Running head: THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION, KAZAKHSTAN

#### **Title of Thesis:**

The role of curriculum in teachers' understanding of Global Citizenship Education in one public school in Akmola region, Kazakhstan

#### **Zhanar Ordabayeva**

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Science in

Educational Leadership

Nazarbayev University Graduate School of Education

June, 2017

Word Count: 15323

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

**KAZAKHSTAN** 

**Author agreement** 

ii

By signing and submitting this license, I, Zhanar Ordabayeva (the author(s) or copyright

owner) grant to Nazarbayev University (NU) the non-exclusive right to reproduce, convert

(as defined below), and/or distribute my submission (including the abstract) worldwide in

print and electronic format and in any medium, including but not limited to audio or video.

I agree that NU may, without changing the content, convert the submission to any medium

or format for the purpose of preservation.

I also agree that NU may keep more than one copy of this submission for purposes of

security, back-up and preservation.

I represent that the submission is your original work, and that I have the right to grant the rights contained in this license. I also represent that my submission does not, to the best of

my knowledge, infringe upon anyone's copyright.

If the submission contains material for which I do not hold copyright, I represent that I have obtained the unrestricted permission of the copyright owner to grant NU the rights required

by this license, and that such third-party owned material is clearly identified and

acknowledged within the text or content of the submission.

IF THE SUBMISSION IS BASED UPON WORK THAT HAS BEEN SPONSORED OR SUPPORTED BY AN AGENCY OR ORGANIZATION OTHER THAN NU. I

REPRESENT THAT I HAVE FULFILLED ANY RIGHT OF REVIEW OR OTHER

OBLIGATIONS REQUIRED BY SUCH CONTRACT OR AGREEMENT.

NU will clearly identify my name(s) as the author(s) or owner(s) of the submission, and will

not make any alteration, other than as allowed by this license, to my submission.

I hereby accept the terms of the above Author Agreement.

Author's signature:

Date: June, 27, 2017

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

KAZAKHSTAN

**Declaration** 

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and to the best of my knowledge

iii

it contains no materials previously published or written by another person, or substantial

proportions of material which have been submitted for the award of any other course or

degree at NU or any other educational institution, except where due acknowledgement is

made in the thesis. This thesis is the result of my own independent work, except where

otherwise stated, and the views expressed here are my own.

Signature:

Date: June, 27, 2017

**KAZAKHSTAN** 

#### NUGSE RESEARCH APPROVAL DECISION LETTER

The NUGSE Research Committee reviewed the project entitled "The role of curriculum in teachers' understanding of Global Citizenship Education in one public school in Akmola region, Kazakhstan" and decided:

☐ To grant approval for this study subject to minor changes, to be discussed with supervisor

**Approval subject to minor changes:** The study is approved subject to minor changes.

Reviewers' feedback:

*Sampling:* It is not clear how the researcher will ensure that maximal variation sample is achieved. How will be the decisions made who is included in the list of participants and who is not. These procedures are not sufficiently described.

Consent: A copy of informed consent is provided. However, in the teacher's copy of informed consent there are inconsistencies in the use of personal pronouns. Also, it is not accurate to combine the total participation time. It is important that participants know how much time they will be required to contribute for an interview and how much time for an observation separately.

Before starting your data collection, you need to discuss these changes with your supervisor, revise your proposal accordingly, and then ask your supervisor to check the revised proposal.

Sincerely, NUGSE Research Committee

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

#### Acknowledgement

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor Professor Amanda Ajodhia-Andrews, who was extremely supportive all the time, encouraged me and provided constant feedback on my progress. I would also like to thank all GSE faculty staff who helped us in different ways and gave us valuable advice.

I would also like to acknowledge a great support of my group mates, without whom the process of writing this thesis would have been more difficult. I am very grateful to all participants who took part in this study. Finally, I would like to thank my family and friends for believing in me and encouraging me to apply for this program.

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

## KAZAKHSTAN

## **Table of Contents**

Author Agreement	ii
Declaration	iii
NUGSE RESEARCH APPROVAL DECISION LETTER	iv
Acknowledgement	V
Table of Contents	vi
Abstract	viii
List of Tables	xiii
Chapter 1. Introduction and Background of Study	1
Personal Journey toward the Proposed Study	4
Statement of the problem	5
Purpose of the study and Research Questions	7
Significance of the study/contributions	8
Chapter 2. Literature Review and Theoretical/Conceptual Framework	is9
Global Citizenship Education and Teachers' Understanding	9
Global Citizenship Education and Teachers' Practices	11
Teacher Learning about Global Citizenship Education	14
Educational Change	17
Theoretical Framework	18
Chapter 3. Methodology	19
Research design	19
Empirical Study	20
Participants	23
Data Collection	23

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

## KAZAKHSTAN

Interviews	24
Document Analysis	25
Observations	25
Data analysis	25
Limitations of the study	26
Ethics in Research with Humans	26
Chapter 4. Findings	29
Characteristics of Participants	30
Teachers' Understanding of Global Citizenship Education	31
The role of administrative leadership in delivering GCE	33
Global Citizenship Education Curriculum and Teachers' Practice	35
Educational Change	37
Attitudes toward Promoting GCE	37
Kazakhstani Patriotism	41
Teacher Learning about Global Citizenship Education	42
Chapter 5. Discussion	46
Conclusion	52
Recommendations	53
Chapter 6. Conclusion	55
Researcher Reflection	55
References	57
Appendices	63

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

#### Abstract

Today Global Citizenship Education is becoming a popular in school system. This new aspect has not widely discussed Kazakhstani schools and it is important to find out what is the situation of the schools toward GCE. The purpose of this qualitative case-study is to explore the understanding of global citizenship education among 10 teachers at a public school in Akmola region (Grades 7-11). Through semi-structured interviews, non-participant classroom observations, document analysis the study investigated how "global citizenship education" is integrated into academic subjects such as Physical education, History, Geography, Languages, Physics, Maths, English included in the curriculum. Purposeful sampling was used to select the participants of the study. Data was collected through document analysis of the academic subjects included in the curriculum, non-participant classroom observations, and semi-structured interviews. Semi-structured interviews were held to examine teachers' perceptions towards "global citizenship education" and how teachers define their role or responsibilities in preparing students for "global citizenship education".

The findings showed the importance of integrating global awareness into the different subjects of the curriculum; the need of professional development for teachers; the importance of administrative leadership in teaching GCE. There is a discussion of recommendations and conclusions which may help in promoting GCE at school.

# THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

KAZAKHSTAN

#### Аңдатпа

Бүгінгі таңда жаһандық азаматтылық тәрбиесі білім жүйесінде өте танымал. Бұл жаңа аспектке әлі де қазақстандық мектептер аса назар аударған жоқ. Сондықтан мектепте жаһандық азаматтылық тәрбиесінің қалай жүзеге асыратыны туралы нақты жағдайын анықтау өте маңызды болып табылады. Сапалы зерттеудің кейс-стади әдісінің мақсаты Ақмола облысындағы мемлекеттік мектептегі жоғары сыныптарда (7-11 сыныптар) жұмыс істейтін 10 мұғалімдердің жаһандық азаматтылық тәрбиесі туралы түсініктерінің қандай деңгейде екенін зерттеу болып табылады.

Зерттеуде мәліметтерді жинау құралдары ретінде жартылай құрылымдалған сұхбат, сабақтарға қатысу және құжаттарды талдау қолданылды. Осы құралдардың көмегімен жаһандық азаматтық тәрбиесі аспекті қазақстан тарихы, география, ағылшын тілі, қазақ тілі, орыс тілі, дене шынықтыру, физика, математика пәндерінің оқу бағдарламасында қаншалықты енгізілгені және сабақ барысында қалай қолданатыны зерттелді.

Зерттеудің қатысушыларын іріктеу үшін мақсатты таңдау жүзеге асырылды. Деректер оқу бағдарламасында жаһандық азаматтылық тәрбиесі аспектінің қаншалықты кіріктірілгеніне талдау жасау арқылы жиналды. Сонымен қатар, бірқатар сабақтарға қатысу арқылы осы аспектінің іс жүзінде қалай қолданылатыны зерттеліп, жартылай құрылымдалған сұхбат жүргізілді. Жартылай құрылымдалған сұхбат мұғалімдердің жаһандық азаматтылық тәрбиесі жайлы көзқарастары мен оны жүзеге асыру барысында олардың рөлдері мен жауапкершілігін зерттеуге бағытталған.

KAZAKHSTAN

жасауы мүмкін.

X

Зерттеудің нәтижелері жаһандық азаматтық тәрбиесі аспектінің оқу бағдарламасындағы академиялық тақырыптарға кіріктіру маңыздылығын көрсетті; осы аспекті бойынша мұғалімдердің кәсіби даму қажеттілігі айқындады; әкімшілік құрамының мектепте жаһандық азаматтылық тәрбиелеудегі және оқудағы рөлінің маңыздылығын анықтады. Бұдан әрі берілген ұсыныстарды талқылау және қорытындылар жаһандық азаматтылық тәрбиесінің жұмысын жақсартуға зор ықпал

THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION, KAZAKHSTAN

#### Аннотация

На сегодняшний день воспитание глобальной гражданственности становится все более популярным в системе школы. Казахстанские школы еще не в полной мере обратили внимание на данный новый аспект в казахстанских школах и поэтому важно выяснить реальную ситуацию в школах в отношении воспитания глобальной гражданственности. Целью данного качественного метода исследования кейс-стади являлось изучение того в какой степени 10 учителей старших классов (7-11 кл) одной государственной школы Акмолинской области правильно понимают, что такое воспитание глобальной гражданственности. В исследовании были использованы такие инструменты сбора данных как полуструктурированные интервью, посещение уроков и анализ документов. С помощью данных инструментов было изучено как воспитание глобальной гражданственности отражается в учебной программе по таким предметам как история, география, английский язык, казахский язык, русский язык, физкультура, физика и математика и насколько данный аспект внедряется во время уроков.

Отбор участников исследования было осуществлен с помощью целенаправленного выбора. Данные был собраны с помощью проведения анализа учебной программы на наличие аспекта воспитания глобальной гражданственности. Также были проведены посещения уроков для обзора внедрения данного аспекта на практике и полуструктурированные интервью. Полуструктурированные интервью были направлены на исследование восприятия учителей по отношению к "глобальной гражданственности", а также как учителя видят свою роль или ответственность в воспитании учащихся глобальной гражданственности.

## THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL xii CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Результаты показали важность интеграции аспекта воспитания глобальной гражданственности в академические темы учебной программы; необходимость профессионального развития учителей по данному аспекту; важность роли административного состава школы в преподавании и воспитании глобальной гражданственности. Далее представлены обсуждение рекомендаций и заключения, которые, возможно, окажут положительное влияние на улучшение работы воспитания глобальной гражданственности.

THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL	xiii
CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,	
KAZAKHSTAN	

_		_			
1	ict	Λť	Tai	hl	ΔC

Table 1			31
Table 1.	 	 	 1

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

#### **Chapter One: Introduction and Background of Study**

In today's society, there are many different opportunities for students to connect globally. For example, daily events worldwide can be experienced through social media, international trips, and inter-school projects. Importantly for students, inter-cultural and global awareness skills are increasingly valued by employers who operate internationally. Student graduates who develop these skills are likely to enhance their understanding of others, appreciating diversity. Thus, in order to prepare students for success in today's global community, schools are paying close attention to global citizenship education within and among their students.

Global citizenship education (GCE) "highlights essential functions of education related to the formation of citizenship in relation with globalization. It is concerned with the relevance of knowledge, skills and values for the participation of citizens in, and their contribution to, dimensions of societal development which are linked at local and global levels. It is directly related to the civic, social and political socialization function of education, and ultimately to the contribution of education in preparing children and young people to deal with the challenges of today's increasingly interconnected and interdependent world"(Global Citizenship Education, 2014, p. 15). This means that the knowledge our children receive should be relevant and important to give them the opportunity to become global citizens and prepare them to solve any issues in highly developing world.

According to Grossman (2003), people think that the aim of preparing global citizens for the future can best be addressed by structuring the school itself in such a way that it becomes

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

a model of global education within inclusive education. The students should live and be educated in a living laboratory of democracy from the very first days at school if inclusion is to be acquired. The school must become a democratic institution, and the role of teachers must be consistent with the aims of global citizenship and inclusion. Moreover, due to Althof (2006), at the heart of citizenship is a belief that everyone has an equal right to play an active role in society and an equal right to receive the support that will make it possible. Inclusion is central to global citizenship education and global citizenship education can be tailored to suit individual schools, classes and pupils.

Global awareness encourages sensitivity to the impact of globalization and promotes better cross-cultural understandings. Within an ever-changing world of diversity, it is critical societies understand each other and come together through increased partnerships among educational institutions, government organizations, and businesses to solve global issues.

According to the public school Integrated Educational curriculum, the educational process within each academic subject is based on certain values, stated in the curriculum: (1) Kazakhstani patriotism and civil responsibility; (2) respect; (3) cooperation; (4) transparency; (5) labour and creation; and, (6)- lifelong learning (Methodical Guidelines for organization of educational process in public schoolsschools,2012) These values are considered a major factor during the learning process in Kazakhstani education in the formation of a learner's personality and the basis for the implementation of national vision of *Mangilik el* programme. The idea of this vision is to develop common values of Kazakhstan and live in a "prosperous" and "well-developed" country (Nazarbayev,2014) The content of all academic subjects, educational work, social projects and practices are directed at students' active participation in their own learning,

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

who will be able to transform these values and relate them to their own lives ( *Centre of excellence forum*, 2012). From this information, it can be seen that the curriculum is mostly directed to promote national identities. Currently, global awareness is an area with which few public school students are becoming familiar. Teachers tend to focus on domestic multicultural issues relevant to their regional settings, rather than introducing different cultures throughout their subjects. The mission of this school is "to enhance the intellectual capacity of Kazakhstan through the development and implementation of an innovative, Mathematics and science-orientated, trilingual model of school system that integrates the best of Kazakhstani traditions, and that meets international standards of best practice" (Students' handbook of public school, 2015, p.2). Its' vision is "to educate graduates to be global citizens who are fluent in three languages, are able to think critically, are aware of the history of their motherland and are prepared for lifelong learning" (Students' handbook of public school, 2015, p.2).

While the vision statement's language implies that the curriculum materials will promote global citizenship, in practice that can be challenging. There is a gap between the professional development provided for a public school personnel and how it relates to preparing students to become global citizens. Working as a teacher in one of the public schools, I can say that the connection to the school's vision rarely happens, and teachers plan their lessons without taking into account the mission and vision of the school to promote global citizenship. According to Fisher and Hicks (1985) who argue that there should be a strong connection between the curriculum and the lesson that are conducted by the teachers. Lessons should reflect what is written and suggested in the curriculum in order to increase the level of understanding of GCE.

This study examines the attitudes and perceptions of teachers towards global citizenship

4

#### KAZAKHSTAN

education. It is crucial to involve the views of teachers, because their experience is vital in this issue and can help to improve the situation and promote global citizenship in schools. Examining the curriculum and the process of its implementation will help school staff develop a deeper understanding of how to make their students globally aware.

#### Personal Journey toward the Proposed Study

I became interested in this area of research after getting involved in the international accreditation process in a school. The accreditation provides the school with an international status, allowing more opportunities for students to enter prestigious universities abroad. I worked as a Vice Principal for External Affairs in a school and was coordinating this accreditation process. I was assigned to lead this process and represent the school while organizing the visits by the international experts, who came from Switzerland to see how our school works and suggest steps for further improvement. I have already organized two visits for the experts of Council of International Schools (CIS). CIS is the organization that conducts the accreditation process. This organization has already conducted Membership and Preliminary Visits. Now the school I work in is preparing for the third stage of accreditation, which is called the self-study process. The self-study process is the most significant moment of the process of accreditation and must be defined a main effort of the school to be accredited. It involves time and thorough planning. The self-study process gives the opportunity for the school to be absorbed in a broad analysis of all aspects of its procedure. Basically, the self-study process shapes the foundation for the enhancement of the educational efficiency of the school. During self-study process, which lasts for about 15 months, the school assesses its strengths and weaknesses and creates long-term planning to improve areas that need further development. The

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

Council of International Schools (CIS) focuses on several aspects when they visit our school: the first aspect is teaching and learning process, second, students' well-being and last, how our students are prepared to become global citizens and to what extent our school is focusing on global citizenship education. The last aspect is something that is very new and unknown to many of our teachers in my school, as well as in the Kazakhstani school system overall. That is why I decided to investigate this topic further and find ways to promote it in our school. It is important for our students to be aware of global citizenship education in order to be successful in their future lives. It is one of the areas that CIS is expecting our school to be successful at in order to be accredited. CIS recommended our school to develop this area. Due to this I decided to examine this area further to see if it is a beneficial form of pedagogy.

#### **Statement of the Problem**

Currently, many Kazakhstani teachers are not paying much attention to global citizenship education, as they consider developing students' national identity as a more important part of students' education. According to Ching (2007) local uniqueness is a feeling of being in the right place, which is not driven only by culture, but on heritage, traditions, language, culture and religion; these are all intertwined with culture. This should be addressed and discussed among teachers to find out ways to teach global citizenship education within the national context. Ledou (2011) considers that careful interest to global citizenship should be given in the school subject curriculum within the school curriculum by pursuing to incorporate it into different academic subjects. The main objectives of global citizenship education (GCE) is to build a sense of belonging with a global community and a common humanity, and nurture a feeling of global solidarity, identity and responsibility that generates actions that are not only

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

based on, but also respect universal values. While the values associated with global citizenship education are not new, GCE as a lens of conducting educational practice and as an area of learning and teaching is still an emerging phenomenon with growing worldwide interest. How teachers can be change agents in the classrooms and the wider school community and how teacher-training programs can be designed and adjusted to support the goals of GCE have become fundamental questions for global education communities.

According to the Association of Graduate Recruiters (2012), companies cannot find enough applicants with the required abilities to activate in an international market place. This suggests that schools must make greater efforts to foster global awareness and international collaboration with the intention to best train students for life in the 21st century. According to Bickmore (2004a) the strong area of global citizenship education is the demonstration and practice inserted in the inherent and unofficial subject programme of school public affairs containing the atmosphere of competition or fairness, allowing the aggression, disagreements, and the chances for independent involvement by students, faculty and staff.

It is important to train teachers to teach global citizenship in the public school in Akmola region chosen for this study. Even though classrooms in this public school in Akmola region are becoming increasingly diverse linguistically and culturally, the evidence of global citizenship education is not enough. This atmosphere requires that teachers be ethnically proficient with the intention to tackle various situations and issues and foster inclusive educational practices. The Kazakhstani context should demand that teachers be pedagogically experienced to support students academically and ethically test compound and provocative global issues, be as reliable global citizens and support general thinking and multicultural

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

perspectives. Many researchers agree that even though teachers understand the significance of embedding global citizenship in the school curriculum and their interest to promote and integrate global citizenship into teaching practice is of high level, the majority of teachers undergo lack of self-confidence and teaching skills to prepare for global citizenship (Desveaux&Guo, 2011; Kelly, 2004; McLean, Cook, & Crowe, 2006; Reimer &McLean, 2009; Richardson & Blades, 2006; Schweisfurth, 2006; Sears & Hughes, 2006). According to Zhao (2010), teachers should be practically and theoretically prepared to teach GCE. They should gain all the necessary skills in order to be aware of global issues, understand and be competent enough to discuss different situations and show respect to cultural diversity. Therefore teachers' professional development is crucial for improving and developing their outlook and prepare them to teach GCE.

#### **Purpose of the Study and Research Questions**

The purpose of this qualitative case-study is to explore the understandings of global citizenship education among teachers at one public school. All academic subjects play a significant role in global citizenship education. The disciplines that are taught in secondary school, however, which are mainly related to the study of people, conditions, and locations at home and around the world, are especially important to adopt in students the beliefs and thoughts usually mentioned as essential for global citizenship.

The researcher analyzed different subjects such as Maths, English, Kazakh language, Russian language, Physics, Chemistry, and Physical Education for its emphasis on "global citizenship education".

For the purpose of this study, the following questions are addressed: Primarily, What are Kazakhstani secondary school teachers' perceptions toward "global citizenship education?

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Additional sub-questions include, How do classroom teachers understand their roles and responsibilities in preparing students for "global citizenship?"; What are ways in which teachers' promoting "global citizenship" within classroom practice?; What are the challenges of teachers in preparing students for "global citizenship"?

#### Significance of the study/contributions

Maximizing global awareness and international collaboration during students' formative years makes them more tolerant people who appreciate and see value in diversity and difference. Students will be encouraged to see things from different perspectives and to make informed decisions, helping them to acquire transferable skills that will be useful for the rest of their lives. The research shows the importance of integrating global awareness into the different subjects of the curriculum; the need of getting professional development trainings for teachers and practitioners.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

#### **Chapter Two: Literature Review and Theoretical/Conceptual Frameworks**

In the previous chapter, background of the problem was introduced and its significance to the area of education was presented. This section reviews the relevant literature on global citizenship education, its theories and practice. This part will also include discussions about teachers' understanding of GCE, GCE curriculum and teachers' practices, Educational Change, and Teacher learning about GCE.

#### Global Citizenship Education and Teachers' Understanding

It is crucial to get a clear understanding of what is Global Citizenship Education (GCE) and define GCE. According to Carabain(2012) the main aspect of global citizenship is shown in people's behavior, when all humans are equal and share the responsibility for solving global issues.

As Gaudelli (2003) notes that misunderstanding around the field of global citizenship education creates lots of confusion and wrong interpretation among people. Indeed, namely Popkewitz (1980) indicated that "global citizenship education" works as a motto, created to reproduce an attitude including people who can connect specific teaching methods. Similar points of view were taken in regard to the contested and complicated description on citizenship education and Global Citizenship Education (Tanner, 2007). In *Critique of "Global Education" and "Citizenship Education,"* Davies, Evans, and Reid (2005) stated, "The question for education is how to come to grips with the changing nature of citizenship in a globalising world" (p. 72). Davies et al. (2005) argued that existing nation-focused types of citizenship education are old-fashioned and that citizenship education subject programme requires development of

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

post-national concepts of people. For instance, global citizenship is a more abstract perception that illustrated a gratitude that individuals have ethical obligations to the global community. It is also about respect, acceptance and understanding of others who are different from ourselves.

According to Oxfam (2006) schools should teach students to become Global Citizen with such characteristics as awareness of the wider world and a sense of their own role as a global citizen; respect and value diversity; understanding of how the world works; is anger by social bias; taking part in the community at different levels, from the local to the global; desire to act to make the world a more fair and supportable place; responsibility for the actions.

It is crucial for students to be aware of the issues that are discussed at a world level due to their global aspects. They should understand that GCE is about inclusion and respect for others by having them actively participate in taking actions and solving global or local issues. They should be able to deal with challenges and questions they face in daily life.

According to the literature that in spite of developing the curriculum and different important resources for the teachers, Evans, Broad, and Rodrigue, (2010) stated that there was a lack of understanding of how global citizenship education is implemented at schools because of low attention given to testing the practices. The researchers also highlighted that there was a range of perceptions and practices connected with global citizenship education.

In the empirical study that was conducted by Rapoport (2010) he found out that even though the nine participants of the study knew about GCE, the term was seldom used during the classes. When the participants were asked to give the definition of what is GCE, all participants could no give proper definition and only theorized the description supporting it with

#### KAZAKHSTAN

their own examples from experiences they had in international travels, international competition, or internationally focused extra-curricular activities.

Based on the literature there was a qualitative study conducted by Alazzi (2011) in Jordan, where 15 secondary school teachers of social studies from six different schools were participating in interviews about their understanding of teaching GCE. Alazzi (2011) identified the social studies purpose in Jordan was to "prepare students to become global citizens" (p. 2). He clarified that teachers were to teach not much global education. The teachers narrated they had little preparation for teaching global citizenship. Alazzi (2011) came to the conclusion that the Jordanian secondary school social studies teachers had basic understanding of global citizenship education and how to integrate it within their classrooms.

It can be concluded that teachers still need to have some kind of preparation in order to be qualified to teach GCE and integrate this concept during their classes preparing students to become global citizens.

#### Global Education Curriculum and Teachers' Practices

This section is going to present the GCE curriculum on its emphasis of the GCE aspects and describe how teachers integrate it in their lessons. As White, 2002, stated "a primary step toward global education is teachers' understanding of transforming knowledge in the classroom. There needs to be a shift from the traditional transmission of knowledge-focused curriculum to one which promotes critical thinking and decision-making skills"(p.134). Students who have own point of view and look analytically at social issues will find their classroom a more breathtaking and thought-provoking place. "Engaging students in learning through dialogue enhances their journey to knowledge and competency" (White, 2002,p.134). Also, according to

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Bickmore (2004a) an influential part of citizenship education is the display and practice embedded in the curriculum of school, including the atmosphere of friendship and the prospects for democratic involvement by students and teachers'.

Thus, the curriculum should be focused on developing and promoting global citizenship education. As understandings of global citizenship education have advanced, there has been expanding concentration on related teaching and learning practices, perceiving that current practices frequently underline specific types of learning. In global citizenship education, participatory, learner-centred and inclusive teaching and learning practices are focal, as is student engagement in various decisions about the teaching and learning process. According to Evans (2008); Kerr (2006;) Parker (1995) such practices are crucial to the transformative plan of global citizenship education.

Global education is used to change students' perspectives, attitudes, their values and way of life. For example, American researcher David Blaney (2002) stated that one of the purposes of global education is to "challenge the interpretive privilege and practical advantages of our students" (p. 269). This means that our students will be able to express their points of view and develop their practical skills that will be useful in their lives. This was a demand of promoting critical thinking of the students as well as inquiry to achieve the goals to change students' behavior and points of view. The public school curriculum is focused on the achievement of specific student learning goals, rather than global awareness and diversity and suggests how to obtain a certain amount of knowledge and development of skills to use them in solving the problems of life and education (Autonomous Educational Organisation, 2013). It is important to note that global education is supposed to be embedded into the curriculum of the school in

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

order to be applied to all academic subjects, programmes, and school policies. It will provide the students with great opportunities to enlarge their outlook and become global citizens. Moreover, it is better if global citizenship education is given not as a separate subject as in public school curriculum such as Global Perspectives or Global scholars, but it should be included in the content of every subject to enhance and develop students' understanding of global citizenship education. The necessary condition for implementation of the public school curriculum, subject programmes and development of wide range of skills is implementation of pragmatic, value-oriented and learner-centered approaches, and also the application of appropriate methods of active learning.

It is recommended to use such modern approaches and educational technologies as, STEM (the integration of Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths)-education, concept-based learning, design-thinking, for subject programme implementation. (Methodical Guidelines for organization of educational process of public school, 2016) However, there is a lack of promoting global citizenship education in public school curriculum. According to Amao (2006) global citizenship education is directed at the young people, who are considered to be the future leaders to assure a well future for the country. That is why it is vital to review the curriculum. Students are required to receive education in ethics, social behavior, and abilities to be able to understand a real picture of the world, diversity, and be involved and independent in social life (Navehebrahim&Masoudi, 2011).

Based on the qualitative study that was conducted by Andrzejewski and Alessio (1999) there were some worries that issues related to global citizenship were not main aspects in the curriculum of the school where study was done. Apart from the problems within curriculum,

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

there was an issue of addressing this concern by other educational stakeholders. According to the literature there was another study that was provided by Anderson (2001) who conducted an anthropological study in which she explored how global education was being practiced in the classrooms. She concluded that the most successful lessons were those where students had the opportunity to be aware how they were connected with people around the world. She explained that often at the elementary level, these links were created within the students' local community; whereas, at the middle and high school levels, the teachers were more willing to use international links. The other finding of the study was reported by Canadian researcher Lynette Shultz which was related to the field of global citizenship education; According to Shultz (2007) there had been an observed "reduction in effective global education or education for global citizenship is a result of various understandings of what global citizenship entails" (p.249), each of which involve varying goals, teaching strategies, and content matter.

#### **Teacher Learning about Global Citizenship Education**

Davies, Gregory, and Riley (1999) argued that citizenship education prepare young people to respect others, to be able to listen and how to respond properly. Eight secondary school teachers believed – when reporting on studies and literature do so in past tense that citizenship education with its emphasis on developing independent discussion- to be able to protect own beliefs and values and to challenge others –has much to offer strategies that seek to build respect, tolerance and self-esteem. If students are aware of global citizenship education, they may develop a greater awareness and respect for diversity within today's global community. According to Davies et al. (1999) teachers should also understand the importance of global education to prepare students to be engaged in global world discussions and be ready to express

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

their own views. Teachers should be well-prepared as well in order to develop students' awareness of global citizenship and transform knowledge to the students. They should receive special training or coaching to raise global awareness and to support their knowledge in global citizenship education. Even while receiving training in teacher preparation programs, many teachers are still not properly equipped with the theoretical knowledge and professional skills to transfer their knowledge to the students (Merryfield, 2000; Pike, 2008; Reimer & McLean, 2009; Weber, Evans, MacDonald, & Ingram, 2013).

Martin, Smolen, Oswald, and Milam (2012) recommended using global literature in academic subjects as one way to promote global citizenship. They applied a literature circle with a group of 12-13 year-olds in the United States to engage the students in discussions about international literature. The researchers suggested that global literature allows students the opportunity to question injustice and take a critical stance on issues that occur in the world. It also allows the students to "develop a respect and understanding of politically and socially oppressed people and why it is important to promote social justice" (Martin et al., 2012, p. 163).

The researchers advocated for teachers to create reflective activities when students participate in social action activities, where the students dealt with social issues such as poverty, education and hunger, so students can think in depth about their actions and its importance. These activities helped them to understand global issues and be able to solve the problems. Rapoport (2010) felt that there has been a lack of teacher preparation regarding citizenship education and global citizenship at the undergraduate level. Moreover, according to Rapoport (2010) teachers often lack confidence and training in the methodological and content of "global citizenship."

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

As Fullan (2000) stated lifelong learning could also provide broad opportunities for teachers to establish partnerships with international organizations. This will increase the development and increasing of knowledge in the field of GCE. In addition, he suggested to implement non-formal learning opportunities within the classroom to support teachers' confidence in teaching GCE as well as being flexible to use different approaches to each student. He is sure that this methods will work and develop teachers' understanding of GCE. Furthermore, Fullan (2000) notes that when creating a reflexive learning environment, students can easily develop lifelong learning competences that are significant for becoming global citizens.

The methodology to teaching and the understanding of global citizenship education varies according to the educator's personal practice and/or professional development. Bottery (2006) claimed that there needed to be a major change in professionals' understanding of their duties and the nature of their work connected with globalization and global citizenship. According to Rapoport (2010) who shared the feelings of researchers from Hong Kong and Shanghai who reinforced GCE. Those teachers also felt stressed from exam-oriented curriculum, their lack of preparation or training, and the lack of support from government officials and school administration.

#### **Educational Change**

According to Bruner, "Education must be not only a transformation of culture but also a provider of alternative views of the world and a strengthener of skills to explore them" (as cited in The International Development Education Association of Scotland journal, 2015, p.25). At times the understanding of GCE is associated with the word "global" which meaning is

#### CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

absolutely different. People should accept GCE as a part of our everyday lives, as we are connected to other people from different parts of the world (The International Development Education Association of Scotland,2015, (e.g.,socially and culturally through the media and telecommunications, and through travel and migration, economically through trade, environmentally through sharing one planet and politically through international relations and systems of regulation)

The opportunities our rapidly changing 'globalised' world gives to young people are great. Young people can choose an education that equips them with the knowledge, skills and values they should have in order to get all the opportunities and challenges they encounter, and to make up the type of world that they want to live in; an education that supports their development as global citizens. The active, participatory methods of the programme "Education for Global Citizenship and Sustainable Development" encourages young people to learn how decisions made by people in other parts of the world influence our lives, just as our decisions influence the lives of others.

According to Davies (2006); Holden & Hicks(2007); McCully (2006); McLean, Cook, & Crowe (2008); Schukar (1993); Yamashita (2006) the most challenging aspect of GCE was thoroughly described in the literature through reports of practitioners' perceptions of the obstacles such as lack of required knowledge; understanding of GCE; lack of resources available to incorporating this approach. In spite of interest for the content, techniques, pedagogies, and aims of GCE, many researches across Canada, the U.S., and the U.K. depicted a lack of confidence in their proficiency to implement it in the classroom. Due to Hargreaves and Fullan (2009) who were the creators of Global Education programme teachers and students should be

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

involved when creating a GCE curriculum taking into consideration professional and learning needs. This will extend the understanding and commitment to global education and help to develop rapidly in today's world.

#### **Theoretical Framework**

The theoretical framework for the present study is described by a social constructivist paradigm of research. Glesne (2006) suggests "this paradigm maintains that human beings construct their perceptions of the world." (p. 6). According to Glesne (2006) the constructivist approach in contrast to positivistic or logical empiricist approaches does not use the scientific values of validity, objectivity, or generalizability similarly. In general, constructivists eliminate the belief that it is possible to remain entirely honest and accept the world not like a reflection of what is happening there, but community objects of what people make. In social constructivism the goal of the research is to rely as much as possible on participants' views of the situation being studied, because people are perceived as having their own understanding and meaning making of their worlds, experiences, and social interactions. The questions become broad and general so that the participants can construct the meaning of a situation (Creswell, 2002,p.8)

KAZAKHSTAN

**Chapter Three: Methodology** 

In the previous chapter I provide a literature review relevant to my study. This section presents a comprehensive explanation of the qualitative methodology selected in order to examine teachers' perceptions and understandings of global citizenship education. This work requires learning about the opinions of individuals, evaluating a process over time, generating theories based on participants' perspectives, and gaining detailed information about a few people or sites. (Creswell, p.64). In addition, based on Creswell (2014) qualitative research is important not only to investigate, but to found a deeper understanding of central phenomenon.

**Research Design** 

To explore understandings of global citizenship education by teachers, this study used a qualitative case study design with one-on-one semi-structured interviews, document analysis, and observation. A case study is an in-depth exploration of a bounded system (e.g.activity, event, process or individuals) based on extensive data collection (Creswell,2007). Bounded means that the case is separated out for research in terms of time, place or physical boundaries. Researcher Robert K. Yin (1984) defines the case study research method as "an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context; when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident; and in which multiple sources of evidence are used" (p. 23). From Yinian point of view, case study is an empirical inquiry that explores the case or cases following the above-mentioned definition by addressing the "how" or "why" questions regarding the phenomenon of interest. According to Yin (2002), it is important to apply detailed and comprehensive approach to the formation of the design and

#### KAZAKHSTAN

be reliable at every stage of the research process from creating the research questions to data collection and data analysis processes.

A case study may sometimes be perceived as a type of ethnography (Creswell, 2014), although it differs from an ethnography in several important ways. Also, when case study writers research a group, they may be more interested in describing the activities of the group instead of identifying shared patterns of behavior exhibited by the group. The ethnographer searches for the shared patterns that develop as a group interacts over time. The research consisted of such methods as interviews, observations, and document analysis (Creswell, 2014).

The researcher seeks to develop an in-depth understanding of the case by collecting multiple forms of data. Providing this in-depth understanding requires that only a few cases be studied, because for each case examined, the researcher has less time to devote to exploring the depths of any one case (Creswell, 2007, p.465). The usage of multiple data collection helped me to get a better understanding of the process and to create more confident research outcomes and conclusions.

#### The Empirical Study

After receiving ethics approval from the Research Ethics Board, the researcher then sought permission from the school principal before conducting research with participants. Convenience sampling was used to select the school. Convenience sampling is a purposeful sampling technique where subjects are selected because of their convenient accessibility and proximity to the researcher (Creswell, 2014). The school principal of the school where the study took place was provided with a detailed description of the procedures of the study. He/she was given the consent form with the description of the study, purpose of the study, time involvement,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

risks and benefits of the study. (see Appendix E). After getting permission from the gatekeeper, he/she was requested to distribute the recruitment flyers with the information about the study and characteristics for the participants' selection to teachers. (see Appendix A). Purposeful sampling was used to select participants of the study. In purposeful sampling, researchers intentionally select individuals and sites to learn about or understand the central phenomenon. The standard used in choosing participants and sites is based on their being "information rich" (Creswell, 2014, p.206). Maximal variation sampling was used in order to present multiple perspectives of individuals to represent the complexity of our world (Creswell, 2014). Thus, one sampling strategy is to build that complexity into the research when sampling participants or sites. Maximal variation sampling is a purposeful sampling strategy in which the researcher gathers diverse individuals that differ on some characteristic or trait. For example, in my study, participants had a range of 5 to 10 years of experience, they came from various academic subject areas (e.g. Maths, Chemistry, Physics, English, Kazakh language, Physical Education), taught in Grades 7-12 and had various understandings and practices of global citizenship education.(e.g. none to some). In addition, they came from different ethnic backgrounds (e.g. Kazakh, Russian, American, German, Ukraine, Polish, English). Research participants included both females and males in order to provide a balanced insight into the research question. This provided in-depth understanding of how Kazakh teachers understand Global Citizenship Education, and their views on how the curriculum assists students in developing their

After getting acquainted with the recruitment flyers, interested participants who fit the criteria contacted the researcher. After that the location and time for meeting were decided by

understanding of global citizenship education.

#### KAZAKHSTAN

the researcher and the participant. Participants were informed about confidentiality and provided with a consent form. After participants' signed the consent form, the data collection process started. First, one-on-one semi-structured interviews took place at one of the school classrooms, which were available at the time of the interview, with teachers of Grades 7-12. Interviews were conducted in English and Russian and lasted for about 45 minutes. An interview protocol was developed. The entire interview was audio-taped. During the interview, notes were taken, which were shown to the interviewee. The answers were transcribed. Thus, the researcher could return on another date and review the transcripts and field notes with participants, so they could edit or revise their responses. Second, document analysis was done to review school curriculum on the inclusion of aspects of global citizenship education. Third, classroom observations were conducted in order to witness real examples of global citizenship education in action in class. Teachers who participated in the interview process were observed. Non-participant classroom observations lasted for 40 minutes. The purpose of the observation was to determine if teachers include aspects of global citizenship education in their classes. Two days before the interview, the researcher contacted the participants to remind them about the interview and to agree on a time and location. Field memos and the researcher's reflective journal were also used for data collection and following analysis. The data will be stored in a separate storage area and kept for two years in case it will be used in further research. At the end of the study, the participants were thanked for their time and participation in the research study. The data collection period lasted for approximately one month. A Word file was created to record necessary information from the documents (Creswell, 2014). All the documents were secured in the password protected computer. They were also kept in USB card that was available only for the researcher.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

#### **Participants**

Overall, nine participants took part in my study. Two of participants had five years of experience, the other two participant had eight years of experience, four participants worked for ten years and one more participant had fifteen years of experience. My participants came from various academic subject areas such as Maths, Chemistry, Physics, English, Kazakh language, Physical Education, ICT, and History. They taught in Grades 7-12 and some of them had some understandings and practices of global citizenship education and some had not had any knowledge about it. In addition, I had two international teachers from Great Britain and the USA who participated in my study; three participants were Kazakh; two teachers were Russian and two participants came from German ethnic background. Research participants included two females and seven males. In addition, two of the participants had Master's degree and seven of them had Bachelor level of education. Different characteristics of the participants allowed to get various perspectives and opinions to conduct a quality study.

#### **Data Collection**

This study collected data using interviews, observations, and document analysis. The use of these 3 methods of data collection will provide the study with rich information and allow to see the case from different perspectives. The researcher used semi-structured interviews with open-ended questions to access the opinions of school teachers regarding global citizenship education and its inclusion in the curriculum. Fontana and Frey (2000) described interviews as "one of the most powerful ways in which we try to understand our fellow human beings" (p. 645). One-on-one interviewing is a data collection process in which the researcher asks questions and records answers from only one participant at a time (Creswell, 2002). These

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

interviews were conducted to gather information on what challenges teachers face in implementing global citizenship education in the curriculum, how they understand global citizenship, and how this form of education is supporting students to succeed in today's diverse society. In this study one-on-one semi-structured interviews were administered to collect data, as well as document analysis and observations. One-on-one interviews with school teachers elicited teachers' perceptions towards global citizenship education. Member checking (According to Creswell, 2002, is a technique that is used to check the responses of the participants)was used to obtain the acquired missed information or get an in-depth understanding of additional details. In document analysis academic subjects such as Geography, History, Kazakh language, Physics, Maths, English and other subjects included in the curriculum were analyzed on the aspect of global citizenship education. All the course plans of these subjects were reviewed. "Lesson observation is the process of gathering open-ended, firsthand information by observing people and places at a research site" (Creswell, 2002, p.235). Non-participant classroom observations were used to see how the teachers implement the dimensions of global citizenship education such as cognitive, socio-emotional and behavioral components.

**Interviews.** One-on-one interviews provided the opportunity to gather in-depth information on how teachers and students feel about their level of global awareness and their understandings of global awareness. Interviews lasted for 45 minutes. They were conducted at one public school in Akmola region. The semi-structured interviews were conducted in one of the classrooms that were available at the time of the interview. Interviews were audiotaped and transcribed. When the participant did not give a full answer, the probing questions were asked

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

in order to help the participants to develop their ideas. (see attached appendix C).

**Document Analysis.** About 11-12 subjects such as Geography, History, Kazakh language, Physics, Maths, English and other subjects are included in the curriculum. The researcher analyzed the curriculum for each subject, specifically looking for tenets of global citizenship education. Document analysis was used as one method of data collection and analysis.

**Observations.** Observation is the process of gathering open-ended, firsthand information by observing people and places at a research site (Creswell, 2014). Creswell (2014) says that "Non-participant classroom observation will be used. A non-participant observer is an observer who visits a site and records notes without becoming involved in the activities of participants" (p.237). Lessons of teachers who participated in the interview were observed. Observations lasted for about 40 minutes. Each participant in the classroom was observed. Special classroom observation protocol was created to record the process of the lesson and to determine if global education aspects were included. The researcher observed the cognitive component, social-emotional and behavioral components in the observation field notes. (see Appendix D).

#### **Data Analysis**

The data analysis process started with data collection, during which the researcher began to reflect on the process and make sense of the raw material. As the study is qualitative in nature, the data analysis was conducted through texts, interpretations, and meanings. According to Yin (2002) thorough attention should be given to the planning for the data analysis steps in case

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

study method in order that their research has a strong foundation for making the analysis of the data.

Interviews were first transcribed, translated into English, and then coded. By re-reading the raw material, the data was divided into initial coding: the process involving identification of concepts, ideas, and issues participants addressed more frequently during the conversation. Then the initial coding were refined into focused codes. After that the researcher searched for patterns and themes. The themes which emerged from the data that are relevant to the research questions were located within the broader meaningful categories. The categories that were elucidated from the data were further analyzed in-depth in relation to the research questions and context. The final stage involved combining the categories in order to develop headings that structured the discussion for analysis and allowed the emergence of common themes (Creswell, 2014).

# **Limitations of the Study**

The first limitation was the fact that purposeful sampling, maximal variation sampling was used, which gave a limited amount of information due to the large number of participants. It should be noted that one of the participants dropped out of the study due to the absence of the agreed date. Also, the researcher did not randomly select participants. Second, focusing on one school experience is insufficient to give a broad picture of the situation of global citizenship education. In addition, one of the participants who was not able to physically participate in the interview requested to send interview questions, that prevented the researcher from asking probing questions, make clarifications and get more detailed information.

#### **Ethics in Research with Humans**

From the beginning, the research project was conducted in accordance with ethical

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

principles and standards. Treating participants with an ethic of respect, protecting their interests and not putting them at risk are among the main priorities.

Participants were selected on a voluntary basis and were fully informed of the purpose and nature of the study. Participants were informed about the duration of the study, the nature of the research, and what exactly was required of them. Each of the participants was provided with a participant informed consent form from the research supervisor. The participant informed consent form explained the purpose of the study, provided a confidentiality statement, and explained that participation was voluntary. Participants were at liberty to withdraw from the study at any time. If participants did not wish to answer a particular question during the interview, he or she could have indicated this so and the interviewer would move on to the next question. Therefore, they could have decided to leave the study at any time. Participants were made aware that gathered information would be used in writing a qualitative research report, which would be read by the researcher's supervisor. Interviews were conducted in English and Russian and lasted for about 45 minutes. An interview protocol was developed. The entire interview was audio-taped. During the interview, notes were taken, which were shown to the interviewee. Thus, in the event of a misunderstanding, the interviewee had an opportunity to correct or delete a response. The answers were transcribed. Though excerpts from the interview were included in the final research report, participant names and other identifying information were kept anonymous. The researcher used pseudonyms to protect participants' confidentiality and anonymity.

Participants were apprised that the information gained from the interview would not be used for any other purposes and would not be recorded in excess of what was required.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Participants were assured that the information recorded would be confidential, and no one else besides the researcher and her supervisor would have access to the audiotapes. The data would be stored in a separate storage and kept for two years in case of use in further research. Though it was planned to include excerpts from the interview in the final research report and potential presentations and publications, participant names and other identifying information would be kept anonymous. The researcher used pseudonyms to protect participants' confidentiality and anonymity. Thus, the researcher might return to another date and review the transcripts and field notes with participants, so they could edit or revise their responses.

Participants were informed that their participation would contribute to a better understanding of developing global awareness in Kazakhstan. Also, participants were allowed to review their responses after the interview, so they could decide if the information I received was correct and they had the opportunity to edit or review aspects of their responses.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

**KAZAKHSTAN** 

**Chapter Four: Findings** 

In this chapter, I present the findings of this study, which focuses on the role of curriculum in teachers' understanding of global citizenship education (GCE) at one public school of Akmola region, Kazakhstan. This chapter introduces the findings from this qualitative case study. This study sought to better understand: 1) Teachers' perceptions of GCE, 2) How teachers integrate GCE into the lessons and 3) To analyze the role of curriculum in GCE. In doing so, I asked what teachers' perceptions toward global citizenship education are. Subquestions are: (1) How do classroom teachers define global citizenship; (2) How do classroom teachers define their roles and responsibilities in preparing students for global citizenship?; (3) What are the examples of teachers' activities in promoting global citizenship?; (4) What are the challenges of teachers in preparing students for global citizenship?

To answer these research questions this study used a qualitative case study design with one-on-one semi-structured interviews, document analysis, and non-participant classroom observations. In general, during interviews the participants were asked to describe their understanding of global citizenship education. They shared their ideas about positive and negative aspects of promoting global citizenship education at school. Participants also have expressed their views about roles and responsibilities of teaching GCE and discussed challenges in teaching GCE in the classroom. Based on participants' responses four significant themes were identified: 1) Global Citizenship Education and Teachers' Understanding; 2) Global Citizenship Education curriculum and Teachers' Practice; 3) Educational Change; and 4) Teacher Learning about Global Citizenship Education.

# CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

## KAZAKHSTAN

# **Characteristics of Participants**

The following chart illustrates the characteristics of respondents who participated in interviews and provides information on the participants" area of specialization. The pseudonyms shown in the Table 1 were used throughout the paper instead of participants' names in order to keep their confidentiality.

Nine participants took part in the interview. More specifically, there were teachers of different subject areas, such as English language, Maths, History, Physics, Chemistry, Physical Education, Kazakh language, Russian language and ICT, who had more than five years of work experience.

Table 1

General characteristics of Participants

Years of teaching experience	Years of teaching experience in this school	Pseudonym	Area of Graspecialization	ade level	Level of Education
Five years	Five years	Anna	English language	Grade 7	Bachelor degree
Eight years	Six years	Zhanna	Maths	Grade 11	Master's degree
Ten years	Five years	Ben	History	Grade 9	Master's degree
Ten years	Five years	Jack	ICT	Grade 8	Bachelr degree
Fifteen years	Seven years	Rus	Physical Education	Grade 7	Bachelor degree
Ten years	Seven years	Dulat	Physics	Grade 8	Bachelor degree
Five years	Six years	Zhan	Chemistry	Grade 9	Bachelor degree
Eight years	Six years	Bill	Kazakh language	Grade 11	Bachelor degree

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

Ten years	Five years	John	Russian language	Grade 7	Bachelor degree

This table was provided to show who participated in the study. In the section below I will introduce the findings about teachers' understanding of GCE.

## **Teachers' Understanding of Global Citizenship Education**

All participants reported that they have basic understanding of GCE and they understand the importance of implementing this concept in the curriculum. For instance, one of the participants reported that,

I think it [global citizenship education] is at a basic level of understanding and that many teachers and staff still are struggling with the concept. As such, a lot of attention is given to global citizenship awareness at a very basic definition level but it does not progress to a deeper understanding or application of the concepts and ideals. (Anna, English language teacher)

Some participants also indicated that little attention from school administration is given to GCE, which prevents school teachers from fully understanding and practicing it during their lessons. For instance, some of the teachers argued that

I feel we pay lip-service to it. We have nice sounding policies and pronouncements but it is largely forgotten in the hurly-burly of our daily programmes. (Dulat, Physics teacher)

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

Dulat indicated that the school does not pay much attention to promoting GCE. It has all the policies that includes the information about GCE, but no one pays attention at this because of the other activities, programmes and events conducted at school every day.

Zhan reported that although the school makes some efforts to teach GCE, it is still much needed in order to give deeper understanding of GCE and prepare students to become global citizens. He stated,

To my knowledge, the school is trying as much as it can with the resources available. The international staff is involved in Shanyraks (two grades are included in one group called Shanyrak, where they are supposed to do everything together). Students at higher grades have the advantage of learning global perspective as a subject though not given much attention. Much needs to be done to prepare students to be global citizens. (Zhan, Chemistry teacher)

Moreover, some of the participants highlighted some resistance to incorporating global citizenship in their lessons and indicated that while GCE is recognized among teachers, little attention is given to deeply understanding and implementing it into everyday lessons. For instance,

The simple answer is 'not as much as we would like'. My previous experience of teaching within the UK was that the challenges of the National Curriculum, targets and Ofsted (The Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills) preparation meant there was already a lot going on. However, due to the positive impact it had we focused in integrating it into our delivery. In Kazakhstan there seems to be

# CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

more of resistant to incorporate it within our lessons and overall school plan. (Jack, ICT teacher)

Jack gives his previous experience comparing it with his practice in this school. His former experience was positive about teaching GCE and integrating it in the lessons and other forms of activities. Nevertheless, in this school he feels that there is more of resistance or opposition to incorporate it within the lessons and school plan itself. According to this participant's response it can be stated that because of resistance to integrate GCE it could lead to negative impact of the school process.

# The role of Administrative Leadership in delivering GCE

In examining the role of school leadership and integrating and delivering GCE in the classroom, participants' responses regarding teachers' responsibilities in preparing students for GCE and accountability for implementing this concept were almost similar to each other. There was a strong feeling among the participants that the implementation of subject programme should not remain solely with the classroom teacher, but should be an effort supported by school administration. For example,

Teachers have the responsibility to promote awareness and understanding among learners about global citizenship education. They need to emphasize this in their everyday lessons through global examples relevant to the subject material. Teachers have to take initiatives to conduct activities that include knowing about cultures, traditions, best practices and be a role model as a tolerant educator. However, teachers should not be the only responsible people at school in preparing students to become

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

global citizens. The school administration should also play a main role in students' life.

(Dulat, Physics teacher)

Dulat stated that teachers should be responsible for promoting awareness and understanding of GCE during their every day lessons, give some global examples to make GCE clear to the students. But teachers consider school administration to play a driving role in promoting GCE.

I think it is a big part of a teacher's responsibilities to prepare students to become global citizens — as I find this to be a cornerstone of a relevant, 21st century education. However, it cannot be done if the teacher does not understand or believe in the concept themselves and/or have no ideas for practically implementing such ideas in the classroom. In addition, teachers need help from administration to prepare students for their future and to have positive influence on them. (Anna, English language teacher)

Anna strongly considers administration as one who should support the learning process and help teachers to prepare students for their future lives.

Ben also expressed his concerns in terms of administration support in promoting and developing GCE. He reported,

School will improve its process only if there is a strong connection between teachers and administration. When they support each other and encourage to create positive learning environment. Unfortunately, it is not seen in our school. (Ben, History teacher)

Therefore, it was important for participants to reflect on this question and express their points of view. According to their behavior it was obvious that they wanted someone to share with their ideas and wanted their voices to be heard. They really wanted some support and help from the administrators to improve their teaching GCE

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

## Global Citizenship Education Curriculum and Teachers' Practice

It seems that many of the participants feel confident about implementing the current curriculum for teaching global citizenship education at school. The responses were mostly positive and participants shared some activities taken from the curriculum (subject programme). Some of the examples given by the participants include activities such as discussing global problems and events, conducting research on global topics. For example, Jack uses ICT related activities connecting them with world news in order to make students think and reflect and enlarge their outlook,

Using the starter to incorporate powerful stats to make kids stop and reflect on the world around them; Using the News as a platform for data when working with ICT; Using the upcoming EXPO 2017 as a platform for various ICT related activities. (Jack, ICT teacher)

Next quote describes how teacher provides global examples rather than just giving local examples, so that the students can be aware of what is happening in a global level. In addition, the participant does some research on internationally recognized scientist to develop students' overview and knowledge of the world facts.

Provide global examples instead of using local examples in a lesson; Research on internationally recognized scientists and their contribution; Using audio-visual resources that involve people, issues, languages in a global level. (Zhanna, Maths teacher)

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Ben says that he always introduces all topics within a global context with elements of intercultural understanding. During his lessons they talk about traditions and cultures of different countries.

I try to introduce all topics within a global context or with some element of intercultural understanding. For example, we look at global weather phenomenon, not just 'if it is sunny and cold in Kazakhstan.' We also talked about, at a very basic level, if it is important to preserve traditional customs and clothing from older cultures — in Kazakhstan and around the world. (Ben, History teacher)

Based on the answers participants provided, it can be seen that teachers implement the activities that prepare students to become global citizens and the curriculum consists of topics which support GCE. Teachers understand that it is crucial to raise students' awareness of GCE and enlarge their outlook so that students can be prepared for their future lives and be familiar with global issues and topics to become global citizens.

Through observing the lessons of the nine participants it was seen that such components of global citizenship education as cognitive (Acquisition of knowledge, ability to understand and critically comprehend global, Regional, national and local problems, the relationship and mutual, dependence of various countries and peoples.), socio-emotional (Possessing a sense of belonging to humanity as a whole, common values and responsibility, a sense of compassion, solidarity and respect for diversity and diversity.) and behavioral (Effective and responsible action at the local, national and Global levels to create a more peaceful and sustainable world.) are in place in the classroom. Students could critically analyze the data and discuss the

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

information at different levels (national and global). Lessons contained activities (e.g. group discussions or open class discussions) where students were expressing different points of view, were sharing their ideas and could agree or disagree with each other. Teachers organized group works (e.g. teacher divided the class into four groups) that helped students to support and encourage each other. Teachers of ICT, History and English language gave the students proper instructions and students can independently work and be responsible for their actions. Therefore through their observations, it seems that many of the teachers are engaging in GCE practices, but had challenges in discussing GCE aspects in my interviews due to the lack of theoretical knowledge of this concept. It was difficult for them to give proper definition of GCE.

## **Educational Change**

Attitudes toward Promoting GCE. When discussing about positive aspects of promoting GCE participants sparked their interest and it was evident that they wanted to express their opinions and to be heard. They said that international week, Model UN debates are organized to promote global citizenship education at school. The most frequent answers about the positive aspects about promoting global citizenship education were,

Global citizenship education enlightens young people about the world around them; it encourages strong discussion; develops critical thinking in the classroom; creates socially responsible young people; raises aspirations; contributes to other subjects; teaches about the importance of sustainability; encourages an interest in social justice (Ben, History teacher)

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Ben stated that if GCE is promoted it will give a great opportunity for the students to develop their critical thinking, organize discussion about global topics. Moreover, GCE could help to develop socially responsible young people. In addition, if GCE is aligned with different subjects students can get useful information about sustainability and interest in social justice.

I have said that the most positive aspect is that it is relevant and necessary in this modern world. The kids are motivated to explore global themes and connections and how to help their fellow man and planet. (Anna, English language teacher)

In this quote the participant says that GCE is necessary in this modern and developing world. It is also about kids who are motivated to learn more of global themes.

Global citizenship education opens up students mind and their attitude towards people from other countries; appreciate the global contributions made by people to make our life comfortable; empowers them to contribute to the global issues like peace, poverty, literacy and crime. (Zhanna, Maths teacher)

This quotation shows how GCE opens up students' minds and their attitude towards people from different parts of the world. Furthermore, GCE helps the students to appreciate global things created by people and be aware of global issues such as peace, poverty, literacy and crime.

Although there were many positive aspects described above, participants also highlighted some negative aspects of promoting GCE they face during the school process, such as lack of funding, no opportunity to promote GCE. Some of the supporting examples were,

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Little additional funding; sometimes creates difficult and emotionally challenging subjects; finding supporting materials that is relevant can be challenging (Bill, Kazakh language teacher)

The negative things are frustration level with the limited opportunity to actively promote the concept. (Ben, History teacher)

May give rise to unhealthy competitions; creates stereotypic thinking about ethnic communities; it overwhelms the students and may cause fear in their minds that they have to face the world in the future. (Zhan, Chemistry teacher)

From these responses it can be seen that teachers have limitations and restrictions to promote GCE concept that really frustrate them. According to the participants, this prevents them from having the opportunity to promote GCE and improve the learning process.

Participants were also asked to give their suggestions to better promote global citizenship education. All the participants eagerly shared their ideas about how to help the school to organize the school process in a better way. Some of the participants were saying that promotion of global citizenship education could be quite challenging if there was little support at national level in integrating the topic into the curriculum. The participants were also indicating that more funding and support should be made available. For example,

It needs formalising into an actual qualification that contributes to the targets of the school. This will encourage time and resources being given to the topic. Teaching in the subject is viewed as a 'nice addition' rather than a 'must have'. More investment needs

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

to be put into teaching resources, best practice guides and online material. (Jack, ICT teacher)

Some of the recommendations were that the students should participate in international competitions which would give more awareness of GCE. One of the supporting quote was,

Joining organisation's that promote global peace and understanding, like Model United Nations; being part of online communities; encourage students to participate in international competitions at both academic and extracurricular levels; Conduct multicultural day at the school level; Helping people around the world through fundraising, collecting clothes, food etc.(Ben, History teacher)

From these responses it can be understood that there is still a gap in lesson planning in promoting global citizenship education in the classroom. In addition, based on the participants' view it is crucial to have support at national and international level so that teachers can make more attempts and effort to promote GCE. Next subsection will provide the data about challenges teachers faced toward GCE.

Some respondents indicated that implementation of GCE could be challenging if the concept was not implied before and if teachers did not have a clear understanding of it. The supporting quote can be following,

I think the biggest challenge is teaching global citizenship in a place where the concept is very new and the staff do not understand it, or necessarily believe in it to the full extent needed to promote it. It is much easier to promote global citizenship at a school where there is a real international base – like students from China, India, Norway, Mexico etc.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

and so the mix promotes a want in staff and in students to find commonalities and join
 as an international, global micro-community. (Anna, English language teacher)

In this quotation, the participant talks about the issues of misunderstanding the concept of GCE. The respondent gives the example as if there is a real international base at school with international students, the situation would be much better and easier to promote GCE.

**Kazakhstani Patriotism.** This subsection reveals the influence of the national Kazakhstani values on teachers' experiences with promoting GCE. The respondents were saying that not enough was done at school in terms of developing GCE concept properly. Additionally, some honest, open dialogues between international and local staff about the conflict between promoting Kazakhstani patriotism/nationalism in conjunction with global citizenship could be set into motion and conversation about this would be a great starting point. The finding can be seen from the following responses,

A negative aspect is that this is a somewhat difficult environment to implement such teachings as the student and staff body is rather homogenous and there is a general/school belief in promoting Kazakhstani values and ideals first. (Zhanna, Maths teacher)

Interference with the social and cultural behavior of people with undesirable aspects.

(Dulat, Physics teacher)

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Consequently, it seems participants view promoting Kazakhstani patriotism/nationalism and global citizenship as mutually exclusive. According to some participants' responses they think that if GCE is promoted, students will not be a patriot of their country. For example,

First of all, students need to know their own history and culture. If we start to promote GCE, the students will forget about their national values and this can cause different situations, like students' desire to leave the country. (Zhanna, Maths teacher)

Jack stated that teachers have wrong perception and understanding of GCE considering it as something that will change students' views and let the students be more independent that will lead to bad behavior of the students. He noted,

I think teachers are afraid that students will receive more freedom if they become global citizens and teachers will lose the control over them. (Jack, ICT teacher)

Obviously, concepts such as patriotism and global citizenship should be equally considered when creating a positive learning environment.

# **Teacher Learning about Global Citizenship Education**

Many participants explained that teaching global citizenship education which is connected with a lack of trainings and professional development that can change and improve the way teachers practice GCE in the classroom. Participating in trainings and professional development sessions gives the theoretical and practical knowledge to the teachers so that they can implement them at their practice. Even though some respondents said that they attended workshops about GCE concept. For instance,

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

I have attended the workshop, which was about GCE concept and how we can implement this concept in the classroom. However, I would like to attend more professional development sessions in order to better understand this concept. (Zhan, Chemistry teacher)

The participant tells that one training is not enough, he needs more training and in different aspects of GCE.

In addition, according to my participants there is a need to review the school curriculum to revise the topics with a focus on global citizenship education which will give an opportunity for the teachers to improve their practice. For example,

We need more professional development on this subject. Practical lesson plans within every subject that address global citizenship. Subject programmes do not have a lot of topics on global citizenship education. (Jack, ICT teacher)

Anna also thinks that professional development is significant for teachers. She stated,

I think the teachers simply need more training in it. Practical professional development in different subjects with different world experts would be incredibly helpful. (Anna, English language teacher)

Besides, participants were requested to share with their reflections about ways of improving teaching global citizenship education. This gave them an opportunity to reflect on and analyze the situation, as well as suggest some practical solutions of improving teaching GCE. The main suggestions were that more investment needed to be put into teaching resources,

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

best practice guides and online materials, all to support professional learning about GCE Dulat stated,

More investment is needed into an actual qualification that contributes to the targets of the school. This will encourage time and resources being given to the topic. Teaching in the subject is viewed as a 'nice addition' rather than a 'must have'. (Dulat, Physics teacher)

In addition, according to my participants teaching global citizenship education could be quite challenging if there was little support at Ministry of Education level in integrating the topic into the curriculum. The participants also noted that more funding and support should be made available. For example,

Promotion of global citizenship education can be quite challenging if there is little support at national level in integrating the topic into the curriculum. In these times of social unrest, polarising elections and intolerance even at the highest political level this topic is needed more than ever. More funding and support should be made available. (Zhan, Chemistry teacher)

From the participants' responses It can be seen that teachers need more professional development sessions that will give useful information about teaching GCE such as aspects of cognitive, socio-emotional and behavioral components and explain what global citizenship education is so that teachers can be fully aware of this concept and use it in a right way. For instance,

I believe we need a firmer commitment from all schools in terms of resources and funding to deliver this content. Delivering the content well is challenging but its benefits

# CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

# KAZAKHSTAN

in terms of producing enlightened, motivated, well rounded young people who also have a range of academic skills as a result of engaging with this material. (Anna, English teacher)

Also, the school curriculum should be review on integrating the GCE topic in it so the teachers can easily get an access and deliver lessons without any problems.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

KAZAKHSTAN

## **Chapter Five: Discussion**

The aim of this chapter is to discuss the major findings, which emerged during a thorough analysis of the data that was collected through interviews, non-participant lesson observations and document analysis. In addition, the major findings are discussed with regard to the literature review. These findings are presented according to research sub-questions, which were set at the beginning of this study. Findings chapter provided information on the teachers' understanding of global citizenship education and how much attention is given to global citizenship education at school; information about the role and responsibilities of the teachers in preparing students to become global citizens and teachers' perceptions and attitudes toward global citizenship education; attitudes toward promoting GCE and challenges teachers experienced toward GCE and teachers' thoughts about their professional preparedness to teach GCE and suggestions of better promoting global citizenship education.

From the findings, it seemed this group of teachers have basic understanding of GCE and they have some understanding of the importance of implementing this concept in the curriculum. Participants considered that GCE was at a basic level of understanding and that many teachers and staff still were struggling with the concept. As such, a lot of attention was given to global citizenship awareness at a very basic definition level but it did not progress to a deeper understanding or application of the concepts and ideals. In spite the fact that teachers are implementing it in practice, but they do not connect this with their theoretical understandings. This finding is in line with the literature, where different authors claimed that there was a lack of understanding of GCE among teachers and it was rarely implemented in class. For instance, Evans, Broad, and Rodrigue, (2010) stated that there was a lack of understanding of how global

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

citizenship education is used in practice at schools because of low attention given to testing the practices. In addition, based on Rapoport (2010) who found out that even though the participants of the study knew about GCE, the term was rarely used in the classes. Similar situation was in my findings when some participants were not clear when they gave the definition of what is GCE, almost all of the participants could not give proper definition and only theorized the picture of GCE supporting it with their own examples from experiences they had in international trips, international contests, or internationally focused extra-curricular activities and events. Based on my observation teachers could show that they do it in practice, however they are still unclear what is GCE. Alazzi (2011) who concluded that the Jordanian secondary school social studies teachers had basic understanding of global citizenship education and how to implement it within their classrooms.

Participants also highlighted the role of administrative leadership as an important factor to promote GCE at school. They reported that there was not much support given from administration staff to help teachers to better understand GCE and improve teaching and learning process. Moreover, some of the participants drew attention to some resistance to merging global citizenship in their lessons and indicated that while GCE is recognized among teachers, little attention is given to deeply understanding and implementing it into everyday lessons. Perhaps, it is a requirement that everyone should know what GCE is, but no further activities are conducted to implement it in practice. According to Fullan (2001), school principals and administration play main role in building close and strong relationship between school staff and the communities that surround them. In addition, due to Hargreaves (2008),

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

only if administration shows support to teaching and learning process; highly involved in every activity; trusted by the parents, teachers and students the school becomes successful.

According to Bickmore (2004a) the main part of citizenship education is the modeling and practice embedded in the curriculum of school, including the atmosphere of friendship and the prospects for democratic involvement by students and teachers'. As it was mentioned earlier the main purpose of preparing global citizens for the future can best be addressed by structuring the model of global education within inclusive education. (e.g. to foster love and patience, minimize the conflicts and use them as learning opportunity). The students should study in peace and tolerance and the role of teachers must be consistent with the aims of global citizenship and inclusion. However, based on the study that was conducted by Andrzejewski and Alessio (1999) there were some issues related to global citizenship, because it was not main aspect in the curriculum of the school where study was done. In my finding it seems that many of my participants feel confident about implementing the current curriculum for teaching global citizenship education at school. My participants were able to understand about peace and tolerance as embedded parts of GCE, even though it was not much seen in their practice. The participants shared some activities taken from the curriculum (subject programme) to promote GCE. They use different global topics that prepare students to become global citizens and be successful in their future lives. However, during lesson observation, that was conducted to see the situation from different angle, it was found out that teachers do implement GCE into practice, but they do not have enough theoretical knowledge to be able to discuss it during the interview and explain the activities they do in class. Yet, some of my observations showed that teachers do not implement aspects of GCE at all and do not fully understand GCE concept.

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Some of the answers were that the curriculum did not consist of topics that can promote GCE in the classroom. This finding is in line with the literature that claims of lack of promoting global citizenship education in school curriculum. According to Amao (2006), it is vital to review the curriculum. Students need to receive education in GCE in order to be able to have a real picture of the world, diversity, and be active and independent in social life (Navehebrahim&Masoudi, 2011).

One of the unexpected findings of my study that was not supported in the Literature Review section is misconception of GCE toward Kazakhstani patriotism. The national Kazakhstani values also seemed to influence teacher's experiences in promoting GCE. The respondents reported that not enough was done at school. The participants were saying that due to the misconception about GCE there was a conflict among subject teachers, when some of teachers were resistant to incorporate GCE in class considering it as an interference to promote Kazakhstani patriotism. For example, one teacher mentioned that if school pays more attention to GCE, students will forget about their national values and will not be the patriots of their country. Maybe they did not understand that these concepts could be taught at the same time without intervening each other. The most important that it would help the students to become global citizens, but it did not mean that they would not be the patriots of their country. This everything came from misunderstanding the concept and various explanation of it.

One of the findings of the study was lack of trainings and professional development for the teachers to become qualified in teaching GCE. Based on the literature there are different studies about teachers' professional development trainings that could help teachers to be prepared to teach GCE and improve their practice. For instance, Davies et al. (1999) claimed

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

that teachers should understand the importance of global education to prepare students to be engaged in global world discussions and be ready to express their own views. Teachers should be well-prepared as well in order to develop students' awareness of global citizenship and transform knowledge to the students. He also stated that teachers should receive special training or teaching preparation courses to raise global awareness and to support their knowledge in global citizenship education. In the result of the study conducted by Merryfield, 2000; Pike, 2008; Reimer & McLean, 2009; Weber, Evans, MacDonald, & Ingram, 2013, even while receiving training in teacher preparation programs, many teacher candidates were not adequately prepared with the theoretical understanding and professional skills to deliver their knowledge to the students. This data from the literature supports the finding from my study which is connected with a lack of trainings and professional development of teachers to conduct effective lessons to teach GCE. Participating in trainings and professional development sessions would give the theoretical and practical background to the teachers so that they can implement them at their practice. Even though some respondents said that they attended workshops about GCE concept, it was not enough. Since, these courses were organized once only without any further discussions or practices. Also, some of the participants mentioned that there was a need to review the curriculum on the aspects of GCE. They thought that the topics were not connected to GCE. Even though there is an aspect included in the programme, it does not appear within the classes. (see appendix F). As Fullan (2000) stated lifelong learning could also provide broad opportunities for teachers to establish partnerships with international organizations. This would increase the development and increasing of knowledge in the field of GCE. In addition, based on Rapoport (2010) who shared the feelings of researchers from Hong Kong and Shanghai who

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

reinforced GCE. Those teachers also felt stressed from exam-oriented curriculum, their lack of preparation or training, and the lack of support from government officials and school administration.

#### Conclusion

The purpose of this chapter was to discuss the major findings, which can explore the questions set in the beginning of this study. First finding which refers to research question about teachers' understanding is that the global citizenship education is recognized by teachers, however little attention is given by school administration to deeply understanding it and implementing into the everyday lessons. Also there was a convincing sense among the respondents that the implementation of a curriculum (subject programme) should not be the responsibility of a classroom teacher only, but school administration should also support it. Second finding is that teachers do implement GCE in the classroom, but they do not have theoretical knowledge about it, which prevents them from discussing in in an open way in the classroom. In addition, there was a limited opportunity to promote the GCE concept at a school level. Third finding was about teachers' limitations and restriction to promote GCE concept. Also, there was a somewhat difficult environment at school to implement teaching and promoting Kazakhstani values, ideals first, which was connected with teachers' resistance to accept new ideas and change the way thinking and teaching. Fourth finding was, there is a need to review the school curriculum to revise the topics with global citizenship education and provide professional development, which will give an opportunity for the teachers to improve their practice. Based on these findings, general discussions have been formed pertaining to each sub-question.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

#### Recommendations

The purpose of this chapter was to discuss the major findings, which can give answers to the questions set in the beginning of this study. Overall, four major findings have been discussed. In light of the discussion of the study, some recommendations are presented. These recommendations are mostly directed to school administration, teacher training universities and Ministry of Education within a Kazakhstani context.

The main purpose of this study was to explore teachers' understanding of GCE. Since, it was identified that teachers had basic understanding of GCE and little attention was given by school administrative leadership team to promote GCE at school and in class level, it is crucial to pay more attention to this situation and conduct creative events and activities to help teachers to be better aware of this concept. In particular, teachers should understand the importance of GCE concept at school and its role to teach students to become global citizens. In order to do that, there should be a thorough action plan created in order to give a proper directions and suggestions to help and support teachers. For example, in the beginning of the school year teachers can set smart targets individually or as a group with objectives and activities to achieve better understanding of GCE. By the end of each term there should be a discussion on what went successfully and areas for improvement.

Second recommendation came from teachers' worries about their lack of competence to teach GCE. Teachers need more professional development trainings to improve their teaching practice and be fully confident in their theoretical and practical knowledge. It is vital to organize trainings and workshops about teaching GCE. This could help teachers to create their own strategies and methods to teach GCE and better promote in the classroom. In order to realize it

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

the school should plan the budget for inviting specialists or trainers to conduct these workshops. It is important to include the topic of GCE in professional development plan and make sure that every teacher gets this training.

Third problem was in the curriculum that did not consist of topics connected with GCE. It worth revising the curriculum and modifying it in order to help teachers with resources and lesson planning so that they could get an access to the materials that would be useful in teaching GCE. School should create a group of teachers to work on curriculum revision. Teachers can make surveys to find out what should be included or excluded from the curriculum After completing it, the revised curriculum should go to the center of programmes so that they can be introduced with the suggestions of the school in order to give approval or add more recommendations.

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

## **Chapter Six: Conclusion and Researcher Reflection**

In this chapter, I will present a summary of the major findings from this study as well as provide researcher reflection on the conducted study. The following questions were explored in the study: 1) What are teachers' perceptions toward "global citizenship education?"2) How do classroom teachers define their roles and responsibilities in preparing students for "global citizenship?" 3) What are some examples of teachers' activities in promoting "global citizenship"? 4) What are the challenges of teachers in preparing students for "global citizenship"? These questions have been formed to find the answer to the main question about teachers' understanding of GCE and the role of curriculum in it.

This study demonstrated that a group of Kazakhstani teachers still have basic understanding of GCE and this prevents them from teaching it in an effective way. Second, the study identified the problem of not having theoretical and practical knowledge of teachers to promote GCE. Third finding was teachers' limitations and restriction to promote GCE concept. Fourth, it showed the importance of revising the subject programme and add more topics about GCE to prepare students to become global citizens and that teachers experience lack of trainings and professional development support in order to improve their teaching practice in GCE.

From the findings of the study it is concluded that teachers do not fully understand the GCE concept. It is happening due to the little or no support from the administrative leadership team, who as participants indicated should be driving the process of promoting GCE in order to improve teaching and learning process. The study revealed the worth of having more people responsible for promoting GCE rather than only teachers. Perhaps, all the school stakeholders

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

should support this process in order to have collaboration that would help to achieve the goal and mission of the school.

Research findings from this study showed that teachers were not fully prepared to teach GCE and respondents were stressing the need to have more trainings and professional development in order to increase their theoretical and practical knowledge. Also, participants highlighted that such trainings should be consistent and conducted more than once. This would be more effective and worthwhile. Moreover, from the findings of the study it could be seen that there is a need to revise the curriculum. Some of the participants were highly disappointed that curriculum did not cover GCE topics and prevented to provide a quality lessons.

The study indicated that there was some resistance from the teachers who considered teaching GCE as the way to forget Kazakhstani values and patriotism. It could happen due to the lack of understanding of what was GCE again. Teachers should be aware that GCE and Kazakhstani patriotism could be taught together and did not create interference.

It can be concluded that teachers do understand the importance of promoting GCE and they indicate the role of curriculum as a driving one that could help teachers to use it in the classroom and teach students to become globally aware.

## **Researcher Reflection**

As a novice researcher, I found this process exciting and full of interesting moments. It was astonishing to work with different kinds of people, listen to various opinions and points of view. Of course, the most difficult part of my research process was to find the problem that would be interesting and significant in the world of science and literature. In the beginning of

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

the process, I could not come up with the area for research, because I had some in my mind and to identify one was difficult. Nevertheless, when the topic and problem are clear the further process is a little bit easier. It was also crucial to find good literature to support my research problem. I have decided to conduct the research based on one school which is located in my city. Perhaps, the thing that I have conducted the study based on the experience of only one school and it could be a limitation. The reason is that it is always interesting to compare the different school practices with various backgrounds and curriculum.

I was glad that I have chosen three methods of data collection that gave me the opportunity to explore the problem from three angles. The interviews went smoothly. Participants were eager to answer the questions and were interested in my topic. The only thing that was unexpected for me, that two of my participants were not able to come at the agreed time and I have sent them my interview questions via email. The limitation was my inability to ask probing questions. However, I think that their responses were detailed enough and there was no need to ask them more questions. Likewise, the lesson observations I have conducted were not enough. Due to the limited amount of time, I could not go to observe each participant twice or three times. If I had a chance to conduct the study again, I would definitely do more lesson observations. Since it shows a real situation what is happening in the classroom. In addition, document analysis was done with school subject programme (curriculum), which also gave more data to investigate the problem.

Overall, I found the recruitment process and interviewing the participants most interesting. It was new experience for me and I was excited to have a lot of people who were eager to participate and who shared with their thought and views regarding my topic.

THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION, KAZAKHSTAN

#### References

- Alazzi, K. (2011). Teachers perceptions and conceptions of global education: a study of Jordanian secondary social studies teachers. *The Journal of Multiculturalism in Education*. 7(3). Retrieved from:

  <a href="http://www.wtamu.edu/webres/File/Journals/MCJ/">http://www.wtamu.edu/webres/File/Journals/MCJ/</a>
- Althof, W. (2006). Moral education and character education: their relationship and roles in citizenship education. Journal of Moral Education, 35(4), 495-518
- Association of Graduate Recruiters (2015), retrieved from: http://www.agr.org.uk/Home
- Bickmore, K. (2004a). Discipline for democracy? School districts' management of conflict and social exclusion. Theory and Research in Social Education, 32(1), 75-97.
- Blaney, D. (2002). Global education, disempowerment, and curricula for a world politics. *Journal of Studies in International Education* 6 (3), 268-282.
- Bottery, M. (2006). Education and globalization: Redefining the role of the educational professional. *Educational Review*, *58*(1), 95-113.
- Carabain, C., Keulemans, S., van Gent, M., & G. Spitz (2012). Global Citizenship. Participation support . Amsterdam, the Netherlands: NCDO.
- Centre of Excellence forum, 2012. Retrieved from: cep.forum.nis.edu.kz
- Ching, 2007. Why cultural and national identity is crucial for a country, Retrieved

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

from: <a href="https://hkuspace1.wordpress.com/2007/11/12/why-cultural-and-national-identity-is-crucial-for-a-country/">https://hkuspace1.wordpress.com/2007/11/12/why-cultural-and-national-identity-is-crucial-for-a-country/</a>

- Creswell, J. (1998). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions.

  Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications Inc.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). Educational research: Planning, conducting and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research (4th ed.). Harlow: Essex, Pearson.
- David L.Blaney. (2002) Global Education, Disempowerment and Curricula for World Politics, Journal of Studies in International Education 6:3:262-282
- Davies, L. (2006). Global citizenship: Abstraction or framework for action? *Educational Review*, 58(1), 5-25. doi: 10.1080/00131910500352523
- Davies, I Gregory, I & Riley, S (1999). Good citizenship and educational provision. London.
- Davies, I., Evans, M., & Reid, A. (2005). Globalising citizenship education? A critique of 'global education' and 'citizenship education'. *British Journal of Educational Studies* Vol 53, No 1, pp. 66-89.
- Definition of Global Awareness (2010). Retrieved from: http://www.ask.com/science/meaning-global-awareness-6fd3fe64a10279a5
- Desveaux, D., & Guo, L. (2011). Educating for global citizenship: A practical guide for Canadian schools. Toronto, ON: UNICEF Canada.

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

- Developing your global awareness (2015), retrieved from: <a href="https://www.shef.ac.uk">https://www.shef.ac.uk</a>
- Evans, T. & Nation, D. (2003). Globalization and the reinvention of distance education.

  In M.G.
- Evans, M., Broad, K., & Rodrigue, A. (2010). *Educating for Global Citizenship*. An ETFO Curriculum Development Inquiry Initiative, Ontario, Funded in part by the Government of Ontario.
- Fisher, S. and Hicks, D. (1985) World Studies 8-13: A Teacher's Handbook. Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd.
- Fontana, A. & Frey, J. H. (2000). The interview: From structured questions to negotiated text.

  In N. K. Denzin, & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), Handbook of qualitative research (2nd ed.)

  (pp. 645-672). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Fullan, M & Hargreaves, A (2009), Improving School Leadership. Retrieved from: https://www.oecd.org/edu/school/44374889.pdf
- Fullan, M. (2000). The three stories of education reform. *Phi Delta Kappan*, Vol April, pp. 581-584.
- Fullan, M. (2001). The new meaning of Educational Change (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Gaudelli, W. (ed.). 2003. World Class: Teaching and Learning in Global Times. Mahwah, NJ,

  Lawrence Earlbaum Associates
- Glesne, C. (2006). *Becoming Qualitative Researchers: An Introduction* (3rd ed.). Boston, MA.: Pearson/Allyn & Bacon.
- Grossman, D. (2003). Citizenship education and inclusion: A multidimensional approach. In V.

# CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

- Heung, & A. Ainscow (Eds.), Inclusive education: A framework for reform: Proceedings of the International Conference on Inclusive Education (pp. 16-22). Hong Kong: The Hong Kong Institute of Education.
- Hargreaves, A. (2008). The Four Deeps in Action, London:SSAT
- Ledou, G., Derriks, M., Heurter, A., & C. Pater (2011). Consolidation of global citizenship in the field of education. Amsterdam, the Netherlands: Kohnstamm Institute.
- Merryfield, M. (1993). Reflective practice in global education: Strategies for teacher educators. *Theory Into Practice*, *32* (1), 27-32.
- Merryfield, M. (1994). Teacher education in global and international education. In Sutton, M. and Hutton, D. eds., *Concepts and Trends in Global Education*. Washington, DC:

  Office of Educational Research and Improvement.
- Merryfield, M. (1998). Pedagogy for global perspectives in education: Studies of teachers' thinking and practice. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 26 (3), 342-379
- Merryfield, 2000; Pike, 2008; Reimer & McLean, 2009; Weber, Evans, MacDonald, & Ingram, 2013
- Methodical Guidelines for organization of educational process in NIS schools,2012. Retrieved from: kt.nis.edu.kz
- Official site of Autonomous Educational Organisation "Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools" (2013). Retrieved from: <a href="http://www.nis.edu.kz/en/news/">http://www.nis.edu.kz/en/news/</a>.
- Oxfam (1997). What is global citizenship? November 12, 2008. Retrieved, from: <a href="http://www.oxfam.org.uk/education/gc/what\_and\_why/what/">http://www.oxfam.org.uk/education/gc/what\_and\_why/what/</a>
- Parker, Ninomiya, & Cogan (1999). Towards Multinational Curriculum Development.

#### KAZAKHSTAN

Retrieved from:

www.rohan.sdsu.edu/~cbabroad/.../PDF.../Educating\_word\_citizens.pdf

President Message "Nurly zhol", 2014, retrieved from:

http://cep.forum.nis.edu.kz/index.php?topic=6778.0.

- Schultz, L. (2007). Educating for GC: conflicting agendas and understandings. *The Alberta journal of Educational Research*, Vol 53, No 3, pp. 248-258.
- Students' handbook of NIS Kokshetau, 2015, retrieved from: kt.nis.edu.kz
- Tanner, J (2007) 'Global Citizenship' in D Hicks & C Holden (eds.) *Teaching the Global Dimension: Key Principles and Effective Practice*, Oxon: Routledge.
- Rapoport, A. (2010) We cannot teach what we don't know: Indiana teachers talk about global citizenship education. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*, 5(3), 179-190.
- White, C. (2002). Creating a "World of discovery" by thinking and acting globally in social studies: Ideas from New Zealand. *The Social Studies*, November/December 2002, 262-266.
- Zhao, Y. (2010). Preparing globally competent teachers: A new imperative for teacher education. Journal of Teacher Education, 61(5), 422-431.doi:10.1177/0022487110375802
- Yazan, B. (2015). Three Approaches to Case Study Methods in Education: Yin, Merriam, and Stake. *The Qualitative Report*, 20(2), 134-152. Retrieved from: http://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol20/iss2/12
- Yin, R.K., (1984). Case Study Research: Design and Methods. Beverly Hills, Calif: Sage Publications.

62

# THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

# KAZAKHSTAN

Yin, R. K. (2002). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

## Appendix A

# **Recruitment flyer (English version)**

#### **DEAR TEACHERS!!!**

I am Zhanar Ordabayeva, a graduate student of Nazarbayev University and I am doing research as a part of my Master Degree. I encourage you to take part in the research. I

hope it will be exciting and interesting!!!

# What is this study about?

- •Teachers' understanding of Global Citizenship Education
- •Teachers' opinions of global citizenship education and their understanding of how it is being integrated within different subject areas in the curriculum

# Who can participate in the study?

•Different subject teachers with 5 years of experience and they should work in Grades 7-11

#### What is involved?

- •This study involves participating in a private interview only with me for about 45 minutes in December/early January, 2017
- •This study involves observing one lesson of yours by me in December/early January, 2017

# What are the benefits of participating?

- •You will be contributing to school changes regarding global citizenship education
- •You will be able to share your experiences and opinions in open and safe environment
- •You will get some useful resources on global citizenship education

If you decide to participate in this voluntary and exciting research, please contact me at <a href="mailto:zhanar.ordabayeva@nu.edu.kz">zhanar.ordabayeva@nu.edu.kz</a> by December, 5<sup>th</sup>, 2016

# Приложение А

# ФЛАЕР (Russian version)

# Дорогие учителя!!!

Я, Жанар Ордабаева, магистрант Высшей Школы Образования Назарбаев
Университета и провожу исследование в рамках магистерской диссертации.

Приглашаю Вас принять участие в исследовании. Надеюсь Вы извлечете для себя
много интересного и полезного!

# О чем будет исследование?

- •О понимании учителей о воспитании глобального гражданства
- •О мнениях учителей о воспитании глобального гражданства и их понимании о том, как оно интегрируется в предметах учебной программы

# Кто может принять участие?

•Учителя разных предметов с опытом работы до 5 лет и работающих в 7-11 классах

# Действия участников

- •Участие в индивидуальном интервью продолжительностью 45 минут в Декабре/начале Января,2017г.
- •Наблюдение одного урока участников в Декабре/начале Января,2017г.

# Преимущества участия?

- •Внесение вклада в работу школы по воспитанию глобального гражданства
- •Обмен опытом и мнениями в открытой и комфортной обстановке
- •Получение полезных ресурсов по воспитанию глобального гражданства

Если вы решили принять участие в данном добровольном и увлекательном исследовании, пишите на почту <u>zhanar.ordabayeva@nu.edu.kz</u> до 5декабря, 2016г.

KAZAKHSTAN

# Appendix B

# **INFORMED CONSENT FORM (English version)**

The role of curriculum in teachers' understanding of Global Citizenship Education in one of public schools in Akmola region, Kazakhstan

**DESCRIPTION:** You are invited to participate in a research study that will be focused on the understandings of global citizenship education among teachers at one of public schools in Akmola region. The study will also examine teachers' opinions of global citizenship education, and their understandings of how it is being integrated within different academic subject areas in the curriculum. In addition, the study will be aimed at looking at the curriculum for its emphasis on "global citizenship education".

You will be asked to participate in a one-on-one interview and lesson observations that will take approximately 45 minutes to complete, with a follow up interview to check and clarify your responses. You may withdraw from the study at any time. If you do not wish to answer a particular question during the interview, you may say so and the interviewer will move on to the next question. Your answers will be audiotaped and kept for 2 years in case it will be needed for further research. The information recorded will be confidential, and no one else except my supervisor and me will have access to the tapes. However, excerpts from the interview will be included in the final research report and potential presentations and publications, however, your names and other identifying information will be kept anonymous. I will use pseudonyms to protect your confidentiality and anonymity. For example, I will make upper name or I will call you "Teacher 1 or Teacher 2"

**TIME INVOLVEMENT:** Your participation will take approximately 45 minutes.

#### **KAZAKHSTAN**

RISKS: The minor risk associated with this study is that you can have a sense of fear and embarrassment to say something negative during the interview. Although you may experience these minor negative psychological feelings, please know that you will remain confidential and the information will not be connected to you in any way. After the interview you will be shown your responses so that you can change them or remove at all. In addition, I assure you that your names and other identifying information will be kept anonymous. I will use pseudonyms to protect your confidentiality and anonymity.

BENEFITS: The benefits which may reasonably be expected to result from this study are mainly educational. You will, as it was mentioned in the research purpose above, understand the importance of promoting global citizenship education and improve your teaching practice. Therefore, you will be able to analyze the content of the curriculum during lesson observation and develop professionally. However, I cannot guarantee that you will benefit. In addition, you will not be received any compensation for participation. Your decision whether or not to participate in this study will not affect your employment and relationship with NU.PARTICIPANT'S RIGHTS: If you have read this form and have decided to participate in this project, please understand your participation is voluntary and you have the right to withdraw your consent or discontinue participation at any time without penalty or loss of benefits to which you are otherwise entitled. The alternative is not to participate. You have the right to refuse to answer particular questions. The results of this research study may be presented at scientific or professional meetings or published in scientific journals.

#### **CONTACT INFORMATION:**

67

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

KAZAKHSTAN

Questions: If you have any questions, concerns or complaints about this research, its

procedures, risks and benefits, contact the Master's Thesis Supervisor for this student

work,(Dr.Amanda Ajodhia-Andrews, Amanda.ajodhia@nu.edu.kz)

**Independent Contact:** If you are not satisfied with how this study is being conducted, or if

you have any concerns, complaints, or general questions about the research or your rights as a

participant, please contact the NUGSE Research Committee to speak to someone independent

of the research team at +7 7172 709359. You can also write an email to the NUGSE Research

Committee at gse\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz

Please sign this consent from if you agree to participate in this study. I have carefully read the

information provided;

• I have been given full information regarding the purpose and procedures of the study;

• I understand how the data collected will be used, and that any confidential information

will be seen only by the researchers and will not be revealed to anyone else;

• I understand that I am free to withdraw from the study at any time without giving a

reason;

• With full knowledge of all foregoing, I agree, of my own free will, to participate in this

study.

Participant Signature:	Date:
•	
Student researcher Signature:	Date:

# Приложение В

# ФОРМА ИНФОРМАЦИОННОГО СОГЛАСИЯ (Russian version)

Роль учебной программы в развитии понимания у учителей одной из школ в Акмолинской области, Казахстан о воспитании глобального гражданства

**ОПИСАНИЕ:** Приглашаем Вас принять участие в исследовании, которое будет направлено на понимание учителей о воспитании глобального гражданства. В исследовании будут также рассмотрены мнения учителей о воспитании глобального гражданства, а также их понимание того, как данное понятие интегрируется в различных академических предметных областях в учебной программе. Кроме того, исследование будет направлено на изучение учебной программы на наличие аспекта "воспитание глобального гражданства».

Вам будет предложено принять участие в интервью, которое займет примерно 80 минут, а также один из ваших уроков будет посещен исследователем. Вы можете отказаться от участия в исследовании в любое время. При Вашем разрешении ваши ответы будут записаны на диктофон. Ваша анонимность будет защищена. Аудиозапись интервью будет уничтожена после транскрибирования данных. В процессе анализа, только два человека будут иметь доступ к информации: мой руководитель и я. Полная анонимность будет сохранена, ваши имена будут заменены на псевдонимы или будут использованы коды «Учитель 1 или Учитель 2».

KAZAKHSTAN

ВРЕМЯ УЧАСТИЯ: Ваше участие займет примерно 80 минут.

РИСКИ: Наименьший риск, связанный с этим исследования заключается в том, что вы

можете иметь чувство страха или смущения сказать что-то негативное в ходе

интервью. Информация о Вас будет оставаться конфиденциальной и анонимной. После

интервью Вам будут показаны ваши ответы, для того чтобы Вы могли изменить их или

удалить вообще. Будут использованы псевдонимы, для того чтобы сохранить Вашу

конфиденциальность и анонимность.

ПРЕИМУЩЕСТВА: Преимущества, ожидаемые в результате этого исследования в

основном образовательные. Вы, как это было упомянуто в исследовательских целях

выше, поймете важность воспитания глобального гражданства и улучшите свою

практику преподавания. Также, Вы будете иметь возможность проанализировать

содержание учебной программы во время наблюдения урока. Ваше решение о согласии

либо отказе в участии никаким образом не повлияет на ваши отношения с Назарбаев

Университетом или вашей работой.

ПРАВА УЧАСТНИКА: Если Вы прочитали данную форму и решили принять участие в

данном исследовании, Вы должны понимать, что Ваше участие является добровольным

и что у Вас есть право отозвать свое согласие или прекратить участие в любое время без

штрафных санкций и без потери социального пакета, который Вам предоставляли. В

качестве альтернативы можно не участвовать в исследовании. Также Вы имеете право

не отвечать на какие-либо вопросы. Результаты данного исследования могут быть

представлены или опубликованы в научных или профессиональных целях.

КОНТАКТНАЯ ИНФОРМАЦИЯ:

## KAZAKHSTAN

**Вопросы:** Если у Вас есть вопросы, замечания или жалобы по поводу данного исследования, процедуры его проведения, рисков и преимуществ, Вы можете связаться с руководителем исследователя, используя следующие данные:, (Аманда Аджодха-Эндрюс, Amanda.ajodhia@nu.edu.kz)

**Независимые контакты:** Если Вы не удовлетворены проведением данного исследования, если у Вас возникли какие-либо проблемы, жалобы или вопросы, Вы можете связаться с Комитетом Исследований Высшей Школы Образования Назарбаев Университета по телефону +7 7172 70 93 59 или отправить письмо на электронный адрес gse\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz

Пожалуйста, подпишите данную форму, если Вы согласны участвовать в исследовании.

- Я внимательно изучил представленную информацию;
- Мне предоставили полную информацию о целях и процедуре исследования;
- Я понимаю, как будут использованы собранные данные, и что доступ к любой конфиденциальной информации будет иметь только исследователь;
- Я понимаю, что вправе в любой момент отказаться от участия в данном исследовании без объяснения причин;
- С полным осознанием всего вышеизложенного я согласен принять участие в исследовании по собственной воле.

Подпись участника:	Дата:	
Подпись студента исследователя:	Дата:	

# **KAZAKHSTAN**

# Appendix C

INTERVIEW PROTOCOL (English version)			
<b>Project title:</b> The role of curriculum in teachers' understanding in Global Citizenship			
Education in one of publ	lic schools in Akn	mola region, Kazakhstan	
Time of interview:	Date:	Place:	
Interviewee:			
Position of Interviewee	:		
measures assuring the co	onfidentiality of th	ripant about (a) the purpose of the study, (b) the he interviewee (the name of the participant and other revealed), and (c) the approximate time for the	er
[Ask the interviewee to	read carefully and	d sign the consent form.]	
[Ask the interviewee's po	ermission to use the	the tape recorder.]	
[Test tape recorder.]			

# **Questions:**

- 1. What subject do you teach?
  - How long have you been teaching at this school?
  - How many years of experience do you have overall?
- 2. Tell me your understanding of "global citizenship education"
  - How much attention is given to "global citizenship education" at school?

# CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

#### KAZAKHSTAN

- 3. Can you tell me more about your perspectives about teachers' responsibilities in preparing students for "global citizenship education?"
- 4. Please share any activities you may use in class to promote "global citizenship education"
  - Can you tell me some benefits students receive from GCE?
- 5. What are the challenges in preparing students for "global citizenship" do you face?
  - What are your thoughts about students' understanding of what is global citizenship?
- 6. In your view, what should be taken into consideration in teaching "global citizenship education"?
  - Could you share with me what is done at the school level to promote "global citizenship education"?
- 7. Tell me about positive and negative things regarding promoting "global citizenship education"?
- 8. What are your suggestions of better promoting "global citizenship education"?
  - What can be improved in order to make teaching "global citizenship education" more effective?

(Thank respondents for participating in the interview. Assure them again about the confidentiality of received information. Acknowledge them about the possibility to do a member check. Tell the participants that you may return to another date and review the transcripts and field notes with participants, so they can edit or revise their responses (member checking))

# Приложение С

# ПРОТОКОЛ ИНТЕРВЬЮ (Russian version)

**Название проекта:** Роль учебной программы в развитии понимания учителями одной из школ в Акмолинской области, Казахстан «воспитания глобального гражданства»

Время интервью: Дата: Место проведения:

Интервьюируемый:

# Должность интервьюируемого:

[После представления себя, ознакомь участника с (а) целью исследования, (б) мерах, обеспечивающих конфиденциальность интервьюируемого (имя участника и других людей, упомянутых в его рассказах, не будут раскрыты) и (в) приблизительной продолжительностью интервью.]

[Попроси интервьюируемого внимательно ознакомиться и подписать форму информированного согласия.]

[Спроси разрешения интервьюируемого на использование диктофона.]

[Проверь работу диктофона.]

## Вопросы:

- 1. Какой предмет вы преподаете?
  - Как долго вы преподаете в этой школе?
  - Какой у вас стаж?
- 2. Расскажите мне о вашем понимании о "воспитании глобального гражданства?"
  - Сколько внимания уделяется «воспитанию глобального гражданства" в школе?
- 3. Можете ли вы поделиться своим мнением об обязанности учителей в подготовке учащихся к «воспитанию глобального гражданства»?
- 4. Какие мероприятия проводятся Вами на уроках для поддержки "воспитания глобального гражданства"?
  - Расскажите о возможных преимуществах учащихся, которые они могут извлечь для себя от «воспитания глобального гражданства»?
- **5.** Какие проблемы возникают в процессе подготовки учащихся к "воспитанию глобального гражданства", с которыми вы сталкиваетесь в классе?

- Что вы думаете о том, насколько учащиеся понимают «глобальное гражданство»?
- **6.** По вашему мнению, что необходимо принимать во внимание при обучении «воспитанию глобального гражданства"?
  - Не могли бы вы поделиться со мной, что делается на уровне школы, для того чтобы поддержать "воспитание глобального гражданства"?
- **7.** Расскажите мне о положительных и отрицательных вещях, касающихся "воспитания глобального гражданства"?
- **8.** Каковы ваши предложения по развитию «воспитания глобального гражданства"?
  - Что может быть улучшено для того, чтобы сделать обучение "воспитания глобальное гражданства" более эффективным?

(Поблагодари респондентов за участие в интервью. Заверь их о конфиденциальности полученной информации. Расскажи о возможности сделать проверку правильного понимания полученной информации).

# Appendix D

# **OBSERVATION PROTOCOL (English version)**

Observational field notes	
<b>Observation Focus:</b> Global Citizenship Education in the class	sroom
<del>-</del>	
Setting: classroom №	
Observer: X	
Role of observer: Observer of global citizenship education in	classroom
Time:	
Length of observation:	
Elements of focus for classroom observation: cognitive, so	cio-emotional and behavioral
components	
Observation Notes	Reflective notes
	Reflective notes
Observation Notes	Reflective notes
Observation Notes	Reflective notes
Observation Notes  1.Cognitive component:	Reflective notes
Observation Notes  1.Cognitive component:	Reflective notes
Observation Notes  1.Cognitive component:	Reflective notes
Observation Notes  1.Cognitive component:	Reflective notes
Observation Notes  1.Cognitive component:  2.Socio-emotional component:	Reflective notes
Observation Notes  1.Cognitive component:  2.Socio-emotional component:	Reflective notes

Приложение D

77

# THE ROLE OF CURRICULUM IN TEACHERS' UNDERSTANDING OF GLOBAL CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION, KAZAKHSTAN

# ПРОТОКОЛ ПОСЕЩЕНИЯ УРОКА (Russian version)

Заметки по посещению урока	
Цель посещения урока: Воспитание глобального гражданства на уроках	
Место: №каб	
Дата:	
Наблюдатель: Х	
Роль наблюдателя: Наблюдатель наличия воспитания	глобального гражданства на
уроках	
Время:	
Продолжительность:	
Темы: Когнитивный, социально-эмоциональный и поведенческий компоненты	
Наблюдение уроков	Рефлективные заметки
1.Когнитивный компонент:	
2.Социально-эмоциональный компонент:	
3.Поведенческий компонент:	

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

KAZAKHSTAN

Appendix E

**INFORMED CONSENT FORM (English version)** 

Dear Principal,

I am Zhanar Ordabayeva, a graduate student of Nazarbayev University and I am doing research

as a part of my Master Degree.

I am going to conduct a research study "The role of curriculum in teachers' understanding of

Global Citizenship Education in one of public schools in Akmola region, Kazakhstan" that will

be focused on the understandings of global citizenship education among teachers in your school.

The study will also examine teachers' opinions of global citizenship education, and their

understandings of how it is being integrated within different academic subject areas in the

curriculum. In addition, the study will be aimed at looking at the curriculum for its emphasis on

"global citizenship education".

Your teachers will be asked to participate in a one-on-one interview and lesson observations

that will take approximately 45 minutes to complete, with a follow up interview to check and

clarify their responses. They may withdraw from the study at any time. Their answers will be

audiotaped and kept for 2 years in case it will be needed for further research. The information

recorded will be confidential, and no one else except my supervisor and me will have access to

the tapes. However, excerpts from the interview will be included in the final research report and

potential presentations and publications, however, their names and other identifying information

will be kept anonymous. I will use pseudonyms to protect their confidentiality and anonymity.

For example, I will make upper name or I will call them "Teacher 1 or Teacher 2"

**TIME INVOLVEMENT:** Teachers' participation will take approximately 80 minutes.

#### KAZAKHSTAN

RISKS: The minor psychological risk related to this study is that participants may have a sense of fear to say something negative during the interview. They may feel a sense of embarrassment to disclose their feelings or ideas, or they may have negative experiences in thinking about previous stories and sharing memories. They may also worry about sharing personal information, because of confidentiality issues. Participants will be informed that after the interview they will be shown their responses so that they can change them or remove at all. In addition, they will be reminded about the confidentiality that will be fully described in the consent form. The researcher will reassure participants that she/he is not there to evaluate/judge their programs or work. Though excerpts from the interview will be included in the final research report and potential presentations and publications, participant names and other identifying information will be kept anonymous in all reporting of the data. The researcher will use pseudonyms to protect participants' confidentiality and anonymity.

**BENEFITS:** The benefits of this project are mainly educational. Teachers will understand the importance of promoting global citizenship education and improve their teaching practice. Therefore, the teachers will be able to analyze the content of the curriculum and develop professionally. In addition, teacher empowerment can be a benefit of the research, when teachers' voice is heard and they can freely express their points of view. If teachers improve their practice, students can benefit as well. This research can also fill in the gaps in the literature and be beneficial for the government and policy makers. However, I cannot guarantee that participants will receive any particular benefits from participating in this project.

#### **CONTACT INFORMATION:**

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

KAZAKHSTAN

Questions: If you have any questions, concerns or complaints about this research, its

80

procedures, risks and benefits, contact the Master's Thesis Supervisor for this student

work,(Dr.AmandaAjodhia-Andrews, Amanda.ajodhia@nu.edu.kz)

Independent Contact: If you are not satisfied with how this study is being conducted, or if you

have any concerns, complaints, or general questions about the research or your rights as a

participant, please contact the NUGSE Research Committee to speak to someone independent

of the research team at +7 7172 709359. You can also write an email to the NUGSE Research

Committee at gse\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz

Please sign this consent form if you agree and allow to conduct this research study. I have

carefully read the information provided;

• I have been given full information regarding the purpose and procedures of the study;

• I understand how the data collected will be used, and that any confidential information

will be seen only by the researchers and will not be revealed to anyone else;

• I understand that I am free to withdraw from the study at any time without giving a

reason;

• With full knowledge of all foregoing, I agree, of my own free will, to participate in this

study.

Principal's Signature:	Date:
Student researcher Signature:	Date:

# Приложение Е

# ИНФОРМАЦИОННОЕ ПИСЬМО ДИРЕКТОРУ ШКОЛЫ (Russian version)

Я, Ордабаева Жанар Мергалиевна, магистрант Высшей Школы Образования Назарбаев Университета по программе «Лидерство в образовании» провожу исследование по теме «Роль учебной программы в развитии понимания о воспитании глобального гражданства у учителей в одной из государственных школ в Акмолинской области, Казахстан». Обращаюсь к Вам с просьбой дать разрешение на проведение научного исследования на базе школы, руководителем которой Вы являетесь. Исследование будет направлено на понимание учителей о воспитании глобального гражданства. В исследовании будут также рассмотрены мнения учителей о воспитании глобального гражданства, а также их понимание того, как данное понятие интегрируется в различных академических предметных областях в учебной программе. Кроме того, исследование будет направлено на изучение учебной программы на наличие аспекта "воспитание глобального гражданства».

Учителям будет предложено принять участие в интервью, которое займет примерно 45 минут, а также один из их уроков будет посещен исследователем. Учителя могут отказаться от участия в исследовании в любое время. При их разрешении ответы будут записаны на диктофон. Анонимность учителей будет защищена. Аудиозапись интервью будет уничтожена после транскрибирования данных. В процессе анализа, только два человека будут иметь доступ к информации: мой руководитель и я. Полная анонимность будет сохранена, имена учителей будут заменены на псевдонимы или будут использованы коды «Учитель 1 или Учитель 2».

KAZAKHSTAN

ВРЕМЯ УЧАСТИЯ: Участие займет примерно 45 минут.

РИСКИ: Наименьший риск, связанный с этим исследования заключается в том, что

учителя могут иметь чувство страха или смущения сказать что-то негативное в ходе

интервью. Информация об учителях будет оставаться конфиденциальной и анонимной.

После интервью им будут показаны их ответы, для того чтобы они могли изменить их

или удалить вообще. Будут использованы псевдонимами, для того чтобы сохранить их

конфиденциальность и анонимность.

ПРЕИМУЩЕСТВА: Преимущества, ожидаемые в результате этого исследования в

основном образовательные. Учителя, как это было упомянуто в исследовательских

целях выше, поймут важность воспитания глобального гражданства и улучшат свою

практику преподавания. Также, учителя будут иметь возможность проанализировать

содержание учебной программы во время наблюдения урока. Решение о согласии либо

отказе в участии никаким образом не повлияет на их отношения с Назарбаев

Университетом или работой.

КОНТАКТНАЯ ИНФОРМАЦИЯ:

Вопросы: Если у Вас есть вопросы, замечания или жалобы по поводу данного

исследования, процедуры его проведения, рисков и преимуществ, Вы можете связаться с

руководителем исследователя, используя следующие данные: (Аманда Аджодха-

Эндрюс, Amanda.ajodhia@nu.edu.kz)

Независимые контакты: Если Вы не удовлетворены проведением данного

исследования, если у Вас возникли какие-либо проблемы, жалобы или вопросы, Вы

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

KAZAKHSTAN

можете связаться с Комитетом Исследований Высшей Школы Образования Назарбаев

83

Университета по телефону +7 7172 70 93 59 или отправить письмо на электронный адрес

gse\_researchcommittee@nu.edu.kz

Пожалуйста, подпишите данную форму, если Вы согласны дать разрешение на

проведение научного исследования.

• Я внимательно изучил представленную информацию;

• Мне предоставили полную информацию о целях и процедуре исследования;

• Я понимаю, как будут использованы собранные данные, и что доступ к любой

конфиденциальной информации будет иметь только исследователь;

• Я понимаю, что вправе в любой момент отказаться от участия в данном исследовании

без объяснения причин;

• С полным осознанием всего вышеизложенного я согласен принять участие в

исследовании по собственной воле.

Подпись директора школы:	Дата:
Подпись студента исследователя:	Дата:

**KAZAKHSTAN** 

Appendix F

**Document analysis protocol** 

Name of document: Integrated Educational programme

The Integrated educational programme is aimed at students' achievement of specific learning

objectives, which means that students not only get a certain amount of knowledge, but also

develop the ability to apply their knowledge in solving learning and life problems, so the

programme is focused on the formation of functional literacy and critical thinking skills of the

students.

Successful implementation of the Integrated Educational Programme requires the use of modern

pedagogical approaches, such as active learning, team teaching, content and language

integrated learning (CLIL), etc. In order to prepare teachers of Intellectual schools to work with

innovative subject programmes and course plans, Centre for Educational Programmes under the

AEO has been conducting five day practical training sessions for each subject led by Cambridge

consultants. Teachers get acquainted with the new course plans jointly developed with

Cambridge, as well as with active learning methods that are necessary in order to develop 21st

century skills. The format of training suggests acquiring knowledge by teachers and applying it

in practice via demonstration of teaching methods and techniques to each other - "micro-

teaching".

There is a component of GCE incorporated in the curriculum. For example,

Developing respect for diversity of culture and opinion in biology

# CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN ONE PUBLIC SCHOOL IN AKMOLA REGION,

# KAZAKHSTAN

Respect for diversity of culture and opinion requires personal, interpersonal and intercultural competences. Developing appropriate forms of behaviour will equip individuals to participate in an effective and constructive way in social and working life and in increasingly diverse societies. In the biology programme this will include:

- the ability to gather information independently, analyse situations and make decisions, adapt to new situations, organise their time properly;
- the ability to work in pairs, groups, and teams, to respect the opinions of others and have a sense of responsibility for their obligations to others, which allows learners to develop interpersonal skills;

## **KAZAKHSTAN**

# Appendix G

# **Interview Transcript Sample**

**Interviewer:** What subject do you teach?

Interviewee: English language

**Interviewer:** How long have you been teaching at this school?

**Interviewee:** 18 months

**Interviewer:** How many years of experience do you have overall?

**Interviewee:** 27 years teaching experience.

**Interviewer:** What is your understanding of "global citizenship education"?

**Interviewee:** To promote an awareness of the things that connect people all around the world

(from every country). Global citizenship is raising awareness of what connects us as humans.

**Interviewer:** How much attention is given to "global citizenship education" at school?

**Interviewee:** I feel we pay lip-service to it. We have nice sounding policy and pronouncements

but it is largely forgotten in the hurly-burly of our daily programs.

**Interviewer:** Can you tell me more about your perspectives about teachers' responsibilities in

preparing students for "global citizenship education?"

**KAZAKHSTAN** 

**Interviewee:** This should be at the forefront of lesson planning – how does this issue or matter

affect us and citizens of other countries?

**Interviewer:** Please share any activities you may use in class to promote "global citizenship"

education"

**Interviewee:** Every time we do a reading, speaking, listening or writing exercise I always ask

'Would this happen here in Kazakhstan' or 'What do Kazakh people feel about this do you

think'? "Why is this important to us'? (wastage in China, for example).

**Interviewer:** Can you tell me some benefits students receive from GCE?

**Interviewee:** It makes them more aware of their own humanity.

**Interviewer:** What are the challenges in preparing students for "global citizenship" do you

face?

**Interviewee:** Provincial mindset. No culture of thinking broadly. Limited knowledge of the

world outside KZ.

**Interviewer:** What are your thoughts about students' understanding of what is global

citizenship?

**Interviewee:** I think that the students have limited concept of what GC actually is. Maybe our

fault because we don't give them enough exposure to the concept of GC?

**Interviewer:** In your view, what should be taken into consideration in teaching "global

citizenship education"?

#### KAZAKHSTAN

**Interviewee:** You must be culturally sensitive, politically correct and aware of the context you are teaching the concept in. You must be aware of the 'nationalism' patriotism' v internationalism' tension present within every context.

**Interviewer:** Could you share with me what is done at the school level to promote "global citizenship education"?

**Interviewee:** At school level, I have contributed in an active way to International Week.

**Interviewer:** Tell me about positive and negative things regarding promoting "global citizenship education"?

**Interviewee:** The negative things are frustration level with the limited opportunity to actively promote the concept. The positive aspects are the discussion that ensues when the issue comes up in the teaching and learning process.

**Interviewer:** What are your suggestions of better promoting "global citizenship education"? **Interviewee:** that there is a component in the LP.

**Interviewer:** What can be improved in order to make teaching "global citizenship education" more effective?

**Interviewee:** More PD on the subject. Practical lesson plans within every subject that address GC.