, +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz) should be contacted. Any other questions or concerns may be addressed to the Nazarbayev University Institutional Research Ethics Committee, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Statement of Consent.**

I, \_\_\_\_\_,

Give my voluntary consent to participate in this study.

The researchers clearly explained to me the background information and objectives of the study and what my participation in this study involves.

I understand that my participation in this study is voluntary. I can at any time and without giving any reasons withdraw my consent, and this will not have any negative consequences for myself.

I understand that the information collected during this study will be treated confidentially.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Researcher:

Signed \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

## Informed Consent Form for Teacher #2

Мұғалімге арналған зерттеу жұмысы келісімінің ақпараттық формасы

**Кіріспе.** Сіздің сыныбыңыз «Назарбаев Зияткерлік мектебіндегі үштілді білім беру бағдарламасы аясында қазақстандық оқушылардың жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуы» атты ғылыми-зерттеу жұмысына қатысуға шақырамыз.

**Процедуралары.** Бұл зерттеудің мақсаты - үштілді мектептегі қазақ оқушыларының жеке тұлғалық қалыптасуын және оқушылардың әр түрлі тілде оқытудың қазақ тіліне деген көзқарасына қалай әсер ететіндігін талдау. Сондықтан сіздің сыныпта оқитын қазақ оқушылары онлайн-сауалнама мен сұхбаттасуды қамтитын осы зерттеуге қатысуға шақырылады. Зерттеуге 18 жасқа дейінгі студенттер қатысатындықтан, ата-аналардың рұқсаты сұралады. Сіздің көмегіңізбен мен сіздің студенттеріңіздің ата-аналарына келісім формаларын таратамын. Егер зерттеу мен оның компоненттеріне қатысты сұрақтар туындаса, онлайн немесе бетпе-бет кездесу ұйымдастырылады. Сауалнама шамамен 10-15 минутты алады. Сұхбат онлайн режимінде жеке жүргізіліп, шамамен 30 минутты алады.

**Қауіптері.** Зерттеу жұмысына қатысудың қауіптері өте аз. Сыныпқа ешқандай қауіп жоқ, өйткені студенттердің барлық жеке мәліметтері құпия және тек зерттеушіге ғана қол жетімді болады. Алайда ұлттық тұлға мен тіл тақырыбы жеке тақырып ретінде қарастырылуы мүмкін. Сондықтан қатысушылар сауалнама мен сұхбат кезінде ыңғайсыздықты сезінуі мүмкін. Зерттеуші, қажетті қауіпсіздік шараларын сақтай отырып, достық атмосферасын құру үшін қатысушыларды өздеріне ыңғайлы жерде бетпе-бет кездесуге шақырады. Сонымен қатар, студенттер өздерінің жеке мәліметтері мен жауаптары барлығына қол жетімді болады деп ойлауы мүмкін. Осылайша, олар барлық жиналған деректердің анонимділігі, құпиялылығы және қадағаланбауы туралы хабардар болады.

**Артықшылықтары.** Бұл зерттеу үштілді білім беру бағдарламалары бар мектептер үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін және алынған нәтижелер білім беру саласындағы зерттеулерге ықпал етуі мүмкін. Осы зерттеудің нәтижелері бойынша әртүрлі тілде оқытатын мектептер ұлттық тұлғалықты сақтау және қазақ тіліне оң көзқарас қалыптастыру мақсатында түрлі іс-шаралар ұйымдастыра алады. Қатысушылардың өздеріне келетін болсақ, олар осы зерттеуге қатысудан тікелей пайда көре алмауы мүмкін. Алайда, бұл қатысу олардың ұлттық тұлғалықтарын және олардың ұлттық тілге қатысты ұстанымын жақсы түсінуге ықпал етуі мүмкін. Сіз үшін, мұғалім ретінде, бұл зерттеу оқушылардың жеке тұлғалықтарын және олардың тілдік қалауын түсінуде пайдалы болуы мүмкін.

**Компенсация.** Материалдық өтемақы болмайды. Зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі зерттеу аяқталғаннан кейін қол жетімді болады. Толық зерттеу NU Repository сайтында қол жетімді болады және қажет болған жағдайда зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі мектепке жіберіледі.

**Құпиялылық.** Осы зерттеу барысында алынған кез-келген ақпарат мүмкіндігінше толық құпиялылықта сақталады. Сауалнама анонимді болады және зерттеушіге тек студенттердің жауаптары ешқандай сәйкестендірісиз қол жетімді болады. Сұхбат барысында алынған мәліметтер құпия болады. Студенттердің жеке деректері,

жиналған мәліметтер мен жазбалар ортақ қол жеткізусіз парольмен қорғалған компьютерде бөлек сақталады. Студенттердің нақты есімдері бүркеншік аттармен ауыстырылады. Жазбаша және ауызша талқылауларда студенттердің жеке басын ашатын сілтемелер жасалмайды.

**Зерттеудің ерікті сипаты.** Бұл зерттеуге қатысу қатаң ерікті болып табылады және егер қатысуға келісім берілсе, ол қатысушыға зиян келтірместен кез келген уақытта кері қайтарылуы мүмкін.

**Байланыс ақпараты.** Осы жобаға қатысты қандай да бір сұрақтар немесе ескертулер туындаған немесе зерттеуге байланысты жарақат алған жағдайда магистрлік диссертацияның ғылыми жетекшісіне хабарласуыңызға болады, *доктор Сәйед Абдул Мананга*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Кез келген басқа мәселелер Назарбаев Университетінің Институционалдық зерттеулер этикасы комитетіне жіберілуі мүмкін, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Келісім туралы өтініш.**

Мен, \_\_\_\_\_,

Осы зерттеуге қатысуға ерікті келісімімді беремін.

Зерттеушілер маған жалпы ақпарат пен зерттеу мақсаттарын, сондай-ақ менің осы зерттеуге қатысуым туралы нақты түсіндірді.

Менің бұл зерттеуге қатысуым ерікті екенін түсінемін. Мен кез-келген уақытта және түсіндірусіз келісімімді қайтарып ала аламын, және бұл маған ешқандай жағымсыз әсер етпейді.

Осы зерттеу барысында жиналған ақпарат құпия түрде қаралатынын түсінемін.

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

Зерттеуші:

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

## Informed Consent Form for Teacher #3

## Форма Информационного Согласия для Учителя

**Введение.** Ваш класс приглашается принять участие в научном исследовании под названием “Формирование идентичности казахстанских студентов в рамках трехязычной образовательной программы в Назарбаев Интеллектуальной школе”.

**Процедуры.** Целью данного исследования является изучение формирования идентичности казахских студентов в трехязычной школе и анализ того, как различные языки обучения влияют на отношение студентов к казахскому языку. Поэтому студенты Казахи, обучающиеся в вашем классе, приглашаются к участию в данном исследовании, которое включает в себя онлайн опрос и интервью. Поскольку в исследовании участвуют студенты младше 18 лет, будет запрошено разрешение родителей. С вашей помощью я распространю формы согласия среди родителей ваших учеников. Если возникнут какие-либо вопросы относительно исследования и его компонентов, будет организована онлайн или очная встреча. Опрос займет примерно 10-15 минут. Собеседования будут проводиться один на один в режиме онлайн и займут около 30 минут.

**Риски.** Потенциальные риски участия в этом исследовании минимальны. Никаких рисков для класса нет, так как вся личная информация студентов будет конфиденциальной и доступной только исследователю. Однако тема национальной идентичности и языка может рассматриваться как личная. Поэтому участники могут испытывать дискомфорт во время опроса и интервью. Участникам будет предложено встретиться лицом к лицу в удобном для них месте, чтобы исследователь смог создать дружескую атмосферу, которую трудно создать онлайн и, несомненно, соблюдая все необходимые меры безопасности. Более того, студенты могут подумать, что их личная информация и ответы будут доступны для всех. Таким образом, они будут осведомлены об анонимности, конфиденциальности и отсутствии прослеживаемости всех собранных данных.

**Преимущества.** Это исследование может быть полезным для школ с трехязычными образовательными программами, а полученные результаты могут внести свой вклад в область образовательных исследований. По результатам этого исследования школы с разными языками преподавания могут организовывать различные мероприятия с целью сохранения национальной идентичности и формирования позитивного отношения к казахскому языку. Что касается самих участников, то возможно они не получают никакой прямой выгоды от участия в данном исследовании. Тем не менее, это участие может способствовать лучшему пониманию формирования их национальной идентичности и их позиции по отношению к национальному языку. Для вас, как для преподавателя, это исследование может быть полезным в понимании идентичности ваших студентов и их языковых предпочтений.

**Компенсация.** Никакой материальной компенсации не будет. Копия результатов исследования будет доступна по завершении исследования. Полное исследование будет доступно на сайте NU Repository и, при необходимости, копия результатов исследования будет отправлена в школу.

**Конфиденциальность & Приватность.** Любая информация, полученная в ходе этого исследования, будет храниться в полной конфиденциальности в максимально возможной степени. Опрос будет анонимным, и исследователю будут доступны только ответы студентов без каких-либо идентифицирующих данных. Данные, полученные в ходе интервью, будут конфиденциальными. Личные данные студентов, собранные сведения и записи будут храниться отдельно в защищенном паролем компьютере без общего доступа. Настоящие имена студентов будут заменены псевдонимами. В письменной форме и устных обсуждениях не будет сделано никаких отсылок, которые могли бы раскрыть личность ваших студентов.

**Добровольный характер исследования.** Участие в этом исследовании является строго добровольным, и если согласие на участие будет дано, оно может быть отозвано в любое время без ущерба для участника.

**Контакты.** В случае возникновения каких-либо вопросов или замечаний относительно этого проекта или получения травмы, связанной с исследованием, следует обратиться к научному руководителю магистерской диссертации, *д-р Сайед Абдул Манан*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Любые другие вопросы или проблемы могут быть адресованы в Комитет по этике институциональных исследований Назарбаев Университета, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Заявление о согласии.**

Я, \_\_\_\_\_,

Даю свое добровольное согласие на участие в данном исследовании.

Исследователи четко объяснили мне общую информацию и цели исследования, а также то, что включает в себя мое участие в данном исследовании.

Я понимаю, что мое участие в этом исследовании является добровольным. Я могу в любое время и без объяснения причин отозвать свое согласие, и это не будет иметь для меня никаких негативных последствий.

Я понимаю, что информация, собранная в ходе этого исследования, будет рассматриваться конфиденциально.

Подпись: \_\_\_\_\_ Дата: \_\_\_\_\_

Исследователь:

Подпись \_\_\_\_\_ Дата \_\_\_\_\_

## Survey Participation

### Written Informed Consent Form for Parent #1

**Introduction.** Your child is invited to participate in a research study entitled “Kazakh Students’ Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School”.

**Procedures.** The purpose of this research is to explore Kazakh students’ identity formation in trilingual school and analyze how different languages of teaching influence students’ attitude towards the Kazakh language. Your child will be asked to complete a survey which will be online and the link will be sent to your child. This survey will take approximately 10-15 minutes to complete.

**Risks.** The potential risks of participating in this study are minimal. However, the topic of national identity and language can be considered as being the personal one. Therefore, participants might feel individual discomfort when answering several questions of the interview. Also, your child might think that his/her personal information and responses will be available for everyone. However, anonymity, confidentiality and non-traceability of the research are guaranteed. All the personal information of the students will be confidential and available only for the researcher.

**Benefits.** The research might be beneficial for schools with trilingual education programs and findings might contribute to the educational research field. With the results of this research, schools with different languages of teaching might organize different events with the aim to preserve national identity and evoke positive attitude towards the Kazakh language. As for the participants, there no direct benefits for them. Yet, this participation might develop a better awareness of their national identity formation and their position towards the national language.

**Compensation.** No tangible compensation will be given. A copy of the research results will be available at the conclusion of the study. The whole research will be available in the NU Repository website and, if necessary, the copy of the results of the study will be sent to your child.

**Confidentiality & Privacy.** Any information that is obtained during this study will be kept confidential to the full extent possible. The survey will be anonymous and only your child’s responses will be available for the researcher without any identifiable data. In a written form and oral discussions no reference that could reveal the your child’s identity will be made. The consent forms and gathered data will be kept separately in the password-protected computer and personal data from the consent forms will not be shared within school and university. So, the anonymity and confidentiality processes are guaranteed.

**Voluntary Nature of the Study.** Participation in this study is strictly voluntary, and if agreement to participation is given, it can be withdrawn at any time without prejudice.

**Points of Contact.** It is understood that should any questions or comments arise regarding this project, or a research related injury is received, the Master’s thesis Supervisor, *Dr. Syed Abdul Manan*, +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz) should be contacted. Any other questions or concerns may be addressed to the Nazarbayev University Institutional Research Ethics Committee, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Statement of Consent.**

I, \_\_\_\_\_,

Give my voluntary consent to participate in this study.

The researchers clearly explained to me the background information and objectives of the study and what my participation in this study involves.

I understand that my participation in this study is voluntary. I can at any time and without giving any reasons withdraw my consent, and this will not have any negative consequences for myself.

I understand that the information collected during this study will be treated confidentially.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Researcher:

Signed \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

## Survey Participation

## Written Informed Consent Form for Parent #2

## Сауалнамаға қатысу

Ата-анаға арналған зерттеу жұмысы келісімінің ақпараттық формасы

**Кіріспе.** Сіздің мектебіңізді «Назарбаев Зияткерлік мектебіндегі үштілді білім беру бағдарламасы аясында қазақстандық оқушылардың жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуы» атты ғылыми-зерттеу жұмысына қатысуға шақырамыз.

**Процедуралары.** Бұл зерттеудің мақсаты - үштілді мектептегі қазақ оқушыларының жеке тұлғалық қалыптасуын және оқушылардың әр түрлі тілде оқытудың қазақ тіліне деген көзқарасына қалай әсер ететіндігін талдау. Сіздің балаңыздан онлайн сауалнаманы толтыру сұралады, сауалнамаға сілтеме сіздің балаңызға жіберіледі. Бұл сауалнама шамамен 10-15 минутты алады.

**Қауіптері.** Зерттеу жұмысына қатысудың қауіптері өте аз. Алайда ұлттық тұлға мен тіл тақырыбы жеке тақырып ретінде қарастырылуы мүмкін. Сондықтан қатысушылар сауалнама кезінде ыңғайсыздықты сезінуі мүмкін. Сонымен қатар, студенттер өздерінің жеке мәліметтері мен жауаптары барлығына қол жетімді болады деп ойлауы мүмкін. Осылайша, олар барлық жиналған деректердің анонимділігі, құпиялылығы және қадағаланбауы туралы хабардар болады. Осылайша, барлық жиналған деректер құпияда сақталады. Студенттердің барлық жеке мәліметтері құпия және тек зерттеушіге ғана қол жетімді болады.

**Артықшылықтары.** Бұл зерттеу үштілді білім беру бағдарламалары бар мектептер үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін және алынған нәтижелер білім беру саласындағы зерттеулерге ықпал етуі мүмкін. Осы зерттеудің нәтижелері бойынша әртүрлі тілде оқытатын мектептер ұлттық тұлғалықты сақтау және қазақ тіліне оң көзқарас қалыптастыру мақсатында түрлі іс-шаралар ұйымдастыра алады. Қатысушылардың өздеріне келетін болсақ, олар осы зерттеуге қатысудан тікелей пайда көре алмауы мүмкін. Алайда, бұл қатысу олардың ұлттық тұлғалықтарын және олардың ұлттық тілге қатысты ұстанымын жақсы түсінуге ықпал етуі мүмкін.

**Компенсация.** Материалдық өтемақы болмайды. Зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі зерттеу аяқталғаннан кейін қол жетімді болады. Толық зерттеу NU Repository сайтында қол жетімді болады және қажет болған жағдайда зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі мектепке жіберіледі.

**Құпиялылық.** Осы зерттеу барысында алынған кез-келген ақпарат мүмкіндігінше толық құпиялылықта сақталады. Сауалнама анонимді болады және зерттеушіге тек сіздің балаңыздың жауаптары ешқандай сәйкестендіріусіз қол жетімді болады. Жазбаша және ауызша талқылауларда сіздің балаңыздың жеке басын ашатын сілтемелер жасалмайды.

**Зерттеудің ерікті сипаты.** Бұл зерттеуге қатысу қатаң ерікті болып табылады және егер қатысуға келісім берілсе, ол қатысушыға зиян келтірместен кез келген уақытта кері қайтарылуы мүмкін.



**Байланыс ақпараты.** Осы жобаға қатысты қандай да бір сұрақтар немесе ескертулер туындаған немесе зерттеуге байланысты жарақат алған жағдайда магистрлік диссертацияның ғылыми жетекшісіне хабарласуыңызға болады, *доктор Сайед Абдул Мананга*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Кез келген басқа мәселелер Назарбаев Университетінің Институционалдық зерттеулер этикасы комитетіне жіберілуі мүмкін, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Келісім туралы өтініш.**

Мен, \_\_\_\_\_,

Осы зерттеуге қатысуға ерікті келісімді беремін.

Зерттеушілер маған жалпы ақпарат пен зерттеу мақсаттарын, сондай-ақ менің осы зерттеуге қатысуым туралы нақты түсіндірді.

Менің бұл зерттеуге қатысуым ерікті екенін түсінемін. Мен кез-келген уақытта және түсіндірусіз келісімді қайтарып ала аламын, және бұл маған ешқандай жағымсыз әсер етпейді.

Осы зерттеу барысында жиналған ақпарат құпия түрде қаралатынын түсінемін.

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

Зерттеуші:

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

## Survey Participation

### Written Informed Consent Form for Parent #3

#### Участие в Опросе

#### Форма Информационного Согласия для Родителя

**Введение.** Ваша школа приглашается принять участие в научном исследовании под названием “Формирование идентичности казахстанских студентов в рамках трехязычной образовательной программы в Назарбаев Интеллектуальной школе”.

**Процедуры.** Целью данного исследования является изучение формирования идентичности казахских студентов в трехязычной школе и анализ того, как различные языки обучения влияют на отношение студентов к казахскому языку. Вашему ребенку будет предложено заполнить онлайн анкету, ссылка будет отправлена вашему ребенку. Этот опрос займет примерно 10-15 минут.

**Риски.** Потенциальные риски участия в этом исследовании минимальны. Однако тема национальной идентичности и языка может рассматриваться как личная. Поэтому участники могут испытывать дискомфорт во время опроса. Более того, студенты могут подумать, что их личная информация и ответы будут доступны для всех. Таким образом, анонимность, будут предприняты все усилия для сохранения конфиденциальности данных. Вся личная информация студентов будет конфиденциальной и доступной только исследователю.

**Преимущества.** Это исследование может быть полезным для школ с трехязычными образовательными программами, а полученные результаты могут внести свой вклад в область образовательных исследований. По результатам этого исследования школы с разными языками преподавания могут организовывать различные мероприятия с целью сохранения национальной идентичности и формирования позитивного отношения к казахскому языку. Что касается самих участников, то возможно они не получают никакой прямой выгоды от участия в данном исследовании. Тем не менее, это участие может способствовать лучшему пониманию формирования их национальной идентичности и их позиции по отношению к национальному языку.

**Компенсация.** Никакой материальной компенсации не будет. Копия результатов исследования будет доступна по завершении исследования. Полное исследование будет доступно на сайте NU Repository и, при необходимости, копия результатов исследования будет отправлена в школу.

**Конфиденциальность & Приватность.** Любая информация, полученная в ходе этого исследования, будет храниться в полной конфиденциальности в максимально возможной степени. Опрос будет анонимным, и исследователю будут доступны только ответы вашего ребенка без каких-либо идентифицирующих данных. В письменной форме и устных обсуждениях не будет сделано никаких отсылок, которые могли бы раскрыть личность вашего ребенка. Формы согласия и собранные сведения будут храниться отдельно в защищенном паролем компьютере без общего

доступа. Таким образом, анонимность и конфиденциальность процессов гарантированы.

**Добровольный характер исследования.** Участие в этом исследовании является строго добровольным, и если согласие на участие будет дано, оно может быть отозвано в любое время без ущерба для участника.

**Контакты.** В случае возникновения каких-либо вопросов или замечаний относительно этого проекта или получения травмы, связанной с исследованием, следует обратиться к научному руководителю магистерской диссертации, *д-р Саїед Абдул Манан*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Любые другие вопросы или проблемы могут быть адресованы в Комитет по этике институциональных исследований Назарбаев Университета, [resetethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resetethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Заявление о согласии.**

Я, \_\_\_\_\_,

Даю свое добровольное согласие на участие в данном исследовании.

Исследователи четко объяснили мне общую информацию и цели исследования, а также то, что включает в себя мое участие в данном исследовании.

Я понимаю, что мое участие в этом исследовании является добровольным. Я могу в любое время и без объяснения причин отозвать свое согласие, и это не будет иметь для меня никаких негативных последствий.

Я понимаю, что информация, собранная в ходе этого исследования, будет рассматриваться конфиденциально.

Подпись: \_\_\_\_\_ Дата: \_\_\_\_\_

Исследователь:

Подпись \_\_\_\_\_ Дата \_\_\_\_\_

## Interview Participation

## Written Informed Consent Form Parent #1

**Introduction.** Your child is invited to participate in a research study entitled “Kazakh Students’ Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School”.

**Procedures.** The purpose of this research is to explore Kazakh students’ identity formation in trilingual school and analyze how different languages of teaching influence students’ attitude towards the Kazakh language. Your child will be asked to participate in the interview which will be online and one-to-one. The convenient online platform and date for your child will be chosen and then the link will be sent. This interview will take approximately 30 minutes.

**Risks.** The potential risks of participating in this study are minimal. However, the topic of national identity and language can be considered as being the personal one. Therefore, participants might feel individual discomfort when answering several questions of the interview. Also, your child might think that his/her personal information and responses will be available for everyone. However, all the efforts will be made to keep the data confidential. All the personal information of the students will be confidential and available only for the researcher.

**Benefits.** The research might be beneficial for schools with trilingual education programs and findings might contribute to the educational research field. With the results of this research, schools with different languages of teaching might organize different events with the aim to preserve national identity and evoke positive attitude towards the Kazakh language. As for the participants, there no direct benefits for them. Yet, this participation might develop a better awareness of their national identity formation and their position towards the national language.

**Compensation.** No tangible compensation will be given. A copy of the research results will be available at the conclusion of the study. The whole research will be available in the NU Repository website and, if necessary, the copy of the results of the study will be sent to your child.

**Confidentiality & Privacy.** Any information that is obtained during this study will be kept confidential to the full extent possible. The data obtained from the interview will be confidential. The personal data of your child, gathered data and recordings will be kept separately in the password protected computer without shared access. The real names of your child will be substituted by pseudonym. In a written form and oral discussions no reference that could reveal the participant’s identity will be made.

**Voluntary Nature of the Study.** Participation in this study is strictly voluntary, and if agreement to participation is given, it can be withdrawn at any time without prejudice.

**Points of Contact.** It is understood that should any questions or comments arise regarding this project, or a research related injury is received, the Master’s thesis Supervisor, *Dr. Syed Abdul Manan*, +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz) should be contacted. Any other questions or concerns may be addressed to the Nazarbayev University Institutional Research Ethics Committee, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Statement of Consent.**

I, \_\_\_\_\_,

Give my voluntary consent for my child to participate in this study.

The researchers clearly explained to me the background information and objectives of the study and what my child's participation in this study involves.

I understand that my child's participation in this study is voluntary. My child can at any time and without giving any reasons withdraw this consent, and this will not have any negative consequences for my child.

I understand that the information collected during this study will be treated confidentially.

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Researcher:

Signed \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

## Interview Participation

## Written Informed Consent Form for Parent #2

## Сұхбатқа қатысу

Ата-анаға арналған зерттеу жұмысы келісімінің ақпараттық формасы

**Кіріспе.** Сіздің мектебіңізді «Назарбаев Зияткерлік мектебіндегі үштілді білім беру бағдарламасы аясында қазақстандық оқушылардың жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуы» атты ғылыми-зерттеу жұмысына қатысуға шақырамыз.

**Процедуралары.** Бұл зерттеудің мақсаты - үштілді мектептегі қазақ оқушыларының жеке тұлғалық қалыптасуын және оқушылардың әр түрлі тілде оқытудың қазақ тіліне деген көзқарасына қалай әсер ететіндігін талдау. Сіздің балаңыз онлайн және бірге бір өтетін сұхбатқа қатысуға шақырылады. Сіздің балаңызға ыңғайлы онлайн платформа мен күн таңдалады, содан кейін сілтеме жіберіледі. Бұл сұхбат шамамен 30 минутты алады.

**Қауіптері.** Зерттеу жұмысына қатысудың қауіптері өте аз. Алайда ұлттық тұлға мен тіл тақырыбы жеке тақырып ретінде қарастырылуы мүмкін. Сондықтан қатысушылар сұхбат кезінде ыңғайсыздықты сезінуі мүмкін. Сонымен қатар, оқушылар өздерінің жеке мәліметтері мен жауаптары барлығына қол жетімді болады деп ойлауы мүмкін. Осылайша, барлық жиналған деректердің құпиялылығы және қадағаланбауына кепілдік беріледі. Оқушылардың барлық жеке мәліметтері құпия және тек зерттеушіге ғана қол жетімді болады.

**Артықшылықтары.** Бұл зерттеу үштілді білім беру бағдарламалары бар мектептер үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін және алынған нәтижелер білім беру саласындағы зерттеулерге ықпал етуі мүмкін. Осы зерттеудің нәтижелері бойынша әртүрлі тілде оқытатын мектептер ұлттық тұлғалықты сақтау және қазақ тіліне оң көзқарас қалыптастыру мақсатында түрлі іс-шаралар ұйымдастыра алады. Қатысушылардың өздеріне келетін болсақ, олар осы зерттеуге қатысудан тікелей пайда көре алмауы мүмкін. Алайда, бұл қатысу олардың ұлттық тұлғалықтарын және олардың ұлттық тілге қатысты ұстанымын жақсы түсінуге ықпал етуі мүмкін.

**Компенсация.** Материалдық өтемақы болмайды. Зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі зерттеу аяқталғаннан кейін қол жетімді болады. Толық зерттеу NU Repository сайтында қол жетімді болады және қажет болған жағдайда зерттеу нәтижелерінің көшірмесі мектепке жіберіледі.

**Құпиялылық.** Осы зерттеу барысында алынған кез-келген ақпарат мүмкіндігінше толық құпиялылықта сақталады. Сұхбат барысында алынған мәліметтер құпия болады. Сіздің балаңыздың жеке деректері, жиналған мәліметтер мен жазбалар ортақ қол жеткізусіз парольмен қорғалған компьютерде бөлек сақталады. Сіздің балаңыздың шың есімі бүркеншік атпен ауыстырылады. Жазбаша және ауызша талқылауларда студенттердің жеке басын ашатын сілтемелер жасалмайды.

**Зерттеудің ерікті сипаты.** Бұл зерттеуге қатысу қатаң ерікті болып табылады және егер қатысуға келісім берілсе, ол қатысушыға зиян келтірместен кез келген уақытта кері қайтарылуы мүмкін.

**Байланыс ақпараты.** Осы жобаға қатысты қандай да бір сұрақтар немесе ескертулер туындаған немесе зерттеуге байланысты жарақат алған жағдайда магистрлік диссертацияның ғылыми жетекшісіне хабарласуыңызға болады, *доктор Сайед Абдул Мананга*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Кез келген басқа мәселелер Назарбаев Университетінің Институционалдық зерттеулер этикасы комитетіне жіберілуі мүмкін, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Келісім туралы өтініш.**

Мен, \_\_\_\_\_,

Осы зерттеуге баламның қатысуына ерікті келісімді беремін.

Зерттеушілер маған жалпы ақпарат пен зерттеу мақсаттарын, сондай-ақ менің баламның осы зерттеуге қатысуы туралы нақты түсіндірді.

Менің баламның бұл зерттеуге қатысуым ерікті екенін түсінемін. Менің балам кез-келген уақытта және түсіндірусіз келісімді қайтарып ала аламын, және бұл менің балама ешқандай жағымсыз әсер етпейді.

Осы зерттеу барысында жиналған ақпарат құпия түрде қаралатынын түсінемін.

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

Зерттеуші:

Қолы: \_\_\_\_\_ Күні: \_\_\_\_\_

## Interview Participation

## Written Consent Form for Parent #3

## Участие в Интервью

## Форма Информационного Согласия для Родителя

**Введение.** Ваша школа приглашается принять участие в научном исследовании под названием “Формирование идентичности казахстанских студентов в рамках трехязычной образовательной программы в Назарбаев Интеллектуальной школе”.

**Процедуры.** Целью данного исследования является изучение формирования идентичности казахских студентов в трехязычной школе и анализ того, как различные языки обучения влияют на отношение студентов к казахскому языку. Вашему ребенку будет предложено принять участие в интервью, которое будет проходить онлайн и один на один. Будет выбрана удобная для вашего ребенка онлайн-платформа и дата, а затем будет отправлена ссылка. Это интервью займет примерно 30 минут.

**Риски.** Потенциальные риски участия в этом исследовании минимальны. Однако тема национальной идентичности и языка может рассматриваться как личная. Поэтому участники могут испытывать дискомфорт во время интервью. Более того, ученики могут подумать, что их личная информация и ответы будут доступны для всех. Таким образом, конфиденциальность и отсутствие прослеживаемости всех собранных данных будет гарантирована. Вся личная информация учеников будет конфиденциальной и доступной только исследователю.

**Преимущества.** Это исследование может быть полезным для школ с трехязычными образовательными программами, а полученные результаты могут внести свой вклад в область образовательных исследований. По результатам этого исследования школы с разными языками преподавания могут организовывать различные мероприятия с целью сохранения национальной идентичности и формирования позитивного отношения к казахскому языку. Что касается самих участников, то возможно они не получают никакой прямой выгоды от участия в данном исследовании. Тем не менее, это участие может способствовать лучшему пониманию формирования их национальной идентичности и их позиции по отношению к национальному языку.

**Компенсация.** Никакой материальной компенсации не будет. Копия результатов исследования будет доступна по завершении исследования. Полное исследование будет доступно на сайте NU Repository и, при необходимости, копия результатов исследования будет отправлена вашему ребенку.

**Конфиденциальность & Приватность.** Любая информация, полученная в ходе этого исследования, будет храниться в полной конфиденциальности в максимально возможной степени. Данные, полученные в ходе интервью, будут конфиденциальными. Личные данные вашего ребенка, собранные сведения и записи будут храниться отдельно в защищенном паролем компьютере без общего доступа. Настоящее имя вашего ребенка будет заменено псевдонимом. В письменной форме и



устных обсуждениях не будет сделано никаких отсылок, которые могли бы раскрыть личность участника.

**Добровольный характер исследования.** Участие в этом исследовании является строго добровольным, и если согласие на участие будет дано, оно может быть отозвано в любое время без ущерба для участника.

**Контакты.** В случае возникновения каких-либо вопросов или замечаний относительно этого проекта или получения травмы, связанной с исследованием, следует обратиться к научному руководителю магистерской диссертации, *д-р Сайед Абдул Манан*, +77079240053, syed.manan@nu.edu.kz. Любые другие вопросы или проблемы могут быть адресованы в Комитет по этике институциональных исследований Назарбаев Университета, [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Заявление о согласии.**

Я, \_\_\_\_\_,  
Даю свое добровольное согласие на участие моего ребенка в данном исследовании. Исследователи четко объяснили мне общую информацию и цели исследования, а также то, что включает в себя участие моего ребенка в данном исследовании.

Я понимаю, что участие моего ребенка в этом исследовании является добровольным. Мой ребенок может в любое время и без объяснения причин отозвать свое согласие, и это не будет иметь для моего ребенка никаких негативных последствий.

Я понимаю, что информация, собранная в ходе этого исследования, будет рассматриваться конфиденциально.

Подпись: \_\_\_\_\_ Дата: \_\_\_\_\_

Исследователь:

Подпись \_\_\_\_\_ Дата \_\_\_\_\_

## Survey Participation

### Child Assent Form #1

Kazakh Students' Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School (NIS)

You are asked to participate in a study done by Altyn Mukhayeva from the Graduate School of Education at the Nazarbayev University (NU). You were chosen as a possible participant in this study because you are Kazakh student who study through the Kazakh, Russia and English languages. This is the criteria for the selection of participants. Your participation in this research study is voluntary.

#### **Why is this study being done?**

The study looks at the identity formation of Kazakh students' who study at the NIS and how different languages of teaching influence their attitude to the Kazakh language. The research is about in what ways different languages of teaching shape students' Kazakhstani national identity to more global one.

#### **What will happen if I take part in this research study?**

Please talk about this with your parents before you decide whether or not to participate. We will also ask your parents to give their permission for you to take part in this study. But even if your parents say "yes" you can still decide not to do this.

If you volunteer to participate in this study, the researcher will ask you to do the following:

1. You will receive the link for the survey.
2. The survey will be anonymous.
3. The survey includes background questions (gender, grade, the level of language knowledge) and statements on national identity and language with which you disagree or agree.
4. You will be able to do the survey at any comfortable place for you using phone, laptop, or any other electronic device.

#### **How long will I be in the research study?**

Participation in the study will take a total of about 10-15 minutes.

#### **Are there any potential risks or discomforts that I can expect from this study?**

There are no anticipated risks or discomfort. You might feel some discomfort because of some questions. But, the survey is anonymous and does not include your name and your answers are confidential.

#### **Are there any potential benefits if I participate?**

You will not directly benefit from your participation in the research. But, the study might be helpful for you to understand the strength of your national identity.

The results of the research may help to understand the connection between identity and language. Also, with the results this research, schools with different languages of teaching might organize different events to preserve national identity and positive attitude towards the Kazakh language.

#### **Will I receive any payment if I participate in this study?**

You will receive no payment for your participation.

**Will information about me and my participation be kept confidential?**

Any information from this survey and that identify you will be anonymous and confidential. It will be disclosed only with your permission.

Answers will be in the password protected computer and only the researcher will have access. The survey is anonymous, no personal data will be asked. The consent forms and your answers will be kept in different folders and personal data from the consent forms will not be shared within school and university. So, the anonymity and confidentiality are guaranteed.

**Withdrawal of participation by the investigator**

The investigator may stop your participation in this research if some problems appear. If the internet connection will be unstable every time when you try to do the survey, you may have to drop out, even if you would like to continue. The investigator will make the decision and let you know if you cannot continue. The investigator can decide to do in this way to not disturb you from your study if it is impossible to do the survey either at school, at home or at any other places. But, the survey can be completed offline if it is comfortable for you.

**What are my rights if I take part in this study?**

You may refuse at any time and stop the participation without penalty.

You can choose to be in this study or not. If you decide to be in this study, you may leave the study at any time without any penalties. You are not refusing any of your legal rights if you choose to be in this study. You have the right not to answer any questions and still be in the study.

**Who can answer questions I might have about this study?**

In the case of injury because of the study, please immediately contact one of the researchers listed below. If you have any questions, comments or concerns about the research, you can talk to the one of the researchers. Please contact the Master's thesis supervisor *Syed Abdul Manan* at +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz).

If you wish to ask questions about your rights as a research participant or if you wish to voice any problems or concerns you may have about the study to someone other than the researchers, please write an email to IREC at [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**SIGNATURE OF STUDY PARTICIPANT**

I understand the procedures described above. My questions have been answered to my satisfaction, and I agree to participate in this study. I have been given a copy of this form.

---

Name of Participant

---

Signature of Participant

---

Date

**SIGNATURE OF PERSON OBTAINING ASSENT**

In my judgment the participant is voluntarily and knowingly agreeing to participate in this research study.

---

---

Name of Person Obtaining Assent

---

Contact Number

---

Signature of Person Obtaining Assent

---

Date

If you wish to ask questions about your rights as a research participant or if you wish to voice any problems or concerns you may have about the study to someone other than the researchers, please please write an email to IREC at [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

Survey Participation

Child Assent Form #2

Сауалнамаға қатысу

Келісім формасы

Назарбаев Зияткерлік мектебіндегі (НЗМ) үштілді білім беру бағдарламасы аясында қазақстандық оқушылардың жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуы Сізден Назарбаев Университетінің Жоғары білім беру мектебінен Алтын Мұхаева жүргізетін зерттеуге қатысуды сұрайды. Сіз қазақ, орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқитын қазақ студенті болу себебінен осы зерттеудің ықтимал қатысушысы ретінде таңдалдыңыз. Бұл қатысушыларды іріктеу критерийі болып табылады. Сіздің осы зерттеуге қатысуыңыз ерікті болып табылады.

### **Неліктен бұл зерттеу жүргізіледі?**

Зерттеу НЗМ-де оқитын қазақ студенттерінің жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуын және әртүрлі тілдерде білім алу олардың қазақ тіліне қатынасына қалай әсер ететінін зерттеуге бағытталған. Зерттеу әртүрлі тілдерде білім алатын оқушылардың қазақ ұлттық тұлғаларынан қалай жаһандық тұлғаны қалыптастыратындарына арналған.

### **Егер мен осы зерттеуге қатыссам, не болады?**

Қатысу немесе қатыспау туралы шешім қабылдас бұрын, мұны ата-анаңызбен талқылаңыз. Сондай-ақ, біз сіздің ата-анаңыздан осы зерттеуге қатысуға рұқсат сұраймыз. Бірақ сіздің ата-анаңыз "Иә" десе де, сіз қатыспауды шеше аласыз.

Егер сіз осы зерттеуге қатысуға келіссеніз, зерттеуші сізден келесі әрекеттерді сұрайды:

1. Сауалнаманы өту үшін, сізге сілтеме жіберіледі.
2. Сауалнама анонимді болады.
3. Сауалнамаға анықтамалық сұрақтар (жынысы, сыныбы, тілді білу деңгейі) және ұлттық тұлғалық және сіз келісетін немесе келіспейтін тіл туралы мәлімдемелер кіреді.
4. Сіз телефон, ноутбук немесе кез-келген басқа электрондық құрылғы арқылы өзіңізге ыңғайлы кез-келген жерде сауалнамадан өте аласыз.

### **Зерттеуге қанша уақыт қатысамын?**

Зерттеуге қатысу шамамен 10-15 минутты алады.

### **Осы зерттеуден күтуге болатын ықтимал қауіптер немесе қолайсыздықтар бар ма?**

Күтілетін қауіптер немесе қолайсыздықтар жоқ. Сіз кейбір сұрақтарға қатысты жеке ыңғайсыздықты сезінуіңіз мүмкін. Алайда, сауалнама жасырын болады, сіздің атыңыз көрсетілмейді және сіздің жауаптарыңыз құпия болып табылады.

### **Менің қатысуымның ықтимал пайдасы бар ма?**

Сіз зерттеуге қатысудан тікелей пайда көре алмауыңыз мүмкін. Алайда, зерттеу сіздің ұлттық тұлғалығыңыздың күшін түсіну үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін.

Зерттеу нәтижелері тұлғалық пен тіл саласына өз үлесін қоса алады. Сонымен қатар, осы зерттеу нәтижелері бойынша әртүрлі тілде оқытатын мектептер ұлттық

бірегейлікті сақтау және қазақ тіліне оң көзқарас қалыптастыру мақсатында түрлі іс-шаралар ұйымдастыра алады.

### **Егер мен осы зерттеуге қатыссам, қандай да бір төлем аламын ба?**

Сіз қатысқаныңыз үшін ешқандай ақы алмайсыз.

### **Мен және менің қатысуым туралы ақпарат құпия бола ма?**

Осы зерттеуге байланысты алынған және сізді анықтайтын кез-келген ақпарат құпия болып қалады. Ол тек сіздің рұқсатыңызбен ашылады.

Жауаптар парольмен қорғалған компьютерде сақталады, оған тек зерттеуші қол жеткізе алады. Сауалнама анонимді болғандықтан, ешқандай жеке деректер қолданылмайды. Келісім формалары мен жиналған деректер бөлек сақталады, ал келісім формаларындағы жеке ақпараттар мектеп пен университет ішінде берілмейді. Осылайша, процестердің анонимділігі мен құпиялылығына кепілдік беріледі.

### **Зерттеуден қатысушыларды шеттетуге**

Егер сізге қажет жағдайлар туындаса, зерттеуші сізді осы зерттеуге қатысудан шеттетуге мүмкін. Егер сіз сауалнаманы аяқтаған сайын интернет байланысы тұрақсыз болса, жалғастырғыңыз келсе де, одан бас тартуға тура келуі мүмкін. Зерттеуші шешім қабылдағаннан кейін сізге жалғастыра алмайтындығыңызды хабарлайды. Егер мектепте де, үйде де, басқа жерлерде де сауалнаманы аяқтау мүмкін болмаса, сізді өзіңіздің оқуыңыздан бөлмеу туралы шешім қабылдануы мүмкін. Алайда, егер сізге ыңғайлы болса, сізден сауалнаманы оффлайн аяқтау сұралады.

### **Егер мен осы зерттеуге қатыссам, менің құқықтарым қандай?**

Сіз кез-келген уақытта келісіміңізді қайтарып ала аласыз және айыппұлсыз немесе басқа құқығыңыз бар жеңілдіктерді жоғалтпай қатысуды тоқтата аласыз.

Сіз осы зерттеуде болғыңыз келетінін таңдай аласыз. Егер сіз осы зерттеуге өз еркіңізбен қатыссаңыз, оны кез-келген уақытта ешқандай салдарсыз қалдыра аласыз. Егер сіз осы зерттеуге қатысуды шешсеңіз, сіз өзіңіздің заңды құқықтарыңыздан бас тартпайсыз. Сіз жауап бергіңіз келмейтін кез-келген сұрақтарға жауап беруден бас тарта аласыз және әлі де зерттеуде бола аласыз.

### **Бұл зерттеу туралы менің сұрақтарыма кім жауап бере алады?**

Зерттеуге байланысты жарақат алған жағдайда, төмендегі зерттеушілердің біріне дереу хабарласыңыз. Егер сізде зерттеу туралы сұрақтарыңыз, пікірлеріңіз немесе алаңдаушылықтарыңыз болса, сіз зерттеушілердің бірімен сөйлесе аласыз. Магистрлік диссертация жетекшісі *Сайед Абдул Мананга* +77079240053 телефоны арқылы хабарласыңыз, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz).

Егер сіз зерттеуге қатысушы ретінде өз құқықтарыңыз туралы сұрақтар қойғыңыз келсе немесе зерттеуге байланысты туындауы мүмкін мәселелер мен алаңдаушылықтарды зерттеушілерден басқа біреуге айтқыңыз келсе, IREC-ке электрондық хат жіберіңіз [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz)

### **ЗЕРТТЕУГЕ ҚАТЫСУШЫНЫҢ ҚОЛЫ**

Мен жоғарыда сипатталған процедураларды түсінемін. Менің сұрақтарыма қанағаттанарлық жауаптар берілді және мен осы зерттеуге қатысуға келісемін. Маған осы бланктің көшірмесі берілді.

---

Қатысушының Аты

---

Қатысушының Қолы

---

Күні

**КЕЛІСІМ АЛҒАН ТҮЛҒАНЫҢ ҚОЛЫ**

Менің ойымша, қатысушы өз еркімен және саналы түрде осы зерттеуге қатысуға келіседі.

---

Келісім Алған Тұлғаның Аты

---

Байланыс Телефоны

---

Келісім Алған Тұлғаның Қолы

---

Күні

Егер сіз зерттеуге қатысушы ретінде өз құқықтарыңыз туралы сұрақтар қойғыңыз келсе немесе зерттеуге байланысты туындауы мүмкін мәселелер мен алаңдаушылықтарды зерттеушілерден басқа біреуге айтқыңыз келсе, IREC-ке электрондық хат жіберіңіз [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz)

## Survey Participation

## Child Assent Form #3

## Участие в Опросе

## Форма Согласия

Формирование идентичности казахстанских студентов в рамках трехязычной образовательной программы в Назарбаев Интеллектуальной Школе (НИШ).

Вас просят принять участие в исследовании, проводимом Алтын Мухаевой из Высшей школы образования Назарбаев Университета (НУ). Вы были выбраны в качестве возможного участника этого исследования по причине того что вы являетесь казахским студентом, обучающимся на казахском, русском и английском языках, что является критерием отбора участников. Ваше участие в данном исследовании является добровольным.

**Почему проводится данное исследование?**

Исследование направлено на изучение формирования идентичности казахских студентов, обучающихся в НИШ, и того, как различные языки преподавания влияют на их отношение к казахскому языку. Исследование посвящено тому, каким образом различные языки обучения формируют у студентов с Казахской национальной идентичностью более глобальную.

**Что произойдет, если я приму участие в этом исследовании?**

Пожалуйста, обсудите это со своими родителями, прежде чем вы решите, участвовать или нет. Мы также попросим ваших родителей разрешить вам принять участие в этом исследовании. Но даже если ваши родители скажут “Да”, вы все равно можете решить не участвовать.

Если вы согласитесь принять участие в этом исследовании, исследователь попросит вас сделать следующее:

1. Вы получите ссылку для прохождения опроса.
2. Опрос будет анонимным.
3. Опрос включает в себя справочные вопросы (пол, класс, уровень знания языка) и утверждения о национальной идентичности и языке, с которыми вы можете быть не согласны или согласны.
4. Вы сможете пройти опрос в любом удобном для вас месте с помощью телефона, ноутбука или любого другого электронного устройства.

**Как долго я буду участвовать в исследовании?**

Участие в исследовании займет в общей сложности около 10-15 минут.

**Есть ли какие-либо потенциальные риски или неудобства, которые я могу ожидать от этого исследования?**

Нет никаких ожидаемых рисков или дискомфорта. Вы можете почувствовать некоторый индивидуальный дискомфорт в отношении некоторых вопросов. Однако опрос анонимный и не содержит вашего имени, а ваши ответы являются конфиденциальными.

**Есть ли какие-либо потенциальные выгоды в случае моего участия?**



Вы не получите прямой выгоды от вашего участия в исследовании. Тем не менее, исследование может быть полезным для вас в понимании силы вашей национальной идентичности.

Результаты исследования могут внести свой вклад в область идентичности и языка. Кроме того, по результатам данного исследования школы с разными языками преподавания смогут организовывать различные мероприятия с целью сохранения национальной идентичности и формирования позитивного отношения к казахскому языку.

### **Получу ли я какую-либо оплату, если буду участвовать в этом исследовании?**

Вы не получите никакой платы за свое участие.

### **Будет ли информация обо мне и моем участии конфиденциальной?**

Любая информация, полученная в связи с этим исследованием и идентифицирующая вас, останется конфиденциальной. Она будет раскрыта только с вашего разрешения.

Конфиденциальность будет поддерживаться путем хранения ответов в защищенном паролем компьютере, к которому будет иметь доступ только исследователь. Поскольку опрос является анонимным, никакие личные данные не будут задействованы. Формы согласия и собранные данные будут храниться отдельно, а персональные данные из форм согласия не будут передаваться внутри школы и университета. Таким образом, анонимность и конфиденциальность процессов гарантируются.

### **Отстранение участников исследования**

Исследователь может отстранить вас от участия в этом исследовании, если возникнут обстоятельства, которые требуют этого. Если подключение к интернету будет нестабильным каждый раз, когда вы пытаетесь завершить опрос, вам, возможно, придется отказаться, даже если вы хотите продолжить. Исследователь примет решение и даст вам знать, если вы не сможете продолжать. Может быть принято решение не отрывать вас от учебы в том случае, если невозможно пройти опрос ни в школе, ни дома, ни в каких-либо других местах. Однако вам будет предложено завершить опрос в оффлайн, если это удобно для вас.

### **Каковы мои права, если я приму участие в этом исследовании?**

Вы можете отозвать свое согласие в любое время и прекратить участие без штрафных санкций или потери льгот, на которые вы имели иное право.

Вы можете выбрать, хотите ли вы быть в этом исследовании. Если вы добровольно участвуете в этом исследовании, вы можете покинуть его в любое время без каких-либо последствий. Вы не отказываетесь ни от каких своих законных прав, если решите участвовать в этом исследовании. Вы можете отказаться отвечать на любые вопросы, на которые вы не хотите отвечать, и по-прежнему оставаться в исследовании.

### **Кто может ответить на мои вопросы об этом исследовании?**

В случае получения травмы, связанной с исследованием, пожалуйста, немедленно свяжитесь с одним из перечисленных ниже исследователей. Если у вас есть какие-либо вопросы, комментарии или опасения по поводу исследования, вы можете поговорить с одним из исследователей. Пожалуйста, свяжитесь с руководителем магистерской диссертации *Сайед Абдул Манан* по телефону +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz).

Если вы хотите задать вопросы о своих правах как участника исследования или если вы хотите высказать какие-либо проблемы или опасения, которые могут возникнуть у вас в связи с исследованием, кому-то другому, кроме исследователей, пожалуйста, напишите электронное письмо в IREC по адресу [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz)

### **ПОДПИСЬ УЧАСТНИКА ИССЛЕДОВАНИЯ**

Я понимаю описанные выше процедуры. На мои вопросы были даны удовлетворительные ответы, и я согласен/согласна принять участие в этом исследовании. Мне дали копию этого бланка.

---

Имя участника

---

Подпись участника

---

Дата

### **ПОДПИСЬ ЛИЦА, ПОЛУЧИВШЕГО СОГЛАСИЕ**

По моему мнению участник добровольно и сознательно соглашается участвовать в этом исследовании.

---

Имя Лица, Получившего Согласие

---

Контактный Телефон

---

Подпись Лица, Получившего Согласие

---

Дата

Если вы хотите задать вопросы о своих правах как участника исследования или если вы хотите высказать какие-либо проблемы или опасения, которые могут возникнуть у вас в связи с исследованием, кому-то другому, кроме исследователей, пожалуйста, напишите электронное письмо в IREC по адресу [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

## Interview Participation

### Child Assent Form #1

Kazakh Students' Identity Formation within a Trilingual Education Program at Nazarbayev Intellectual School (NIS)

You are asked to participate in a study done by Altyn Mukhayeva from the Graduate School of Education at the Nazarbayev University (NU). You were chosen as a possible participant in this study because you are Kazakh student who study through the Kazakh, Russia and English languages. This is the criteria for the selection of participants. Your participation in this research study is voluntary.

#### **Why is this study being done?**

The study looks at the identity formation of Kazakh students' who study at the NIS and how different languages of teaching influence their attitude to the Kazakh language. The research is about in what ways different languages of teaching shape students' Kazakhstani national identity to more global one.

#### **What will happen if I take part in this research study?**

Please talk about this with your parents before you decide whether or not to participate. We will also ask your parents to give their permission for you to take part in this study. But even if your parents say "yes" you can still decide not to do this.

If you volunteer to participate in this study, the researcher will ask you to do the following:

1. You will choose which online platform is comfortable for you for the interview (Skype, WhatsApp, Zoom, etc.).
2. The comfortable date and time for you will be chosen.
3. Then the link for the interview will be sent to you.
4. Before asking question, the researcher will tell you about the anonymity and confidentiality processes and ask the permission for the recording of your answers.
5. The questions are about the background information (name, age, grade, etc.) and your national identity.
6. Also, if you cannot participate through Zoom, Skype, or etc. the interview might be face-to-face in a comfortable place for you.

#### **How long will I be in the research study?**

Participation in the study will take a total of about 30 minutes.

#### **Are there any potential risks or discomforts that I can expect from this study?**

There are no anticipated risks or discomfort. You might feel some discomfort because of some questions. Also, you might think that your name and responses will be known for everyone. However, this information is confidential and no one will know your name except the researcher.

#### **Are there any potential benefits if I participate?**

You will not directly benefit from your participation in the research. But, the study might be helpful for you to understand the strength of your national identity.

The results of the research may help to understand the connection between identity and language. Also, with the results this research, schools with different languages of teaching might organize different events to preserve national identity and positive attitude towards the Kazakh language.

**Will I receive any payment if I participate in this study?**

You will receive no payment for your participation.

**Will information about me and my participation be kept confidential?**

Any information from this study and that identify you will be confidential. It will be disclosed only with your permission.

Answers will be in the password protected computer and only the researcher will have access. The data from the interview will be confidential. The personal data, gathered data and recordings will be kept in different folders in the password protected computer. Your real name will be replaced by pseudonym. In writings and discussions no information about your identity will be mentioned. So, the confidentiality is guaranteed.

**Withdrawal of participation by the investigator**

The investigator may stop your participation in this research if some problems appear. If you feel bad and anxious during the interview, you may have to drop out, even if you would like to continue. The investigator will make the decision and let you know if you cannot continue. The researcher will do so to protect your psychological health.

**What are my rights if I take part in this study?**

You may refuse at any time and stop the participation without penalty.

You can choose to be in this study or not. If you decide to be in this study, you may leave the study at any time without any penalties. You are not refusing any of your legal rights if you choose to be in this study. You have the right not to answer any questions and still be in the study.

**Who can answer questions I might have about this study?**

In the case of injury because of the study, please immediately contact one of the researchers listed below. If you have any questions, comments or concerns about the research, you can talk to the one of the researchers. Please contact the Master's thesis supervisor *Syed Abdul Manan* at +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz).

If you wish to ask questions about your rights as a research participant or if you wish to voice any problems or concerns you may have about the study to someone other than the researchers, please write an email to IREC at [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**SIGNATURE OF STUDY PARTICIPANT**

I understand the procedures described above. My questions have been answered to my satisfaction, and I agree to participate in this study. I have been given a copy of this form.

---

Name of Participant

---

Signature of Participant

---

Date

**SIGNATURE OF PERSON OBTAINING ASSENT**

In my judgment the participant is voluntarily and knowingly agreeing to participate in this research study.

---

Name of Person Obtaining Assent

---

Contact Number

---

Signature of Person Obtaining Assent

---

Date

If you wish to ask questions about your rights as a research participant or if you wish to voice any problems or concerns you may have about the study to someone other than the researchers, please please write an email to IREC at [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

## Interview Participation

## Child Assent Form #2

## Сауалнамаға қатысу

## Келісім формасы

Назарбаев Зияткерлік мектебіндегі (НЗМ) үштілді білім беру бағдарламасы аясында қазақстандық оқушылардың жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуы Сізден Назарбаев Университетінің Жоғары білім беру мектебінен Алтын Мұхаева жүргізетін зерттеуге қатысуды сұрайды. Сіз қазақ, орыс және ағылшын тілдерінде оқитын қазақ студенті болу себебінен осы зерттеудің ықтимал қатысушысы ретінде таңдалдыңыз. Бұл қатысушыларды іріктеу критерийі болып табылады. Сіздің осы зерттеуге қатысуыңыз ерікті болып табылады.

**Неліктен бұл зерттеу жүргізіледі?**

Зерттеу НЗМ-де оқитын қазақ студенттерінің жеке тұлғаларының қалыптасуын және әртүрлі тілдерде білім алу олардың қазақ тіліне қатынасына қалай әсер ететінін зерттеуге бағытталған. Зерттеу әртүрлі тілдерде білім алатын оқушылардың қазақ ұлттық тұлғаларынан қалай жаһандық тұлғаны қалыптастыратындарына арналған.

**Егер мен осы зерттеуге қатыссам, не болады?**

Қатысу немесе қатыспау туралы шешім қабылдас бұрын, мұны ата-анаңызбен талқылаңыз. Сондай-ақ, біз сіздің ата-анаңыздан осы зерттеуге қатысуға рұқсат сұраймыз. Бірақ сіздің ата-анаңыз "Иә" десе де, сіз қатыспауды шеше аласыз. Егер сіз осы зерттеуге қатысуға келіссеніз, зерттеуші сізден келесі әрекеттерді сұрайды:

1. Сіз сұхбаттан өтуге ыңғайлы онлайн платформаны таңдайсыз (Skype, WhatsApp, Zoom және т.б.).
2. Сізге ыңғайлы күн мен уақыт таңдалады.
3. Содан кейін сізге сұхбат сілтемесі жіберіледі.
4. Сұрақтарға кіріспес бұрын, зерттеуші сізге анонимдік және құпиялылық туралы тағы да айтады және жауаптарыңызды жазуға рұқсат сұралайды.
5. Сұхбат жалпы ақпарат туралы сұрақтарды (аты, жасы, сыныбы және т.б.) және сіздің ұлттық тұлғалығыңызға қатысты негізгі сұрақтарды қамтиды.
6. Сондай-ақ, қажет болған жағдайда сізге ыңғайлы жерде бетпе-бет сұхбат жүргізу ұсынылады.

**Зерттеуге қанша уақыт қатысамын?**

Зерттеуге қатысу шамамен 30 минутты алады.

**Осы зерттеуден күтуге болатын ықтимал қауіптер немесе қолайсыздықтар бар ма?**

Күтілетін қауіптер немесе қолайсыздықтар жоқ. Сіз кейбір сұрақтарға қатысты жеке ыңғайсыздықты сезінуіңіз мүмкін. Және де сіз өзіңіздің жеке мәліметтер мен жауаптарыңыз барлығына қол жетімді болады деп ойлауыңыз мүмкін. Осылайша, барлық жиналған деректердің құпиялылығы және қадағаланбауына кепілдік беріледі.

**Менің қатысуымның ықтимал пайдасы бар ма?**

Сіз зерттеуге қатысудан тікелей пайда көре алмауыңыз мүмкін. Алайда, зерттеу сіздің ұлттық тұлғалығыңыздың күшін түсіну үшін пайдалы болуы мүмкін.

Зерттеу нәтижелері тұлғалық пен тіл саласына өз үлесін қоса алады. Сонымен қатар, осы зерттеу нәтижелері бойынша әртүрлі тілде оқытатын мектептер ұлттық бірегейлікті сақтау және қазақ тіліне оң көзқарас қалыптастыру мақсатында түрлі іс-шаралар ұйымдастыра алады.

**Егер мен осы зерттеуге қатыссам, қандай да бір төлем аламын ба?**

Сіз қатысқаныңыз үшін ешқандай ақы алмайсыз.

**Мен және менің қатысуым туралы ақпарат құпия бола ма?**

Осы зерттеуге байланысты алынған және сізді анықтайтын кез-келген ақпарат құпия болып қалады. Ол тек сіздің рұқсатыңызбен ашылады.

Жауаптар парольмен қорғалған компьютерде сақталады, оған тек зерттеуші қол жеткізе алады. Сұхбат барысында алынған мәліметтер құпия болады. Сіздің жеке деректеріңіз, жиналған мәліметтер мен жазбалар ортақ қол жеткізусіз парольмен қорғалған компьютерде бөлек сақталады. Сіздің шың есіміңіз бүркеншік атпен ауыстырылады. Жазбаша және ауызша талқылауларда сіздің жеке тұлғаныз туралы ештеңе айтылмайды. Осылайша, құпиялылыққа кепілдік беріледі.

**Зерттеуден қатысушыларды шеттету**

Егер сізге қажет жағдайлар туындаса, зерттеуші сізді осы зерттеуге қатысудан шеттетугі мүмкін. Егер сіз сұхбат кезінде қатты ынғайсыздық пен мазасыздықты сезінсеңіз, жалғастырғыңыз келсе де, бас тартуға тура келуі мүмкін. Зерттеуші шешім қабылдайды және егер сіз жалғастыра алмасаңыз, сізге хабарлайды. Шешім сіздің психологиялық денсаулығыңызды қорғау үшін қабылдануы мүмкін.

**Егер мен осы зерттеуге қатыссам, менің құқықтарым қандай?**

Сіз кез-келген уақытта келісіміңізді қайтарып ала аласыз және айыппұлсыз немесе басқа құқығыңыз бар жеңілдіктерді жоғалтпай қатысуды тоқтата аласыз.

Сіз осы зерттеуде болғыңыз келетінін таңдай аласыз. Егер сіз осы зерттеуге өз еркіңізбен қатыссаңыз, оны кез-келген уақытта ешқандай салдарсыз қалдыра аласыз. Егер сіз осы зерттеуге қатысуды шешсеңіз, сіз өзіңіздің заңды құқықтарыңыздан бас тартпайсыз. Сіз жауап бергіңіз келмейтін кез-келген сұрақтарға жауап беруден бас тарта аласыз және әлі де зерттеуде бола аласыз.

**Бұл зерттеу туралы менің сұрақтарыма кім жауап бере алады?**

Зерттеуге байланысты жарақат алған жағдайда, төмендегі зерттеушілердің біріне дереу хабарласыңыз. Егер сізде зерттеу туралы сұрақтарыңыз, пікірлеріңіз немесе алаңдаушылықтарыңыз болса, сіз зерттеушілердің бірімен сөйлесе аласыз. Магистрлік диссертация жетекшісі *Сәйед Абдул Мананга* +77079240053 телефоны арқылы хабарласыңыз, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz).

Егер сіз зерттеуге қатысушы ретінде өз құқықтарыңыз туралы сұрақтар қойғыңыз келсе немесе зерттеуге байланысты туындауы мүмкін мәселелер мен алаңдаушылықтарды зерттеушілерден басқа біреуге айтқыңыз келсе, IREC-ке электрондық хат жіберіңіз [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz)

**ЗЕРТТЕУГЕ ҚАТЫСУШЫНЫҢ ҚОЛЫ**

Мен жоғарыда сипатталған процедураларды түсінемін. Менің сұрақтарыма қанағаттанарлық жауаптар берілді және мен осы зерттеуге қатысуға келісемін. Маған осы бланктің көшірмесі берілді.

---

Қатысушының Аты

---

Қатысушының Қолы

---

Күні

**КЕЛІСІМ АЛҒАН ТҰЛҒАНЫҢ ҚОЛЫ**

Менің ойымша, қатысушы өз еркімен және саналы түрде осы зерттеуге қатысуға келіседі.

---

Келісім Алған Тұлғаның Аты

---

Байланыс Телефоны

---

Келісім Алған Тұлғаның Қолы

---

Күні

Егер сіз зерттеуге қатысушы ретінде өз құқықтарыңыз туралы сұрақтар қойғыңыз келсе немесе зерттеуге байланысты туындауы мүмкін мәселелер мен алаңдаушылықтарды зерттеушілерден басқа біреуге айтқыңыз келсе, IREC-ке электрондық хат жіберіңіз [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz)



Interview Participation

Child Assent Form #3

Участие в Интервью

Форма Согласия

Формирование идентичности казахстанских студентов в рамках трехязычной образовательной программы в Назарбаев Интеллектуальной Школе (НИШ).

Вас просят принять участие в исследовании, проводимом Алтын Мухаевой из Высшей школы образования Назарбаев Университета (НУ). Вы были выбраны в качестве возможного участника этого исследования так как вы являетесь казахским студентом, обучающимся на казахском, русском и английском языках. Это является критерием отбора участников. Ваше участие в данном исследовании является добровольным.

### **Почему проводится данное исследование?**

Исследование изучает формирования идентичности казахских студентов, обучающихся в НИШ, и то, как различные языки преподавания влияют на их отношение к казахскому языку. Исследование посвящено тому, каким образом различные языки обучения формируют у студентов с Казахской национальной идентичностью более глобальную.

### **Что произойдет, если я приму участие в этом исследовании?**

Пожалуйста, обсудите это со своими родителями, прежде чем вы решите, участвовать или нет. Мы также попросим ваших родителей разрешить вам принять участие в этом исследовании. Но даже если ваши родители скажут “Да”, вы все равно можете решить не участвовать.

Если вы согласитесь принять участие в этом исследовании, исследователь попросит вас сделать следующее:

1. Вы выбираете на какой онлайн-платформе вам удобно проходить интервью (Skype, WhatsApp, Zoom и т.д.).
2. Будет выбраны удобные для вас дата и время.
3. Затем вам будет выслана ссылка для интервью.
4. Прежде чем как приступить к вопросам, исследователь вам снова расскажет о процессах анонимности и конфиденциальности, а также будет запрошено разрешение на запись ваших ответов.
5. Интервью будет включать вопросы об общей информации (имя, возраст, класс и т.д.) и основные вопросы, касающиеся вашей национальной идентичности.
6. Также при необходимости вам будет предложено провести интервью лицом к лицу в удобном для вас месте.

### **Как долго я буду участвовать в исследовании?**

Участие в исследовании займет в общей сложности около 30 минут.

### **Есть ли какие-либо потенциальные риски или неудобства, которые я могу ожидать от этого исследования?**

Нет никаких ожидаемых рисков или дискомфорта. Вы можете почувствовать некоторый индивидуальный дискомфорт из-за некоторых вопросов. Также вы можете

подумать, что ваша личная информация и ответы будут доступны для всех. Однако, информация будет конфиденциальной и никто не будет знать ваше имя кроме самого исследователя.

**Есть ли какие-либо потенциальные выгоды в случае моего участия?**

Вы не получите прямой выгоды от вашего участия в исследовании. Но, исследование может быть полезным для вас в понимании силы вашей национальной идентичности. Результаты исследования могут внести свой вклад в область идентичности и языка. Кроме того, по результатам данного исследования школы с разными языками преподавания смогут организовывать различные мероприятия с целью сохранения национальной идентичности и формирования позитивного отношения к казахскому языку.

**Получу ли я какую-либо оплату, если буду участвовать в этом исследовании?**

Вы не получите никакой платы за свое участие.

**Будет ли информация обо мне и моем участии конфиденциальной?**

Любая информация, полученная в связи с этим исследованием и идентифицирующая вас, останется конфиденциальной. Она будет раскрыта только с вашего разрешения. Ответы будут храниться в защищенном паролем компьютере, к которому будет иметь доступ только исследователь. Данные, полученные в ходе интервью, будут конфиденциальными. Ваши личные данные, собранные сведения и записи будут храниться отдельно в защищенном паролем компьютере без общего доступа. Ваше настоящее имя будет заменено псевдонимом. В письменной форме и устных обсуждениях не будет информации, которая могли бы раскрыть вашу личность. Таким образом, конфиденциальность гарантируется.

**Отстранение участников исследования**

Исследователь может отстранить вас от участия в этом исследовании, если возникнут некоторые проблемы. Если вы почувствуете сильный дискомфорт и беспокойство во время интервью, вам, возможно, придется отказаться, даже если вы хотите продолжить. Следователю примет решение и даст вам знать, если вы не сможете продолжать. Исследователь сделает так для защиты вашего психологического здоровья.

**Каковы мои права, если я приму участие в этом исследовании?**

Вы можете отказаться в любое время и прекратить участие без штрафных каких-либо штрафов.

Вы можете выбрать, хотите ли вы быть в этом исследовании. Если вы добровольно участвуете в этом исследовании, вы можете покинуть его в любое время без каких-либо последствий. Вы не отказываетесь ни от каких своих законных прав, если решите участвовать в этом исследовании. Вы можете отказаться отвечать на любые вопросы, на которые вы не хотите отвечать, и по-прежнему оставаться в исследовании.

**Кто может ответить на мои вопросы об этом исследовании?**

В случае получения травмы, связанной с исследованием, пожалуйста, немедленно свяжитесь с одним из перечисленных ниже исследователей. Если у вас есть какие-либо вопросы, комментарии или опасения по поводу исследования, вы можете поговорить с

одним из исследователей. Пожалуйста, свяжитесь с руководителем магистерской диссертации *Сайед Абдул Манан* по телефону +77079240053, [syed.manan@nu.edu.kz](mailto:syed.manan@nu.edu.kz).

Если вы хотите задать вопросы о своих правах как участника исследования или если вы хотите высказать какие-либо проблемы или опасения, которые могут возникнуть у вас в связи с исследованием, кому-то другому, кроме исследователей, пожалуйста, напишите электронное письмо в IREC по адресу [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz)

### **ПОДПИСЬ УЧАСТНИКА ИССЛЕДОВАНИЯ**

Я понимаю описанные выше процедуры. На мои вопросы были даны удовлетворительные ответы, и я согласен/согласна принять участие в этом исследовании. Мне дали копию этого бланка.

---

Имя участника

---

Подпись участника

---

Дата

### **ПОДПИСЬ ЛИЦА, ПОЛУЧИВШЕГО СОГЛАСИЕ**

По моему мнению участник добровольно и сознательно соглашается участвовать в этом исследовании.

---

Имя Лица, Получившего Согласие

---

Контактный Телефон

---

Подпись Лица, Получившего Согласие

---

Дата

Если вы хотите задать вопросы о своих правах как участника исследования или если вы хотите высказать какие-либо проблемы или опасения, которые могут возникнуть у вас в связи с исследованием, кому-то другому, кроме исследователей, пожалуйста, напишите электронное письмо в IREC по адресу [resethics@nu.edu.kz](mailto:resethics@nu.edu.kz).

**Appendix D**

## Data Sample

## An Extract from an Interview Transcript

I: How old are you?

Sara: 17

I: What grade are you in? How long have you been educated through the three languages – Kazakh, Russian and English?

Sara: It turns out that until the 10th grade, we were taught in Kazakh and Russian languages and had English lessons. There weren't many of them. In the 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grade, Almost all the content-subjects are in English. And only the Russian language, geography, Kazakh language were in Kazakh. There is also such subject as KSM, Kazakhstan in the modern world, but it is also in Kazakh. Thus, we've been studying through trilingual education program for two years.

I: What is your first language?

Sara: Well, my first language that I basically spoke as a child is Kazakh. Because I was given to a Russian school, I speak two languages. So, I am a bilingual.

I: How do you feel about the introduction of multilingual education in our country?

Sara: I'm all for it, I totally agree with it. I think in the modern world of globalization, it is necessary that a person speaks not only in their native language and Russian, but also in English. In general it would be cool if a person could choose which language in our school... well, what language to learn. We, for example, in the tenth grade, were offered to choose a second foreign language and I chose Chinese. But it didn't work out. I think it's very cool, but when a person speaks several languages, He becomes more versatile and this is a movement forward.

I: From your point of view, what are the advantageous of the introduction of trilingual education in Kazakhstan?

Sara: Most importantly, I think, for example, there is a lot of information in the English Internet space. I told you that in the eleventh grade we switched to trilingualism and at the moment, for example, I have access to many information portals abroad. For example, to the Cambridge library, I can easily read some books on biology, chemistry and understand them. I know that there is no such thing in the Kazakh Internet space at all. Very little can be found in the Kazakh language and, accordingly, it will be difficult for a person who knows only the Kazakh language to find information on the Internet. It is more or less possible to find some websites in Russian... Well, the study is in the foreground for me and it is much easier find information on a topic in Russian and English than in Kazakh. But there's a lot of it in English. It just makes life easier.

I: What are the characteristics of Kazakhstani person with strong Kazakhstani national identity? Do you consider yourself being such person?

Sarah: It seems to me that family institution and family values are well-developed in Kazakhstan. And if a child grew up in a family where the role of every person is very brightly expressed, for example, mothers, grandparents, and they all take part in his upbringing, then he grows up being such a... well, such a Kazakh child who appreciates family values. And on the other hand, yes, on the one hand, it is very cool that a child strongly values his family, loves and always has a family in the foreground. That is, well, such a basic value. But on the other hand, he still has such a framework in his head that he cannot do anything against his family, cannot completely choose himself, for example. The same thing, for example, a girl cannot go abroad, because she is forced to have a family, something like that. It is a little about the stereotypes, but I think the native Kazakh upbringing is very cool, beautiful. For example, my mother, like all mothers, praises

Dimash Kudaibergenov, who has a native Kazakh upbringing and such a “zhurttyn balasy”. He has a symbiosis of Eastern and Western culture. In this regard, his parents made a lot of efforts and it seems to me that if, without any bias, a child grew up in a Kazakh family, where he was brought up according to Eastern principles, he would be a very well-mannered, intelligent person.

I: Do you consider yourself being such person?

Sara: Cool, very interesting question actually. In terms of... how to say... I'm a more wayward person. Yes, I know the Kazakh traditions, I know the language, I read books, I read Abay. Yes, I think I have a symbiosis of a more Kazakh person. It seems to me wrong to separate the Kazakh person from the whole world. I also have such a symbiosis of the West and the East, but I am a person who loves freedom, so I choose the West in terms of communication, in terms of seeing the whole world.

I: In What ways does trilingual education influence you being such person?

Sara: As I said, if we take without bias, without any stereotypes, which probably appeared in the Soviet Union and created such a foundation for a little biased education, stereotypical education. Then, it seems to me that trilingualism will only help a person to expand the boundaries of consciousness, the vision of the world. And a person... here it would be really cool that a person who brought up in a Kazakh family with... I think we have a very beautiful culture and such a well-educated person with the proficiency in three or more languages, a multilingual, then he will see the world more widely. Accordingly, he will achieve more in the world and develop the country, develop the world, open new borders of consciousness.

I: Do you feel more confident about your Kazakh identity or vice versa?

Sara: At NIS, we have a very good policy of trilingualism, as I said. But we do not have such a direct one-hundred-percent incline towards any language, and I really like the fact

that our school has a lot of projects that develop the Kazakh identity. A lot of circles are dedicated to traditions. And at every concert there is always a Kazakh dance, there is always a Kazakh song and there is an orchestra that plays Kazakh kui. I understand that every day I cannot constantly spend 20 minutes reading Kazakh literature, because a priori I do not have time, for example, to do a task in English. But, when you constantly hear... even during the break, we hear kui Akku and you remind yourself that you are, yes, a Kazakh, yes, for example, a slightly different culture from Russia, let's say, and this so slightly reinforces your patriotism, probably.

I: What are the positive sides of being Kazakh person?

Sara: Well, the most important thing that the whole world knows is our hospitality. Because, for example, we watch *Orel i Reshka* every night with our parents, and there is also a different... Ptushkin, who also films about culture, the world. And we see that the Eastern culture is very famous for its hospitality and they will accept any person as their own. And I noticed a difference, when I was in Russia, people are a little bit restricted or something. Our, Kazakhs... you even go up to a person, say "can you tell me" or "can you borrow the phone, I want to call". We have very friendly people.

I: Which period of Kazakh nation's development is the most important for you?

Sara: Well, it seems to me that the very first thing I want to note here is the formation of the Kazakh Khanate in 1456. When the Kazakh people received a first title of the Kazakh khanate, which was kept until the unification with Russia. I also want to note the period of the 20th century, when the Kazakh intelligentsia fought for the rights of the Kazakhs. Most importantly, the first newspaper in the Kazakh language appeared, where there was Propaganda like now, for example, *Rukhani zhangyru*, all this started at that time. And I really like that... it seems to me even, I will depart a little from the topic, in fact, the Kazakh intelligentsia was born much earlier than it should have been, because all the laws

that they adopted for the Alash Horde are still relevant nowadays. I mean, they're great people, and I admire them.

I: Which Kazakh traditions/holidays are important for you? If relevant: Why?

Sara: Every year we celebrate Nauryz and this is very important for me. It is reinforced by such childish, warm memories, when we gathered at home with all the relatives, we ate Nauryz Kozhe... Well, we celebrate it every year and it reminds us of the most carefree days.

I: How can studying Russian and English as the languages of instruction influence your perception of the Kazakh culture (customs, traditions, and holidays)?

Sara: Well, for example, how to say, it turns out that there is a certain comparison in the mind and it is very interesting that we can look at the Kazakh culture from the outside, at the traditions, understand that one people has some traditions, and others do not. And just to look at it, probably to feel like such an English person.

I: In your opinion, what impact will the promotion of English have on the development of the Kazakh language?

Sara: A very interesting question indeed. I think, Russian and English will help... I noticed when a person speaks Russian and English, he subconsciously strives to somehow maintain his national identity. Even now, Nazarbayev, says at every meeting that we need to strengthen our national identity in this period of globalization. And even I, being such a modern person, yes, I'm 17 years old, it turns out if I had lived a little earlier, for example in 2010, I think I would have immersed myself into Western culture. I would stand with tattoos, well, again, biased. And now I try to remind myself that... I study, for example, in English, I read in Russian, I always try to tell myself that you cannot forget your roots, you cannot forget your language, because "blood is not water". I can't escape from myself. And probably most of my qualities are probably embedded in my culture, in my national



identity. I can't give it up, so I noticed just the same in my environment, I noticed that most people try to preserve it, most try to somehow... somehow go deeper into the Kazakh culture, to preserve, to know something. I think it's... everyone understands the importance of all this. It is very fashionable to say "oh, I don't need all this", "I don't need the Kazakh language", but deep down we still can't avoid this. And everyone understands that.